The Winner of Iqbal Award (2001)

THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL'S POETRY

(A Critical and Evaluative Study)

by

PROF. DR. ABDUL GHANI



The Winner of Iqbal Award (2001)

THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL'S POETRY

(A Critical and Evaluative Study)



Prof. Dr. Abdul Ghani

BAZM-i-IQBAL
2 – CLUB ROAD, LAHORE

130351

Publisher: Dr. Ghulam Hussain Zulfiqar
Hon. Secretary
Bazm-e-Iqbal
Nursinghdas Gardens
2-Club Road, Lahore
Phone: 6363056

Published: May 2004
Printed by: Haji Muhammad Hanif & Sons Printers
Pages: 480
Quantity: 500
Price:
Hard Bound Rs. 400/-

ISBN 969-8042-32-6

This project is completed with the financial help of Punjab Government.

بسم اللہ الرحمٰن الرحیم

سلسلۂ اقبالیات کے وسعت پذیر ذخیرے میں پروفیسر ڈاکٹر عبدالغنی کی قابلِ قدر تحقیقی وتنقیدی کاوش:

'An Evaluation of the English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry'

پر اظہارِ خیال کی فرمائش مجھ سے کی گئی ہے جو حقیقتاً اقبالیاتی ریسرچ کے وسیع سلسلے میں ایک لینڈ مارک تالیف ہے۔ اس عظیم کام کے بارے میں، جس کے ساتھ مَیں شروع سے آخر تک بطور نگران منسلک رہا ہوں، توصیفی کلمات کہاں سے لاؤں۔ اگر انگریزی کو ذریعہ بناؤں تو یہ ایک رسمی سی بات ہوگی۔ اور اگر اُردو میں یہ بات کہوں تو بھی یہ خدشہ ہے کہ کہیں اسے ''تقریظ نویسی'' کی کہنہ روایت نہ سمجھ لیا جائے۔ مناسب یہی ہے کہ سیدھے سادے لفظوں میں صاف صاف دل کی بات کہہ دی جائے۔ کیونکہ مقالہ نگار نے بھی اپنے موضوع کے ساتھ انصاف کرتے ہوئے حق کو حق کہا ہے اور باطل کو باطل قرار دیا ہے، اور یہ بڑے حوصلے کی بات ہے جو حضرت علامہ اقبال کے مسلک کے عین مطابق ہے:

''کہتا ہوں وہی بات سمجھتا ہوں جسے حق''

فکرِ اقبال اب زمان و مکان کی حدود سے ماورئ 'للہ المشرق والمغرب' کے پیغام ربانی کی تفسیر بن کر دُنیائے انسانی کے لیے اس امر کی دعوت ہے کہ:

مشرق سے ہو بیزار نہ مغرب سے حذر کر
فطرت کا اشارہ ہے کہ ہر شب کو سحر کر

اس لیے اب اقالیم شرق وغرب میں اقبال کا کلام پھیل رہا ہے اور مشرق ومغرب کے دانش جُو اب اُن کے کلام کی طرف متوجہ ہیں۔ اقبال کا کلام اگرچہ فارسی اور اُردو میں ہے، مگر اس کا ترجمہ انگریزی سمیت دُنیا کی مختلف زبانوں میں ہو کر عالمِ انسانی کو دعوتِ خاص وعام دے رہا ہے۔

اقبال کے اُردو و فارسی کلام کے انگریزی تراجم کے سلسلے گذشتہ ایک صدی کی حدود سے آگے بڑھ کر نئی صدی میں داخل ہو چکے ہیں۔ ڈاکٹر عبدالغنی نے ۱۹۰۰ء سے ۱۹۹۹ء تک یعنی پوری ایک صدی کے انگریزی تراجم کا بے لاگ جائزہ لے کر فکرِ اقبال کے انگریزی خواں قارئین کی رہنمائی کا فریضہ انجام دیا ہے۔ یہ ایک بہت دشوار کام تھا۔ ذوالسانی بلکہ سہ لسانی مشکلات کو سر کرنے کے علاوہ

فکرِ اقبال کی صحیح ترجمانی کے لیے ان سب زبانوں پر ''ماہرانہ دسترس'' کی از بس ضرورت تھی ـــــ اور ڈاکٹر عبدالغنی ماشاء اللہ اُردو، فارسی، عربی اور انگریزی زبانوں پر عبور کے ساتھ ساتھ علم العروض (شرقی و غربی) کے بھی رمز شناس ہیں۔ یہی وجہ ہے کہ وہ اس مشکل ترین مرحلے میں کامیابی و کامرانی سے گزر سکے۔ مَیں اس کامیابی پر اُنھیں ہدیۂ تبریک پیش کرتا ہوں۔

پہلی بار جب میری اُن سے ملاقات ہوئی تو مجھے وہ ایک درویش صفت، صوفی منش انسان کے رُوپ میں سراپا عجز و انکسار کا پیکر نظر آئے۔ پھر رفتہ رفتہ اُن کے جوہر کُھلتے گئے اور قرائن سے مجھے اندازہ ہو گیا کہ پروفیسر صاحب نقشبندی طریقے کے ایک فعّال رُکن ہیں۔ گو مَیں ایک سیدھا سادا توحید پرست مسلمان ہوں، اَور کسی سلسلے سے وابستہ نہیں رہا۔ سب صوفیانہ طریقوں کا احترام کرتا ہوں۔ البتہ نقشبندیہ سلسلے کے بارے میں میرا یہ تاثر ہے کہ اقبالؒ نے ''سلطان ٹیپو شہید کی وصیّت'' میں جو یہ کہا ہے:

باطل دُوئی پسند ہے، حق لاشریک ہے
شرکت میانۂ حق و باطل نہ کر قبول

یہ وصیّت اسی سلسلے کے اکابر پر پوری اُترتی ہے۔ اور پروفیسر عبدالغنی کی تحریر و تقریر سے مجھے یہ اندازہ ہوا کہ اُن کے ہاں عجز و نیاز تو ہے، مگر وہ میانہ روی (Liberalism) نہیں جس میں حق و باطل کی تمیز ہی مشکوک ہو جائے۔ اُن کی اس تنقیدی کاوش میں بھی یہی صورت نمایاں ہے۔

مَیں اُمید کرتا ہوں، اور دُعا گو ہوں کہ ڈاکٹر عبدالغنی اپنے ایمان و ایقان، علم و فضل اور اپنی ان خداداد صلاحیتوں کے ساتھ اقبالیات کے سلسلے میں بیش از بیش اضافہ کرتے ہوئے تعمیرِ فکرِ انسانی کا فریضہ انجام دیتے رہیں گے، انشاء اللہ۔

[۴ صفر المظفر ۱۴۲۴ھ/ ۷۔اپریل ۲۰۰۳ء]

غلام حسین ذوالفقار

(پروفیسر، ڈاکٹر غلام حسین ذوالفقار)
ناظم بزمِ اقبال، لاہور

CONTENTS

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

I have never come across anyone, who has contributed more to the world of knowledge, than the author of this book. He is *Professor Doctor Abdul Ghani,* who was born in 1954 in Bhaun, a neighbouring town of Islamabad, in an Abbasi family. His reverent father, late Hazrat Maulana Muhammad Sadiq (May God Bestow Blessings Upon Him), was a well-known *Poet, Tabeeb & Researcher,* who got his education from Breli, India. The author is also a well-known religious scholar, famous spiritual researcher and preceptor, an accomplished poet of English, Urdu, Persian and Punjabi, and the Assistant Professor of English at a local College in Rawalpindi.

There are some persons who possess unique and extraordinary qualities by birth. This is a natural blessing from Almighty Allah. Such a solitary favour from the Creator of the worlds has come in the lot of Professor Dr. Abdul Ghani. Since childhood, he is distinguished in his love for the Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him). Moreover, it is his prolific intellect that distinguishes him from others. He has gained applaudable achievements in his educational, religious and spiritual fields. A glimpse of his educational excellence can be seen from the fact that he has obtained five degrees of M.A. in English (Literature), TEFL (Teaching English as a Foreign Language), Persian, Urdu, and History. He has also done M.Phil in Iqbaliat and has

acquired the honour of Ph.D in the same subject from Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad. All these degrees are featured with distinctions. He did his M.A. in Persian from NIML, Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad, in first class first, and thereupon he was awarded with free visa and a visit to Iran by the Iranian Government. He was also declared the best Persian Poet in Pakistan by the Iranian Government. Prior to his M.A. degrees, he also did his Matriculation, F.A & B.A with positions and distinctions in Boards and University.

After all the above grand achievements, Dr. Abdul Ghani did not put an end to his sincere efforts towards gaining and disseminating knowledge. In order to prove his sincerity with knowledge, he preferred to remain in the Professorial job despite doing his CSS with distinction. Another outstanding feature of his blessed life is that he is a true *Spiritualist*. He always gives priority to the practical aspects of spiritualism and imparts such knowledge and gives training to thousands of devotees. He is a true Sufi from Naqshbandi order. He also gives training in Chishti, Qadiri and Sohrwardi orders.

Dr. Abdul Ghani has also contributed books with the titles of "Mnemonics and the English Words" and "Allama Iqbal ki Farsi Nazmgoi". The former facilitates learning and retaining difficult and new English words in memory forever, while the latter presents the true place of Iqbal in

Persian poem-writing. He has also translated Iqbal's famous book "Asrar-i-Khudi" into English poetry, which is under print. He has also located and published the English translations of Iqbal's renowned poems "Shikwa" and "Jawab-i-Shikwa", which were made by Mahmood Ali Fyro; thus, he has saved a precious work from limbo of oblivion. His aptitude for research can be adjudged through the fact that he occupies an equal command over the English, Arabic, Persian and Urdu languages. He also owns a sizeable library containing about 40,000 invaluable and rare books, which, as he says, shall be utilized by him in his future research and academic projects.

In spiritualism, Dr. Abdul Ghani has a marvelous command over Meditation, Reiki (spiritual healing), Hypnosis, Advanced Hypnosis, Telepathy and Yoga. He is a true Reiki specialist and has attuned more than 600 people in Usui Reiki, who have been instructed to heal the ailing people.

Dr. Abdul Ghani started his research work on the thesis of Ph.D in November 1998 and completed it after his final interview on 28th November 2001. The Interview Committee of the University was chaired by Professor Najeeb A. Khan, Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, and comprised Professor Doctor Muhammad Siddique Khan Shibli, Chairman, Department of Iqbal Studies, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Professor

Doctor Ghulam Hussain Zulfiqar, Chairman Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore, Professor Doctor Muhammad Akram Shah, Chairman, Department of Iqbal Studies, Punjab University, Lahore and Professor Doctor Nissar Ahmad Qureshi, Chairman, Department of Urdu, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad. ***This Interview Committee declared his thesis as the best one*** and gave a unanimous recommendation for its publication.

Dr. Abdul Ghani has made an evaluative study of the English translations of Iqbal's poetry, covering a century, i.e. from 1901 up to 2000. His *thesis* titled as ***"An Evaluation of the English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry"*** was supervised by Professor Doctor Ghulam Hussain Zulfiqar. This thesis has been written in English and the semantic, artistic and linguistic strengths, and weaknesses of the translators have been brought to lime-light quite judiciously.

This book is a revised and somewhat amended version of his thesis. Its appearance may herald the dawn of a new era in the world of Iqbal.

Asad Mahmood Qazi
Assistant Legal Advisor,
Cabinet Division, FLC, Islamabad.

FOREWORD

By

Professor Dr. Muhammad Siddique Khan Shibli,

Chairman, The Department of Iqbal Studies,

Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad

The Book in view holds a mirror to complete 20th century of the English Translations of Iqbal's poetry, made by the orientalists and occidentalists. I feel pride in presenting this book and introducing its author to the enlightened world of Iqbal. Our University also feels honour in offering this invaluable research as a real national service, rendered by its research scholar, towards analyzing the works of the real and sincere translators of the great national poet, and those of the distortionists, fame hunters, plagiarists and hidden enemies.

Professor Doctor Abdul Ghani, the author, is a polyglot with a wonderful command over English, Persian, Urdu and Arabic languages - all equally important in understanding the elite like Iqbal. He is also well equipped with sound knowledge of philosophy, history, Islamic culture and literature, which is indispensable towards Iqbal Studies. A noticeable dimension is that of his creative brilliance and dexterous handling of the structural patterns of the languages he uses in his writing.

The pattern adopted by him is highly convincing. He clearly indicates the span of his research, and categorically considers the translations of Iqbal's Persian and Urdu books

separately; and in the cases of miscellaneous translations, appearing in journals and newspapers, he subdivides them according to the books concerned. First, he gives introduction to the translation, and then he proceeds to its technical and semantic aspects, highlighting its weaknesses and strengths, and making certain comparisons wherever necessary. Finally, he proffers an overall assessment of the translation and determines its place among other translations of that particular work. This sequencing generates a soothing impression. His reader, therefore, feels inner satisfaction while witnessing the logical coherence displayed by him, as he has facilitated subsequent research work for the researchers to come.

Dr. Abdul Ghani, as I know him, is very polite, sweet-tempered, tolerant and loving personality. However, as a researcher, I find him highly bold, extremely daring, strong and judicious in his critical judgments. It is, perhaps, due to his being a renowned ***Sufi*** in the Naqshbandi order, which does not spare even the kings if they commit wrong. He has judiciously and justifiably recommended the immediate confiscation of *six* books, which are slurs on Iqbal Studies. I fully agree with him in his conscientious verdict. These books must be confiscated to save Iqbal's actual message.

This book gives us to think that much more can be expected from its author. I pray for him a radiant future.

M. Siddique Khan Shibli,
AIOU, Islamabad.

PREFACE

Nothing is more consoling to me than paying my homage to the patrons of knowledge --- the members of the Admission Committee and the Board of Advanced Studies, at Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, who approved, without a single dissension, the topic 'An Evaluation of the English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry', and provided me with an opportunity to proffer my research of more than a decade to the esteemed lovers of Iqbal. Actually, two departed souls, Dr. Muhammad Riaz and Dr. Rahim Bakhsh Shaheen (may Allah bless them with the best of His blessings), were my first benefactors, who, initially, picked me up, out of a flux of students, for research on this demanding topic.

After the demise of these two scholars, within a limited span of time, my anxiety knew no bounds, but, luckily enough, I suddenly felt another gentle blow of vernal breeze, in the munificent spirit of their successor, Prof. Dr. Muhammad Siddiq Khan Shibli, on whose sincere proposal, the great Iqbalist and Quaidist, the outstanding elite and an ardent preacher of the ideology of Pakistan, Prof. Dr. Ghulam Hussain Zulfiqar, Chairman Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore, agreed to supervise my research. Thus, I established a filial bond with this great figure of the age. The nectar I acquired out of this fountain of knowledge is oozing throughout these pages.

This research covers the span of a complete century, from 1901 to 1999, that is, from the first to the latest English translation of Iqbal's poetry. An effort has been made, herein, to pay due attention to the most essential points, and not to squander time on the worthless material, which goes on creeping in from time to time. However, no perfidious translator has been allowed to escape. The loyals and the disloyals both have been brought to lime-light.

In the little research material, previously available on this subject, the artistic aspect of the poetic translations has been overlooked altogether. We have endeavoured to make up this deficiency, as we could, within the constraints of our time and space, commenting upon rhyme, rhythm and the creativity of the poet-translators.

Iqbal's text, used for referential purposes in this research paper, is that of 'Kulliyat-i-Iqbal' (Persian; 1990) and 'Kulliyat-i-Iqbal' (Urdu; 1989), published by Sheikh Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore. Some translations have been published along with comparative Urdu/Persian text, but, we have not relied upon them, because a number of mistakes have been observed even in their original text. So, we have adopted a uniform policy of referring only to Iqbal's standard texts.

The translations, initially published in some journal or a newspaper, but, subsequently, published as/in a book, have not been dealt with in the sections of journals and newspapers; instead, they have been discussed in the

sections of books. However, they have been included in the sections of journals and newspapers in the 'Bibliography'.

In the cases of the lists of words, phrases or hemistichs, we have used one reference number, and inserted their page numbers in their numerical order, in order to avoid excessive referencing.

It is our moral obligation to clarify a basic point that, in this research, we have not, at all, tried to be inimical to any translator. If, however, some misconception arises in the mind of any translator, or his follower, it may kindly be treated as the demand of justice on our part, or, else, a personal feeling on theirs.

I would like to mention, with a deep sense of pride, some of my dear ones, who have sincerely and devotedly co-operated with me in this project --- and always do so: Prof. Hasan Akhtar, my most respected friend and a prominent scholar of the English language and literature; my loyal, dedicated and sincere adopted-brother, Riaz Ahmad, and his team of composers --- Syed Sa'd Imam, Bilal Ahmad and Zulfiqar Ali; Khurram Arshad, a pious youth and my sincere follower, and his co-ordinators in proof-reading, photo-copying and binding etc. --- Abid Hussain, Muhammad Saeed Akhtar, Sultan Badshah, Muhammad Ikram and Muhammad Amir; my benefactors from Lahore, Muhammad Saleem, Muhammad Imran Malik of Bazm-i-Iqbal and Syed Shaukat Ali Shah of Iqbal Academy. May

Allah bless all these companions in this world and the world hereafter.

I am also especially grateful to my Principal, Prof. Abdul Latif, for his ideal co-operation during this research.

Abdul Ghani
Rawalpindi;
19 Sep, 2002.

INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION

In this research programme, we are going to evaluate the English translations of Iqbal's poetry. Before moving on to the actual process of this research, it seems quite pertinent to throw some light on a few fundamental concepts of translation, which may determine the proper course of our study:

Translation: What it is?

Translation is a linguistic activity, in which a translator endeavours to transfer the material of one language into another. The renowned linguist, J.C. Catford, has defined translation in these words:

The replacement of textual material in one language (SL -- Source Language) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL --- Target Language).[*1]

Translatability: a Language Universal:

Since translation is a bilingual process, the linguists have considered it a subject of Comparative Linguistics, in which common properties of different languages are studied. The properties common to all languages are called 'language universals'.[*2] Translatability has acceptedly been recognized as one of the language universals. Its degree may vary according to the richness, or otherwise, of a particular language, but, the fact that every language is translatable, is undeniable.

Living nations utilize the translatability of languages, and bring in, or send out, whichever is the best. Thus, they

perform the act of 'cross-cultural paraphrase', in Kenneth L. Pike's words.*3 Aristotle's 'Poetics', for instance, was originally written in the Greek language. From Greek, it was translated into Syriac, from Syriac into Arabic, from Arabic into Italian, from Italian into English and from English it has been rendered into Urdu.*4 This translingual travel of a book, through centuries, is an ample proof of the fact that classics are the best and imperishable ambassadors.

Inter-lingual Relationship:

The phenomenon of translation is greatly influenced by inter-lingual relationships. Languages, like human beings, are also bound in familial groups, encompassing cultures, religions and history. Peter Hobson has taken up the question of translation in the perspective of language variations, in an article, 'Translation: Problems and Methods'.*5 He points out four aspects of translation, with reference to different languages:

1- The simplest categories of translation are those, in which there is a coincidence of three factors:

(i) cultural background
(ii) language family
(iii) historical period

All the modern languages of Europe, e.g., English, French, Spanish and Italian etc., fall under this head. Arabic, Persian, Urdu and old Turkish are also of the same kind.

2- The next category, in order of simplicity, is where there is a coincidence of two factors:

(i) cultural background
(ii) historical period

But, in it the languages do not belong to the same family, as English and Hungarian, or Classical Arabic and Classical Persian.

3- The next category is, where there is a coincidence of cultural background, but not that of language family or historical background, e.g., Arabic, Bengali and Indonesian.

4- The area of the greatest difficulty is encountered, when there is lack of coincidence between all the three factors --- cultural background, language family and historical period, e.g., Chinese and Arabic, or English and any other Asian language.*6

Iqbal's poetry is in two Asian languages, Urdu and Persian. English is altogether different from these languages, in its cultural background, etymological history and language family. Our translators, therefore, of Iqbal in English stand in the fourth category mentioned above, which is the most problematic area of translation. Bearing this situation in mind, one can easily realize the difficulties of these translators. They can justifiably be regarded as the benefactors of the lovers of Iqbal's poetry.

Why Translate Iqbal?

Iqbal is a poet, a philosopher, a politician, a jurist and a religious reformer, all in one. His poetry is a reservoir of most of his ideas. With the promulgation of his ideas, therefore, various schools of thought have emerged, which interpret him in their own ways, none of them being negative: the dominant schools are:

1- Iqbal is the poet of Islam.
2- Iqbal is the poet of the East.
3- Iqbal is a progressive and revolutionary poet.

4- Iqbal is a poet-philosopher or a philosopher-poet.

5- Iqbal is a cosmopolitan (universal) poet.

This scholastic war of conflicting ideas may continue for an indefinite period, but, one fact is quite clear that Iqbal is all this. He must not remain within the lingual barriers of Urdu and Persian. His universal ideas must be globalized. The first, and the most important, step to globalize his ideas can be to translate his poetry into some global language. Out of all the modern languages, it is only English, which has emerged as a global language and lingua franca throughout the world community. Hence, translating Iqbal into English is an act of globalizing his message.

Some Problems in Translating Iqbal:

As stated above, English is a horizontally different language from Urdu and Persian. So, a translator is confronted with a number of problems, while translating into it:

1- The occidentalists, e.g., A.R. Tariq, A.A. Shah, Hadi Hussain and Maqbool Elahi etc., are at home in Urdu or Persian, but, they are not well-oriented in English. On the other hand, the orientalists, e.g., R.A. Nicholson and A.J. Arberry etc., possess a remarkable competence in English, but, at times, they fail to comprehend the linguistic delicacies of Urdu and Persian.

2- Poetic-translation is a controlled re-creation of a certain text into another language. The poet-translator endeavours to put into the rhyme scheme and rhythmic patterns of his target language what the original poet (Iqbal in our case) presents in his own language. He enjoys no liberty of thought as the original poet does.

3- Semantic subtleties, especially synonyms and cultural symbols, create a considerable difficulty in translation. Iqbal is no exception in this connection. His poetry is deep-rooted in the Islamic, Asian and contemporary transnational culture.

4- Iqbal's thoughts are deeply immersed in philosophy. Almost all the branches of philosophy interact into it. This specific feature of his poetry poses major problems for his translators.

Different Categories of the Translators:

In view of the seriousness or non-seriousness in translation, there can be various categories of Iqbal's translators into English:

1- Those who have done their works honestly and devotedly in the form of prose translations.
2- Those who are accomplished poets, and have re-created Iqbal's poetry nicely into English verse.
3- Those who are sincere in their effort, but, have nullified their own effort, while trying to become a poet-translator, without being a poet.
4- Those who have tried to translate, without having the required command of the source language, or the target language, or both.
5- Those who have made the translations of some selected verses, with a special negative or positive aim in their mind.
6- The distracted ones:
   (i) who plagiarize some translation from some corner in order to become famous through it.

(ii) who say something else capsuled in Iqbal's verses.

(iii) who use derogatory language to defame Iqbal, or fallacious lexis to distort his message.

(iv) who change the order and form of the original book, and give it a new shape of their own.

At this introductory stage, we are not going to place any one of the translators in any of these categories, nor should we do so, until our research proves something about someone. However, in order to prove the validity of this categorization, it would be quite relevant to give a suspensive statement that it is purely based upon our initial survey of the English translations of Iqbal's poetry; it is not a presumptive one.

The Previous Research:

The first translation of Iqbal's poetry was made by Iqbal himself in 1901. He translated his poem 'اشکِ خوں', which is an elegy written on the death of Queen Victoria, as 'Tear of Blood',[*7] and the latest one, as we could trace, is the recent edition of V.G. Kiernan's 'Poems from Iqbal', published in 1999.[*8] Thus, we have got a century of Iqbal's English translations in view. During this period, a number of successful and unsuccessful efforts have been made to translate Iqbal's poetic asset into English. But, unfortunately, no effort has been made, at Ph.D level, to evaluate these translations, to point out the pure from the rubbish. Some partial work, done in this area, is only upto the M.A. and M.Phil level. Here is a survey of it.

1- M.A. Level:

(i) Kalam-i-Iqbal Ke Manzoom Tarajim:

(The Poetic Translations of Iqbal's Poetry):
Thesis for M.A. (Urdu); written by Nausheen Sabahat; (the supervisor's name not mentioned); University of the Punjab, Lahore; 1982.

(ii) Abdur Rahman Tariq Bator-i-Iqbal Shanas:
(Abdur Rahman Tariq as an Iqbalist):
Thesis for M.A. (Urdu); written by Iqbal Bano; supervised by Dr. Rafi-ud-Din Hashimi, University of the Punjab, Lahore: 1991.

(iii) Kalam-i-Iqbal Ke Tarajim Ka Tauzihi Isharia:
(An Expository Index of the Translations of Iqbal's Poetry)
Thesis for M.A. (Urdu); written by Shazia Zaheer Khawaja; supervised by Dr. Rafi-ud-Din Hashimi; University of the Punjab, Lahore; 1991.

2- <u>M. Phil Level</u>:

(i) Pas Cheh Bayad Kard Aey Aqwam-i-Sharq Ma' Musafir Ke Urdu Aur Angrezi Mansoor Aur Manzoom Tarajim Ka Tahqiqi Aur Tauzihi Mutala'a:
(An Evaluative and Expository Study of the Urdu and English poetic and prose Translations of Pas Cheh Bayad Kard Aey Aqwam-i-Sharq Ma' Musafir):
Thesis for M. Phil (Iqbaliat); written by Muhammad Hameed Khokhar; supervised by Dr. Muhammad Riaz; Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad; 1993.

(ii) Payam-i-Mashriq Ke Urdu Aur Angrezi Tarajim Ka Tanqidi Mutala'a:
(A Critical Study of the Urdu and English Translations of Payam-i-Mashriq):
Thesis for M. Phil (Iqbaliat); written by A. Q. Navid Kiani; supervised by Dr. Muhammad Riaz; Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad; 1994.

(iii) Asrar-i-Khudi Ke Angrezi Tarajim Ka Tanqidi Mutala'a:
(A Critical Study of the English Translations of Asrar-i-Khudi):
Thesis for M. Phil (Iqbaliat); written by Shaukat Hussain; supervised by Dr. Muhammad Siddiq Khan Shibli; Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad; 2000.

This list indicates that only one translator, namely, A. R. Tariq, and the English translations of only three books, i.e., 'Pas Cheh Bayad Kard Aey Aqwam-i-Sharq Ma' Musafir', 'Payam-i-Mashriq' and 'Asrar-i-Khudi', have been critically studied so far. All the other translators and the English translations of the remaining books are yet to be evaluated.

Realizing a dire need for a panoramic and all-inclusive research on this subject, we have come forward, with the following objectives in view:

1- To have an overall surview of the English translations of Iqbal's poetry, from the first translation to the latest one.

2- To highlight the artistic qualities of the poetic translations, and to explore the re-creative ability of the poet-translators.

3- To sift out the pseudo-poetic substance from these translations.

4- To assess their lexical and semantic precision:
   (i) through discrete lexical items
   (ii) through syntactical structures
   (iii) through logical development of thought vis-a-vis Iqbal

5- To locate the incorrect translations of the individual words, cultural and religious terms and historical allusions etc.

6- To draw a line of distinction between the sincere translators and non-serious/over-serious ones, by identifying:
   (i) the fame hunters
   (ii) the plagiarists
   (iii) the distortionists
   (iv) the interpolators
   (v) the adversaries

7- To indicate the translators' predilection, if any, to some social, political or religious faction.

With these aims, our major focus will be on the translations published in book-forms. However, it will be our effort to accommodate the translations published in journals and newspapers.

REFERENCES

1. A Linguistic Theory of Translation; J.C. Catford; Oxford University Press, U.K.; 1965; P. 20
2. A Dictionary of Linguistics and Phonetics; David Crystal, Basil Blackwell, Britain; 1987; P. 321
3. Linguistic Concepts; Kenneth L. Pike; University of Nebraska Press, London; 1982; P. 131
4. Adopted from 'Fun-i-Tarjima Nagaari', by Khaliq Anjum, Samar Offset Printers, Delhi; 1995; P. 135
5. Included in 'Philosophy, Literature and Fine Arts', edited by Seyyed Hossein Nasr, King Abdul Aziz University, Jeddah; 1982; PP. 71-84
6. op cit; PP. 77-8; (abridged with slight variations)
7. Published by Mufid-i-Am Press, Lahore.
8. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.

PART ONE

THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL'S URDU POETRY

BANG-I-DARA

CALL OF THE MARCHING BELL

M.A.K. Khalil

Iqbal published his first Urdu collection of poetry, 'Bang-i-Dara', in September 1924, and its first complete English translation, 'Call of the Marching Bell', appeared in 1997.*1 The translator, M.A.K. Khalil, seems to have put in sincere efforts in his translation, as it is evident from his initial 58 pages of introduction to Iqbal's thought and art, with special reference to 'Bang-i-Dara', 5 appendices and the explanatory notes after the translation of every poem. He also gives an introduction to every poem before its translation.

The first impression that entangles a reader's attention is that of its form; whether it is a prose translation or a poetic one. The translator himself seems to be confused at this point, as he confesses in his own 'Preface', "Much though I had liked to make the translation in verse, I realized that the restraints of the rules of prosody would militate against a clear and faithful rendering of his thought in English. Clarity of the subject matter has been of paramount importance in my mind. Consequently I adopted the prose style."*2

Thus, he justifies his adoption of prose style in his translation. But, simultaneously, he seems to have been overawed by the spell of verse, and mentions his endeavour to create a poetic impression, "However, I have tried to keep the two hemistichs of every verse equal to each other as far as possible. Though at times this was a difficult task, I have succeeded in doing my best. I have also used the "free verse"

in some cases where rhyming was possible, without sacrificing clarity."*3

These two statements vividly indicate that the translator initially realized his inability in poetic rendering of 'Bang-i-Dara' and, therefore, adopted a prose style, but, during the course of his prose translation, he also made some experiments in free verse. Moreover, according to him, his free verse is a rhymed verse and his hemistichs are of equal length. Out of such antithetical claims, it could be inferred that the translator is at a loss in comprehending the difference between prose and free verse, and also between free verse and rhymed verse.*4 Due to this basic flaw, the translator spends most of his energies on:

1. equalising the length of his self-termed hemistichs
2. inserting rhyming words at the end of every line

Here is an example of how he does so:

> This perturbation of mine a means for fulfillment
> could be
> This torment a source of my intellectual
> illumination could be.*5

Obviously, these lines are not prose, as they have no syntax; nor are they poetry, as there is no rhythm in them. The translator is hanging somewhere in between. Ironically enough, such practice has been carried out throughout the whole book. At some stages, it grows unbearably irksome. For example, Iqbal's well known prayer, 'یارب دلِ مسلم کو وہ زندہ تمنا دے',*6 has been translated in a pattern that its every second hemistich ends with an imperative verb, 'grant'. Here are its first two couplets:

O Lord! To the Muslim's heart grant that live longing
Which may warm the heart, which may restlessness to the soul grant.
Again brighten up every speck of dust of the Valley of Faran
Again longing for the Spectacle, taste for the asking grant*7

A penetrative look into this semi-prose or pseudo-poetic style reveals to the keen reader that throughout the entire translation, the translator could not avoid the first language interference. Most of his syntactical structures are modelled on Urdu patterns. The above-mentioned poem, 'Du'a' (The Supplication), is an outstanding example of it. Let us take another example, and compare its original text with its translation:

تم بتا دو راز جو اس گنبدِ گرداں میں ہے
موت اک چبھتا ہوا کانٹا دلِ انساں میں ہے *8

Tell us what the secret under this rotating dome is
Death a pricking sharp thorn in the human breast is*9

It is quite clear that the Urdu syntactical order has been kept intact in its English rendering. However, in thirteen poems,*10 this first language interference is not observed. A major cause of this immediate rectification seems to be a fact that in the translation of these poems, M.A.K. Khalil has fully benefited from D.J. Matthews' translations of these poems.*11 He maintains Matthews' original syntax, but, in order to avert the charge of plagiarism, he makes some changes by

using synonyms or explanatory phrases. However, in some cases, he has not been successful in doing so, for example:

Matthews:

With crafty moves the capitalist has won the game.
In his extreme naivety, the labourer has been checkmated*[12]

Khalil:

The capitalist has won with deceitful stratagems
Due to extreme naivete the laborer is checkmated*[13]

To be more judicious, such borrowing does not sound grotesque, nor plagiarism in its true sense. It can be regarded as a refinement. So, the translator has proved to be more successful in the rendering of these thirteen poems as compared to the rest of his poems.

Another considerable aspect of this translation is that an excessive use of apostrophe has been made in it in most of the possessive compounds, e.g., night's alternation, sky's expanse, the mountain top's lightning, nature's hand, petal's tongue etc.*[14] The entire text is interspersed with such phrases. Though, this style does not affect the sense of the phrases, careful writers avoid the use of apostrophe, and use 'of' instead of it, as 'alternation of night', 'hand of nature' etc.

In the translations of pure Islamic terms or the Quranic verses, M.A.K. Khalil has employed transliteration instead of translation. He manages to explain all such terms and verses at the end of the translation of every poem separately. It is an acceptable style, as it introduces the Islamic terms in original form. He also transliterates the Urdu names of the poems

and, then, gives their English equivalents. In the text of the translations, all the transliterations are italicized. Perhaps, the translator has devoted much time to the art of transliteration.

M.A.K. Khalil uses the American English, and other than the American spellings, at times, he uses some of the words, which are markedly different from those of the British English. For example, he uses the word 'obligated' instead of 'obliged' wherever it is required. In 'Pathos of Love' (Dard-i-Ishq), he writes:

> Beware! You should not be striving for ostentation;
> You should not be obligated to the nightingale's lament.*15

After these general observations, let us be more specific, and note the points where the translator has completely failed to get the actual sense:

1- In 'A Mother's Dream' (Maan Ka Khaab), he translates a couplet as this:

> The separation from me makes you cry;
> Not least little good does this to me*16

The words 'not least little' obliterate the sentence.

2- In 'The Morning Sun' (Aftab-i-Subh), there is a couplet:

نور سے معمور ہو جاتا ہے دامانِ نظر
کھولتی ہے چشمِ ظاھر کو ضیا تیری مگر 17*

Here is its translation:

> Perception's expanse gets filled with light
> Though opens only the material eye your light*18

The word 'though' is irrelevant; why not 'but'?

3- In 'Pathos of Love' (Dard-i-Ishq), Iqbal apostrophizes love. In the tenth couplet; he says:

حیرت میں چھوڑ دیدۂ حکمت پسند کو *19

It has been translated as:

Let your wisdom-loving eye remain in
astonishment*20

The word 'your' destroys the entire sense, as it is not love's wisdom-loving eye that has to remain in astonishment, but, it is love itself that has to dispel the eye of those, who carry knowledge merely as an intellectual practice.

4- In the 'Mah-i-Noe' (The Crescent), there is a line, in which Iqbal likens the Crescent to a fish of raw-silver, swimming in the Nile:

نیل کے پانی میں یا مچھلی ہے سیم خام کی *21

M.A.K Khalil writes:

Or has the fragile cord in the Nile's waters
strolling?*22

It could be 'cod', not 'cord'. Likewise, the auxiliary verb 'has' has been used incorrectly. A far-fetched justification for its usage can be sought, if we consider the word 'strolling' as a noun.

5- In' Zuhd-o- Rindi' (Piety or Ecstasy), there is a couplet:

ہے اس کی طبیعت میں تشیّع بھی ذرا سا
تفضیلِ علیؓ ہم نے سنی اس کی زبانی *23

It has been translated as this:

He has accepted a little bit of Shiaism also
I have heard the greatness of Ali from him *24

The word 'greatness' is the translation of *'Tafzeel'*, which is a Shia creed, according to which Ali is considered to be superior to all other companions of the Prophet (Sm.). In this perspective, the word 'greatness' does not denote the actual creed. It should have been 'superiority' or 'preference'.

6- In the same poem, there is a couplet:

خم ہے سر تسلیم مرا آپ کے آگے
پیری ہے تواضع کے سبب میری جوانی 25*

M.A.K. Khalil has failed to understand the second line; he writes:

My youth is accustomed to <u>respect</u> for the old[*26]

The actual sense is that I have grown old due to humility.

7- The word 'دریا' has been translated as 'ocean' almost everywhere in the book, and does not sound so bad. But, in the poem 'Mauj-i-Darya' (The Ocean Wave), it is obviously incorrect. A river wave is desirous of rushing into ocean. If we call a river an ocean, the entire theme would be lost.

8- In the same poem (Mauj-i-Darya), the wave says:

خار ماہی سے نہ اٹکا کبھی دامن میرا 27*

It has been translated thus;

The <u>fishing tackle</u> has never caught my skirt.[*28]

A fishing tackle is an equipment used in fishing, and 'خار ماہی' is a kind of fish, called 'swordfish'.

9- In 'Tasweer-i-Dard' (The Portrait of Anguish), a hemistich reads as follows:

یہ شیریں بھی ہے گویا بیستوں بھی، کوہکن بھی ہے 29*

Its translation has been made as this:

It is Shirin, the sky, as well as the mountain digger.*30

The word 'بیستون' does not mean the sky. It is the name of the mountain, which was dug up by Farhad, Shirin's lover.

10- The last Persian couplet of 'Tasweer-i-Dard' is:

نمی گردید کوتہ رشتۂ معنی رہا کردم
حکایت بود بے پایاں بخاموشی ادا کردم *31

Here is how the translator takes it:

Take not this meaningful tale as related by me is;
The story was endless, but related with silence is*32

The actual translation of the first line is, 'The string of my thought could not be controlled, so I let it loose'.

11- In 'Kanar-i-Ravi' (On the Banks of the Ravi), Iqbal says about the ebb and flow of water:

پیام سجدہ کا یہ زیر و بم ہوا مجھ کو *33

M.A.K. Khalil says:

This became message of prostration's rise and fall to me*34

Iqbal talks about water's rise and fall, but, the translator talks about prostration's rise and fall.

12- In 'Iltija-i-Musafir' (The Traveller's Request), Iqbal says about Syed Mir Hasan:

وہ شمع بارگہِ خاندانِ مرتضوی *35

'Murtaza' is the title of Hazrat Ali, but, the translator attributes it to The Holy Prophet (Sm.) by saying:

That candle of the audience of the Holy Prophet's descendants*36

13- The poem 'Abdul Qadir ke Nam' (To Abdul Qadir) contains Iqbal's suggestions to his friend, Sir Abdul Qadir. One of those suggestions is:

رختِ جاں بت کدۂ چیں سے اُٹھا لیں اپنا
سب کو محوِ رُخِ سعدیٰ و سلیمیٰ کر دیں 37*

So'da and Sulaima are two famous beloveds, mentioned in Arabic literature. M.A.K. Khalil has changed So'da into Sa'di, a Persian poet. He writes:

> We should fascinate all with the face of Sa'di and Sulaima*38 & *39

14- In a Ghazal (No. 4), Iqbal says about God:

جو ہے بیدار انساں میں وہ گہری نیند سوتا ہے
شجر میں، پھول میں، حیواں میں، پتھر میں ستارے میں 40*

M.A.K. Khalil could not grasp the idea of awakening and sleep; he says:

> The real life in Man is pervading in everything;
> It is in tree, in flower, in animal, in stone, in star*41

The central idea of this couplet is that the One omnipresent spirit, which is awake in man, is dormant in the phenomenal world.

15- In another Ghazal (No. 6), Iqbal pays tribute to Mazzini, an Italian poet, which clearly indicates the translator's ignorance about Mazzini. He writes:

ہرے رہو وطنِ مازنی کے میدانو
جہاز پر سے تمہیں ہم سلام کرتے ہیں 42*

The translator, ignorant of Mazzini, calls 'وطن نازی' as Iqbal's own motherland:

> May the meadows of the <u>motherland</u> be ever flourishing,
> We are saluting you from the ship sailing away'*43

He also gives an explanatory note on it, "This expresses Allama Iqbal's patriotism at the time of his departure from India."*44

16- In the next Ghazal (No. 7), Iqbal talks to the dove in a couplet, and says about the cypress tree:

کہا جو قمری سے میں نے اک دن یہاں کے آزاد پا بگل ہیں *45

The term 'پا بگل' means 'fixed' or 'deep-rooted' in the soil. But, M.A.K. Khalil regards it as 'treading on dust':

> As I told the turtledove one day the free of here are <u>treading on dust</u>.*46

Obviously, trees do not tread. It is, however, interesting that the same translator provides us with an exquisite translation of the same term, in another couplet:

صنوبر باغ میں آزاد بھی ہے پا بگل بھی ہے *47

> The juniper in the garden is free as well as <u>chained to the soil</u>.*48

17- In the poem 'Do Sitaray' (The Two Stars), Iqbal has used an astronomical term *'queran'*, which means 'the constellation of two stars in the space':

آئے جو قِراں میں دو ستارے
کہنے لگا ایک دوسرے سے *49

M.A.K. Khalil takes it for the Holy Quran and says:

> As two stars came together in the <u>Holy Quran</u>,

One started saying this to the other*50

18- In 'Numud-i-Subh' (The Morning's Appearance), there is a couplet:

پا چکا فرصت درودِ فصلِ انجم سے سپہر
کشت خاور میں ہوا ہے آفتاب آئینہ کار *51

Here is M.A.K. Khalil:

The sky has completed benedictions for the star's crop
The sun has decorated the eastern horizon with mirrors*52

The word 'درودن' is a Persian infinitive, which means 'to harvest'. Thus the sense is quite clear that the sky has harvested the crop of the stars. M.A.K. Khalil takes the word for 'درود شریف', which is offered to the Holy Prophet (Sm.) in Islam. In the translation of the second hemistich as well, the translator seems to have misunderstood the word 'کار', which is an imperative of the Persian infinitive 'کاشتن', and has been placed after the word 'آئینہ' to form a compound subject 'آئینہ کار' which means 'the one who sows mirrors'.

19- M.A.K. Khalil has played havoc with a beautiful poem of Iqbal, 'Phul Ka Tohfa Ata Honay Par' (On Being Presented with a Flower). Iqbal says:

وہ مست ناز جو گلشن میں جا نکلتی ہے
کلی کلی کی زباں سے دعا نکلتی ہے
الٰہی پھولوں میں وہ انتخاب مجھ کو کرے
کلی سے رشکِ گلِ آفتاب مجھ کو کرے

تجھے وہ شاخ سے توڑیں، زہے نصیب ترے
تڑپتے رہ گئے گلزار میں رقیب ترے *53

The first couplet shows that Iqbal is talking about some feminine character; the second couplet contains the supplication of buds; the third couplet is Iqbal's salutation to the flower selected for presentation. Let us, now, see how M.A.K. Khalil takes it:

> When that exquisite beauty strolls into the garden
> Every single flower bud recites this supplication
> "O God! Out of all flowers he may he pick me
> From flower-bud into full flower he may turn me"
> He may pluck you from the branch! How lucky you are!
> Your rivals in the garden may flounce at you*54

In the first two couplets, 'she' has been changed into 'he', and in the third one, Iqbal's salutation has been turned into a prayer. Hence, the entire sense of the poem has been destroyed.

20- In 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' (The Response to the Complaint), Iqbal calls the black Muslims the pupils of the eyes of the world:

مردم چشم زمیں یعنی وہ کالی دنیا *55

But M.A.K. Khalil translates the word 'مردم' as people:

> The majority people, that is the non-white world*56

21- In 'Qurb-i-Sultan' (Closeness to King), a word 'سروش'

has been used, which means 'angel':

پیامِ مرشدِ شیراز بھی مگر سن لے
کہ ہے یہ سر نہاں خانۂ ضمیر سروش *57

The translator reads it as 'ضمیر فروش' and translates the couplet thus:

> However, listen to the message of the Saint of Shiraz also
> That this is the secret of the conscience seller's closet*58

22- In the poem 'Siddique', in a couplet, Iqbal mentions the things, which Hazrat Abu Bakr donated to the Holy Prophet (Sm.):

مِلکِ یمین و درہم و دینار و رخت و جنس *59

The term 'مِلکِ یمین' means 'slaves' or 'house maids', but, M.A.K. Khalil could not understand it. He gives just literal meanings of the term:

> All that right hand possessed, in cash, kind, chattel*60

23- In 'Firdose Main Ek Mukalama' (A Dialogue in Paradise), there is a hemistich:

دامن چراغِ مہ و اختر زدۂ باز *61

These are Sa'di's words for Hali that 'you have again put out the lamps of the moon and the stars'. M.A.K. Khalil translates 'باز' as a falcon:

> The falcon became companion of moon and stars' light*62

24- In 'Mein Aur Tu' (I and You), M.A.K. Khalil has failed to understand the following two couplets:

مرا عیش غم، مرا شہد سم، مری بود ہم نفس عدم
ترا دل حرم گرو عجم، ترا دیں خریدۂ کافری!
دم زندگی رم زندگی، غم زندگی سم زندگی
غم رم نہ کر، سم غم نہ کھا کہ یہی ہے شان قلندری! 63*

He says;

My grief is pleasure, my poison is honey, my existence is companion of annihilation
Your heart is Haram, captivated by the Ajam; your din has been purchased by infidelity!
Loss of life is its essence, concern for life is its poison
Do not be sad for loss, do not take grief's poison as this is the way of qalandari!*64

The actual translation of these couplets is:

My pleasure has turned into sorrow and my honey into poison; my life has degenerated into nothingness. The Ka'ba of your heart is captivated by Ajam; your *deen* is a sale item of infidelity. Every inhalation curtails life and worrying about life poisons it. Do not worry about rushing of life, nor take the poison of grief; This is what the qalandars do*65

25- In the translation of a line in 'Khizr-i-Rah' (The Guide), M.A.K. Khalil translates the word 'پری' as 'ferry' (a boat), instead of fairy:

تو سمجھتا ہے یہ آزادی کی ہے نیلم پری 66*

You consider it as the beautiful <u>ferry</u> of independence*67

Apart from these completely incorrect translations, the book has a considerable number of non-acceptable translations, the detail of which we cannot afford here. A short list of them, however, is given below: *68

1-	humour	شوخی
2-	waxing	کھا رہا ہے
3-	beloved	بے نیاز
4-	birds	چڑیوں
5-	audience	محفل
6-	material sight	مجاز
7-	rise and fall	گھٹتا بڑھتا
8-	bursting	پھوٹتا
9-	amorous	حسن فروش
10-	enigmatic	خفقانی
11-	ocean	دریا
12-	material beauties	حسینوں
13-	mist	حباب
14-	tavern	نگار خانہ
15-	habitation	شہر
16-	theology	لطفِ کلام

To sum up, it does not seem convenient to accept this translation as a standard one, since the translator has made an unpleasant blend of prose and poetry, and a number of his translations are completely incorrect. Only his hard work is appreciable.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Tayyab Iqbal Printers, Royal Park, Lahore.
2. Call of the Marching Bell; P. ix
3. Ibid, P. ix
4. Prose has no metre, therefore, no rhythm. Free verse has its rhythm, but no rhyme: unlike blank verse, its hemistichs are also of no equal length. Blank verse and free verse both have no rhymes. Rhymed verse has both rhythm and rhyme and a specific metric scheme. (For a detailed study, please consult 'The Poet's Dictionary'; by William Packard; Harper Perennial, New York; 1994; P. 75: or any other basic book on the English prosody)
5. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 69
6. Bang-i-Dara; P. 212
7. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 298
8. Bang-i-Dara; P. 40
9. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 87
10. Zuhd-o-Rindi; Tifl-i-Shirkhar; Tarana-i-Hindi; Nia Shiwala; Dagh; Kanar-i-Ravi; Ek Sham; Siqliyyah; Tarana-i-Milli; Shikwa; Walida Marhooma Ki Yaad Mein; Khizr-i-Rah; Tulu-i-Islam.
11. Published by Heritage Publishers, New Delhi in 1993, under the title 'Iqbal: A Selection of the Urdu Verse'.
12. Ibid; P. 69
13. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 352
14. Ibid; PP.66-67
15. Ibid; P. 105

16. Ibid; P. 83
17. Bang-i-Dara; P. 48
18. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 103
19. Bang-i-Dara; P. 51
20. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 105
21. Bang-i-Dara; P. 53
22. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 110
23. Bang-i-Dara; P. 59
24. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 118
25. Bang-i-Dara; P. 60
26. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 119
27. Bang-i-Dara; P. 62
28. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 123
29. Bang-i-Dara; P. 76
30. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 131
31. Bang-i-Dara; P. 76
32. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 131
33. Bang-i-Dara; P. 94
34. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 157
35. Bang-i-Dara; P. 97
36. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 159
37. Bang-i-Dara; P. 132
38. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 209
39. For So'da and Sulaima, please see 'Matalib-i-Bang-i-Dara', by Ghulam Rasul Mehr, published by Sh. Ghulam Ali and Sons, Lahore, 1991; P. 157
40. Bang-i-Dara; P. 138
41. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 219
42. Bang-i-Dara;139
43. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 221
44. Ibid; P. 222
45. Bang-i-Dara; P. 141
46. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 223
47. Bang-i-Dara; P.250
48. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 341

49. Bang-i-Dara; P. 148
50. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 231
51. Bang-i-Dara; P. 153
52. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 237
53. Bang-i-Dara; P. 158
54. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 242
55. Bang-i-Dara; P. 207
56. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 289
57. Bang-i-Dara; P. 210
58. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 295
59. Bang-i-Dara; P. 224
60. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 312
61. Bang-i-Dara; P. 245
62. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 334
63. Bang-i-Dara; P. 252
64. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 343
65. Adopted and translated into English from 'Matalib-i-Bang-i-Dara'; P. 303
66. Bang-i-Dara; P. 261
67. Call of the Marching Bell; P. 351
68. Ibid; PP. 1-71; 2-85; 3-97; 4-101; 5-105; 6-105; 7-110; 8-116; 9-118; 10-118; 11-123; 12-129; 13-155; 14-159; 15-175; 16-175

THE COMPLAINT AND THE ANSWER

Altaf Husain

The first, and perhaps yet unsurpassed, translation of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', titled as 'The Complaint and the Answer', appeared in 1943.[*1] The translator, Altaf Husain, enjoys a complete command over the English prosody, and has made two successful rhythmic experiments in the translation of the two poems. He translates Iqbal's six-lined stanza into twelve iambic tetrametric[*2] lines in 'The Complaint' and maintains the same rhythmic scheme throughout the poem. In 'The Answer', however, he keeps the first tetrametric lines intact, but changes the second lines into trimetric ones[*3] and, thus, creates a new scheme on the pattern of Coleridge's 'Rime of the Ancient Mariner'.

Altaf Husain is so punctilious about rhythm that he makes some changes even in the proper nouns by dropping some letters; for example;

1- Thrill over Afric's burning sands

2- Although the singer sings in Ind[*4]

The letters 'a' and 'ia' have been dropped from 'Africa' and 'India'.

At times, he introduces syllabic changes to achieve his rhythmic throb, e.g.;

1- While sons of Israel side by side

2- Qais is mad: what if he dwells[*5]

The word 'Israel' is trisyllabic (Is-ra-eel), but, in this line, one has to read it in a bisyllabic tone:

While sóns / of Ís / rael síde / by síde

The word 'Qais' is monosyllabic, but, here, one has to make it bisyllabic:

Qā ís/ ĭs mád/ whăt íf /hĕ dwells

The same innovation seems to have been made for the word 'Owais' in stanza No. xxi of 'The Complaint':

Qārán's / Ōwá / ĭs ánd / Sālmăn

In this condition, 'Owais' becomes a trisyllabic word.

Other than these syllabic omissions or additions, there are two lines, in which the translator could not retain his desired rhythm.

1- That ignorant men who lack the grace

2- You are known as Syed, and Mughal*6

In both the lines, one syllable each is additional, which breaks the rhythm. These pitfalls could be easily avoided, if we make the following minor changes:

1- That ignorant men with no grace

2- You're known as Syed and Mughal

Altaf Husain's choice of words seems to be inextricably connected with his aesthetic sense. For 'nightingale', for instance, he has used three words:

1- The plaintive notes of Philomel?

2- Lo, wingless soars the nightingale

3- A lonely Bulbul, all day long.*7

'Philomel' is a deep-rooted literary allusion. It is the name of an Athenian virgin, who according to the Greek mythology, was turned into a nightingale by the gods.*8 The word 'bulbul' (بلبل) , on the other end, is an Urdu word. It seems that the translator intends to bring this melodious word into the notice of the English readers. Another Urdu word 'Qafila'(قافلہ)has also been introduced by him:

The Qafila can ne'er disperse[*9]

'Qafila' is a trisyllabic word, 'Qa-fi-la', and the same is the case with the well-known word 'Caravan'. It is quite convincing to use the word 'Caravan' here, but, the translator's preference of the word 'Qafila' does carry some justification.

Keeping aside the poetic artistry, Altaf Husain is equally successful in conveying the message of Iqbal in precise diction. There are, however, some instances where he could not do justice:

1- In the translation of 'حرم' or 'کعبہ', he uses the word 'shrine':

(i) Thy holy Kaaba's hallowed shrine
(ii) Strange idols on its shrine!
(iii) My Kaaba's hallowed shrine[*10]

A 'shrine' is a place where some Prophet, some saint or some other holy figure is buried. No such concept is associated with the Kaaba at all.

2- For 'آتش کدہ', he uses the phrase 'fiery urn', as in this line:

The fiery urns of fair Iran[*11]

He could have used the actual term 'the fiery temple', without any loss of rhythm:

The fiery temple of Iran

'Urn' is a specific term used for the container of the ashes of the dead bodies.

3- For the Arab tradition 'حدی', in which a cameleer poetically addresses a camel, Altaf Husain has used the phrase 'hymn-reciting':

Of hymn-reciting camel-men[*12]

4- For 'حیدری فقر' , he uses the phrase 'Ali's empty bowl'.*13 In Islamic tradition, 'faqr' is a highly positive tribute, whereas, the emptiness of one's bowl means one's being a mendicant type of person. The translator could have used the words like 'contentment' or 'satisfaction' etc. or even the term *'faqr'*, which is to be introduced as the words 'yoga', 'reiki' or 'shamanism' etc.

Generally speaking, Altaf Husain has given us an exquisite piece of translation. It is really a recognizable poetic re-creation of Iqbal's two remarkable poems.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Orientalia, Lahore
2. Four feet, in which every foot has two syllables, first unstressed and the second stressed.
3. Having three feet.
4. Please see Sts. 6 and 31 in 'The Complaint'.
5. St. 5 (The Complaint) and St. 24 (The Answer)
6. St.16 (The Complaint) and St.17 (The Answer)
7. The Complaint; Sts. 1, 26 and 28
8. For a detailed study please consult 'Mythology', by Edith Hamilton; New American-library, New York; (publication date not given); PP. 270-71
9. The Answer; St. 28
10. St. 13 (The Complaint) and Sts. 7, 11 (The Answer)
11. The Complaint; St. 9
12. Ibid; St. 15
13. The Answer; St. 20

COMPLAINT AND ANSWER
A.J. Arberry

A.J. Arberry, a renowned orientalist, is the next translator of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa'. His translation, 'Complaint and Answer', appeared in 1955. Poetically, this translation can rightly be regarded as a masterpiece.

While Altaf Husain translates Iqbal's sestet[*1] into twelve lines, Arberry does so in six lines. Thus, he manages to retain Iqbal's pattern. However, keeping in view the poetic conventions of English, he alters Iqbal's rhyme scheme from ***aaaabb*** into ***ababcc***.

Arberry has paid special attention to rhythm in his effort to translate. He creates heptametric lines.[*2] Every line contains a dactylic foot,[*3] followed by six iambic feet.[*4] Caesura[*5] falls after the first three feet (a dactylic + two iambic feet). Though, such pattern is very rare even in the English poetry, Arberry's choice seems to be quite relevant, because in adopting such pattern, he conveys the sense in single line what Altaf Husain was compelled to put in two lines. Here is the scansion of the first line:

Whỳ mūst Ī fōr é/vēr súf/fēr lóss/ōb lí/vī óus/tō
gáin.

Iqbal's lines in 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' comprise four feet, 'فعلاتن، فعلاتن، فعلاتن، فعلن/فعلات', and have been composed in '*ramal* 'رمل'' metre.[*6] It means that Arberry says in seven feet what Iqbal says in four feet, or, to be more meticulous, if we count even the syllables, the 4/7 ratio of feet would turn out to be 11/15, for example:

Iqbal:

کیوں۔ زیاں۔ کا۔ رب۔ نوں۔ سو۔ دف۔ راں۔ مو۔ ش۔ر۔ہوں *(11 syllables)*

Arberry: Why – must - I- for – e – ver – suf – fer – loss – ob – li – vi- ous – to - gain *(15 syllables)*

This artistic detail leads us to infer that this imbalance in feet or syllables must have some effect on translation, wherein the translator would be under a constraint to insert some redundant words in order to meet the requirement of his metre. Here, in Arberry's case, the addition of three feet, or four to five syllables, means an addition of one to, may be, four or five words. Let us see it through an example:

Iqbal:

ہے بجا شیوۂ تسلیم میں مشہور ہیں ہم

قصۂ درد سناتے ہیں کہ مجبور ہیں ہم *7

Arberry:

True, we are forever famous for our habit to submit.
Yet we tell our tale of grief, as by our grief we are constrained.*8

Let us, now, point out the redundancies through a verbal comparison:

Line No. 1:

a. Exact translation

true	ہے بجا
habit to submit	شیوۂ تسلیم
famous for	میں مشہور
we are	ہیں ہم

b. Redundant words:

forever, our

c. Comment: There might be some justification for 'our', but, 'forever' serves no semantic purpose.

Line No. 2:

a. Exact translation:

tale of grief قصۂ درد
we tell سناتے ہیں
as کہ
we are constrained مجبور ہیں ہم

b. Redundant words:

yet, our, by, our grief

c. Comment: The first 'our' may be justifiable, but, 'yet' and 'by our grief' are of no use here, except rhythm.

This analysis indicates that there are seven redundant words in a single couplet. Although, through poetic artistry, Arberry manages to conceal his redundancies, yet, sensible readers can easily locate his fill-in-the-blanks.

As far as the standard of the translation is concerned, a basic fact must be borne in mind that Arberry did not know Urdu, as it is evident from the 'Preface' to his book:

> .... the publishers, Sheikh Muhammad Ashraf, most kindly procured for him a literal rendering of the originals into English prose, ably executed by Mr. Mazherudin Siddiqi *9

Thus, Arberry's rendering is an indirect one. Here are some of his flaws in getting the actual sense:

1- Iqbal:

کلمہ پڑھتے تھے ہم چھاؤں میں تلواروں کی *10

Arberry:

In the shadow of our glinting swords, we

shouted, "God is One"![*11]

The shouters were the Muslims, but, the swords were those of their enemies. So, 'our' is incorrect.

2- Iqbal:

تیغ کیا چیز ہے؟ ہم توپ سے لڑ جاتے تھے [12*]

Arberry:

Then we hurled us on their cannons, took their
Swordpoints but for play.[*13]

The personal pronoun 'us' seems very queer.

3- Iqbal:

ہے خوشی ان کو کہ کعبے کے نگہبان گئے [14*]

Arberry:

Jubilant to see the guardians of the Kaaba's
shrine depart;[*15]

'Kaaba' is not a 'shrine'. Moreover, there was no need of the possessive compound 'the Kaaba's shrine', which might create a confusion that shrine is a part of the Kaaba.

4- Iqbal:

رسمِ سلمانؓ و اویسؓ قرنی کو چھوڑا؟ [16*]

Arberry:

Did we quit the path of Salman, cease from
Qarani to learn?[*17]

Dr. Muhammad Riaz has realized a considerable aspect regarding this line. He writes, " 'Qarani' refers to Uwais Qarani, but elimination of the name may not be properly understood by the Western readers."[*18]

5- Iqbal:

تیرے دیوانے بھی ہیں منتظر ھو بیٹھے [19*]

Arberry:

Dream, Thy lovers, of Thy coming, and the cry of

"He, the King"! *20

Perhaps, Arberry has failed to comprehend both the syntax of the line and the sense of the word 'هو'. It is not God, here, who is awaited. The consoling voice 'هو' is awaited, which is not a cry.

6- Iqbal:

آسماں چیر گیا نالۂ بیباک مرا *21

Arberry:

That the very walls of heaven fell down before its wild lament.*22

Iqbal is talking about piercing the sky, while Arberry is felling the walls. Does the sky have any wall?

7- Iqbal:

تا سرِ عرش بھی انساں کی تگ و تاز ہے کیا؟ *23

Arberry:

Shall a mortal man aspire in our high firmament to sit? *24

There is no word in Iqbal's line, which means 'to sit', rather, the phrase 'تگ و تاز' means 'to be vehement and hectic', which is quite opposite to sitting.

8- Iqbal:

قیس زحمت کشِ تنہائیِ صحرا نہ رہے *25

Arberry:

Qais, if so he pleases, may endure the desert's solitude.*26

It is unintelligible as to why Arberry has overlooked the idea of 'نہ' (not) in this line.

To wind up, Arberry's artistic grandeur is beyond any doubt, but, some of his translations are not agreeable due to

religious or cultural background. His redundancies also invite a special notice.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Sestet is a stanza form having six lines.
2. Lines of seven feet each.
3. A dactylic foot is a trisyllabic foot, in which the first syllable is stressed and the next two are unstressed, as 'take her up/tenderly'.
4. An iambic foot is a bisyllabic foot, in which an unstressed syllable is followed by a stressed one, as,

   The cúr / few tólls / the knéll / of pár / ting dáy
5. The poetic pause meant for facilitating the rhythmic reading of a line.
6. For further detail, please consult 'Auzaan-i-Iqbal', by Abu-al-Ijaz Hafeez Siddiqui, Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore, 1983, pages 78-80
7. Bang-i-Dara; P. 163
8. Complaint and Answer; P. 3
9. Ibid; P. vi
10. Bang-i-Dara; P. 164
11. Complaint and Answer; P. 6
12. Bang-i-Dara; P. 165
13. Complaint and Answer; P. 7
14. Bang-i-Dara; P. 166
15. Complaint and Answer; P. 11
16. Bang-i-Dara; P. 168
17. Complaint and Answer; P. 15
18. The Journal 'Iqbal'; Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore; January 1984; P. 75
19. Bang-i-Dara; P. 169
20. Complaint and Answer; P. 18
21. Bang-i-Dara; P. 199
22. Complaint and Answer; P. 24
23. Bang-i-Dara; P. 199
24. Complaint and Answer; P. 25

25. Bang-i-Dara; P. 204
26. Complaint and Answer; P. 37

COMPLAINT AND ANSWER

Khushwant Singh

Khushwant Singh's bilingual translation of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' was first published in 1981, under the title of 'Complaint and Answer'.[*1] K. Sing gives Iqbal's Urdu text, followed by its English and Hindi translations. Obviously, here we are concerned with only the English translation.

The first impression of this translation is that K. Singh has made a futile effort to imitate A.J. Arberry, but, ironically enough, he became the predecessor of M.A.K. Khalil in giving a pseudo-poetic version. His prose lines are rhymed at the end, having a rhyme scheme of *aa bb cc*. It is, however, his merit that his rhyming scarcely affects the cohesion in the lines.

K. Singh is not a poet, and in his effort to impose his self-made poesy, he has distorted the text of Arberry's poetically excellent translation. Let us have a look at the first two lines of the two translators. Here are Arberry's heptametric lines:

> Why must I forever suffer loss, oblivious to gain,
> We think not upon the morrow, drowned in grief for yesterday.[*2]

And here is K. Singh with no rhythm:

> Why must I forever lose, forever forgo profit that is my due,
> Sunk in the gloom of evenings past, no plans for the morrow pursue.[*3]

It looks that K. Singh paraphrases Arberry's text, and inserts rhymes at the end of the lines in order to create a poetic impression.

In his pseudo-poetic frame, K. Singh has served a relatively simple and fluent translation. At some stages, however, he has failed to convey the actual sense:

1- Iqbal:

ہم کو جمعیت خاطر یہ پریشانی تھی
ورنہ امت ترے محبوبؐ کی دیوانی تھی؟ *4

K. Singh:

We Your people were dispersed, no solace could we find,
Or, would Your Beloved's following have gone out of its mind?*5

Actually, in the preceding couplet, Iqbal was talking about the spreading of the fragrance of Tauheed through the Muslim Ummah, which spread like air to bring this fragrance everywhere. This spreading was a source of solace to them. K. Singh conveys a completely opposite sense, by saying, "no solace could we find." Moreover, there is no agreement of sense between the two lines.

2- Iqbal:

کلمہ پڑھتے تھے ہم چھاؤں میں تلواروں کی *6

K. Singh:

Under the shades of glittering sabres Your creed we proclaimed.*7

'Creed' is "a short statement of religious belief, esp. the formal statement of Christian belief said at certain church services."*8 It is also "a system of beliefs and principles."*9

'Kalima' is a specific Islamic term with specified wording, *'La Ilaha Illallah'*. So, 'creed' is its misleading translation.

3- An Urdu word, 'mehfil', has been used in three lines:*10

i. Your mehfil is dissolved ....

ii. ..... Your burning cheeks set the entire mehfil aflame.

iii. You are no longer the spirit of the mehfil .....

There seems to be no justification in using a word for which a large number of words are available in English.*11

4- Iqbal:

اے خوش آں روز کہ آئی وبصد ناز آئی

بے حجابانہ سوئے محفلِ ما باز آئی! *12

K. Singh:

O happy day, return a hundred times with all
Your grace!
Drop Your veil and let us gaze upon your lovely
face.*13

The translation of this couplet shows that K. Singh could not differentiate between imperative form of the sentence and future tense, nor did he study even Arberry properly, who is very much clear about it:

Joyous day, when Thou returnest in Thy beauty
and grace
And unbashfully revealst to our gathering Thy
Face.*14

5- Iqbal:

حیدری فقر ہے، نے دولتِ عثمانی ہے *15

K. Singh:

You take neither Ali's pledge of poverty, nor

Osman's path of wealth pursue;*16

'Pledge of poverty' can, by no means, be the correct translation of ' فقر ', which is a greatest human attribute in Islam, and which is a combination of kingship and humility.

6- Iqbal:

یہ جہاں چیز ہے کیا لوح و قلم تیرے ہیں 17*

K. Singh:

What is this miserable world? To write the
world's history, pen and tablet we offer you.*18

The translator seems to be unaware of the Islamic terms 'لوح و قلم'

To sum up, this pseudo-poetic translation is a futile effort to imitate A.J. Arberry. Unluckily, this effort could not be that successful and turned out to be just a rhymed paraphrase of Arberry's sublime poems. The standard of the translation is overall acceptable, yet, it has got no special aspect worth-mentioning.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Oxford University Press, Delhi.
2. Complaint and Answer; P. 3
3. Ibid; P. 28
4. Bang-i-Dara; P. 163
5. Complaint and Answer; P. 30
6. Bang-i-Dara; P. 164
7. Complaint and Answer; P. 33
8. Please consult 'Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English; by Paul Procter; Longman, London; P. 260
9. Ibid
10. Complaint and Answer; PP. 46, 50, 51

11. Consult, if required, 'Roget's Thesaurus'; by Peter Mark Roget; Oxford IBH Publishing Company, New Delhi; 1978; Heading 74 — assemblage.
12. Bang-i-Dara; P. 169
13. Complaint and Answer; P. 51
14. Complaint and Answer (Arberry); P. 17
15. Bang-i-Dara; P. 204
16. Complaint and Answer; P. 80
17. Bang-i-Dara; P. 208
18. Complaint and Answer; P. 96

REMONSTRANCE AND THE RESPONSE TO THE REMONSTRANCE

Mahmood Ali Khan Tyro

After Altaf Husain and A.J. Arberry's invaluable poetic translations of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', Nawab Mahmood Ali Khan Tyro's translation, 'Remonstrance and the Response to the Remonstrance',*1 is another sincere and valid effort in versified translation of these poems. The matter, which was translated in double lines (12 lines for 6) by Altaf Husain, and long heptametric lines by A.J. Arberry, has been quite successfully rendered by Tyro line for line in iambic pentameter, with a rhyme scheme of ***ababcc***.

The translator is well acquainted with the poetic art and has created elegant rhythmic patterns during the course of this translation. Out of a total of 402 lines, there are only 5 lines wherein there seems to be a lapse of rhythm;

1- Should I be a loser, reckless of the gain?
2- Lived here the Jewish folk and the Christian band,
3- Dislodged the gate of Khaiber who? Speak!
4- Left stage the camel-chanters in dire plight!
5- Thy need is to the assembly of existence.

A smooth syllabic reading of these lines, according to the iambic pentametric rhythm, does create problems: but, if we combine one or two syllables to meet the requirement of the metre, we can easily overcome or change the stress. No doubt, this subtle approach demands a poetic taste. Let us scan the first line in both the forms, first, with common syllables, and second, with altered syllables:

1- Should I / be a / lo ser / reck less / of the / gain.
Should I / be a lo / ser reck / less of / the gain.

In the first line, 'gain' is an additional word/syllable, which breaks the rhythm. In the second line 'be' and 'a' are combined in a monosyllabic sound and, thus, rhythm has been created. In the remaining four lines the following considerations can rectify the rhythm.

2- 'and' and 'the' should be combined, as:
Lived here/the Jew/ish folk/and the Chris/tion band

3- 'Dislodged the' should be read in dactylic foot as 'Dis- lodged-the' , followed by three iambic metres, as:
Dislodged the/gate of/Khai ber/who speak/

4- 'Dire' should be read as a monosyllabic word, as:
Left stage/ the ca/ mel chan/ ters in/ dire plight/

5- 'need' should be combined with 'is', as 'need's ', and 'to' and 'the' should be made one syllable:
Thy need's/ to the as/sem bly/ of ex/ is tence/

This artistic discussion removes the possible charge of lack of rhythm in these lines. It seems that Tyro has tried his best to grasp Iqbal's poetic reverberation in English. To a great extent, he has succeeded in his effort, as his 'Foreword' writer, S. Sirajuddin, writes:

> It is true Tyro's language is somewhat old-fashioned and archaic, deliberately so perhaps, and his syntax rather involved with too many inversions, it is true too that there are occasional grammatical lapses and phrasal inaccuracies or inadequacies, yet, despite all

this, what is praise-worthy is the attempt in his translation to recapture the volume and flow of Iqbal's rhetoric and the drum-beat of his stanzas ...*3

What S. Sirajuddin regards as 'grammatical lapses and phrasal inaccuracies or inadequacies' is, perhaps, a corollary of the poetic constraints, which necessitate changes in prose-style syntax. S. Sirajuddin has not pointed out any grammatical or phrasal flaw, which could have been seen through in the light of rules. Tyro's archaism, however, is evident; but, it is not a draw-back.

There are, however, some imprecise translations, as below:*4

1- call	تکبیر
2- murky oceans	بحرِ ظلمات
3- lightening	برق
4- hoories	حور
5- ubiquitous	ہر جائی
6- Hyacinth	نرگس

The word 'call' may be correct, but, it does not convey the clear sense of 'Takbeer'. 'Ubiquitous' means 'omnipresent'; thus, it is a positive word, not suitable for 'ہرجائی', which is used for fickle ones. 'Lightening' and 'hoories' have been misspelled, the actual spellings being 'lightning' and 'houries'. 'Hyacinth' is a plant, known as *'sumbul'* in Urdu/Persian; it is not narcissus.

A more inconvenient translation is that of a hemistich:

تیرے دیوانے بھی ہیں منتظرِ ھو بیٹھے *5

Tyro translates it as:

For an incentive lovers Thine look on thee."[6]

The word 'هو' is a well-known recitational word in Islamic Sufism. From Tyro's translation of this line, one can get no idea of 'Hoo'.

Overall, Tyro's translation is really an invaluable attempt in the field of translation. He ranks with Altaf Husain and Arberry, and, at times, surpasses them due to his brevity and precision.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Hyderabad; (date of publication not given).
2. Remonstrance; Sts. 1, 5, 9, 15
   Response to the Remonstrance; St. 31
3. Remonstrance and Response to the Remonstrance; Foreword (2nd page).
4. Ibid; Please see the Sts. 10, 12, 14, 16, 22, 30. (Remonstrance)
5. Bang-i-Dara; P. 169
6. Remonstrance and Response to the Remonstrance; St. 25

REPRESENTATION AND REPLY

Sultan Zahur Akhtar

The latest translation of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' is 'Representation and Reply' (1998).*1 The translator is Raja Sultan Zahur Akhtar, the son of Raja Hasan Akhtar, who was Iqbal's well- known companion. A special feature of this book is that the translator has given a complete transliteration of the Urdu text of the two poems, along with the Urdu script. Thus, in this book, three texts are simultaneously available to the reader:

1- The Original Urdu Text
2- The transliterated text
3- The translated text

Just as K. Singh tried to imitate Arberry in his translation, Zahur Akhtar has followed the style of Altaf Husain. Like Altaf Husain, he translates Iqbal's sestet into twelve lines, and even reproduces Altaf's words as well as rhymes. But, at the same time, he replaces Altaf's words with suitable (sometimes unsuitable) synonyms, in order to remove the spell of imitation. This parallelism goes on throughout the book. Let us see their first stanzas:

Altaf:

Why should I choose the loser's role?
Forbear to seek what gain I may?
Nor think of what the morrow holds,
But brood o' er woes of yesterday?

Why should my ears enraptured hear
The plaintive notes of Philomel?
O fellow-bard! A rose am I

To lose me in sweet music's swell?

For I too have the gift of song
Which gives me courage to complain,
But ah! 'tis none but God Himself
Whom I, in sorrow, must arraign! *2

Zahur:

Why should I suffer loss,
And abstain to quest what avail I may?
Nor image of what tomorrow retains,
And despond over sorrows of yesterday?

Why should my ears entrenched hear,
The doleful cries of the nightingales?
O fellow-bard! a posy am I,
To loose me in sweet music's dilate?

For I too have the gift of note,
Which gives me mettle to complain.
But alas! it is Creator Himself,
To whom in gloom I must explain.*3

Obviously, both the texts are twelve-lined, with a similar rhyme scheme and a major portion of common diction. However, Zahur Akhtar makes some changes in words, and, thus, in most of the cases, ruins the rhythm. All the lines in Altaf Husain's text are iambic tetrametric ones, but, Zahur Akhtar's text has no consistent rhythmic pattern. Let us try to scan his first four lines:

W̄hy shóuld/ Ī súf/fēr lóss — 3 - feet
Ān̄d áb/stāin tó/qūest whát/ā váil/Ī máy? — 5 - feet
Nōr í/m̄age óf/w̄hat tó/mōr rów/rē táins — 5 - feet

And dés/pond o/ver sór/rows óf/yes tér/day 5½ feet

Having such a deplorable inconsistency in rhythm, such a text cannot be regarded as poetry. We have made an effort to apply iambic metre to these lines, as it seems to be the only nearly applicable metre. Actually, it is an imposed scansion. The translator seems to have no knowledge of the English prosody.

Apart from this lack of the knowledge of prosody, there are some other noticeable aspects of this translation:

1- In the translation of the last couplet of the stanza No. 27, the translator commits an unforgivable error:

Iqbal:

جوے خوں می چکد از حسرت دیرینۂ ما
می تپد نالہ بہ نشتر کدۂ سینۂ ما 4*

Zahur:

My Heart's cravings are unfulfilled
Constantly the life blood drain;
My bosom is dagger gashed,
Strive hard with the cry of pain.*5

In the second line, the subject of the verb 'drain' needs some clarifying word for its subject. Is it the lifeblood that drains out, or it is the heart's cravings, which drain the blood out? In the last two lines the subject is 'my bosom', which is third person singular, but the verb 'strive' does not agree with it. It should have been 'strives'.

In the translation of the very first line of 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', he commits the same error:

Passion, streaming from the heart
Never fail to have effect.*6

The verb 'fail' does not agree with the subject, 'passion'.

A similar error is yet in another translation:

Only on the abodes of poor Muslims
Your fury, like the lightning fall.*7

He has used 'fall' instead of 'falls'.

2- In the translation of the same first stanza of 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', he reverses the order of the hemistichs of Iqbal:

Iqbal:

دل سے جو بات نکلتی ہے اثر رکھتی ہے
پر نہیں، طاقتِ پرواز مگر رکھتی ہے
قدسی الاصل ہے، رفعت پہ نظر رکھتی ہے
خاک سے اٹھتی ہے، گردوں پہ گزر رکھتی ہے *8

Zahur:

Passion, streaming from the heart
Never fail to have effect.
But no! Blessed is its origin,
On heights its locus is set;
Though they have no wings,
Yet have power to fly,
And though from dust it rises,
Yet pierces through the sky.*9

Thus, the order of translation is 1, 3, 2, 4. Moreover, the insertion of the pronoun 'they' has created a confusion, which cannot be removed, as, in the second last line, he again uses the pronoun 'it'.

3- In the stanza No. 26 of 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', there is a line:

کوکب غنچہ سے شاخیں ہیں چمکنے والی *10

Zahur translates it as:

...... soon the branches will be gay

With buds, with and beaming bright.*11

It is quite difficult to understand the second line, perhaps, due to the omission of the word 'star' between 'with' and 'beaming'. This might be a printing omission, as in the translation, some other words have also been misspelled, as:

Page 6	:	wether	weather
Page 12	:	warriers	warriors
Page 56	:	jingle	jangle
Page 68	:	parlays	parleys
Page 76	:	in not	is not

In any case, such errors are not justifiable at any stage.

4- At some stages, Zahur has used improper, rather incorrect, words, e.g.:*12

(i) But then no breeze its aroma stretch

(ii) Thouself ordered to go!

(iii) Some time to us, at time to others

Breeze spreads its aroma, does not stretch it. 'Thouself' has never been used in English. 'Some time' and 'at time' should have been 'sometimes' and 'at times'.

Likewise, he is not clear in some other words:*13

1- oceans	بحرِ ظلمات
2- Ka'aba's shrine	کعبہ
3- Trillions	ہزاروں
4- hiss songster	زمزمہ پرداز

'بحرِ ظلمات' is Atlantic Ocean. Ka'ba is not a shrine. 'ہزاروں' means 'thousands', not trillions. 'Hissing' is never used for singing; it is snake that hisses.

To conclude, the study of this translation indicates that despite his hard effort, Zahur could present nothing special due to his artistic and linguistic impediments.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. The Complaint and the Answer; St. I
3. Representation and Reply; P. 2
4. Bang-i-Dara; P. 169
5. Representation and Reply; P. 54
6. Ibid; P. 66
7. Ibid; P. 28
8. Bang-i-Dara; P. 199
9. Representation and Reply; P. 66
10. Bang-i-Dara; P. 205
11. Representation and Reply; P. 116
12. Ibid; PP. 6, 38, 44
13. Ibid; PP. 24, 26, 46 and 56

TWO NON-SERIOUS TRANSLATIONS

Some other translations of 'Bang-i-Dara' have been made by different translators, and have been included in miscellaneous collections. We shall discuss those translations in the Part-III of this thesis, under 'Miscellaneous English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry', as it is necessary to discuss a certain book in complete form, in order to have an acute assessment of it.

Here, it seems quite pertinent to mention two translations of 'Bang-i-Dara', which are too non-serious to be accepted:

1-Allama Doctor Iqbal's 'Baang-i-Dara'

This translation of some selected poems of 'Bang-i-Dara' has been made by Muhammad Sadiq Khan Satti.*1 On the title page of the book, the translator calls it a poetic translation of the Part-I of 'Bang-i-Dara', but, ironically enough, it is neither poetry, except some ill-adjusted pseudo-rhymes, nor the translation of the Part-I of 'Bang-i-Dara'.

The Part-I of 'Bang-i-Dara' contains 49 poems and 13 ghazals. The translator has rendered only 34 poems and 8 ghazals into English.*2 Thus, he leaves out 15 poems and 5 ghazals, without giving any justification.*3

In this collection, 5 other poems, 4 from the Part-II and 1 from the Part-III, have been included.*4 It is unintelligible as to why the translator considers these poems as those of the Part-I.

A highly appalling aspect of this translation is the disorder, in which the work has been done. All the

translations are haphazard and random, clearly revealing the translator's aimlessness.

In the translation of the ghazals, he is unpardonably non-serious, or, may be, over-serious. He combines various couplets of two ghazals, gives this combination a self coined title and, thus, creates a poem of his own. For example, he takes the ghazal No. 1 and 3 couplets from the ghazal No. 2 and, then, combines them, under the title of 'Love'.*5 Likewise, under the next title, 'Man', he combines the remaining 3 couplets of the ghazal No. 2, and 3 couplets of the ghazal No. 3.*6 Similarly, he has played havoc with the ghazal No. 9, which contains 18 couplets. He has left out the first couplet. The remaining 17 couplets have been converted into two poems of 10 and 7 couplets respectively, under the titles of 'Life's Truth' and 'The Human Heart'.*7

Another irksome aspect of this work is that the translator has included a poem of his own in Iqbal's poems.*8 This poem and the 'Preface' to the book indicate the translator's hypochondriac nature, which, as he himself mentions in the 'Preface', was the result of his imprisonment, due to Rawalpindi Conspiracy Case, and his subsequent removal from military service. It seems that, under the guise of the translation of 'Bang-i-Dara', he has to say something personal, which, otherwise, he would have never been able to convey safely. Thus, this book is more of a self-exposure than a translation of Iqbal.

If some critic turns out to be kind enough to evaluate the substance of this translation, he would not be able to designate it more than a practice in translation, replete with personal relapses.

2- Allama Muhammad Iqbal's Expostulation with the Almighty and Almighty's Censure

The second non-serious translation is Suleman Zubair's translation of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', under the title of 'Allama Muhammad Iqbal's Expostulation with the Almighty and Almighty's Censure'.*9 Orthographically, linguistically, grammatically and poetically, in all respects, this translation is a miserable failure. It is really shocking as to why a prestigious institution; like Iqbal Academy, has selected and published such a worthless book. In the translation of a total of 402 lines, there are more than one hundred spelling mistakes. Please see a list of these mistakes in 'Notes and References'.*10

The translator calls his work 'a poetic rendering', and attempts at writing in poetic diction, but, the more he tries to do so, the more ridiculous his work grows:

1- Without being a poet, he tries to drag rhymes into his lines. Where he fails to do so, he writes the same rhyme in both the hemistichs. At a number of places, he has left the couplets unrhymed. Thus, his so-called verse is neither blank verse, nor rhymed verse.

2- In order to create a poetic impression, the translator tries to apply inversion*11 in adjectival compounds, formed by possessive adjectives*12 everywhere in the translation. In most of the other adjectival compounds as well, he does the same practice. Moreover, he is so possessed of the use of inversion that he has nullified his own task of translation by this deluge of inversions.

3- Other than false rhyming and superfluous inversions, he has committed gross mistakes in the use of the

poetic auxiliary verb 'art' (are). The poets use it only with the personal pronoun 'thou', but, Suleman Zubair has used it in every place, with only a few exceptions, where the word 'are' was required.

4- A very strong impression a reader gets out of the reading of this translation is that, perhaps, the translator does not know Urdu, as required; he just guesses the sense and in doing so, he commits blunders. Let us for example, analyze just one stanza:

تھی تو موجود ازل سے ہی تری ذاتِ قدیم
پھول تھا زیبِ چمن، پر نہ پریشاں تھی شمیم
شرط انصاف ہے اے صاحبِ الطافِ عمیم
بوئے گل پھیلتی کس طرح جو ہوتی نہ نسیم؟
ہم کو جمعیتِ خاطر یہ پریشانی تھی
ورنہ اُمت ترے محبوبؐ کی دیوانی تھی؟ 13*

Suleman Zubair translates it as this:

Spirit Thine is omnipotent & omnipresent right from eternity,
Nilofars bloom in meadows with breezes' continuity.
Let judgement thine unruffled be, Oh! Ye Lord of power immense,
How could necter disseminate without the breezes essence,
For the nations, sake we carried out a struggle so very incessant,

Adored we Thy Prophet so much that called were we fanatic.*14

It looks that the translator is groping in the dark. In the first line, Iqbal says 'تھی' but, it has been rendered as 'is'. The word *'qadeem'* (قدیم), a purely philosophical term, opposite of *'hadith'* (حادث), has been misunderstood. The second line simply means that the beautiful flower of Tauheed was there in the garden, but, its fragrance was unspread. The translator's words, here, convey no sense. In the third line, Iqbal talks about God's boundless blessings, but, the translator talks of God's powers. In the fourth line, the translator has inserted the word 'necter', instead of 'fragrance'. In the last two lines, Iqbal says that it was the spreading of the fragrance of Tauheed, which encouraged us to bear such hardships, otherwise, the Holy Prophet's Ummah was not so mad to undergo such ordeals. The translator utterly mishandles the sense and, through people, calls the Ummah really mad.

This is a short analysis of only one stanza. Almost all the stanzas have been massacred in the same way. At times, he grows so vulgar that one desires to throw the book off, and no more waste even a single moment on it. For example, in the second-last stanza of 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', Iqbal says how the Muslim world benefits out of the name of the Holy Prophet (Sm.):

تپش اندوز ہے اس نام سے پارے کی طرح
غوطہ زن نور میں ہے آنکھ کے تارے کی طرح 15*

Suleman Zubair:

Like mercury doth this Name fresh sensations &

preceptions creates,
It's tender flame like a <u>woman</u> glows & images of stars it creates.'[16]

The translator does not know even the meanings of 'غوطہ زن'. He separates the word 'زن', and translates it as 'woman', without caring even a pin for what Iqbal intends to say. The entire translation is replete with such bogus translations.

The only judicious treatment to this translation, therefore, can be to confiscate it without delay, and produce its corrected and revised version, if required at all.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Ferozsons, Rawalpindi; 1984
2. The poems translated:
   48, 6, 19, 16, 15, 30, 1, 2, 7, 3, 4, 5, 8, 11, 14, 13, 18, 9, 7, 20, 21, 22, 23, 28, 24, 25, 36, 29, 12, 10, 38, 43, 45, 41
   The ghazals translated:
   1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9
3. The poems not translated:
   26, 27, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 37, 39, 40, 42, 44, 46, 47, 49
   Ghazals not translated:
   8, 10, 11, 12, 13
4. Part II: Poems translated: 96, 62, 59, 56
   Part III: Poem translated: 70
5. op cit; P. 55
6. Ibid; P. 56
7. Ibid; PP. 60-61
8. Please see the poem 'Portrait of Agony' on page 41
9. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1997
10. Here is a stanza-wise detail of these mistakes:

Expostulation

(i)	commorade	(comrade)
	quite	(quiet)
	verile	(virile)
(ii)	we doth	(we do)
	t'is	(tis)
	vicregents	(viceregents)
(iii)	nations, sake	(nation's sake)
	necter	(nectar)
(iv)	horizions	(horizons)
	t'is	(tis)
	t'was	(twas)
(v)	to up held	(to uphold)
(viii)	embeded	(embedded)
	sabers	(sabres)
(ix)	Ceaser	(Caesar)
(xi)	devotes	(devotees)
	soverign	(sovereign)
	antiqueted	(antiquated)
(xii)	embeded	(embedded)
(xiii)	deciet	(deceit)
	art we	(are we)
(xiv)	posses	(possess)
	elevalts	(elevates)
(xv)	cameliers	(cameleers)
(xvi)	remainth	(remains)
(xvii)	art Muslims	(are Muslims)
	oppulence	(opulence)
	enroute	(en route)
	thats	(that's)
(xviii)	haven	(heaven)
	we'v quit	(we'v quitted)
	t'is	(tis)
(xix)	snacthing	(snatching)
	discreen	(discern)

(xx)	infuration	(infuriation)
	adherants	(adherents)
(xxi)	bossom	(bosom)
	frevour	(fervour)
(xxiii)	demanour	(demeanour)
	frevour	(fervour)
(xxiv)	shakles	(shackles)
	hearths	(hearts)
(xxv)	revelary	(revelry)
(xxvi)	leadth	(lead)
	reachth	(reach)
	fleat	(fleet)
(xxix)	fiolage	(foliage)
(xxx)	discreen	(discern)
	percieve	(perceive)

Censure

(i)	doth they	(do they)
	michevious	(mischievous)
(ii)	celectial	(celestial)
	tw'as	(twas)
	tw'as	(twas)
	t'is	(tis)
(iii)	could'nt	(couldn't)
	posses	(possess)
	blasphmeous	(blasphemous)
	posses	(possess)
(iv)	grevious	(grievous)
	t's	(tis)
	ar'nt	(aren't)
	t's	(tis)
	hav'nt	(havn't)
(v)	grevious	(grievous)
	reverabted	(reverberated)
	ti's	(tis)

(vi)	T'is	(tis)
	t'is	(tis)
(vii)	prepostourous	(prepostrous)
	t's	(tis)
(viii)	steel	(steal)
(ix)	resiprocal	(reciprocal)
(x)	profitering	(profiteering)
(xi)	eclisped	(eclipsed)
	embeded	(embedded)
	raptoursly	(rapturously)
	fathers fore	(forefathers)
(xiv)	hearts yours art	(your hearts are)
(xv)	t's	(tis)
	weath	(wealth)
(xvi)	philosphy	(philosophy)
(xvii)	asuredly	(assuredly)
(xviii)	embeded	(embedded)
(xx)	demanor	(demeanour)
(xxi)	boisterious	(boisterous)
	gallantary	(gallantry)
(xxii)	sucidal	(suicidal)
	faternity	(fraternity)
	martydom	(martyrdom)
	boistorious	(boisterous)
(xxiii)	idolarious	(idolatrous)
(xxiv)	virtious	(virtuous)
	impartive	(imperative)
	barg	(brag)
(xxvi)	horizion	(horizon)
(xxvii)	autnums	(autumns)
	berefit	(bereft)
(xxviii)	Yousoof	(Yusuf)
(xxix)	annihiliated	(annihilated)
(xxx)	buggle	(bugle)
	to analyzes	(to analyze)

(xxxii) mumering (murmuring)
(xxxiii) faternity (fraternity)
(xxxiv) embeded (embedded)
(xxxv) It's (its)
(xxxvi) vicregent (viceregent)

11. 'Inversion' is a departure from normal word order, common in poetry.
12. Possessive adjectives are the adjectives formed by possessive pronouns (my, our, your, his, him, its, their etc.). They are also called determinative possessive pronouns. Please see NTC's Dictionary of Grammar Terminology, by Richard A. Spears, Published by NTC Publishing Group, USA; 1998; P. 56
13. Bang-i-Dara; P. 163
14. Expostulation; St. III
15. Bang-i-Dara; P. 207
16. Censure; St. xxxv

BAL-I-JIBRIL

GABRIEL'S WING

Syed Akbar Ali Shah

'Bal-i-Jibril' was first published in 1935. It contains 77 ghazals, 41 quatrains and 63 poems. The first serious attempt at its translation was made by Syed Akbar Ali Shah, who translated all the 77 ghazals of this book, under the title of 'Gabriel's Wing' in 1979.*1 This translation, perhaps the only serious effort in 'Bal-i-Jibril's' translation, is a considerable one for its command of language, dexterity in the art of verse and lucidity of expression.

An immediate impression one gets out of the reading of A.A. Shah's translation is that the translator possesses a remarkable command of the English language, both lexical and grammatical. The translator displays an appreciable awareness of the difference between prose and poetic diction. Here is an example of it:

O Lord hearken to my woeful wail,
Though it may move or it may fail,
This bold and unfettered wight
Begs Thee not to do the right.*2

Here are the prose counterparts of the poetic words in this stanza:

hearken	listen
wail	weeping
wight	man
Thee	you

The entire translation is replete with poetic words, such as, bard (poet), clime (climate), firmament (sky), meads (meadows), founds (foundations), betwixt (between), oft

(often), perchance (by chance), smart (pain) etc. The usage of these specialized poetic words speaks of the translator's deep study of the English poetry and his keenness for observance of rhythm through the choice of befitting words.

A.A. Shah's choice of words is subservient to his choice of metre. He has experimented with the lines, ranging from trimetric upto hexametric ones. In most of his translations, he employs iambic metre, and also makes variations, wherever necessary, by using dactylic metre. Let us cast an analytic look upon his rhythmic patterns:

1- In 9 ghazals, he uses iambic trimeter,[*3] i.e., three feet, one unstressed and one stressed each, e.g.:

How can / the stars / foretell
What fu / ture holds / in store?
They roam / perplex'd / and mean
In skies / that know / no shore.[*4]

2- In 9 ghazals, he uses iambic tetrameter[*5], i.e., four iambic feet, in every first and the third line and, iambic trimeter in the second and the fourth line, e.g. :

The pain / ted dolls / of pre / sent age
At seats / of lear / ning taught
Have not / infi / del's charm / or mould
Of i / dols A / zar wrought.[*6]

3- In 48 ghazals, all of his lines have been composed in iambic tetrameter,[*7] e.g. :

Houris / and an / gels all / alike
My soar / ing thought / can keep / in hold.
The moulds / in which / Thou dost / reveal
Get ruf / fled by / my glan / ces bold.[*8]

4- In 9 ghazals, iambic pentameter has been used,[*9] e.g.:

> Pāss róund / ōnce móre / thē bówl / ōf wíne / O Sáqi,
> Ī máy / āttáin / trūe pláce / ōf míne / O Saqi.[*10]

5- In 2 ghazals, the translator has used iambic hexameter,[*11] i.e., six iambic feet, e.g. :

> Āt Lón / dōn wín / tēr wínd / līke swórd / wās bí / tīng thó'ugh,
> Mȳ wónt / tō ríse / āt eár / lȳ mórn / Ī dídn't / fōrgó.[*12]

These are the five general rhythmic patterns adopted by A.A. Shah, but, during the course of translation, he makes some variations. At times, he places a dactylic foot in the beginning of an iambic line to create an emphatic tone, and, at times, he adds, or, omits a foot in a line. However, these variations sound quite suitable and enhance the overall effect of his rhythm. Evidently, he is an expert in creating nice musical patterns in his work.

Now, we turn to the nature of his translations. Out of a total of 77 ghazals, he has translated only 13 ghazals line for line.[*13] Out of these 13 ghazals, 8 are in iambic pentameter. It means that he is prone to using this metre in line for line translation. These eight translations are highly reverberating, precise and free of redundancy. The same is the case with three other line for line translations.[*14] Iambic tetrameter has been employed in these ghazals, as Iqbal has also composed these ghazals in shorter hemistichs. There seems to be a pleasant balance between the original and the translation. The remaining two ghazals are in iambic hexameter.[*15] In the

first one [3(1)], the translator seems to be confused in grasping the accuracy in rhythm, but, in the second one (17), he achieves an acute sense of this particular rhythm, and successfully fabricates the hexametric texture of the ghazal. Generally viewing, these line for line translations are convincing, due to their accuracy in conveying the essence of Iqbal's thought.

In the rest of the 64 poems, A.A. Shah has translated every couplet into four lines. The very first impression a reader gets from such translations is that of redundancy. A.A. Shah seems to be well conscious of this possibility, as in this duplication of lines, from two to four, the translator is compelled to add some superfluous words in order to meet his poetic requirement. A.A. Shah cautiously handles this problem in a number of ways:

1- He uses synonymous words, along with the original translation of a single word, and joins them through the conjunction 'and'. Let us take an example from the very first ghazal:

گرچہ ہے میری جستجو دیر و حرم کی نقشبند

میری فغاں سے رستخیز کعبہ و سومنات میں! 16*

In my search and quest for Thee
Cloisters and Kirks I did design,
But my groans and woeful wails
Can shake the founds of Fane and Shrine.*17

In this stanza two words have two synonymous translations each:

search and quest	جستجو	(i)
groans and woeful wails	فغاں	(ii)

It is further noticeable that in case of the second word 'fughan', the translator has added an adjectival phrase, 'woeful wails', instead of a single synonym.

2- Other than the use of synonyms, A.A. Shah adds prepositional phrases to fill in the blanks. Let us see the translation of a couplet of the same ghazal:

تو نے یہ کیا غضب کیا! مجھ کو بھی فاش کر دیا

میں ہی تو ایک راز تھا سینۂ کائنات میں! *18

I was the only secret veil'd
In Nature's Womb, in Latent form:
When I was brought to light for show,
What wondrous act Thou didst perform!*19

In these lines, 'in latent form' and 'for show' are superfluous words, meant only for equalizing the length of the hemistichs.

3- Another skill employed by A.A. Shah is the use of apposition. He brings some words or phrases, which explain their antecedents, e.g. :

کانٹا وہ دے کہ جس کی کھٹک لازوال ہو

یا رب وہ درد جس کی کسک لازوال ہو *20

A thorn within my breast infix
To make me feel its prods and pricks:
I pray Thee, Lord, to me impart
A ceaseless pain, an endless smart.*21

The words, 'Lord' in the third line and 'an endless smart' in the fourth, explain their antecedents 'Thee' and 'pain': thus, these are appositional words.

In addition to synonyms, prepositional phrases and appositions, A.A. Shah has inserted many adverbial phrases and short co-ordinate and subordinate clauses, as the situation demands. The purpose of these additions is, obviously, to elucidate the sense and maintaining the rhythmic framework of the translation.

A.A. Shah is very successful in transporting the meaning from Urdu into English. But, despite his utmost care, there are some flaws in his understanding Iqbal's text:

1- In ghazal 10 (1), there is a couplet:

ترے آزاد بندوں کی نہ یہ دنیا، نہ وہ دنیا

یہاں مرنے کی پابندی، وہاں جینے کی پابندی [*22]

A.A. Shah translates it as this:

How can this life or life to come
A lover's heart enslave?
An endless life must pinch him here
And there the fear of grave.[*23]

The words 'here' and 'there', in the third and fourth line, would have been 'there' and 'here' respectively.

2- In ghazal 3 (1), there is a line:

یا مجھے ہمکنار کر یا مجھے بیکنار کر! [*24]

A.A. Shah translates it as following:

Make me the Ocean Strong and let my waters in
You fall.[*25]

The word 'and' has been used instead of 'or'. A similar mistake is observable in the fifth couplet of the same ghazal, where he has inserted 'though' in place of 'if':

اقبال : نغمۂ نوبہار اگر میرے نصیب میں نہ ہو

اس دمِ نیم سوز کو طائرکِ بہار کر! [26*]

A.A. Shah:

<u>Though</u> fated not to share the joys of spring,
Let this birdie mute and dumb the Advent of April sing.[*27]

3- In ghazal No. 4 (1), there is a couplet:

یہ مشتِ خاک، یہ صرصر، یہ وسعتِ افلاک

کرم ہے یا کہ ستم، تیری لذتِ ایجاد! [28*]

The term 'وسعتِ افلاک' has been rendered incorrectly:

Thou hast put this speck of dust
Midst deep abyss and raging gust:
Is Thine fondness for creation
An act of mercy or oppression?[*29]

4- In four cases, the translator has overlooked the literal meanings of the words used by Iqbal:[*30]

(i) Mars مشتری

(ii) charm اکسیر

(iii) brain گلو

(iv) wolfish tricks روباہی

These words are too simple to create any lexical or artistic problem. In these cases, there seems to be just an overlook. A.A. Shah is an M.A. in Persian as well. It seems almost impossible for a man of such a vast erudition to commit such childish errors.

5- In the seventy seven ghazals in view, Iqbal has used the word 'حرم' fourteen times, and 'کعبہ' twice – sixteen times in total. A.A. Shah has translated this word in a number of ways. Here is an analysis of it:

(i)	Kirk[*31]	1
(ii)	Fane[*32]	1
(iii)	Kaaba[*33]	1
(iv)	House of God[*34]	1
(v)	Sanctuary[*35]	1
(vi)	Shrine[*36]	10

(vii) In the translation of the first couplet of the ghazal No. 38, the word 'حرم' has been left untranslated.

The word 'Kirk' is a completely incorrect word for 'Haram', as A.A. Shah himself annotates, it is a 'Scotch equivalent for church'.[*37] Obviously, 'Haram' is not a church. The words 'fane', 'house of God' and 'sanctuary' do convey the sense of some holy place, but, even these words cannot denote the actual status of 'The Kaaba'. The word 'shrine' also is imprecise, as usually a shrine is known for human association, i.e., a place famous for being a living place or a burial place of some saint. It is, therefore, more relevant to use only the words 'Haram' or 'Kaaba' for this central holy place of the Muslims. An expert poet can easily make necessary rhythmic adjustments to accommodate these terms.

Generally speaking, A.A. Shah's translation is a highly commendable effort. He seems quite serious and sincere in his effort, therefore, deserves special notice.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Modern Book Depot, Islamabad
2. Gabriel's Wing ; P.7
3. Ghazals No.: 3 (2), 6 (2), 9 (2), 24, 26, 33, 36, 40, 50. The figure 2 in brackets indicates that the ghazal in view has been taken from the second part of the ghazals. Iqbal started the book with the ghazal No. 1, but after the ghazal No. 16, he renumbered the next ghazals, starting from 1 upto 61. Thus the ghazals 1 upto 16 have been doubly numbered. For our own convenience, we have indicated their numbers and, then, within brackets, their first or second Part.
4. Gabriel's Wing; P.45
5. Ghazals No.: 2 (1), 10 (1), 11 (1), 21, 22, 35, 48, 49, 51.
6. Gabriel's Wing; P.21
7. Ghazals No.: 1 (1), 4 (1), 5 (1), 6 (1), 9 (1), 12 (1), 13 (1), 14 (1), 15 (1), 16 (1), 1 (2), 2 (2), 4 (2), 5 (2), 7 (2), 8 (2), 10 (2), 11 (2), 12 (2), 14 (2), 15 (2), 16 (2), 18, 19, 20, 25, 27, 29, 31, 32, 34, 37, 38, 39, 41, 42, 45, 46, 47, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60.
8. Gabriel's Wing; P.1
9. Ghazals No.: 7 (1), 8 (1), 13 (2), 23, 28, 30, 43, 44, 61.
10. Gabriel's Wing; P.15
11. Ghazals No.: 3 (1), 17.
12. Gabriel's Wing; P.73
13. Ghazals No.: 3 (1), 8(1), 13(2), 17, 20, 23, 28, 30, 37, 43, 44, 52, 61.
14. Ghazals No.: 20, 37, 52.
15. Ghazals No.: 3 (1) and 17.
16. Bal-i-Jibril: Sh. Ghulam Ali and Sons, Lahore: 1989; P.5
17. Gabriel's Wing; P.1
18. Bal-i-Jibril; P.5
19. Gabriel's Wing; P.1
20. Bal-i-Jibril; P.9
21. Gabriel's Wing; P.10
22. Bal-i-Jibril; P.14
23. Gabriel's Wing; P.19
24. Bal-i-Jibril; P.7

25. Gabriel's Wing; P.5
26. Bal-i-Jibril; P.7
27. Gabriel's Wing; P.5
28. Bal-i-Jibril; P.8
29. Gabriel's Wing; P.7
30. Ibid; PP. 27, 39, 92, 133.
31. Ibid; P.1
32. Ibid
33. Ibid; P. 26
34. Ibid; P. 57
35. Ibid; P. 104
36. Ibid; PP. 13, 38, 99, 103, 116, 121, 124, 133, 147, 159
37. Ibid; P. 2

BAAL-I-JIBREEL

Naim Siddiqui

An apparently complete, but actually fallacious, translation of 'Bal-i-Jibril' appeared in 1996, under the title of 'Baal-i-Jibreel'.*1 The translator, Naim Siddiqui, has left 278 couplets untranslated, out of a total of 1165 couplets of 'Bal-i-Jibril'. Here is its detail:

1- Out of 77 ghazals in total, he leaves out ghazals No. 1 (Part I), 12 (Part II), 49, 51, 52, 54, 60 and 61: 8 ghazals in all, containing 40 couplets.

2- Out of 39 quatrains in the book, he leaves out quatrains No. 7 and 36, i.e., 4 couplets.

3- Out of a total of 59 longer and shorter poems, he leaves out 27 poems, having 129 couplets.*2

4- He has also left 105 miscellaneous couplets untranslated at different places.*3

As, throughout the book, Naim Siddiqui has given no justification for these omissions, it can be inferred that he did the task of translation indiscriminately. This remark is strengthened, when we look at the order of the translated ghazals, quatrains and poems. Here is a survey of it:

1- Iqbal has written 77 ghazals in two parts; 1 to 16 ghazals in the part 1 and, then, 1 to 61 ghazals in the part 2. Naim Siddiqui combines both the parts, and gives them his own continuous numbers (1 to 69), without indicating the 8 untranslated ghazals.

2- Iqbal writes his first quatrain on page 6, the second on page 9 and the rest of them have been placed together on pages 80 to 90 (39 in total). Naim Siddiqui re-orders them

thus: 1, 2, 3, (quatrains on the pages 6 and 9 interpolated here), 8, 4, 5, (a qat'a from page 170 interpolated), 6, 12, 10, 11, 9, 13, 15, 16, 18, 14, 17, 23, 22, 20, 19, 21, 26, 24, 27, 25, 28, 33, 30, 31, 29, 32, 34, 35, 37, 38, 39.*4

3- There are 4 qat'as in 'Bal-i-Jibril'; one on page 79, one on page 90 and two on page 170. Naim Siddiqui plays havoc with them as well. He creates a self-titled heading, 'Stanzas', and, then, puts together a poem, 'Khudi'(خودی), and the first qat'a of page 79.*5 The remaining three qat'as, i.e., those on the pages 90 (one) and 170 (two), have been converted into quatrains, and translated under that head.*6

4- In the translation of the 32 poems, selected out of 59, Iqbal's actual order has been neglected. From poem No. 1, 'Dua' to the last one, 'Chiunti Aur Uqab' (چیونٹی اور عقاب), Naim Siddiqui's order is thus: 44, 27, 46, 1, 2, 5, 6, 8, 9, 11, 28, 12, 13, 14, 16, 17, 38, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 29, 26, 30, 31, 47, 52, 53.

This haphazard re-shaping of the entire book, and indiscriminate discarding of about one fourth of it's substance, is by no means justifiable. The translator seems to be utterly immersed in his personal likings and dislikings, or making a tentative attempt at translation. An immediate and dominant impression about this translation is that Naim Siddiqui seems to discard whatever he feels difficult to translate, as he has nowhere vindicated his selection of the verses and their re-arrangement.

To come to the quality of his translation, at many places, Naim Siddiqui has failed to grasp Iqbal's sense:

1- In ghazal No. 12 (Part I), Iqbal writes:

نہ چھین لذت آہ سحر گہی مجھ سے

نہ کر نگاہ سے تغافل کو التفات آمیز *7

Naim writes:

Take not from me the pleasure of sighs at dawn,
And cloud not with neglect Thy eye of grace.*8

Iqbal wants his Beloved not to lessen the pleasure produced by His indifference, by mixing it with attentive look, but Naim Siddiqui, contrarily, asks the Beloved not to be indifferent, but to give an attentive look.

2- In the ghazal No. 16 (Part I), Iqbal plaintively says to God:

تو برگ گیاہے نہ دہی اہلِ خرد را

او کشت گل و لالہ بہ بخشد بہ خرے چند *9

Naim translates it thus:

<u>One man</u> gives not a straw to men of wisdom;
<u>Another</u> bestows on donkeys gardens of roses.*10

This translation seems to indicate that the translator does not even know the difference between ' تو ' (you) and' او ' (he). This lack of understanding might be due to his lack of the knowledge of the Persian language.

3- In the ghazal No. 3 (Part II), Iqbal points out a paradox in the divine system:

عجب مزا ہے مجھے لذتِ خودی دے کر

وہ چاہتے ہیں کہ میں اپنے آپ میں نہ رہوں *11

This simply means that it is enjoyable that, despite making me overconscious of myself through Ego, my God wants me to be unconscious of myself. Here is Naim Siddiqui's nonsensical rendering of it:

Pleasures of selfhood are a blessing of God,
Who makes me lose my awareness of myself.*12

4- In the second couplet of the ghazal No. 45, Iqbal uses a word 'zarraki' (زرّاقی), which means 'cheating' or 'deception'.*13

خراب کوشکِ سلطان و خانقاہِ فقیر
فغاں کہ تخت و مصلّی کمال زرّاقی *14

Naim takes it for 'razzaki' (رزاقی), i.e., divine system of sustenance:

Be it the King's palace, or the fakir's sanctum,
Both have usurped God's power of providing
Sustenance.*15

5- In the translation of a couplet of the ghazal No. 56, Naim goes his own way; the poet and the translator are poles apart:

اقبال: صاحبِ ساز کو لازم ہے کہ غافل نہ رہے
گاہے گاہے غلط آہنگ بھی ہوتا ہے سروش *16

Naim: Even the Orphean lyre
Falters and fails sometimes
Even the greatest master
Will nod as Homer does.*17

Naim's rendering seems to be nothing more than a blank exposure of his Knowledge of Greek mythology. No one can extract Iqbal's sense out of Naim's lines here.

6- There is a poem, 'Javed Ke Nam; London Mein Us Ke Haath Ka Likha Hua Pehla Khat Ane Par' (جاوید کے نام: لندن میں اس کے ہاتھ کا لکھا ہوا پہلا خط آنے پر).*18 Naim Siddiqui translates the heading as 'To Javid; On Receiving His First Letter from

130351

London'.*[19] Thus, he changes the sense of 'in' into 'from', which means that Javid was writing to Iqbal from London, and Iqbal was elsewhere.

There are a number of incorrect verbal translations. Here is a list of the most unbearable mistakes:*[20]

1- star	مشتری
2- book of Psalms	پاژند
3- straw	اسپند
4- glass	پانی
5- Solomon	قارون
6- light	جیحون
7- aliens	مغ زادے
8- eagle	ہما
9- sound	بو
10- ecstasy	فغاں
11- beast	ماہی

There are some other inconsistencies in this translation, which tax the mind of a reader:

1- In Most of the cases, Naim Siddiqui avoids the translation of Proper names. This avoidance mars the glamour of historical or cultural allusions. Here is an example:

اقبال : درویشِ خدامست نہ شرقی ہے نہ غربی
گھر میرا نہ دِلّی، نہ صفاہاں نہ سمرقند 21*

Naim: A man of God is neither of the East nor the West,
My home is not a city, nor a clime.[*22]

In some cases, this dropping of proper names may be acceptable, yet, at many places, it grows very awkward.[*23]

2- Another regrettable aspect of this translation is that the translator alters the order of the couplets. In the case of the ghazal No. 7 (N 6), out of a total of seven couplets, three (5, 6 & 7) have been left out untranslated, and the order of the four translated couplets is 1, 2, 4, 3, i.e., the couplet No. 4 precedes the couplet No. 3. The same is the case with the ghazal No. 42 (N 56), where the order of translation is 1, 2, 3, 5, 4, 6, 7, i.e., the couplet No. 5 precedes the couplet No. 4.

3- In the poem, 'Tariq's Prayer', the couplet No. 1 has been translated into two couplets:

اقبال: یہ غازی یہ تیرے پراسرار بندے
جنھیں تو نے بخشا ہے ذوقِ خدائی [*24]

Naim: These warriors, victorious,
These worshippers of Thine,
Whom Thou hast granted the will
To win power in Thy name.[*25]

The rest of the poem has been translated as one couplet for one. Thus, two different styles have been adopted in a shorter poem of only ten couplets.

4- A worse distortion of Iqbal's text is seen in the translation of the first seven couplets of 'Saqi Nama'. Here are both the texts:

اقبال: ہوا خیمہ زن کاروانِ بہار　ارم بن گیا دامنِ کوہسار
گل و نرگس و سوسن و نسترن　شہیدِ ازل لالہ خونیں کفن

جہاں چھپ گیا پردۂ رنگ میں
لہو کی ہے گردش رگِ سنگ میں
فضا نیلی نیلی ہوا میں سرور
ٹھہرتے نہیں آشیاں میں طیور
وہ جوئے کہستاں اچکتی ہوئی
اٹکتی، لچکتی، سرکتی ہوئی
اچھلتی، پھسلتی، سنبھلتی ہوئی
بڑے پیچ کھا کر نکلتی ہوئی
رُکے جب تو سِل چیر دیتی ہے یہ!
پہاڑوں کے دِل چیر دیتی ہے یہ! *26

Naim: Look! What wonders the spring has wrought!
The river bank is a paradise!
Rose embowered glades,
Blossoming jasmine and hyacinth,
And violets, the envy of the skies!
Rainbow colours transformed
Into a chorus of rapturous sounds,
And the harmony of flowers.
The hillside is carnation-red;
In the languid haze, the air
Seems drunk with the beauty of life!
The brook, on the heights of the hill,
Dances to its own music:
The world is dizzy in a pageant of colour!*27

There is no need commenting on this translation, as the translator is busy in creating his own images, instead of conveying what Iqbal says.

5- It is equally appalling that Naim Siddiqui staggers while recognizing the cultural significance of Iqbal's message. Being overawed by the Christian terminology, he translates the heading of the poem 'Deen Aur Siasat' (دین اور سیاست) as 'Church And State'. '*Deen*' is not church. There would have been no flaw in translating the word

'*Deen*' as 'religion', even if the translator feels difficulty in accepting Iqbal as a Muslim poet at all. The same trend has been adopted in the translation of a very famous couplet of Iqbal:

جلالِ پادشاہی ہو کہ جمہوری تماشہ ہو
جدا ہو دیں سیاست سے تو رہ جاتی ہے چنگیزی *28

Naim: Whether imperial power or democracy's Farce,
Tyranny results when church and state are divorced*29

To wind up, Naim Siddiqui's translation has almost deformed 'Bal-i-Jibril', by discarding a major portion of its text, indiscriminately dropping a large number of couplets even in the translated pieces of poetry, committing a number of verbal and semantic mistakes, rearranging the entire book, doing away with the cultural and historical allusions, making an effort towards self-exposure as a poet and preponderating to the Christian stream of thought. We do find some better translations in his book, but, they seem to be lost in the labyrinths of his self-insertion.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Alhamra Publications. U.S.A.
2. Qaidkhana Mein Mo'tamad Ki Faryad; Abdur Rahman I Ka Lagaya Huwa Khajoor Ka Pehla Darakht; Lenin; Parwana Aur Jugnoo; Alartho Lillah; Mussolini; Sowal; Punjab Ke Dehqan Se; Nadir Shah Afghan; Khushhal Khan Ki Wasiat; Tatari Ka Khab; Abu-ul-Ula Mo'arri; Cinema; Punjab Ke Pirzadoon Se; Siasat; Faqr; Judai; Lahoo; Parwana; Sheikh-i-Maktab Se; Falsafi; Haroon Ki Akhari Nasihat; Mahir-i-Nafasiat Se; Europe; Azadi-i-Afkar; Sher Aur Khachar; Chiunti Aur Uqab. These 27 poems have been left.

3. Poems:

(i)	Bhartari Hari	1
(ii)	Du'a	3 (4, 10, 11)
(iii)	Masjid-i-Qortoba	1 (5)
(iv)	Spain	2 (4, 7)
(v)	Tariq Ki Du'a	2 (5, 9)
(vi)	Farishtoon Ka Geet	9 (5, 6 to 13)
(vii)	Zoq-o-Shoq	2 (4, 6)
(viii)	Javid Ke Nam	1 (2)
(ix)	Din Aur Siasat	1 (6)
(x)	Ek Nojawan Ke Nam	1 (5)
(xi)	Saqi Nama	2 (56, 64)
(xii)	Zamana	2 (2, 4)
(xiii)	Pir-o-Murid	5 (23, 24, 39, 40, 41)
(xiv)	Jibreel-o-Iblis	1 (9)
(xv)	Iblis Ki Arzdasht	1 (3)
(xvi)	Shaheen	1(7)

4. Ibid: PP. 85 to 93.
5. Ibid: P. 94.
6. Ibid: For the qat'a on page 90 please see p. 86, and the qat'as on p. 170 please see page 93.
7. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.16
8. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.26
9. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.20
10. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.30
11. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.27
12. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.35
13. Matalib-i-Bal-i-Jibril; P.88
14. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.65
15. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.74
16. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.75
17. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.81
18. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal); P.147
19. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim); P.111

20. Ghazals:
    (i) Ghazal No. 14 (Part 1), P. 18: Naim 13, P. 28
    (ii) Ghazal No. 16 (Part 1), P. 20: Naim 15, P. 30
    (iii) Ghazal No. 16 (Part 1), P. 21: Naim 15, P. 30
    (iv) Ghazal No. 1 (Part 2-3), P. 25: Naim 16, P. 33
    (v) Ghazal No. 3 (Part 2), P. 27: Naim 18, P. 35
    (vi) Ghazal No. 3 (Part 2), P. 28: Naim 18, P. 35
    (vii) Ghazal No. 14 (Part 2), P. 37: Naim 28, P. 44
    (viii) Ghazal No. 22, P. 45: Naim 36, P. 52
    (ix) Ghazal No. 37, P. 59: Naim 51, P. 66
    (x) Ghazal No. 41, P. 62: Naim 55, P. 71
    (xi) Quatrain : (تری دنیا جہانِ مرغ و ماہی), P. 87: Naim P. 90
21. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal), P.21
22. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim), P.30
23. Please see the translations of the following couplets:
    (i) Couplet No. 12, Ghazal No. 16 (Part I), P.21: Naim 15, P.30
    (ii) Couplet No. 2, Ghazal No. 1 (Part II-ii), P.23: Naim 16, P.32
    (iii) Couplet No. 2, Ghazal No. 2 (Part II), P.26: Naim 17, P.34
    (iv) Couplet No. 1, Ghazal No. 5 (Part II), P.29: Naim 20, P.37
    (v) Couplet No. 4, Ghazal No. 26, P.49: Naim 40, P.56
    (vi) Couplet No. 1, Ghazal No. 50, P.70: Naim 63, P.78
    (vii) Couplet No. 5, Ghazal No. 55, P.74: Naim 65, P.80
    (viii) Quatrain: (دمِ عارف نسیمِ صبح دم ہے) P.88: Naim, P.92
    (ix) Couplet No. 5, Stanza No. 4, Masjid-i-Qortoba, P.96: Naim, P.100
    (x) Couplet No. 3, Stanza No. 4, Zoq-o-Shoq, P.113: Naim, P.109
    (xi) Couplet No. 2, Ek Nojawan Ke Naam, P.119: Naim, P.115
24. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal), P.105
25. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim), P.105
26. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal), P. 122
27. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim), P. 119
28. Bal-i-Jibril (Iqbal), P. 40
29. Baal-i-Jibreel (Naim), P. 47

THE MOSQUE OF CORDOVA

Abdul Haleem

A translation of 'Masjid-i-Qortoba' appeared in 1976, under the title of 'The Mosque of Cordova'.*[1] The translator, Mohd. Abdul Haleem, seems to be very sincere in his effort, thus, it is a valuable translation. Iqbal's Urdu text has also been printed along with the translation, yet, the book is unpaged. So, we can refer to it through the eight stanzas of the original poem.

In the translation, Abdul Haleem has not observed Iqbal's stanza scheme, nor has he rendered line for line translation. Iqbal's every stanza contains 16 lines, but, Abdul Haleem's text consists of varying numbers of lines for each stanza, i.e., 24, 16, 20, 18, 23, 23, 17, 20 -- 161 lines in total, as compared to Iqbal's 128 lines. It is, therefore, an irregular prose translation, also having no rhythm or rhyme scheme. So, the claim of the printer, on the tittle page of the book, of its being a verse translation, is not true.

The diction of the translation is quite impressive, and indicates the linguistic competence of the translator. His overall tendency is interpretative, but, at a stage, he has fallen into a ditch of redundancy, while translating Iqbal's following couplet:

سادہ و پرسوز ہے دخترِ دہقاں کا گیت
کشتیٔ دل کے لیے سیل ہے عہد شباب [2*]

Abdul Haleem translates it as:

Sweet and simple is the rustic maid's song,
Deep, profound, striking like a gong,

Youth's the ever-fresh rhythmic flow,
the flowering time of hearts desire.
Sales the dream-boat swan-like heaving
On its surface of gold and glittering.*3

The translator has adopted a profusely redundant style, and has explained Iqbal's imagery through a number of self-created images.

Abdul Haleem looks very careful in the choice and usage of words, but, in the case of some words, he could not achieve the expected sense:*4

1-	Self	ذات
2-	Watch-dog	صیرفی
3-	younder azure	سپہر کبود
4-	song of bliss/ecstatic tune	صلوٰۃ و درود
5-	beautific melody	اللہ ھو

The word 'zaat' here means 'God', 'serafi' means 'a jeweller' and 'sapehr-i-kabud' simply means 'the blue sky'. 'Salat', 'dorood' and 'Allah Hoo' are exclusively Islamic terms, with no substitute. It is better to keep them intact.

There are two other lines, where Abdul Haleem is mistaken:

1۔ عشق ہے اصلِ حیات موت ہے اس پر حرام *5

Love's to him the very life of life, death for him is banned.*6

Here, the pronoun 'him' is additional at both the places. Iqbal is talking about love, but, Abdul Haleem is talking about 'momin'.

2۔ ہر دو جہاں سے غنی اس کا دلِ بے نیاز *7

In his unruffled heart lies hidden the glory and grandeur of all worlds.'[8]

The word 'ghani' here means 'indifferent', but, Abdul Haleem is giving it the sense of 'rich'.

These were some of the shortcomings in this translation. However, it is a valuable work.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Hyderabad.
2. The Mosque of Cordova, St. 8
3. Ibid
4. Sts. 1 (1, 2), 3 (3, 4, 5).
5. The Mosque of Cordova, St. 2
6. Ibid
7. Ibid, St. 5
8. Ibid

THE MOSQUE OF CORDOBA

Saleem A. Gilani

In 1995, Saleem A. Gilani came forward with a highly appreciable translation of 'Masjid-i-Qortoba', under the title of 'The Mosque of Cordoba'.*1 Like Abdul Haleem, Saleem Gilani also has not adopted a consistent style of translation. He has translated 64 couplets in the following manner:

1-	40 couplets	4 lines each
2-	18 couplets	3 lines each
3-	6 couplets	2 lines each

The translation is unrhymed, and not purely rhythmic as well, yet, the reader finds the translator equally busy in generating resonance, through a dexterous arrangement of words. Thus, this text can be regarded as poetic-prose.

The greatest feature of the book is its precision of language. Saleem Gilani seems to be a maturer writer than Abdul Haleem. Let us see how Saleem tackles the words, where Abdul Haleem was not successful in translation:*2

1-	Divine Essence	ذات
2-	Touch-stone	صیرفی
3-	azure skies	سپہر کبود
4-	peace upon the Prophet	صلوٰۃ و درود
5-	Allah hoo	اللہ ھُو

None of these words is imprecise. Let us also see the two lines where Abdul Haleem had flawed; Saleem Gilani writes:

1. .... Love,

The essence of life,
which death is forbidden to touch.*3

2. His contented self has no demands
On this world or the other.*4

Saleem Gilani has rightly grasped the sense of the two lines.

There is almost no word in the book, which could be regarded as incorrect translation. There are a few words, which could have been improved:*5

1- sanctuary	حرم
2- aura	فضا
3- exalted throne	عرشِ معلّٰی
4- supplication	سجدہ
5- soaring minaret	مینارِ بلند

Every holy place can be a sanctuary; Haram is the only place in the world. 'Aura', these days, is used for the astral or ethereal body of an animate or inanimate object. 'Arsh-i-Mu'alla' is only God's throne, whereas the throne of every king can be called an exalted one. 'Supplication' denotes humble request, but not an explicit prostration. The word 'soaring' conveys loftiness, but, it carries a sense of upward motion; minarets are high, but not soaring. All these words can be replaced with an improved version. However, these suggestions are meant for refinement; otherwise, even these words can serve the purpose.

In short, due to its accuracy of diction, succinctness of style and sublimity of expression, this translation can be placed among the best translations of Iqbal's poetry.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. The Mosque of Cordoba; PP. 11 (1, 2), 21 (3, 4, 5)
3. Ibid; P. 16
4. Ibid; P. 28
5. Ibid; PP.18, 20, 22, 22, 24

ZARB-I-KALIM

The Rod of Moses; Akbar Ali Shah; 1983 96

THE ROD OF MOSES

Akbar Ali Shah

'Zarb-i-Kalim' was published in July, 1936 and its first, and the only complete poetic translation, was presented by Akbar Ali Shah in August, 1983, under the title of 'The Rod of Moses'.*[1] The translator's previous poetic translation, i.e., that of a part of 'Bal-i-Jibril', appeared in 1979, wherein he had adroitly exercised his command of the English prosody. So, 'The Rod of Moses' is not his experimental translation. He spent a reasonable period of about four years in compiling and submitting this book.

'Zarb-i-Kalim' contains 186 shorter and longer poems, (3 introductory, but unnumbered poems, plus 1 to 183 poems, as numbered by Iqbal himself), A.A. Shah's preference is iambic metre and he goes on making experiments from trimeter to octometer (from three feet to eight feet):

1- In the translation of only one poem, 'Fakr-o-Molookiyat', A.A. Shah has adopted iambic octometer.

2- Three poems have been translated in iambic hexameter:

Tamheed (1); Afrang Zuda; Eik Sawal.

3- The following 61 poems have been translated in iambic pentameter:

A'la Hazrat Sir Hameed Ullah Khan Farman Rawa-i-Bhopal Ki Khidmat Mein; Nazireen Se; Tamheed (1); Subh; Me'raj; Eik Falsafa Zuda Sayyid Zade Ke Nam; Zameen-o-Asman; Ilm-o-Ishq; Ijtehad; Shukr-o-Shikayat; Taqdeer; Hindi Musalman; Azadi-i-

Shamsheer Ke E'lan Par; Sultani; Sufi Se; Afrang Zuda (2); Dunia; Qalandar Ki Pehchan; Modoniyat-i-Islam; Imamat; Fakr-o-Rahibi; Ghazal; Tasleem-o-Raza; Makka Aur Geneva; Azadi; Maqsood; Hindi Maktab; Tarbiat; Khoob-o-Zisht; Asatiza; Deen-o-Ta'leem; Javid Se; Mard-i-Farang; Aurat Ki Hifazat; Aurat Aur Ta'leem; Deen-o-Hunar; Jonoon; Shoa-i-Ummid; Wojood; Subh-i-Chaman; Jiddat; Musawir; Nafsiyat-i-Ghulami; Bolshevik Roos; Aj Aur Kal; Ahl-i-Misr Se; Abysinia; Iblees Ka Pegham Apne Siyasi Farzandun Ke Nam; Europe Aur Soorya; Mussolini; Gila; Intedab; La Deen Siyasat; Dam-i-Tahzeeb; Nasihat; Eik Behri Qazzaq Aur Sikandar; Jami'at-ul-Aqwam; Sham Aur Phalistine; Ghulamun Ki Namaz; Phalistini Arab; Mehrab Gul Afghan Ke Afkar (4, 6, 8, 11, 13, 18).

4- The following 24 poems have been translated in iambic trimeter:

Musalman Ka Zawal; Mulla-i-Haram; Ilm Aur Deen; Wahi; Kafir-o-Momin; Aqwam-i-Mashriq; Bedari; Asr-i-Hazir; Khalwat; Aurat; Takhleeq; Theatre; Ghazal; Jalal-o-Jamal; Fawara; Hunarwaran-i-Hind; Mard-i-Bazurg; Khushamad; Manasib; Jami'at-ul-Aqwam-i-Mashriq; Sultani-i-Javid; Jamhooriyat; Siyasi Peshwa; Mehrab Gul Afghan Ke Afkar (3, 16, 17).

5- All the other poems, being 97 in number, have been translated in iambic tetrameter.

This detail has been given in order to assess the metrical preferences of the translator. Briefly it can be summarized as this:

1- Iambic octometer 1 poem

2- Iambic hexameter 3 poems
3- Iambic pentameter 61 poems
4- Iambic tetrameter 97 poems
5- Iambic trimeter 24 poems

It means that A.A. Shah is prone to tetrametric and pentametric compositions. In octometric and hexametric compositions, he seems to be in somewhat trouble. Contrarily, in shorter metres, particularly in trimeter, he is highly successful, both in creating rhythm and conveying the sense.

A.A. Shah mostly translates one line into two lines, but, in 60 poems, he has given a line for line translation. In these translations, he is more lucid. These poems are:

A'la Hazrat Sir Hameed Ullah Khan Farman Rawa-i-Bhopal Ki Khidmat Mein; Nazireen Se; Tamheed; Subh; Me'raj; Eik Falsfa Zuda Sayyid Zade Ke Nam; Zameen-o-Asman; Taqdeer; Hindi Musalman; Azadi-i-Shamsheer Ke E'lan Par; Sufi Se; Afrang Zuda; Dunya; Qalandar Ki Pehchan; Imamat; Faqr-o-Rahibi; Tasleem-o-Raza; Ilham Aur Azadi; Makka Aur Geneva; Punjabi Musalman; Azadi; Maqsood; Hindi Maktab; Tarbiat; Khoob-o-Zisht; Talib-i-Ilm; Imtehan; Asatiza; Din-o-Ta'leem; Javid Se; Mard-i-Farang; Eik Sawal; Parda; Aurat Ki Hifazat; Aurat Aur Ta'leem; Deen-o-Hunar; Paris Ki Masjid; Shoa-i-Ummeed; Subh-i-Chaman; Rumi; Jiddat; Musawir; Nafsiyat-i-Ghulami; Bolshevik Roos; Aj Aur Kal; Ehl-i-Misr Se; Abyssinia; Iblees Ka Farman Apne Siyasi Farzandun Ke Nam; Europe Aur Sooria; Mussolini; Gila; Intedab; La Deen Siyasat; Dam-i-Tahzeeb; Nasihat; Eik Behri Qazzaq Aur Sikandar;

Jam'iat-i-Aqwam; Ghulamun Ki Namaz; Phalistini Arab; Mehrab Gul Afghan Ke Afkar (4, 6, 8, 11, 13, 18).

In line for line translations, one can easily avoid redundancy, whereas, in two for one line translations, a translator is often constrained to rely on additional interpretative phrases, clauses, synonyms or antonyms, to meet the requirement of rhythm. Judged on this criterion, A.A. Shah's line for line translations are more precise than those two for one. It is, however, interesting to note that his two for one translations are relatively more musical and resonant, specially in trimetric compositions.

His choice of metre, no doubt, is iambic, but in cases of emphatic versions or interrogative lines, he resorts to dactylic (one stressed syllable followed by two unstressed ones) feet. This shift-over to other feet, sounds pleasant, though heavy in some cases.

A somewhat unpleasant impression is created, when he inserts some hexametric line among the pentametric ones, or a pentametric line among the tetrametric ones. Here are two examples:

1- Perhaps the part of year that Spring you deem,
In others' view destructive Autumn it may seem.*2

The first line is in iambic pentameter, while the second one is in iambic hexameter. Let us scan them:

Pĕr háps/thĕ párt/ŏf yéar/thăt spríng/yŏu déem/
Ĭn ó/thĕr's víew/dĕs trúc/tĭve Áu/tŭmn ít/măy séem/

A.A. Shah could have easily avoided this imbalance, just by removing the trisyllabic additional word, 'destructive' by replacing it with some monosyllabic one, may be, 'an':

In other's view an Autumn it may seem.

This would have been more relevant, as in Iqbal's text no adjective has been used with the word 'Khazan'(خزاں):

ممکن ہے کہ تو جس کو سمجھتا ہے بہاراں
اوروں کی نگاہوں میں وہ موسم ہو خزاں کا 3*

2- The Koranic teaching that did bring
The Moon and Pleiades within human reach. *4

The first line is in iambic tetrameter, and the second one is in iambic pentameter. Let us scan these lines:

The Kóra / nic téa / ching thát / did bríng/
The Móon/ and Pléia / des wíth/ in hú/ man
reách.

In this scansion, we have to be lenient towards the translator, in taking the words 'Koranic' and 'Pleiades' as bisyllabic ones. Actually, both the words are trisyllabic, 'ko-ra-nic' and 'plei-a-des'. In this case, A.A. Shah's lines become totally rhythmless. Using the code of poetic licence, the English poets have written poems with casually additional or reduced feet. But, they are very careful in it. It looks that A.A. Shah has taken undesirable liberty in this respect. Being well acquainted with the English prosody, he could have easily amended his text.

As a sequel to this impression of hastiness or confusion, we can have some other observations as well:

1- Couplet No. 4 of the poem 'Sultani' (سلطانی) has been left untranslated. The couplet is:

یہ جبر و قہر نہیں ہے یہ عشق و مستی ہے
کہ جبر و قہر سے ممکن نہیں جہانبانی *5

2- In the translation of 'Makka Aur Geneva' (مکہ اور جنیوا), the following hemistich has been left:

اسلام کا مقصود فقط ملت آدم *6

3- The poem 'Maqsood' (مقصود) contains three couplets. The first couplet is Spinoza's Statement, the second one is Plato's statement and the third one is Iqbal's comment.*7 A.A. Shah has combined Plato and Iqbal's statements, under Plato's statement. Thus, this poem has completely lost its sense.*8

4- The poem 'Karl Marx Ki Awaaz' (کارل مارکس کی آواز) has a single heading in 'Zarb-i-Kalim'.*9 A.A. Shah coins a heading of his own, 'Karl Marx', and converts Iqbal's heading into a subheading.*10 On the contrary, in the case of another poem, 'Ghulamun Ki Namaz' (غلاموں کی نماز), he drops Iqbal's sub-heading, 'Turkey Wafd Hillal-i-Ahmer Lahore Mein'(ترکی وفد ہلالِ احمر لاہور میں). *11 & 12

5- In the poem 'Nigah-i-Shauq' (نگاہِ شوق), there are six couplets in all.*13 A.A. Shah has translated the first two couplets as line for line, and the remaining four couplets as four lines for two. Thus, he has rendered six couplets into five stanzas.*14 Similarly, in the next poem, 'Ahl-i-Hunar Se' (اہل ہنر سے), ten lines have been translated in eighteen lines.*15&16 The last couplet has been translated as line for line, whereas, the initial four are four for two. Likewise, another sub-heading, 'Islahat' (اصلاحات), of the poem 'Nafsiyat-i-Hakimi' has been overlooked. *17&18

6- There is a reversal of order at two places. Iqbal's order of the poems is:

(a) Paris Ki Masjid; Adabiyat.*19

(b) Sham-o-Phalistine; Siyasi Peshwa.*20

A.A. Shah changes the order of these poems as this:

(1) Literature; Paris Mosque.*21

(2) Political Leaders; Syria and Palestine.*22

7- A hemistich of the poem 'Mehrab Gul Afghan Ke Afkar (4)' has been neglected:

الحکم للہ الملک للہ *23

A full couplet out of the part 5 of the same poem has been left out:

فطرت کے نوامیس پہ غالب ہے ہنر مند
شام اس کی ہے مانندِ سحر صاحبِ پرتو *24

Another couplet, out of the part 17 of the same poem, has also been left out:

بالائے سر رہا تو ہے نام اس کا آسماں
زیرِ پر آگیا تو یہی آسماں زمیں *25

8- There are some orthographic mistakes, which indicate the translator's lack of due attention, e.g.:

	Incorrect	Correct
(i)	heart *26	art
(ii)	Shapped*27	Snapped
(iii)	Behzad's *28	Behzads

9- Other than such orthographic errors, there are some grammatical mistakes, which also speak of less attention of the translator:

(i) In the poem 'Philosophy' there is a line:

He heeds not shell who seeks the pearl*29

The verb 'heed' is never used without the preposition 'to'.

(ii) There is a poem in 'Zarb-i-Kalim', 'Apne She'r se' (اپنے شعر سے).*30 A. A. Shah translates this title of the poem as, 'To His Own Verse'.*31 The possessive pronoun 'his' has been inserted instead of 'My'.

(iii) In the poem 'Alam-i-Noe' (عالم نو), there is a couplet:

اور جب بانگِ اذاں کرتی ہے بیدار اسے
کرتا ہے خواب میں دیکھی ہوئی دنیا تعمیر 32*

A.A. Shah translates it as this:

When Prayer Call at early morn,
Transports him to Morpheus' domain,
He tries to build the world beheld,
With utmost might and utmost main*33

Iqbal is talking of coming out from the world of dream, but, A.A. Shah is talking of going 'to' the world of dream. So, it is completely opposite translation.

(iv) In the poem 'Tutelage', there is a couplet:

Where dice and drink are both by law forbid,
And women keep their bodies fully hide.*34

The word 'hide' should be 'hid', both poetically and grammatically. It might be a printing error. Anyway, an uncondonable flaw is there.

The above points were highlighted to vindicate our stance that A.A. Shah could not pay due attention to this invaluable translation. With minimum efforts, he could have saved himself from such petty mistakes. Now we turn our attention to the translations, wherein he has failed to understand Iqbal's text, and, therefore, presented flawed translations:

1- The last couplet of 'Mardan-i-Khuda' (مردانِ خدا) is:

وجود انھیں کا طوافِ بتاں سے ہے آزاد

یہ تیرے مومن و کافر تمام زناری 35*

A.A. Shah translates it:

This life is free from ugly taint
That makes men round the fane to tread:
O God ! the faithful and pagan all
Have worn on shoulders sacred thread.*36

In this couplet, Iqbal's subject is God's Men, not life. Had A.A. Shah changed 'This Life' into 'their life', he would have been correct.

2- In 'Kafir-o-Momin' (کافر و مومن), Iqbal says:

کافر کی یہ پہچان کہ آفاق میں گم ہے

مومن کی یہ پہچان کہ گم اس میں ہیں آفاق 37*

A.A. Shah says:

A heathen gets distinct
By getting lost in life:
Whereas a Muslim true
Keeps 'bove its brawl and strife.*38

The translator has stifled Iqbal's universal concept of Mominhood, according to which microcosmic physical body encompasses the macrocosmic universe.

3- In 'Makhlooqat-i-Hunar' (مخلوقاتِ ہنر), Iqbal regards all the artistic creations as egoless and lifeless. There is a couplet:

نہ خودی ہے نہ جہانِ سحر و شام کے دور

زندگانی کی حریفانہ کشاکش سے نجات 39*

A.A. Shah's rendering of the second line looks quite ridiculous:

There is no Self nor usual change
Of morn and night at all is found:
The Muslims have got rid entire
Of combats and shun such a round.*40

4- In 'Mard-i-Bazurg' (مردِ بزرگ), Iqbal enumerates the qualities of great men. The first couplet of this poem is:

اس کی نفرت بھی عمیق اس کی محبت بھی عمیق
قہر بھی اس کا ہے اللہ کے بندوں پہ شفیق *41

Here also, A.A. Shah has almost failed to give a correct sense of the second hemistich:

His contempt has no bound
His love's depth none can sound;
His wrath on men of God
Is tempered in manner odd.*42

The words 'manner odd' mystify the sense of 'Shafeeq' (شفیق), which clearly means being highly sympathetic. The word 'odd' is usually used in negative sense.

Other than these flaws in grasping the overall sense of couplets, one finds incorrect translations of some discrete words, namely:*43

1-	Worldly affairs	احوال
2-	Jealous	غیور
3-	Shark	نہنگ
4-	Guide	مہدی
5-	Shrine	حرم
6-	Sea	دریا
7-	God is Great	لا موجود (الا اللہ)

8- Kettle چھلنی

9- Pot چھاج

We have tried to be meticulous in our assessment of this translation, and have brought in picture most of its pitfalls. However, generally observing, this is a very precious translation. A.A. Shah deserves kudos for his sincerity, command of the English prosody and language and thus, for his first and the only effort so far, towards the complete rendering of 'Zarb-i-Kalim'.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. The Rod of Moses; P.4
3. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.19
4. The Rod of Moses; P.2
5. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.32
6. Ibid; P.58
7. Ibid; P.68
8. The Rod of Moses; P.40
9. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.137
10. The Rod of Moses; P.87
11. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.158
12. The Rod of Moses; P.100
13. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.111
14. The Rod of Moses; P.67
15. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.112
16. The Rod of Moses; P.68
17. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.161
18. The Rod of Moses; P.101
19. Zarb-i-Kalim; PP.102-3

20. Ibid; PP.156-7
21. The Rod of Moses; P.62
22. Ibid; PP.98-9
23. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.166
24. Ibid; P.167
25. Ibid; P.176
26. The Rod of Moses; P.73; Fine Arts
27. Ibid; P.75; Rumi
28. Ibid; P.77; The Painter
29. Ibid; P.22
30. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.102
31. The Rod of Moses; P.61
32. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.130
33. The Rod of Moses; P.82
34. Ibid; P.96
35. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.43
36. The Rod of Moses; P.22
37. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.44
38. The Rod of Moses; P.23
39. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.117
40. The Rod of Moses; P.72
41. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.129
42. The Rod of Moses; P.81
43. Ibid; Please see PP. 1-4; 2-14; 3-18; 4-23; 5-33; 6-75; 7-78; 8-95; 9-95

ARMAGHAN-I-HIJAZ

ARMAGHAN-I-HIJAZ

Q.A. Kabir

Iqbal's last poetic creation, 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz', has witnessed only one complete translation, under the same title.*1 The translator, Q.A. Kabir, calls it a versified translation, but, unfortunately, it is neither poetic, nor in prose. It is unintelligible as to why Iqbal Academy has taken up the task of printing this worthless book in a presentable form. The shortest possible comment on it can be that Q.A. Kabir has endeavoured to translate 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' into English without knowing English. Being well aware of the fact that we have passed a strictest judgement, let us try to vindicate it, with reference to the Urdu section of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz':

1- Q.A. Kabir poses to be a poet, yet, nothing is poetic in his book, except his self-inserted rhymes. By this false rhyming, sometimes ridiculous and sometimes annoying, he, very often, nullifies Iqbal's both sense and impression. Let us take the very first couplet of the Urdu section of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz':

یہ عناصر کا پرانا کھیل یہ دنیائے دوں
ساکنانِ عرش اعظم کی تمناؤں کا خوں *2

Q.A. Kabir translates it as this:

An old game of needs this mean world's tact,
To heavenly host hopes a cold blood act.*3

Both the rhyming words, 'tact' and 'act', are out of place, and the couplet is totally rhythmless and meaningless. Such pseudo-rhyming goes on throughout the book.

2- Gross syntactic flaws are observable everywhere in the book: in his reckless effort of imposing rhymes, which is the only sign of poetry, in the book, he deshapes grammatical structures and, as a corollary, it becomes difficult to get to the meanings. The book is replete with such flawed structures and meaningless couplets. Let us take just one example:

Isn't this a marvel of constant push hence,
That Mullah is tied with kingship fence.
A best booze it was to Eastern nature then,
No lesser vice singing to 'eloquence' Ken.*4

No one can understand the meaning of these couplets, until one reads Iqbal's original text. An advisor of Satan says:

یہ ہماری سعیِ پیہم کی کرامت ہے کہ آج
صوفی و مُلا ملوکیت کے بندے ہیں تمام
طبعِ مشرق کے لیے موزوں یہی افیون تھی
ورنہ قوالی سے کچھ کمتر نہیں علمِ کلام 5*

3- Another considerable aspect is the translator's inability in the proper use of prepositions. Here are some examples:

(i) To plants we watered; caused to be trees.*6

No preposition is used with the verb 'water'; 'to', therefore, is incorrect.

(ii) A king's eye craves a foreign land or port*7

The verb 'crave' is never used without 'for'.

(iii) Who is now wrapped with waves of Roman sea.*8

'Wrapped' is always followed by 'in', not 'with'.

(iv) If that is doomsday, to that I wont seek.*9

No preposition is used with the verb 'seek'. So, 'to' is incorrect.

(v) To him can't wake up the Israpheel's horn.*10

'To' is incorrect, since the verb 'wake' is used only with 'up', not with any additional preposition.

(vi) At dawn to wail of birds, they think songs gay.*11

There is no justification for using 'to' with 'think'.

(vii) For murder of longings who will compensate,*12

'Compensate' is always used without any preposition; 'for' is incorrect and additional.

(viii) Lords of hermitage, to me a rival take.*13

'To' should be replaced by 'for' to make it a meaningful idiom, 'take for'. 'Take to' is also an idiom, but, it means 'to be addicted to'.

(ix) Who took my love's labour of Farhad's kind*14

Here also 'of' should be replaced by 'for' to create a clear sense of this hemistich:

سمجھتا ہے مری محنت کو محنتِ فرہاد *15

(x) Each bitter in my palate turns sweet things.*16

'Turns' should be followed by 'into'.

(xi) To Mustafa reach, to him belongs deen.*17

The verb 'reach' is used without preposition: 'to' is additional and incorrect.

4- Q.A. Kabir is highly careless in the use of definite article, 'the'. He uses it even with the proper nouns; what to speak of its disputed or special usages. Let us see the following lines:

(i) The collars to whom the Nature has torn*18

(ii) The Islam, not Muzdak is the future's fright.*19

(iii) To him cant wake up the Israpheel's horn.*20

(iv) The Khizr thus broods over the Wooler's banks.*21

(v) The God gave to rivers a taste for flood*22

5- Although, it is evident from the above discussion that this translation is grammatically, syntactically and poetically, a non-acceptable one, yet, it would be more convenient to point out that the translator is more careless in transporting the meanings of one language into the other. Let us consider some keywords, which have been translated incorrectly, beyond any doubt:*23

1-	prey	نماز
2-	stay	قیام
3-	eloquence	علمِ کلام
4-	Kaisar	پرویز
5-	Basra	بخارا
6-	face	سر
7-	radiant	پرسوز
8-	quill	مضراب

These grammatical and semantic blunders are just in 24 pages of the Urdu portion of the book, which expose the non-seriousness of the translator. Another aspect of the translation is that out of this portion, he has left the following lines untranslated:

1۔ کیوں نہیں ہوتی سحر حضرتِ انسان کی رات *24

2۔ گر صاحبِ ہنگامہ نہ ہو منبر و محراب
دیں بندۂ مومن کے لیے موت ہے یا خواب
اے وادیٔ لولاب 25*

3۔ محکوم ہے بیگانۂ اخلاص و مروّت
ہر چند کہ منطق کی دلیلوں میں ہے چالاک 26*

As a model of his translation, let us take a shorter poem of three couplets, and see how Q.A. Kabir handles it:

عجم ہنوز نداند رموزِ دیں ورنہ
ز دیوبند حسین احمد ایں چہ بوالعجبیست
سرود بر سرِ منبر کہ ملت از وطن است
چہ بے خبر ز مقامِ محمدؐ عربی است
بہ مصطفٰیؐ برساں خویش را کہ دیں ہمہ اوست
اگر بہ او نہ رسیدی تمام بولہبیست 27*

Q.A. Kabir:

Yet non arabs know not the deen's hid signs,
From Devband Ahmad the man's odd line.
He sings on pulpit, "Nation is known by land",
He queer, knew not land, of the Prophet Grand.
To Mustafa reach, to him belongs deen,
If you didn't reach him, you are Boolahb clean.*28

It is needless to comment upon such a ridiculous translatio It is a pity that Q.A. Kabir's all the translations, in this volume, are of the same standard. A sane judgement can be that Iqbal must be saved from such translations.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1983
2. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.5
3. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); P.129
4. Ibid; P.130
5. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.6
6. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); P.129
7. Ibid; P.130
8. Ibid; P.131
9. Ibid; P.138
10. Ibid; P.138
11. Ibid; P.142
12. Ibid
13. Ibid; P.154
14. Ibid; P.156
15. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.46
16. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); P.156
17. Ibid; P.157
18. Ibid; P.133
19. Ibid; P.133
20. Ibid; P.138
21. Ibid; P.153
22. Ibid; P.157
23. Ibid; PP.1-129; 2-129; 3-130; 4-130; 5-136; 6-136; 7-141; 8-148
24. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.22
25. Ibid; P.34
26. Ibid; P.41
27. Ibid; P.49
28. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); P.157

THUS CONFERRED SATAN

M. Ashraf

It seems quite pertinent to mention a translation of a poem of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz', 'Iblis Ki Majlis-i-Shura'. Although, this translation has been given in an interpretative book, whose writer, Malik Muhammad Ashraf, did not focus on its exclusive significance, as his prime aim was the annotations and interpretations of this poem. But, due to its simplicity, clarity and validity, his translation can be placed among the successful and sincerely rendered translations of Iqbal. He published the first edition of the book, 'Devil's Conference', in 1951.*[1] After twenty three years, i.e., in 1974, he presented his revised version of this book, under the title of 'Thus Conferred Satan'.*[2]

The first edition contains 158 pages, whereas, the revised edition is of 360 pages. Obviously, the revised edition contains more material. However, the additional material lies only in the commentaries and interpretations. In the translation, only two changes have been made:

1- There are 64 couplets in the poem. The first translation is just on Iqbal's pattern, but, in the revised version, every couplet has been separately numbered. It is, however, strange that the numbers from 1 to 20 are in the English digits, whereas, the rest of them are in the Roman figures. This lapse, perhaps, is due to the writer's more attention to the annotation than the translation.

2- The translator, in few cases, has tried to bring in substitute words, i.e., synonyms, e.g.:*[3]

The First Edition	The Second Edition
1. base world	vile world
2. Be it so	let there be
3. taught	instructed in
4. blazing fire	devouring blaze

These words have been picked up from the 'devil's first speech'. It seems that both the versions are equally correct. One may take either of the two translations and feel its precision and validity.

It would be relevant to note two discrepancies located in the revised version:

1- Couplet No. xxvi is the, statement of the 'Third Counselor of the Arch-Devil'. M. Ashraf has overlooked the heading, and has mixed it with the preceding statement, i.e., that of the Fourth Counselor.

2- In the fourth couplet of Satan's last speech, there is a hemistich:

توڑ کر دیکھے تو اس تہذیب کے جام و سبو 4*

M. Ashraf's first version is:

> Let him dare smash the goblets and ewers of this Civilization,*5

In the revised version, he writes:

> Let him only dare smash its goblets and if he can*6

Here, he has dropped the word 'ewers'. The conjunction 'and' indicates that the word was there; it is just a typing overlook. Probably, it can be so, but, it does indicate the writer's lack of proper attention to proof-reading.

Overall, it is a translation worth considering, and its annotations are immensely important.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Urdu House, Gujrat.
2. The Book House, Lahore.
3.

	A	B
1-	P.101	P.191
2-	P.102	P.193
3-	P.104	P.195
4-	P.104	P.196

4. Armaghan-i-Hijaz; P.11
5. Devil's Conference; P.125
6. Thus Conferred Satan; P.255

PART TWO

THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL'S PERSIAN POETRY

ASRAR-I-KHUDI

THE SECRETS OF THE SELF

R. A. Nicholson

'Asrar-i-Khudi' was first published in 1915, and its first English translation, 'The Secrets of the Self', was made by Reynold A. Nicholson in 1920.*[1] Fortunately, this translation was revised by Allama Iqbal himself, and all the necessary corrections were incorporated by the translator accordingly. A.J. Arberry got the honour of acquiring Iqbal's original corrected version of this book, and got it published, under the title of 'Notes on Asrar-i-Khudi'.*[2] After going through 'Notes on Asrar-i-Khudi' and the revised edition of 'The Secrets of the Self', a reader comes to know that there are three kinds of corrections recommended by Iqbal, and accepted, or not accepted, by Nicholson:

1- The corrections made by Nicholson exactly as Iqbal recommended.*[3]

2- The corrections recommended by Iqbal and incorporated by Nicholson with further linguistic improvements.*[4]

3- The refinements recommended by Iqbal, but, not accepted and incorporated by Nicholson.*[5]

The rest of the comments made by Iqbal are just explanatory points.*[6] We need not go into minute details of these corrections, since we want to elaborate the basic fact that, after having passed through the minds of two literary giants, i.e., Nicholson and Iqbal, there seems to be least possibility of its being an unreliable rendering.

It is the translation of complete book, except the eighteen couplets, which were, subsequently, included by

Iqbal in the chapter 'Alwaqt-o-Saif' (الوقت سیف).*7 It is in prose and its style is Biblical. It would be correct to say that it is poetic prose, as a number of lines have fullest poetic rhythm, e.g., the following lines are, consciously, or unconsciously, in iambic pentameter:

1- The Gardener tried the power of my song.
2- Within my bosom are a hundred dawns.
3- My dust is brighter than Jamshid's cup.*8

Likewise, the following line can be read as an iambic tetrametric one:

He sowed my verse and reaped a sword.*9

Similarly, the following two lines are iambic hexametric:

1- Tho' I am but a mote, the radiant sun is mine:
2- I have not learned the ways and fashions of the sky:*10

These lines have been taken out of only first three pages. Hundreds of lines are there in this book, which are rhythmical. It is, therefore, difficult to agree with M. Hadi Hussain's view, that "taken as a whole, the translation is rather insipid".*11 Rather, it would be more relevant to assert that a philosopher's translation of a philosopher's book is more poetic in nature than philosophic.

It is a nice translation, beyond any doubt, yet, there are some mistakes, which ironically enough, escaped even Iqbal's keen eye.

1- Line 17 is:

I struck dumb the musicians where they were gathered together.

Its original text is:

محفل رامش گری برہم زدم 12*

'برہم زدن' means 'to scatter', as A.R. Tariq translates it:

> I dispersed the gathering of a musical concert.[*13]

'Struck dumb', does not convey the sense of 'برہم زدن'.

2- Line 26 reads:

> Untouched are the mountains by my crimson hue.

The phrase 'crimson hue' has been used for 'رنگِ حنا', which is myrtle colour and is reddish. A.R. Tariq has also used the word 'crimson', but, in order to save himself, he has added the word 'myrtle' to it:

> And the mountains are not adorned
> With the crimson hue of my Myrtle![*14]

The word 'hena', or 'henna', is also in use in English. Another translator of 'Asrar-i-Khudi', Maqbool Elahi, has rightly rendered it:

> And mountains from my henna's hue
> At distance themselves keep.[*15]

3- Line 33:

> I have no need of the ear of today:

The original text is:

> نغمہ ام از زخمہ بے پرواستم[16*]

Firstly, the first two basic words 'نغمہ ام', have been left untranslated, and, secondly, the word 'زخمہ' (plectrum) has been avoided. What Iqbal says is that he is a celestial song, therefore, needs no material plectrum.

A.R. Tariq has very precisely translated this line:

> I am a Tune,
> Which doesn't need a plectrum.[*17]

4- Lines 88 and 113:

> And imbue the idle looker-on with restless

impatience.
At last mine eye could endure no more.

In these two lines, the words 'looker-on' and 'eye' have been used for the word 'نظارہ' , which Iqbal has used in the sense of 'the act of seeing' or 'sight'. *18

Here are Iqbal's lines:

1- ذوق بیتابی دہم نظارہ را

2- ایں قدر نظارہ ام بے تاب شد *19

Nicholson's words, 'looker-on' and 'eye', therefore, though partially correct, lack precision.

5- Lines 95-6:

Inspired by the genious of the Master of Rum
I rehearse the sealed book of secret lore.

These lines are actually a subordinate clause of the lines No.85 and 86. In these lines (i.e., 85 and 86), Iqbal addresses the Saqi:

Arise and pour pure wine into my cup,
Pour moonbeams into the darker night of my thought.

The next ten lines express Iqbal's desires, and start with 'that I may', and continue with an initial 'and', i.e.:

That I may lead home the wanderer
And imbue the looker-on with restless impatience,
And . . . . . .
And . . . . . . etc.

The lines in question (95 and 96) are the continuum of this statement, and should, therefore, start either with 'that I may' or 'and'. A.R. Tariq has correctly understood Iqbal's syntax:

That, I may express again
The spiritual beneficence of Rumi
And rehearse the secret Book
Of his Divine Wisdom.*20

Iqbal's text also is quite clear:

باز بر خوانم ز فیضِ پیرِ روم
دفترِ سر بستہ اسرارِ علوم *21

Nicholson seems to be confused in the Persian expressions 'بر خوانم' (that I may rehearse) and 'ی خوانم'(I rehearse).

6- Line 102:

And set my ashes aflame.

Iqbal is paying homage to Rumi in these words:

از غبارم جلوہ ہا تعمیر کرد *22

'To set something aflame' is generally used in the negative sense, 'to burn out some worthless object'. Iqbal's meaning, here, is altogether different. The word 'جلوہ' is used in the sense of 'light', 'radiance' or 'manifestation'. Nicholson's line, on the other hand, creates a smoky and gloomy impression.

7- Lines 125 and 126:

Tongue-tied, thou art in pain:
Cast thyself upon the fire, like rue.

The original text is:

در گرہ ہنگامہ داری چوں سپند
محملِ خود بر سرِ آتش بہ بند *23

The word 'ہنگامہ' does not mean 'pain'; it is used for 'tumult' or 'noise'. 'در گرہ داشتن' means 'to have some latent property or

quality'. It is rue's quality of concealment that has been likened by Iqbal to his reader, not its being cast on fire. Moreover, the idiom 'محمل بر آتش بستن' means 'to rest on fire willingly', not to throw something, someone or oneself coercively, as rue is instinctively prone to manifest itself through fire.

8- Lines 57 to 60:

Many a night I wept for man's sake
That I might tear the veil from life's mysteries.
And extract the secret of life's constitution
From the laboratory of phenomena.

Iqbal's text carries the meanings of 'I tore' and 'extracted', i.e., my night-wails bore fruit and I made this achievement. His original words are:

بہر انساں چشمِ من شب ہا گریست تا دریدم پردۂ اسرار زیست
از درونِ کارگاہِ ممکنات بر کشیدم سرِّ تقویمِ حیات *24

Nicholson expresses only the sense of the cause of night-wails, by using the words 'that I may tear/extract'. A.R. Tariq, quite lucidly, renders these lines in these words:

Many a night I wept,
For the good of man,
Untill I tore the curtain,
Which concealed the mysteries of Life!
I brought out the Almanac
Of Human Life,
From the Laboratory of phenomena! *25

9- Line 170:

Cast abroad the secret behind this veil.

Iqbal's couplet is:

خامہ ام از ہمتِ فکر بلند

راز این نُہ پردہ در صحرا فگند 26*

This line is included in the lines corrected by Iqbal himself. Its first version was:

Cast abroad the secret of this veil.*27

Iqbal changed the preposition 'of' into 'behind'. It is, however, unintelligible how he forgot to correct 'نُہ پردہ' (nine curtains), translated by Nicholson simply as 'veil'.

10- Lines 217 and 218:

The Self rises, kindles, falls, glows, breathes;
Burns, shines, walks and flies.

Iqbal's text is:

خیزد، انگیزد، پرد تابد، رمد

سوزد، افروزد، کُشد، میرد، دمد 28*

There is no word in Iqbal's text, which means 'falls', or 'walks' or 'breathes'. The verb 'رمد' has been wrongly translated as 'breathes', and two verbs, 'کُشد' (kills) and 'دمد' (grows) have been left out.

11- Line 265:

When life gathers strength from the self

Iqbal's line is:

چوں خودی آرد بہم نیروے زیست 29*

Nicholson's rendering is quite opposite. He uses 'life' in place of 'self', and 'self' in place of 'life'.

12- Line 335:

The hardest rocks are shivered by love's glance.

Iqbal's words are:

از نگاہِ عشق خارا شق بود 30*

The word 'شق' means 'to be cleft or split asunder'. 'To shiver' is just 'to move in a vibratory style'.

13- Line 372:

He sat with his slave at one table.

Iqbal is writing about the Great Prophet, Muhammad (Sm.):

با غلام خویش بر یک خواں نشست 31*

Everyone knows that the Prophet (Sm.) never sat on a table, nor tables were in use in the Arab society at that time. Actually, it is the quality of human equality, which is being hinted at by Iqbal, and one can convey this sense, without using the word 'table', but, if one feels, at all, a need for its verbal translation, one can use the words 'sheet' or 'carpet' for 'خواں'.

14- Line 424:

Abstained from eating a water-melon.

Iqbal praises Ba Yazid-i-Bastami for his abstaining from eating melon, as he did not know how the Prophet (Sm.) ate it:

اجتناب از خوردن خربوزہ کرد 32*

Nicholson has changed 'melon' into 'water-melon'.

15- Lines 699-700:

Ere tulips blossomed in his brain
There was heard no note of joy and grief.

Iqbal is praising the fertility of a poet's mind and its ability to foresee the future, and, accordingly, create new themes. He says:

در دماغش نادمیدہ لالہ ہا
ناشنیدہ نغمہ ہا ہم نالہ ہا 33*

It is highly astonishing that, in his corrections, Iqbal pointed out the inaccuracy of these two lines, but Nicholson did not make the required amendment.*34 A.R. Tariq is very clear about the sense of this couplet:

The image of unblossomed Tulips
And unheard Songs and Lamentations
Is defined and developed
In his Brain.*35

16- Lines 701-2:

His music breathes o'er us a wonderful enchantment,
His pen draws a mountain with a single hair.

These two lines are the translation of the following couplet:

طرفہ افسوں نقش او بر ما دمد
خامہ اش کوہے بموئے می کشد

This couplet was not there in the first edition of 'Asrar-i-Khudi' (1915). It was included in the second edition (1918: P.57), but again excluded from the third edition (1923).*36

17- Line 710:

And laid a plot to <u>beguile</u> us.

In the preceding lines, Iqbal is lauding the superb qualities of a poet. This line is a continuum of it. About the poet he says:

عندلیبِ او نوا پرداخت است
حیلۂ از بہر ما انداخت است *37

Nicholson, lacking in understanding the sense of the couplet, blames the poet for laying a plot to beguile the nation. On the contrary, A.R. Tariq makes no mistake in grasping the real positive sense of the couplet. He writes:

His Nightingale has produced
An alluring Tune,
And has laid a Plot
To instigate us.[*38]

18- Lines 765-6:

Love hath been put to shame by Thy wailing,
His fair picture hath been fouled by Thy brush.

Iqbal's text is:

عشق رسوا گشته از فریاد تو
زشت رو تمثالش از بہزاد تو [39*]

In the translation of this couplet, Nicholson has lapsed into two mistakes:

(i) He has used 'his' instead of 'its' for love.
(ii) Behzad was a well-known Iranian painter. Nicholson is calling him a brush.

In the next lines (767-85), he goes on using the pronoun 'his' instead of 'its'.

19- Line 885:

Almsgiving causes love of riches to pass away

Iqbal's line is:

حب دولت را فنا سازد زکوٰۃ [40*]

Generally speaking, almsgiving can be a correct rendering. But, Iqbal, at this stage, is talking of the Five Pillars of Islam, Zakat being the second of them. No other word, therefore, seems to be suitable to replace this purely Islamic term.

20- Lines 1667-8:

Mine eye fell to weeping, like dew,
Since I was entrusted with that hidden fire.

The word 'since' denotes that the poet fell to weeping because the hidden fire was prompting him to do so. But,

Iqbal's own text says something else:

همچو شبنم دیدهٔ گریاں شدم
تا امینِ آتشِ پنہاں شدم [41*]

Iqbal's text demands that 'since' should be changed into 'till', as done by A.R. Tariq:

Just like the Dew,
I became a weeping Eye,
Till I was entrusted
With that hidden Fire.[*42]

Other than Iqbal's indications, these were the cases where Nicholson could not do justice. But, it does not mean that his effort is of lesser value by any means. It is a remarkable, and perhaps yet unsurpassed, effort.

NOTES AND REFERENCES

1. Published by Macmillan, London
2. S.M. Ashraf, Lahore; 1992 (date of first publication not given)
3. Lines: 6,18, 43, 71, 94, 116, 136, 138, 170, 193, 208, 243, 257, 281, 288, 295, 298, 301, 305, 306, 310, 315, 316, 317, 337, 354, 363, 365, 378, 434, 446, 534, 556, 557, 558, 635, 636, 644, 670, 704, 715, 767, 792, 869, 875, 881, 931, 932, 941, 943, 1043, 1044, 1045, 1057, 1063, 1071, 1111, 1249, 1250, 1316, 1328, 1330, 1332, 1348, 1374, 1395, 1396, 1436, 1442, 1522, 1528, 1531, 1547-8, 1580, 1595-6, 1608, 1615, 1623, 1635, 1643, 1646, 1656, 1661, 1662, 1664, 1671, 1675, 1695, 1698
4. Lines: 5, 16, 46, 76, 97, 102, 108, 120, 135, 168, 216, 245, 247, 261, 274, 283, 334, 386, 412, 421, 479, 633, 634, 640, 663, 716, 833, 834, 861-2, 942, 963-4, 1013, 1023, 1036, 1037, 1047, 1054, 1064, 1106, 1207-8, 1294, 1329, 1376, 1483-4, 1500, 1536, 1566, 1663, 1676
5. Lines: 105, 127, 134, 210, 215, 231-2, 235, 280, 285, 286, 422, 498, 672, 699-700, 738-42, 906, 907, 1039, 1117, 1289, 1290, 1555, 1559

6. Lines: 13, 24, 293, 314, 493-4, 793, 966, 975, 996, 999, 1000, 1003, 1080, 1325, 1645
7. Couplets: 26 to 43
8. Lines: 5, 10, 11
9. Line: 6
10. Lines: 9, 22
11. The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves, [illegible] Ashraf, Lahore, 1991; P.VI
12. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.6
13. Secrets of Ego; Islamic Book Service, Lahore; 1977; P.46
14. Ibid; P. 47
15. The Secrets of the Self; Iqbal Academy, Lahore, 1986; P. 3
16. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 6
17. op cit; P. 47
18. Farhang-i-Iqbal (Persian); P. 843
19. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 8 and 9
20. Secrets of Ego; P. 53
21. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 8
22. Ibid; P. 9
23. Ibid; P. 9
24. Ibid; P. 11
25. Secrets of Ego; P. 59
26. Asrar-i-Khudi, P. 11
27. Notes on Iqbal's 'Asrar-i-Khudi'; P. 9
28. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 13
29. Ibid; P. 15
30. Ibid; P. 18
31. Ibid; P. 19
32. Ibid; P. 22
33. Ibid; P. 35
34. Notes on Iqbal's 'Asrar-i-Khudi'; P. 25
35. Secrets of Ego; P. 117
36. For Detailed study, please see 'Tasaneef-i-Iqbal Ka Tahqeeqi Aur Tauzihi Mutala'a', by Rafi-ud-Din Hashimi, Iqbal Academy, Lahore, 1982; P.104

37. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.35
38. Secrets of Ego; P. 118
39. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 38
40. Ibid; P. 43
41. Ibid; P. 77
42. Secrets of Ego; P. 223

SECRETS OF EGO

A.R. Tariq

The second translation of 'Asrar-i-Khudi', titled 'Secrets of Ego', appeared in 1977.*[1] The translator is A.R. Tariq, who has actually presented a revised version of Nicholson's translation of this book. It can be irrefutably said that it is the second revision of Nicholson's work --- first by Iqbal and second by A.R. Tariq. The difference between Iqbal and A.R. Tariq's revision is that the former pointed out just the problematic lines, but, the latter revised the text completely.

It is a prose translation, with a smooth and clear syntax. The diction has been changed from Biblical to the modern English, i.e., the words 'thou', 'thee', 'hath', 'doth' etc, have been changed into 'you', 'has', and 'does'. The syntax has been so simplified that, throughout the book, one can scarcely find any sentence, which might cause semantic complexity.

Mostly, it is a quite careful rendering, and suitable alterations in Nicholson's translation, at times, sound very pleasant, as it is a simplification of Nicholson's text as well. However, we have to be careful about the weaknesses of this translation also, since the translator is not a native speaker of English, and there is a sheer possibility of linguistic or semantic flaws. Given below are our findings in this respect:

1- In the 'Prologue', couplet 13, there are two lines:

> The ocean couldn't partake the pleasure
> Of my dancing Rays,*[2]

The verb 'partake' is always followed by the preposition 'of', i.e., 'partake of'.

2- In the Chapter I, couplet 6, he reads 'می کُشد' as 'می کَشد', and translates accordingly:

> It <u>carries</u> and <u>moves</u> heavy weights
> With the strength of its own Arm.*[3]

Iqbal's line is:

می کُشد از قوتِ بازوے خویش *[4]

Nicholson and Maqbool Elahi, in their translations,*[5] and Yusuf Saleem Chishti and Ghulam Rasool Mehr, in their commentaries on 'Asrar-i-Khudi',*[6] have read it as 'می کُشد'.

3- In the chapter I, couplet 38, he translates the word chinar 'چنار' as <u>a poplar</u>:

> The beauty of a Poplar Tree
> Allures our Sight,*[7]

Poplar is a well-known green tree, whereas chinar is known for its redness. Nicholson translates it as 'red-beech' and Maqbool Elahi as 'red-plane tree'.

4- In the Chapter III, couplet 4, he makes a grammatical mistake, by using 'who' instead of 'which'.

> Its nature obtains Flame
> From "Love",
> <u>Who</u> instructs it to illuminate
> The whole world.*[8]

5- In the Chapter III (25), he uses, as did Nicholson, the word 'table' for the Prophet's sitting:

> --- he sat with his Slave
> At one <u>Table</u>!*[9]

Thus, he also seats the Prophet (Sm.) on a dining-table.

6- In the Chapter IV (11), he misses correct meanings by using the word 'although', instead of 'if ever', 'ever if' or 'even though':

Although you are poor,
And wretched,
And overwhelmed
By the Flood of Calamities
Yet don't seek your Sustenance
From the bounty of others!
Do not seek water
From the Fountain of sun.*10

Iqbal's couplets are:

گرچہ باشی تنگ روز و تنگ بخت   در رہِ سیل بلا افگندہ رخت
رزق خویش از نعمتِ دیگر مجو   موجِ آب از چشمۂ خاور مجو*11

Maqbool Elahi is well aware of this linguistic subtlety; he translates:

Even though in penury,
In clutches of wretchery be,
Even though all possessions yours
Wash off the stormy sea.
Seek not your sustenance from
Bounty of this, that, other
Seek not even a ripple from
The sun ('s gushing river).*12

7- In the Chapter IV (14), he uses the word 'substance' instead of 'sustenance':

The Moon gets her Substance
From the Table of the Sun,
Therefore she bears the brand
Of his bounty on her heart!*13

The word 'his' and 'her' also sound awkward for the two planets. Iqbal uses the word 'روزی', which means 'sustenance', not 'substance':

ماہ را روزی رسد از خوانِ مہر

داغ بر دل دارد از احسانِ مہر *14

8- In the Chapter VI (7), we come across a queer use of 'must', expressing the past necessity of tigers:

Since the Tigers
Must have their Prey,
That meadow turned red
With the blood of Sheep!*15

Let us quote an eminent grammarian, Michael Swan, to resolve this matter. He writes, "Must is normally not used to talk about past obligations --- 'Had to' is used to talk about outside obligations in the past."*16 'Must', therefore, should be changed into 'had to', then the verb 'prey' should be added.

9- In the Chapter VIII (7), we come across a mistake in the use of pronoun; 'our' has been used instead of 'your':

Its image becomes inscribed
In our Heart,
And it creates Desires
In our Heart!*17

Iqbal's couplet is:

نقش او محکم نشیند در دِلت

آرزو ہا آفریند در دِلت *18

10- In the Chapter VIII (46), the word 'Brush' has been used instead of 'Behzad', as did Nicholson. Although, A.R. Tariq adds a foot-note to justify his translation, by using the

words, 'the Painter's Brush',*[19] yet, there seems to be no justification for using, even figuratively, the word 'Brush' for an historical figure, 'Behzad'.

11- In the Chapter IX (11), the pronoun 'his' has been used for star:

The star marches on
To his Destination,*[20]

12- In the Chapter IX (61), a similar mistake has been committed; the same possessive pronoun, 'his', has been used, instead of 'this':

He gives us new explanation
Of "Life", --
And, a new interpretation
Of his dream!*[21]

Iqbal uses the words 'ایں خواب' :

زندگی را می کند تفسیرِ نو
می دہد ایں خواب را تعبیرِ نو *22

13- In the couplet 65 of the same Chapter, he again uses 'who' for 'which':

In the ashes of our Today
Is asleep that Flame of Tomorrow,
Who will burn the whole world
Of Evil.*[23]

14- In the Chapter X (29), a complete line has been added by the translator:

Arise, and create a new world!
Wrap yourself in Flames,
And cry like Abraham:
"I do not love the setting ones!"*[24]

Now, let us see Iqbal's text:

خیز و خلاق جہانِ تازہ شو
شعلہ در بر کن خلیل آوازہ شو *25

There are no words in Iqbal's text, which mean 'I do not love the setting ones'.

15- In the Chapter XII (5), the translator has misused a verb. He uses the verb 'sharped' instead of 'sharpened':

"O slave of vain desire!" said
The Diamond, "You have sharped
Your greedy beak on me."*26

16- In the Chapter XVIII (18), the translator is rendering the couplet in the present indefinite tense, whereas, in this couplet, Iqbal expresses a desire; therefore, it should begin with 'that I may', 'that I should' etc:

I sow it in the Garden,
And there grows a Flame,
Which washes away the fire-brand
From the Tulip's cloak!*27

Iqbal prays to God to grant him the tear, which he may sow in the garden and grow flames to surpass the tulips:

کارمش در باغ و روید آتشے
از قبائے لالہ شوید آتشے *28

Nicholson has clearly understood these lines:

May I sow in the garden, and may it grow into a fire
That washes away the fire-brand from the tulip's robe!*29

This was a surview of A.R. Tariq's pitfalls. Another irksome aspect of this translation is an indiscriminate and excessive use of initial capital letters. Despite our utmost speculation, we could not set rules for this reckless approach.

Anyhow, keeping aside some of the weaknesses indicated above, A.R. Tariq's effort is quite valuable and his sincerity is reflected in the translation.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Islamic Book Service, Lahore.
2. Secrets of Ego; P.47
3. Ibid; P.64
4. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.13
5. Pages 17 and 17 respectively
6. Pages 266 and 65 respectively
7. Secrets of Ego; P.70
8. Ibid; P.77
9. Ibid; P.82
10. Ibid; P.92
11. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.24
12. The Secrets of the Self (M.E); P.38
13. Secrets of Ego; P.92
14. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.24
15. Secrets of Ego; P.102
16. Practical English Usage; Oxford University Press; 1996; P.350
17. Secrets of Ego; P.116
18. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.35
19. Secrets of Ego; P.124
20. Ibid; P.132
21. Ibid; P.143
22. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.45
23. Secrets of Ego; P.144
24. Ibid; P.153

25. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.49
26. Secrets of Ego; P.167
27. Ibid; P.221
28. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.76
29. The Secrets of the Self (Nich.); P.144; lines 1651-2

THE SECRETS OF THE SELF

Maqbool Elahi

The third translation of 'Asrar-i-Khudi', made by Maqbool Elahi, bearing the title of 'The Secrets of the Self', appeared in 1986.*1 It is a poetic rendering. It is clear from the 'Preface' to this book that the translator has intensively read Nicholson. The glimpses of Nicholson's translation are also felt in the text as well. There is, however, no signal given by the translator whether he read A.R. Tariq or not.

Neither of the two languages, English and Persian, is the translator's mother tongue, yet, it can be said that he seems to possess a remarkable proficiency in both the languages. As far as meanings are concerned, his rendering can be regarded better than that of Nicholson. First, he grasps the meanings of Iqbal's Persian text accurately and, then, he manages to successfully present it in the English language. He leaves minimum chance of semantic mistakes.

Unlike Nicholson and A.R. Tariq, Maqbool Elahi's rendering is in verse. He has selected, as his model, the verse style used by the Victorian poets, especially Tennyson. Coleridge's 'Rime of the Ancient Mariner' was also composed in the same metre. In this style, a stanza is formed with four lines, of which the first and the third lines are in iambic tetrameter, and the second and the forth lines are in iambic trimeter. Maqbool Elahi exercises his poetic genius in his work and, sporadically, creates excellent stanzas. Let us, for example, feel the rhythm of just two of them:

(1) My garden Stands embellished by
The foliage yet unborn

I carry flowers in my skirt,
Yet branches don't adorn.*2

(2) The stars have not yet taken flight
Before my Splendour great
My quick-silver is static yet
Its stirring does await.*3

The entire book is interspersed with such rhythmically well-knit stanzas. But, one feels immensely uneasy, when one comes across a large number of stanzas having no rhythm, or distorted rhythm. We need not bring examples for it, as the translator himself is well conscious of it. He admits:

> The metre, however, is not consistent. It varies. Somehow, I varied it unconsciously as the tempo of the original took hold of me. Later, during revisions, when I became conscious of this, I let it remain as it had come.*4

This mistake of not revising his rhythm has resulted into a sheer reduction in the quality of his work.

Moreover, since Maqbool Elahi develops Iqbal's every couplet into a four-lined stanza, i.e., he duplicates the text, he can not avoid redundancy. In his effort to highlight this redundancy, he introduces an unprecedented style. He adds brackets in the beginning and at the end of every additional word, phrase or clause, e.g.:

1- word: My dust is far far brighter than
King Jamshid's famous cup;
(For), it knows well yet-unborn things
In (this) world's whole set-up*5

2- phrase: I am the sun that's newly born

In this world (old and vast).
I hav'nt learnt the ways and laws
Of skies (swirling fast).*6

3- clause: My roof received the rays of the Sun
And broke the (spell of) night
And fresh dew settled on the rose
(Making the world so spright).*7

The entire book is replete with such redundant material. At many stages, he has introduced a queer style of writing a word outside the bracket and its apostrophe and 's' inside it, e.g.:

And ocean deep be better mad
Than face its fury ('s line.)*8

He seems to be in a fix, while looking for rhymes. At times, he is compelled to bring in ridiculous rhymes, e.g.:

Its flame it did split into
The littlest well-lit sparks
And worship of minute details
It taught to reason ('s clerks.)*9

The word 'clerks' is absolutely out of place and ridiculous. Similarly, workshop/warp; dawn/anon; Jami/immaturity; characteristics/statistics; his/bliss; fair/lovelier; taste/date; abode/horde; had/lacked; old/disposed; God/lord; Jinn/been; old/Lord; etc. can be cited as pseudo-rhymes.*10

The above discussion is sufficient to prove that Maqbool Elahi's translation can not be ranked among the poetically acceptable translations. On the other hand, he is successful in conveying the meanings in an appropriate language. However, a discriminate reader finds the following weaknesses in it:

1- In 'Introduction', there are two lines:

My roof received the rays of the sun
And broke the (spell of) night.*11

Iqbal's line is:

بامم از خاور رسید و شب شکست 12*

The word 'بام', which is an abbreviated form of 'بامداد', means 'morning'. The translator mistook it for 'roof', and, in accordance with it, made another glaring mistake of using the word 'received' instead of 'reached' or 'arrived'.

The line simply means:

My morning has arrived from the East and the night is over.

2- In 'Introduction', there is a stanza:

Full many a night for man-kind
My eyes have shed tears
That I may rend the veil of
Life's mysteries, (hopes and fears.)*13

Iqbal's text is:

بہر انساں چشمِ من شب ہا گریست
تا دریدم پردۂ اسرار زیست 14*

The words 'تا دریدم' mean 'until I tore', but Maqbool writes, 'that I may'.

3- In the Chapter II, there are two lines:

The heart, by burning desire
Inspire life with zeal.*15

Its original hemistich is:

دل ز سوزِ آرزو گیرد حیات 16*

The word 'inspire', (if not misprinted), should have been 'inspires'.

4- In the Chapter III, the word 'water-melon' has been used instead of melon:

A water-melon he abstained
From eating (due to caution).*17

5- In the Chapter XVI, there is a stanza:

The preachers as well mystics
Worship the worldy rank;
The "radiant nation's" prestige
To lowest depth has sank*18

The words 'rank' and 'sank' rhyme with each other, but, 'sank', being the past participle of the verb 'sink', is incorrect. Its correct form is 'sunk'.

6- Some flaws in the use of prepositions have also been traced in this book:

(i) The fate of moths is constantly
Themselves to immolate
And for this sacrifice unique
The candles compensate.*19

The verb 'compensate' is used without any preposition, not 'compensate for'.

(ii) Himself consuming, he bemoaned
Of fate's vicissitude*20

The verb 'bemoaning' is also used without any preposition.

(iii) Possessed he was of a grasping mind*21

The simple meaning of this line is:

He had a grasping mind

If someone wants to use the verb 'possess' to convey this sense, one can use it in two ways:

(a) He possessed a grasping mind
(b) He was in possession of a grasping mind

'To be possessed of' means to be possessed of some gennie or some other supernatural entity.

7- In this translation, one also finds some words which, though not altogether incorrect, sound heavy or queer:*22

(i) God-sents ہر شے

(ii) laskhar لشکر

(iii) youngish کوچک

(iv) thread-girdle زنار

(v) guider-by-the-hand دستگیر

(vi) un-being نیستی

8- There is a line in 'Tamheed':

در جہاں خورشید نوزائیدہ ام *23

Maqbool Elahi's translation of this line is:

I am the sun that's newly born*24

This translation can be correct only if we take the infinitives 'زادن' and 'زائیدن' as synonyms. But, if we take them strictly in their literal sense, i.e., 'زادن' (to be born) and 'زائیدن' (to give birth to), the translation would be:

I have given birth to a new sun.

So, if someone takes the verb 'زائیدن' in its actual transitive form, his approach cannot be ruled out.

To wind up, it is a nice translation in a pseudo-poetic style. Although, its literary significance has been eclipsed by the translator's lack of proper attention to the poetic artistry,

yet, its semantic significance is intact, and can be utilized in the subsequent efforts.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. The Secrets of the Self; P.2
3. Ibid
4. Ibid; P. iii
5. Ibid; P.2
6. Ibid; P.2
7. Ibid; P.3
8. Ibid; P.5
9. The Secrets of the Self (M.E); P.18
10. Ibid; Please see PP. 12, 26, 34, 46, 57, 67, 93, 99, 104, 111, 112, 124
11. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.6
12. The Secrets of the Self (M.E); P.3
13. Ibid, P.12
14. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.11
15. The Secrets of the Self (M.E); P.24
16. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.16
17. The Secrets of the Self (M.E); P.35
18. Ibid; P.127
19. Ibid; P.17
20. Ibid; P.47
21. Ibid; P.104
22. Ibid; PP. 1-23; 2-35; 3-42; 4-106; 5-114; 6-117
23. Asrar-i-Khudi; P.6
24. The Secrets of the Self; P.2

ROMOOZ-I-BEKHUDI

THE MYSTERIES OF SELFLESSNESS

A.J. Arberry

Since its first publication, in 1918, 'Romooz-i-Bekhudi' has witnessed only two translations:

1- The Mysteries of Selflessness; by A.J. Arberry; 1953*1

2- Secrets of Collective Life; by A.R. Tariq; 1977*2

Both the translations have got their own importance.

THE MYSTERIES OF SELFLESSNESS

It is a poetic translation. A.J. Arberry has adopted the blank verse in it, using iambic pentameter as his rhythmic pattern. Keeping in view the convention of the blank verse, his verse is unrhymed, and run-on lines have been used throughout the book. Verse paragraphs have been formed in accordance with Iqbal's text.

Since Arberry is a native speaker of English and a renowned orientalist, his standard of translation is very high, both poetically and semantically. Being himself a poet, he endeavours to give his work an outlook of Milton's 'Paradise Lost' or Wordsworth's 'The Prelude'. He seems to be almost successful in his effort.

Despite Arberry's utmost care, there are some stages, where his translation is weak, sometimes even not acceptable:

1- The very first couplet of 'Romooz-i-Bekhudi' is:

اے ترا حق خاتم اقوام کرد

بر تو ہر آغاز را انجام کرد *3

Arberry translates the first line as this:

You, who were made by God to be the Seal
Of all the peoples dwelling upon earth,*4

Actually, Iqbal had an unflinching faith in the Finality of Prophethood. He also regards the Muslim Ummah as the last nation in the world. So, this concept of the finality of nationalism is closely associated with Iqbal and the Muslim majority's religious conviction. The word 'seal', therefore, cannot satisfy the orthodox Muslims. A.R. Tariq has convincingly rendered it thus:

O you! whom Allah has made
Last of the Nations.*5

2- An apparently minor, but, actually a grave, mistake is the use of 'were' instead of 'are' in this line:

Whose saints were prophet like, ----*6

This statement is about the Muslim Ummah, and is an allusion to the Holy Prophet's (Sm.) *hadith* that the scholars of His Ummah are like the prophets of Bani Israel, since the Prophet's (Sm.) proclamation is not time-bound, it is by no means justifiable to associate it only with the past.

3- There is a couplet in 'Romooz-i-Bekhudi':

عشق را داغے مثالِ لالہ بس
در گریبانش گل یک نالہ بس *7

In the translation of this couplet, Arberry says:

Love, like the tulip, has one brand at heart,
And, on its bosom, wears a single rose;*8

In the second line, he has overlooked the pivotal word 'نالہ'. Iqbal does not mean only a rose, but 'the rose of lamentation'.

4- While discussing the relationship between an individual Muslim and the Ummah, Iqbal says:

پختہ تر از گرمیٔ صحبت شود
تا بہ معنی فرد ہم ملت شود*9

Arberry renders it:

His immaturity
Is warmed to ripeness by their friendship's flame,
Till he becomes one with the Commonwealth.*10

'Commonwealth' is a political term, used for a comity of nations dominated by the British. It is unintelligible as to why Arberry has chosen this word for 'Millat', a key-word, used for the Muslim Ummah, in Iqbal's system of thought.

5- In a couplet, Iqbal regards fear as a spy of the realm of death, and, then, mentions its inner darkness:

بیم جاسوسے است از اقلیم مرگ
اندرونش تیرہ مثل میم مرگ *11

In the translation of the second line, Arberry seems to have been distracted:

Its spirit dark and chill as Death's own heart.*12

Thus, he has translated 'میم' as 'heart'. A.R. Tariq seems to be more careful in his translation of this line:

And its interior is as dark
As the *'meem'* of *'marg'*.*13

6- There are two couplets, wherein Iqbal mentions the cause of the finality of the Prophethood and that of Islamic Shariah:

تا نہ ایں وحدت ز دستِ ما رود
ہستیٔ ما با ابد ہمدم شود

پس خدا بر ما شریعت ختم کرد
بر رسولؐ ما رسالت ختم کرد [14*]

Arberry separates these two couplets:

Let not this unity go from our hands,
And we endure to all eternity.
God set the seal of holy Law on us,
As in our Prophet all Apostleship
Is sealed.[*15]

Using the word 'let', Arberry makes it a suggestive statement, whereas, it is a causal clause, related to the next sentence. A.R. Tariq translates these couplets quite clearly:

So that we may not lose
This perfect Unity,
And be always associated
With Eternity!
Just as Allah has put an end
To Prophecy, after the Holy Prophet,
He has also put an End
To Religion.[*16]

7- Iqbal enumerates the qualities of the Ummah by mentioning it clearly in two couplets, and, then, using the pronoun 'او' for it:

امتے از ماسوا بیگانۂ
بر چراغ مصطفٰیؐ پروانۂ
امتے از گرمئ حق سینہ تاب
ذرہ اش شمع حریم آفتاب
کائنات از کیف او رنگیں شدہ
کعبہ ہا بت خانہ ہائے چیں شدہ [17*]

The third couplet has been misunderstood by Arberry. He uses the pronoun 'his' for the Ummah:

His fervour flushed
Creation all with joy;*18

This misconception goes on in the next five couplets, till the end of the chapter.

8- In paying tribute to Ali and Hussain (may their souls rest), Iqbal says:

اللہ اللہ بائے بسم اللہ پدر
معنی ذبح عظیم آمد پسر 19*

Perhaps, Arberry did not know Ali's statement about himself, "I am the *'ba'* (ب) of *Bismilla*". His rendering, therefore, is very vague:

Ali's son,
Whose father led the sacrificial feast,
That he might prove a mighty offering.*20

He has left the first line and expanded the second.

9- In the same chapter, Iqbal has a couplet:

دشمناں چوں ریگ صحرا لا تعد
دوستانِ او بہ یزداں ہم عدد 21*

By 'یزداں' Iqbal means 'seventy two', as according to the Muslim science of *Jafar* (علم ابجد), every alphabet has its value in figures. The value of the letters in 'یزداں' is this:

10	=	ی
7	=	ز
4	=	د
1	=	ا

50	=	ن
Total =	72	

Arberry does not give any idea of this concept, and simply translates the second line as this:

Equal his friends in number to God's Name.*22

As it is difficult to express this idea into some other language, A.R. Tariq has simplified it thus:

But his friends were only
Seventy-two.*23

10- In the translation of the following couplet, the second line has been left untranslated:

بر لبش آہے جگر تابے رسید
درمیانِ سینۂ او دل تپید *24

11- In a couplet, Arberry portrays just the opposite meaning:

فکرِ خام تو گراں خیز است و لنگ
تہمت گل بست بر پروازِ رنگ *25

Simply, it means that an immature thinker gives the name of flower to the flying colour. Arberry takes the opposite sense as this:

Thy thought is immature, lame, slow to rise,
If thou suppose the mortal flower itself
The fleeting colour.*26

A.R. Tariq is quite clear about it:

Your thought is very low
And lame,
Because it considered

The flight of colour
As a rose.*27

12- In a couplet, Iqbal emphasizes the semantic connotations of the word *'Ummat'*, he says:

ہست اگر فرہنگ تو معنی رسے
حرف امت نکتہ ہا دارد بسے *28

Actually, Iqbal points towards the root of this word, 'اُم' (mother), to highlight the sense of motherhood in the concept of Ummah. Arberry has nullified the subtlety of the word (Ummah), by translating it thus:

If thou art learned to attain the truth
Behind the form, our word Community
Hath, in the Persian, many Subtleties.*29

13- In the exegesis of a sura, *'Al-Ikhlas'*, Iqbal chastises the ones who depend on others than on God:

ارجمندی از شعارش می بری
من ندانم تو توئی یا دیگری *30

Arberry renders it in this way:

In those insignia thou takest pride,
Until I know not if thou be thyself
Or art another*31

Nothing can be said as to why the translator has used the word 'until'.

Apart from the above shortcomings, one finds some words or phrases, in this translation, which could be ticked as imprecise. Briefly, we can list them as follows:*32

1- sacred well   زمزم

2- oak   شمشاد

3- tiger	شیر ببر
4- cadi	قاضی
5- jealous	غیّور
6- flight	ہجرت
7- dawn's sun	صبحِ آفتاب
8- good words	حدیث

Careful reader may find more weaknesses in this translation. However, this translation can be offered as one of the exquisite efforts in field of the translations from poetry to poetry. Arberry's command of poetic language and style is to the extent that, at times, one feels like reading Milton or Wordsworth.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by John Murray, London.
2. Published by Islamic Book Service, Lahore.
3. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.81
4. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.1
5. Secrets of Collective Life; P.1
6. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.1
7. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.83
8. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.3
9. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.86
10. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.6
11. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.96
12. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.15
13. Secrets of Collective Life; P.36
14. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.102

15. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.20
16. Secrets of Collective Life; P.52
17. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.104
18. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.22
19. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.110
20. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.27
21. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.111
22. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.28
23. Secrets of Collective Life; P.75
24. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.130
25. Ibid; P.134
26. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.49
27. Secrets of Collective Life; P.135
28. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.149
29. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.63
30. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.160
31. The Mysteries of Selflessness; P.72
32. Ibid; PP 1-6; 2-6; 3-18; 4-24; 5-27; 6-31; 7-51; 8-71

SECRETS OF COLLECTIVE LIFE

A.R. Tariq

A.R. Tariq's rendering of 'Romooz-i-Bekhudi', published in 1977,*[1] titled 'Secrets of Collective Life' is a prose translation, like his 'Secrets of Ego'. The translator has tried to be as simple as possible, as he did in his first translation. His sincerity and devotion is quite evident from the outlook of the book. All the chapters, and under them, all the couplets are numbered to facilitate the reference work. Footnotes on every page are very helpful in understanding the text.

The initial considerable point is A.R. Tariq's translation of the word 'Bekhudi' in a phrase 'Collective Life'. Although, in this phrase, a single word has been translated into two, yet, it sounds more akin to Iqbal's concept of 'Bekhudi', which embosoms the social aspect of the life of the Muslim Ummah. In this perspective, this phrase is broader than 'selflessness', which can be associated only with an individual.

Obviously, it is a good translation. Yet, at some stages, it needs revision:

1- It has been observed that A.R. Tariq is somewhat careless in the use of prepositions:

(i) The verb 'instruct' is always followed by 'in', but, A.R. Tariq uses 'with' after it:

(a) It is the Nation, which <u>instructs</u> him <u>with</u> "Discipline" and "Self-control".*[2]

(b) ----- and it is he
who <u>instructs</u> them

With Faithfulness and Obedience!*3

(c) Since she was instructed
With Patience and Submission.*4

(ii) The verb 'engage' is followed by 'in', but, A.R. Tariq uses 'by' after it:

He is engaged only by
Weeping, sucking and slumber.*5

(iii) The verb 'partake' is always followed by 'of', but, A.R. Tariq uses it without any preposition:

If you desire to partake
The knowledge of the Religion
Of Islam, then come and sit
In the circle of my Instruction!*6

2- He is, at times, careless in direct or indirect narration:

(i) Yet this drop never says
That I am from the Narcissus,
And that drop never says
That I am from the Lotus!*7

It is a fundamental rule in the change of narration that in indirect speech the first personal pronoun, 'I/We', is changed into the third personal pronoun, 'he, she, it/they' etc. So, 'I' in the above extract should be changed into 'it', followed by 'is'.

(ii) In his supplication to the Prophet (Sm.), at the end of the book, Iqbal says:

محفل از شمع نوا افروختم   قوم را رمز حیات آموختم
گفت بر ما بندد افسونِ فرنگ   ہست غوغایش ز قانونِ فرنگ *8

Here is A.R. Tariq's, 'fallacious' rendering:

I illumined an Assembly
With the Candle of my Voice,
And I told the Nation
The Secret of Life!
To all my Instruction,
He responded
"I have a Spell of Britain
Upon my Head!"
Of course, all his Tunes are
From the Musical Instrument
Of Britain.*9

Firstly, in 'He responded', the pronoun 'He' should be changed into 'it', since an assembly is not 'he'. Secondly, the pronouns should agree with the reporting speech, and the inverted commas should either be dropped to make it an indirect speech, or should be inserted in the beginning and at the end of the statement. Here are both the forms:

(a) direct It responded
"He has a Spell of Britain
On our Heads!
Of course all his Tunes are
From the Musical Instrument
Of Britain."

(b) indirect It responded
That I have a spell of Britain
On their Heads!
Of course, all my Tunes are
From the Musical Instrument
Of Britain.

3- It looks very queer, when A.R. Tariq uses the pronouns 'he' or 'she' for abstractions, e.g., about love he uses 'he':

"Love" is yet a greater Killer,
He is purer, cleverer.*10

For reason, he uses 'she':

But Reason, being cunning,
Can only throw her Net!*11

4- The attribute 'خیر الانام' is exclusively used for the Holy Prophet (Sm.) in the Muslim Tradition, but, A.R. Tariq has used it for the Muslim Ummah:

Therefore, O people of the best Nation
Of the world! Now his bloodshed
Is forbidden to our swords!*12

Iqbal's original couplet is:

خونِ او اے معشرِ خیرُ الانام
بر دمِ تیغِ مسلماناں حرام *13

Other than these grammatical and lexical flaws, there are some other imprecise words and phrases, which are distasteful to a curious reader. Here is a short list of them: *14

1- Prophecy — نبوت
2- deer — نخچیر
3- sentence — کلمہ
4- flee — ہجرت (کردن)
5- the morning sun — صبحِ آفتاب
6- illiterate person — امّی

The word 'prophecy' is used for prediction: for apostlehood (نبوت), the word 'Prophethood' is used. ' نخچیر ' means prey; any animate or, may be, inanimate, object can be a prey; why to confine it only to some deer. 'Kalima' is not merely a sentence; it is an emblem of Islam. Every sentence cannot be 'Kalima'. To use the word 'to flee' for 'ہجرت' is to admit fright and cowardice: thus, it is a derogatory word for the Prophet's migration, which was made only on Allah's command. ' صبح آفتاب ' means 'the shining morning', not 'the morning sun'. 'An illiterate person' has been used for the Prophet (Sm.). It is also a derogatory, phrase. The Holy Prophet (Sm.) was unschooled, but, not illiterate, as His guide was Allah Himself.

Generally speaking, overlooking its linguistic shortcomings, this is a valuable translation, and can serve as a model for further translation work on Iqbal.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Islamic Book Service; Lahore.
2. Secrets of Collective Life; P.12
3. Ibid; P.22
4. Ibid; P.187
5. Ibid; P.167
6. Ibid; P.203
7. Ibid; P.207
8. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.167
9. Secrets of Collective Life; P.221
10. Ibid; P.69
11. Ibid; P.70
12. Ibid; P.63
13. Romooz-i-Bekhudi; P.106
14. Secrets of Collective Life; PP. 1-47; 2-55; 3-82; 4-82; 5-140; 6-15

PAYAM-I-MASHRIQ

THE TULIP OF SINAI

A.J. Arberry

'The Tulip of Sinai', a translation of 163 quatrains of 'Lala-i-Toor', the first part of 'Payam-i-Mashriq', was published in 1947.*1 It is a poetic translation, wherein A.J. Arberry appears, for the first time, as a poet-translator of Iqbal. It is a line for line rendering in Fitzgeraldian style, in iambic pentameter. Arberry's subsequent poetic competence seems to be intermittently reflected in this small volume of 36 pages. His initial weaknesses are also observable herein.

As a poet, we find Arberry more careful in rhythm, but less careful in rhyme. There is, perhaps, just one line, which has a distorted rhythm:

That labours fiercely and blazes with good cheer.*2

As the entire translation is in iambic pentameter, we expect this line to be in the same metre, but, its scansion reveals that it has an extra foot, which renders it rhythmless:

Thāt lá/bōurs fiérce/lȳ ánd/blā zés/wīth goód/cheer

If, however, we divide the word 'fierce' into two syllables, we can safely read the line as a hexametric one:

Thāt lá/bōurs fí/ērce lý/ānd blá/zēs wíth/gōod chéer/

In this way, Arberry can be acquitted of the charge of rhythmlessness. Although, in this case, it will be the only hexametric line in the book, yet, it is also an established fact that the English poets have used hexametric lines in pentametric compositions.

Being a translator, Arberry seems to be under a sheer constraint in bringing in suitable rhymes. His rhyme scheme is of two types ***aaba*** and ***abcb***. Let us have a look at a

quatrain, where he has tried to follow *aaba* scheme, but he could not bring in properly rhyming words:

What man in secret is not sorrowful,
He hath a body, but he hath no soul:
Desirest thou a spirit? Then pursue
The fire and fever that shall never cool[13]

The words 'ful', 'soul' and 'cool' are neither phonetically, nor orthographically congruous as rhymes. Here are some other pseudo-rhymes of Arberry:

Quatrain No. 4:	cheap; grip; leap
Quatrain No. 22:	Gabriel; well
Quatrain No. 29:	quest; possessed
Quatrain No. 34:	Jam; Abraham; I am (also 43 and 53)
Quatrain No. 57:	death; faith
Quatrain No. 62:	blandishments; sense
Quatrain No. 92:	lovelier; air
Quatrain No. 116:	breast; addressed
Quatrain No. 123:	possessed; rest
Quatrain No. 153:	again; men

Arberry's rhymes may be poetically objectionable, yet, they do not impede the intelligibility of the text. His translation is pellucid and clear, particularly, the quatrains No. 37, 88, 97, 107, 122, 126, 140, 146 and 159, which seem to be relatively more simple and fluent. Let us take, for instance, the quatrain No. 159, which is highly philosophical in its sense, but has been translated in very simple words:

Words are too frail, abodelessness to bear
Look inwardly, and see this point is clear;
The soul has such a seat within the flesh
One cannot say, "It is not here, but there".

Other than his simple style of most of the quatrains, he has given some very suitable and rare words, which speak of his creative genius and literary taste. Here is a short list of some of them:*4

1-	langurous eye	چشمِ مست
2-	joy-in-grief	ذوقِ مہجوری
3-	air	نوا
4-	being and decay	کون و فساد
5-	self sown tulip	لالۂ خودرو
6-	cherubin	قدسیاں
7-	piercing eye	چشمِ رسا
8-	finite space	مکاں
9-	spacelessness	لامکاں
10-	ringing cry	آوازِ درا
11-	Creator's "Be"	کُن فکاں
12-	lilt	حدی
13-	diamantine hue	رنگ الماس
14-	anemones	لالۂ نعمانی
15-	plangent melodies	فغاں (نغماتِ پُرسوز)
16-	abodelessness	لامکاں

These words have added radiance to Arberry's translations. There are, however, some places where he has not been successful in grasping Iqbal's intended meanings:

1- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 4 is:

نگہ دارد دلِ ما خویشتن را
ولیکن از کمینش بر جهد عشق 5*

Arberry's translation is:

Our hearts look carefully to their defence
But suddenly, out of ambush, love doth leap.

The translation of 'ش' (its), in 'کمینش', has been left, which determines that although, heart is highly self-defendant, yet, love springs forth out of its own ambush.

2- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 8 is:

نگاہ ما دوبیں افتاد ورنہ
جہانِ ہر کسے اندر دلِ اوست 6*

It has been rendered as:

Surely our sight is double, or the world
Of every man is in his heart to see.

The word 'ورنہ' (otherwise) can not be translated as 'or'.

3- In the quatrain No. 10, Iqbal is talking about the existing world; the second couplet is:

کہن را نو کن و طرحِ دگر ریز
دلِ ما بر نتابد دیر و زودش 7*

Here again, Arberry has misunderstood the inflection 'ش' (its, i.e., the world):

Our heart will not endure it, soon or late:
Make new the world and build it up again.

'It' should be changed into 'its' and the comma dropped.

4- In the next quatrain (No. 11), Iqbal talks about God and man; the second couplet is:

جہاں او آفرید ایں خوب تر ساخت
مگر با ایزد انباز است آدم 8*

Arberry says:

God made the world; man made it yet more fair;
And is Man God's competitor to be?

The word 'and' is additional here, causing a hindrance in the meaning.

5- Iqbal's quatrain No. 14 is:

تنے پیدا کن از مشتِ غبارے
تنے محکم تر از سنگیں حصارے
درونِ او دلِ درد آشنائے
چو جوئے درکنارِ کوہسارے 9*

Arberry has not translated the imperative words,'پیدا کن', losing the entire sense of the quatrain:

A hand of dust, a body fortified,
Firmer than rocky rampart shall abide;
Yet beats therein a sorrow-conscious Heart
A river flowing by a mountainside.

6- The first couplet of the quatrain No. 38 is:

چہ می پرسی میانِ سینہ دل چیست؟
خرد چوں سوز پیدا کرد دل شد 10*

Arberry uses the physical term, 'brain' for 'خرد' and, then, consumes it to create a heart:

Enquirest thou, what is this Heart of Thine?
The Heart was born, when fire consumed the brain.

Hadi Hussain has offered a sublime rendering of this subtle thought:

> You ask me what is this heart in your breast?
> It is your intellect that has been blest
> With feeling.*11

7- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 39 is:

نمی گردد کہن افسانۂ طور

کہ در ہر دل تمنائے کلیم است *12

The word 'کہ', in the beginning of the second hemistich, means 'because' or 'as' or 'since'. Arberry renders it as 'and', which confuses the sense:

> It grows not old, the tale of Sinai,
> And every heart yet whispers Moses' prayer.

8- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 45 is:

ولے ایں راز کس جز من نداند

ضمیر خاک و خونم بیچگون است *13

Arberry seems to be highly confused in the translation of the word 'بیچگون' :

> But in this flesh, there dwells a spaceless Thought
> I only have this secret understood.

The other scholars are also confused herein; here are three translations:

i- Ahmad Javid; unique, peerless.*14
ii- Nassem Amrohavi; immaterial*15
iii- Hadi Hussain; subtle soul*16

All the three translations are partially correct. The words 'بیچون' and 'بیچگون' are commonly used in Islamic mysticism to denote 'God', but, keeping in view Iqbal's context at this stage, it looks more relevant to translate the word 'بیچگون' as 'unique' or

'peerless', as preferred by Ahmad Javid.

9- In quatrain No. 65, Arberry uses the pronoun 'he' for love, which looks highly awkward:

Speak not of love, and of Love's wizardry;
Whatever shapes thou wilt, he doth descend:
Within the breast he is a spark, no more,
But on the tongue a tale without an end.

10- The second line of the following couplet of the quatrain No. 71 has been misunderstood by Arberry:

تو خورشیدی و من سیارۂ تو
سراپا نورم از نظارۂ تو 17*

Arberry:

I am a circling planet, thou my sun,
The light that bathes me by Thy glance is thrown.

Arberry is talking of only a light-bath, whereas, Iqbal implies a complete transformation into light. Iqbal means that it is I who look on Thou; Arberry takes it the other way round, i.e., it is Thou who look on me.

11- The last line of the quatrain No. 90 is:

غمِ عشق ار بدست افتد نگہ دار 18*

It is a conditional sentence, which simply means, "If you get love's wealth of sorrow, protect it carefully", but, Arberry has changed it into imperative form:

But guard Love's sorrow that Thy heart hath won.

12- The first couplet of the quatrain No. 133 reads:

ضمیر کن فکاں غیر از تو کس نیست
نشانِ بے نشاں غیر از تو کس نیست 19*

Arberry presents a highly ambiguous rendering of the second line:

Thou only art in the Creator's 'Be',
Thou only art the Sign that none may see.

The clause 'that none may see' is very confusing, out of which two different meanings can be guessed:

i. You are the only Sign, which may see no one. In this case, 'Sign' is a subject (seer).

ii. You are the only Sign, which no one may see. In this case, Sign is an object (the seen).

In both the cases, Iqbal's sense is nowhere. A simplest translation of this line can be, 'you are the only Symbol of the Unseen', or, to use even Arberry's word, 'Sign', 'You are the only Sign of the Signless'.

13- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 156 is:

ہنوز ایں راز بر من ناکشود است
کہ چشمم آنچہ بیند ہست یا نیست *20

Arberry has failed to comprehend the second line:

Yet I have not resolved this mystery
Whether it is mine eye that sees, or no

Arberry's syntax of the second line clearly indicates that he is inquisitive about the seeing eye, whether it is his or someone else's, whereas, Iqbal is inquisitive about the existence or non-existence of the external world seen by his eyes.

These were the pitfalls of Arberry's rendering. As a passing survey, let us briefly list some of his words, which cannot be regarded as precise translations:*21

1- May — فرودیں

2- Eden — ارم

3-	annihilation	عدم
4-	I am	ضمیر ما
5-	lust	فیض
6-	shark	نہنگ
7-	stay	دستگاہ
8-	brain	ضمیر

Generally speaking, this translation of Arberry is acceptable one, yet, it cannot be placed at par with his subsequent translations. Its poetic significance is more than its semantic significance.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by The Royal India Society, London.
2. The Tulip of Sinai; Quatrain No. 27
3. Ibid; Quatrain No. 87
4. Ibid; Quatrains No. 1-42; 2-47; 3-92; 4-95; 5-114; 6-118; 7-131; 8-132; 9-132; 10-133; 11-140; 12-141; 13-147; 14-151; 15-151; 16-159
5. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 26
6. Ibid; P.27
7. Ibid; P.28
8. Ibid
9. Ibid; P.29
10. Ibid; P.37
11. A Message from the East; M. Hadi Hussain; Iqbal Academy, Pakistan; 1977; P.16
12. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.38
13. Ibid; P.40
14. Tasheel-i-Payam-i-Mashriq; P.87

15. Farhang-i-Iqbal; P.180
16. A Message from the East; P.18
17. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.48
18. Ibid; P.55
19. Ibid; P.69
20. Ibid; P.77
21. The Tulip of Sinai; Quatrains: 3; 15; 21; 53; 63; 96; 111; 112

A MESSAGE FROM THE EAST

M. Hadi Hussain

The only complete translation of 'Payam-i-Mashriq' (1923), so far, comes from M. Hadi Hussain, under the title 'A Message from the East'.*1 The translator published the translations of some selected poems of 'Payam-i-Mashriq' in 1971, and, subsequently, offered this complete version, excluding a single poem, 'Joo-i-Ab', which, as the translator writes, is already a translation.*2

This book is an invaluable example of a virtually successful translation from poetry into poetry. It is quite evident from the 'Preface' that the translator is well aware of his cumbersome task, as he says:

> I have tried to make it readable as English verse. Bearing in mind Robert Frost's famous saying, "Poetry is that which is lost in translation", I have spared no effort to minimize the loss.*3

Although, Hadi Hussain seems to be very careful in his claim of minimizing the loss of the aesthetic appeal of poetry in his translation, yet, a judicious reader of him would probably agree that Robert Frost's statement seems to be nearly invalid, after reading this poetic translation of Hadi Hussain.

It is a poetic re-creation of Iqbal's thought, and, in it, Hadi Hussain has nicely displayed his abilities as a poet. He makes use of all the three kinds of verse; rhymed verse, blank verse and free verse.

He has not adopted any regular or conventional style in his rhymes, yet, a major part of his work is rhymed. The

best examples of his rhymed verse are the translations of 163 quatrains, under the heading 'The Tulip of Sinai'. His 'Dedicatory Epistle' is in blank verse. Some of his shorter poems are in free verse, while the others also have a smack of modernity of style. As far as his rhythm is concerned, his experiments range from bimetric lines upto octometric ones, e.g.:

1- Bimetric:	Within you lies A real full moon.*4
2- Trimetric:	I am so jealous of The seeing power of my eyes That I weave with my sight One more veil for your face.*5
3- Tetrametric:	I am no creature of mere light That I should bow to man. He is a base-born thing of dust, And I am of fire born.*6
4- Pentametric:	With every heart Love plays a different part -- Now as a stone, now as a crystal bowl.*7
5- Hexametric:	You made the night; I made the lamp that lights it up. You fashioned clay; I made of it a drinking cup.*8
6- Heptametric:	I do not find a single comrade in the garden yet: For springtime is approaching and I am an early rose.*9

7- Octometric: Do not imagine that the work of the Wine-maker is complete.
With unknown quantities of undrunk wine the vine is still replete.*10

The examples have been taken from different parts of the book, just to indicate that Hadi Hussain possesses a remarkable dexterity in composing shorter as well as longer hemistichs. But, a rather more important fact about his art is that, temperamentally being prone to modern trends of versification, he combines shorter and longer lines to heighten the rhythmic effect. His book is replete with such examples as rank him among modern poets. Thus, he maintains Iqbal's originality and creates his own individuality. For example, here is his translation of a short poem, 'Philosophy and Politics':

Do not weigh politician and philosopher
In the same scale.
The one's eyes are blind to the sun,
The other's shed no tears.
The one advances unsound arguments
In proof of truths.
The other proves untruths
By cogent arguments.*11

If we scan this short poem, we get a nice variety of rhythmic patterns. Let us judge the lines in ascending order:

1- Bimetric lines: In the/same scale
In proof/of truths

2- Trimetric lines: The o/ther proves/un truths
By co/gent ar/gu ments
The o/ther's shed/no tears

3- <u>Tetrametric line</u>: The one's/eyes are/blind to/the sun

4- <u>Pentametric line</u>: The one / ad van/ ces un / sound ar/ gu ments

5- <u>Hexametric line</u>: Do not/weigh po/li ti/cian and/phi lo/so pher

This objective analysis of the rhythm of the poem purports to cull out the underlying subjective music of the patterns created by the poet. The same is the greatest characteristic of modern poetry, namely, a combination of the external and internal rhythm. Hadi Hussain is an ambidextrous poet-translator on this criterion.

To come to his quality of translation, although, he is a highly careful translator, yet, there do exist some stages, where he has slipped:

1- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 11, in the part 'Lala-i-Toor', is:

جہاں او آفرید ایں خوب تر ساخت

مگر با ایزد انباز است آدم 12*

Here is its translation:

God made the world; man makes it beautiful;
Man is God's colleague and companion.*13

The translator has overlooked the word 'مگر', which makes the statement a rhetorical question, not a simple statement. A.J. Arberry's rendering of it is also invalid:

God made the world; Man made it yet more fair;
And is Man God's competitor to be? *14

2- The first couplet of the quatrain No. 99 is:

ترا اے تازہ پرواز آفریدند

سراپا لذتِ بال آزمائی 15*

Hadi Hussain's translation is:

O swift-winged bird, with your light weight,
You are the joy of flying incarnate.*16

The translation of 'تازہ پرواز' (new-fledged) has been made as 'swift-winged'. A bird can be swift-winged without being new-fledged. Let us again see what Arberry says:

O new-fledged spirit proudly hovering.
God made thee all delight upon the wing;*17

The term 'new-fledged' is a very precise one.

3- The quatrain No. 41 reads:

نہ پیوستم دریں بستاں سرا دل
زبند این و آں آزادہ رفتم
چو بادِ صبح گردیدم دمے چند
گلاں را آب و رنگے دادہ رفتم *18

Hadi Hussain has neglected the word 'رفتم', which occurs in two lines:

I never got attached to this world, this
Fair-seeming garden, and its vanities;
But, rather, lending colour to its flowers,
I wandered round it like the morning breeze.*19

Arberry offers an exquisite rendering of it:

Not in these Bowers have I bound my heart,
But fare on free from this imprisonment;
Awhile I tarried, like the breath of dawn,
And gave the roses fragrance as I went,*20

4- The second couplet of the quatrain No. 45 is:

ولے ایں راز کس جز من نداند
ضمیر خاک و خونم بے چگون است *21

Hadi Hussain's translation is:

But no one knows this secret but
Myself: a subtle soul informs my mud.*22

The word 'informs' looks utterly out of place and, perhaps, subverts the entire sense of the couplet. He could have used the words 'lives in' or 'dwells' (with some monosyllabic addition to keep the rhythm intact).

5- In the translation of the first couplet of the quatrain No. 50, he has left the word 'زریر', which means 'turmeric', called 'ہلدی' in Urdu:

دلت می لرزد از اندیشۂ مرگ

ز تمش زرد مانندِ زریری *23

Your heart quakes with the fear of death: you pale
At the mere thought of it.*24

As this word is a beautiful simile, it is not wise to drop it.

6- The first couplet of the quatrain No. 152 is:

بجانِ من کہ جاں نقشِ تن انگیخت

ہوائے جلوہ ایں گل را دورو کرد *25

Hadi Hussain has failed to understand 'بجانِ من' and swearing herein:

The soul designed the body, love of self-display
Thus fashioning a double-tinted rose.*26

7- In the poem 'پند باز با بچۂ خویش', there is a couplet:

تو از زرد چشمانِ صحراستی

بگوہر چو سیمرغ والاستی *27

The phrase 'زرد چشم' has been misunderstood by Hadi Hussain:

You are one of the cold-eyed children of the
wilderness,

By ancestry a griffin of the purest breed, no less:*28

No one can get the idea of any bird out of the phrase, used by the translator. This phrase is figuratively used to denote the blue-eyed (quick-eyed) birds of prey.29*

8- In the poem 'تنہائی', there is a line:

بخود خزید و نفس در کشید و هیچ نگفت *30

The situation is that Iqbal asks some questions from a mountain. This line is the mountain's response;

If it had breathed, it breathed no more, and uttered not a word.*31

The compound infinitive 'بخود خزیدن' means 'to shrink'. Thus, the mountain's response can be simply put in these words:

It shrank, inhaled and said nothing.

Hadi Hussain looks utterly confused at this stage.

9- In the ghazal No. 20 of the part 'Ma-i-Baqi', there is a couplet:

آہِ درونہ تاب کو، اشکِ جگر گداز کو

شیشۂ بسنگ می زنم عقلِ گرہ کشائے را *32

It has been translated by Hadi Hussain as this:

Where is the breast-inflaming sigh
And where the heart-dissolving tear?
Stones to hurl at the mirror of
The knot-resolving intellect.*33

Iqbal's second hemistich clearly means, 'I throw reason's mirror on the stone', but, Hadi Hussain takes it the other way round: he throws the stone on the reason's mirror.

10- The second line of the second couplet of the ghazal No. 24 is:

راہے زمشرہ کاوم از کعبہ بہ بت خانہ *34

The translator has grown somewhat ridiculous in its rendering:

With my eyelashes I will dig
A tunnel from the Kaaba to the idol-house*35

Some readers may agree with this translation, as lexically it is correct; but, the word 'tunnel' has eclipsed its aesthetic impression.

11- The first couplet of the poem 'جمعیت الاقوام' is:

بر فتد تا روشِ رزم دریں بزم کہن
دردمندانِ جہاں طرح نو انداختہ اند *36

Hadi Hussain has misunderstood the phrasal verb 'برفتد', which means 'to be finished' or 'to end' or 'come to an end'. Instead, he takes just opposite sense of it, by using the verb 'induct':

In order to induct the ways of war
Into this old assembly-hall of peace,
Those whose hearts bleed for man have laid a
new Foundation.*37

12- The last couplet of the poem 'بائرن' reads as this:

گزاشت طائر معنی نشیمنِ خود را
کہ سازگار تر افتاد حلقۂ دامش *38

It simply means that the bird of meaning left its nest, and rested in the snare of Byron's mind. Hadi Hussain makes a bird of Byron's genius and, then, makes it fly:

But his genius, that high-soaring bird,
Left its nest to fall into a snare,
Which it preferred
To soaring in the air.*39

13- In 'موسیولینن و قیصر ولیم', there is a couplet:

غلامِ گرسنہ دیدی کہ بردرید آخر
قمیصِ خواجہ کہ رنگیں زخونِ ما بودست *40

Hadi Hussain's translation is:

Have you not seen the hungry slave at last
Tear to shreds his lord's garment, dyed red with
His blood.* 41

Thus, he has translated 'خونِ ما' into 'his blood', instead of 'our blood'.

14- In the same poem, there is a line:

شرارِ آتشِ جمہور کہنہ ساماں سوخت *42

This line has been taken from Lenin's speech, who is talking about masses' revolt. Hadi Hussain translates this line in these words:

Democracy's spark has burnt up
The robes of the Church elders and the kings.*43

Everyone knows that Lenin was a Marxist, not a Democrat. It is, therefore, beyond reason to ascribe a democratic speech to Lenin.

15- In 'خطاب بہ انگلستان', Iqbal says about the Eastern people:

فکرِ نوزادۂ او شیوۂ تدبیر آموخت *44

But Hadi Hussain has associated with the West:

The west's new-fangled thought has taught him
how to think
And act for himself.*45

The translator seems to be confused in the word 'آموخت', which he takes for 'taught'. The infinitive 'آموختن' serves dual purpose: it also means 'to learn', which is Iqbal's intended meaning here. So, the real sense of the hemistich is:

The newly-awakened Easterners have learnt new strategies of self-improvement.

16- A somewhat confusing translation is the word 'mind', which has been used simultaneously for contradictory terms. One of the pivotal points of Iqbal's thought is that reason (عقل) and heart (دل) are always in conflict with each other. Our translator has used the word 'mind' for both of them:

(i) Heart:

چساں در مشتِ خاکے تن زند دل

کہ دل دشتِ غزالانِ خیال است! *46

How in a pinch of dust the mind appears,
That field for thought's gazelles to wander in.*47

In the quatrains No. 68, 77, 97 and 104, this word has been used for heart. 'تن زند' means 'maintains a silence', not 'appears'.

(ii) Reason:

ز انجم تا بہ انجم صد جہاں بود

خرد ہر جا کہ پرزد آسماں بود *48

There are a hundred worlds from star to star,
And sky on sky, as far as mind can soar.*49

In the quatrain No. 44 also the word 'mind' has been used for 'خرد'. In the quatrain No. 123, it has been used for 'جاں' (soul) and in 148 for 'ضمیر' (conscience).*50 Such a variegated use of this word -- mind, breeds a number of misconceptions.

These were some relatively major flaws in the translation. There are some other discrete items, whose translation is not convincing. Let us see them briefly:*51

1- fortune گردوں

2- shark نہنگ

3- Iran عجم

4- surma سرمہ

5- key پردہ

6- beggary فقر

7- grain of sand دانہ

These drawbacks have been pointed out, as it was the requirement of our present study? Otherwise, in an overall assessment, it is a remarkable translation. Its artistic and prosodiac experiments, its exalted diction and command of language and, above all, its recreative impulses, modernity and semantic care, all are unique. There seems to be no exaggeration in S.A. Rahman's view that, "..... he has produced an elegant translation, which should be regarded as an achievement of a very high order."*52

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1977
2. It is, actually, Goette's poem. Its German text and its English translation have been included by Akbar Hussain Qureshi in his book 'Mutala'a-i-Talmihat-o-Isharat-i-Iqbal'. Please see pages 490 to 496: Publication of Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1986.
3. A Message from the East; P. ix
4. Ibid; P.46
5. Ibid; P.107

6. Ibid; P.47
7. Ibid; P.43
8. Ibid; P.78
9. A Message from the East; P.45
10. Ibid; P.59
11. Ibid; P.161
12. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.28
13. A Message from The East; P.10
14. The Tulip of Sinai; A.J. Arberry; London; 1947; P.3
15. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.31
16. A Message from the East; P.12
17. The Tulip of Sinai; P.4
18. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.38
19. A Message from the East; P.17
20. The Tulip of Sinai; P.9
21. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.40
22. A Message from the East; P.18
23. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.41
24. A Message from the East; P.19
25. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.75
26. A Message from the East; P.41
27. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.103
28. A Message from the East; P.66
29. Farhang-i-Iqbal(Persian); P.463
30. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 118
31. A Message from the East; P.84
32. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.162
33. A Message from the East; P.127
34. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.165
35. A Message from the East; P.131
36. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.193
37. A Message from the East; P.159
38. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.200
39. A Message from the East; P.165
40. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.209

41. A Message from the East; P.172
42. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.209
43. A Message from the East; P.172
44. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.214
45. A Message from the East; P.175
46. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.44
47. A Message from the East; P.21
48. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.50
49. A Message from the East; P.24
50. Ibid; PP. 35 and 40
51. Ibid; PP. 1-3; 2-29; 3-39; 4-99; 5-130; 6-139; 7-158
52. Ibid; P.vii

THE MOONBEAMS OVER THE EAST

Abbas Ali Jaffery

Another poetic translation of 'Payam-i-Mashriq', titled 'The Moonbeams over the East', has been published in 1996.*1 It is a partial translation, and only the poems of 'Payam-i-Mashriq' have been translated by Abbas Ali Jaffery. The quatrains, 'Lala-i-Toor', and the ghazals, 'Ma-i-Baqi', have been excluded. A poem, 'Cheestan-i-Shamsheer', has also been, consciously or unconsciously, left out.

The translator is an accomplished poet, and looks quite successful in grasping the spirit of Iqbal's rhetoric. He feels the importance of intelligibility and selects his metres accordingly, as he says:

> In order to convey the real sense of the original, many of the poems have been rendered into blank verse, while for others a variety of metres and rhyming patterns have been adopted without deviating from the original in letter and spirit.*2

His choice of blank verse is justifiable, but, in order to avoid monotony, he also makes successful use of tetrameter, hexameter and heptameter, predominantly in iambic foot. Here is a survey of it:

1- He has composed the following two poems in iambic tetrameter:

(i) The Springtime
(ii) Life

2- The following fifteen poems have been composed in iambic hexameter:

(i) The New Moon of Eid

(ii) Philosophy and Poetry
(iii) The Glow-worm
(iv) God's Country
(v) The League of Nations
(vi) Hegel
(vii) Europe's Wineshop
(viii) The Share-Deed of the Capitalist and the Labourer
(ix) The Freedom of the Sea
(x) The Quest
(xi) Age and Poetry
(xii) The Sign of Life
(xiii) The Eastern Board
(xiv) Thorn
(xv) The Poet's Treasure

3- The following thirteen poems have been translated in iambic heptametric lines:

(i) Rose Perfume
(ii) The Morning Zephyr
(iii) Kashmir
(iv) Servitude
(v) Democracy
(vi) Shopenhauer and Nietzche
(vii) Philosophy and Politics
(viii) Nietzche
(ix) Europe's Tavern
(x) Philosophers
(xi) To England
(xii) The Worker's Song
(xiii) The Rose

4- There are some stanza poems, whose refrain*3 is rhythmically different from the rest of the text.

(i) 'The Song of Time' is in iambic pentameter, but, its first three refrains, out of five, are in hexameter.*4

(ii) 'The Glow-worm' is in iambic hexameter, but, its refrain is in pentameter.*5

(iii) 'The Song of a Hijazi Camel-rider' is in iambic pentameter, but, its refrain is in hexameter.*6

A survey of these versatile rhythmic patterns reveals that, although Abbas Ali has not adopted the twentieth century rhythmic style, as did Hadi Hussain, he is, no doubt, a master poet. On account of this, he can be ranked among the greatest poet-translators.

In the quality of his translation, he seems to surpass, or to be more careful, equal Hadi Hussain. Both of them are sincere and punctilious translators, but, like Hadi Hussain, Abbas Ali's translation also has got some shortcomings. Here is what we could sense out of it:

1- The title of the poem 'Reflections of a Star' is not agreeable, as Iqbal's title is 'افکارِ انجم'. The word 'انجم' is a plural noun, obviously, denoting more than a single star. Moreover, this poem has got four parts, separately numbered by Iqbal. In keeping with the title, these four parts could be the reflections of four different stars.

2- In the poem 'حکمتِ فرنگ', there is a couplet:

نہ بینی کہ چشمِ جہاں بینِ ہور
ہمی گردد از غازِ او روز کور*7

The word 'تاز' means 'gas',*8 but, Abbas Ali translates it as 'powder':

Seest not Thou that their powder blinds
The vision of the world-observing sun? *9

He seems to be confusing it with the word 'تازہ' (rouge), which is a sort of powder.

3- In 'Address to Mustafa Kamal', we come across a grammatical error:

The zephyr's breath has shrank us, like a bud.*10

The past participle of the verb 'shrink' is 'shrunk', not 'shrank'. This might be a printing mistake and a proof-reading flaw.

4- In the Persian text of the same poem, there is a couplet:

ہر کجا راہ دہد اسپ براں تاز کہ ما
بارہا مات دریں عرصہ بتدبیر شدیم *11

Abbas Ali translates it as this:

Charge wheresoe'er your steed may find a way,
Through meditation oft we've lost the day.*12

The word 'meditation' is highly positive, and particularly, in the twentieth century, it has been regarded a basis of all success. To call it the basis of all the failures is a sheer misapprehension of this word. The word 'تدبیر' can be rendered as 'a strategy' or 'manoeuvring'. Hadi Hussain's rendering of it sounds quite elegant:

We have been outdone many times
On this manoeuvring-ground.*13

5- In 'پیام', a couplet describes disparity between the European culture and Christianity:

ہنرش خاک بر آورد ز تہذیبِ فرنگ
باز آں خاک بچشمِ پسرِ مریم زد *14

Here, Abbas Ali could not produce any suitable word for 'برآورد': he uses the word 'removed' for it:

Its ingenuity removed the dust
From the civilization of the West,
And hurled it in the eyes of Christendom.*15

Hadi Hussain has provided a precise word, 'raised':

It raised up much dust from the civilization of the West.*16

6- A big mistake has been committed in the rendering of the second couplet of the stanza No. 5 of 'پیام':

در نگر ہمتِ ما را کہ بہ داوے نگیم
دو جہاں را کہ نہاں بردہ عیاں باختہ ایم *17

Abbas Ali translates it:

Behold our courage. We have set
At hazard both the worlds, which overtly
We've lost but covertly regained.*18

In Iqbal's sense, our boldness is worth-seeing, because we give away (not set at hazard) openly what we acquired secretly, i.e., first we gained, and then we lost. To Abbas Ali, first we lost, and then, we regained. Thus, in this couplet, Iqbal and Abbas are poles apart.

7- The first couplet of the poem 'آئین شائن' is:

جلوۂ می خواست مانندِ کلیم ناصبور
تا ضمیر مستنیرِ او کشود اسرارِ نور *19

Abbas Ali renders it as this:

Like restless Moses, he solicited
A splendour so that his enlightened mind
May open up the mysteries of light.*20

The words 'so that' and 'may open' are incorrect: these words should be replaced by 'till' and 'opened', because the word 'کشود' is the past tense of 'کشودن' and should be translated in the past tense, 'opened'.

Hadi Hussain is quite clear about it:

Like Moses he sought a theophany
Until his mind, in quest of light,
Unveiled its mysteries.*21

8- The first two couplets of 'جلال و گوئٹے' are:

نکتہ دانِ المنی را در ارم　　صحبتے افتاد با پیرِ عجم
شاعرے کو ہچو آں عالی جناب　　نیست پیغمبر و لے دارد کتاب *22

In the second couplet, Goethe has been described; that he is a poet, who, like Rumi, owns a revealed book, though he is not a prophet. Abbas Ali's syntax indicates that he is associating this couplet with Rumi:

The great philosopher of Germany
In heaven came across the Persian sage ---
A poet of such eminence, who, though
No prophet, had composed a book inspired ---*23

According to the rule of proximity, the words between the two dashes explain their antecedent, i.e., the Persian sage, who is Rumi. Thus, it is a fallacious rendering.

9- The second last couplet of the same poem is:

ہر کسے از رمزِ عشق آگاہ نیست
ہر کسے شایانِ ایں درگاہ نیست *24

For the word 'درگاہ', Abbas Ali has used the word 'shrine':

The mystery of Love's not known to all,
As everyone's not worthy of this shrine.*25

'Shrine' does convey the sense to some extent, yet, it lacks precision, as mostly it is used for some Saint's burial place.

One of the characteristics of this translation is that Abbas Ali has incorporated, like Altaf Husain, or Hadi Hussain, some original Urdu words, e.g., Millat; bulbul; dervish; fakir; carvansarai; Shariyeth; Kohkan, etc.*26 These words are acceptable in the most of the cases, as, either they are precise cultural terms, or already existing in the English literature.

The diction of this translation is very exalted. During the course of reading, one comes across highly impressive words, e.g.:*27

1-	scion	ابن
2-	mind and matter	انفس و آفاق
3-	symphony	سرود
4-	virgin world	عالمِ نو
5-	fledgeling	بچۂ باز
6-	an Aphrodite	غیرتِ لیلیٰ (ناقہ)
7-	supernal Paradise	بہشتِ بریں
8-	Diana-faced saqi	ساقیِ ماہ سیما
9-	benighted sphere	تیرہ خاک
10-	Epigrams	خردہ

These are some of his beautiful words. There are a lot of gem-like words in this translation. It is an invaluable asset in Iqbal studies. Its form and content both are well thought

out. Poetically, it is fluent and semantically, it is easy to understand.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Royal Book Company, Karachi
2. The Moonbeams over the East; P.47
3. Words or lines repeated in the course of a poem, recurring at intervals, sometimes with slight variation, usually at the end of a stanza, (A Dictionary of Literary Terms; by Martin Gray; P. 171).
4. The Moonbeams over the East; P.75
5. Ibid; P. 87
6. Ibid; P. 89
7. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 126
8. Tasheel-i-Payam-i-Mashriq; Ahmad Javid; Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1992; P.381
9. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 101
10. Ibid; P. 110
11. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 138
12. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 110
13. A Message from the East; P. 101
14. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 189
15. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 116
16. A Message from the East; P. 155
17. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 190
18. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 117
19. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 199
20. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 123
21. A Message from the East; P. 164
22. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 206
23. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 128
24. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 207
25. The Moonbeams over the East; P. 128
26. Ibid; PP. 59, 60, 64, 64, 97, 103, 122 respectively.
27. Ibid; PP. 1-59; 2-62; 3-81; 4-83; 5-84; 6-89; 7-93; 8-93; 9-105; 10-135

ZABOOR-I-AJAM

PERSIAN PSALMS
A.J. Arberry

'Zaboor-i-Ajam' was first published in 1927, and the translation of its first two parts, made by A.J. Arberry, appeared in 1948; i.e., one year after 'The Tulip of Sinai'. Its title is 'Persian Psalms'.*1 Arberry has used the word 'Psalms', instead of 'lyrics' or 'ghazals', perhaps, due to the reason that Iqbal himself does not name the verses, included in the first and the second part of his book, as ghazals: he calls them 'ghazal-like pieces'.*2 Since Iqbal has mentioned the Prophet David many times, with special reference to his effective psalms, and even named his book after that Prophet's divine book, Arberry has adopted this Biblical word as a title of his book.

It is a poetic translation, wherein Arberry seems to be striving hard for the display of his poetic abilities. He has experimented with a number of rhythmic patterns, ranging from dimetric upto pentametric ones. We may have a view of these poetic patterns in an ascending order:

1- His shortest lines have been composed in two feet each. There are four such poems in the book; poems No. 35 and 49 (Part I) and 39 and 58 (Part II). The hemistichs of these poems are composed of a dactylic plus an iambic metre, e.g.:

By the saki's eye
Heart-enflamed I lie.*3

If we scan these lines, their shape would be:

By the sā/kī's eye
Heart ēnflāmed/Ī lie

A slight variation of this pattern is the poem No. 33 (Part I), which is in iambic dimeter, but, the first line of every couplet has an additional syllable:

The days are ended
Of winter long;
The branches quiver
With living song.*4

Let us scan the first two lines:

The days/are en/ded
Of win/ter long/

2- There are 69 poems (including the introductory couplets of the Part II), wherein trimetric compositions have been used. Here is a detail:

(i) In 14 poems, simple iambic trimeter has been used.*5

(ii) There are 37 poems in which every line has been composed of a dactylic plus two iambic feet.*6

<u>Example</u>: With a song/of a/go ny*7

(iii) There are three poems having couplets with a trimetric line followed by a dimetric one.*8

<u>Example</u>: One step/on friend/ship's road
Fairer I see
Than the most pressing load
Of piety.*9

(iv) There are two poems of trimetric rhythm, wherein each couplet has trimetric rhythm in both the lines, but with variant feet:*10

<u>Example</u>: Of the friend's/in gen/uous wit
I can/re late/no more:
By my pil/low he/did sit,

And spake/ u pon/the cure![11]

All the feet in this stanza are iambic, except the first two feet of the lines 1 and 3, which are dactylic.

(v) There are nine poems, wherein every couplet is of trimetric length, but, the first line of every couplet has an additional syllable:[12]

Example: Ne ver more/will I/look back/ward
On the road/that I/have traced;
Tis to gain/the far/to mor/row
That, like time / I for/ward haste.[13]

(vi) There are four other poems, wherein we observe trimetric patterns in different forms. All these poems are in the Part II:

(a) In the poem No 13, the first and the third lines of stanza are composed of one dactylic and two iambic feet, and the second and the fourth lines are in iambic trimeter and dimeter respectively, e.g.:

Of the Sul/tan I/would take
One gaze/if so/I may;
Moslem I/I do/not make
A god/of clay.[14]

(b) In the poem No. 19, each stanza is of thirteen lines, out of which the first eight have been composed of one dactylic and two iambic feet each. The ninth, the tenth and the twelfth are dimetric (dactyl + iamb). The remaining two, i.e., the eleventh and the thirteenth are monometric, with a single iambic foot:

Lit tle flo/wer fast/as leep,

Rise narcissus-like, and peep;
Lo, the bower droops and dies
Wasted by cold grief; aries!
Now that birdsong fills the air
And muezzins call to prayer,
Listen to the burning sighs
Of the passionate hearts, and rise!
Òut ōf lēa/dēn sléep,
Out of slumber deep
Ārișe!
Out of slumber deep
Arise! *15

(c) The poem No. 30 is composed of nine stanzas, having seven lines each. The first four lines of each stanza are trimetric, having a composition of one dactyl plus two iambs. The remaining three lines are iambic dimetric:

Òf thē hīre/liñg's blóod/oūt poúred
Lustrous rubies makes the lord;
Tyrant squire to swell his wealth;
Desolates the peasant's tilth.
Rēv ólt/Ī cŕy!
Revolt defy!
Revolt, or die! *16

(d) The four-lined stanzas of the poem No. 72 are all trimetric, but, the first two lines of all of them have an additional syllable:

Tù līp īn/thē móun/tāins blów/ing,
Làmp īn mēad/ānd gár/dēn
glów/ing,

Gaze on me/for I/will give
Guidance on/the way/to live/*17

3- Arberry has translated 54 poems (including two introductory pieces of the two parts of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam') in iambic tetrameter. Out of these 54 poems, he has written 38 poems in simple iambic tetrameter.*18 The remaining 16 poems have the following variations:

(i) There are four poems, wherein Arberry has adopted the pattern of tetrametric lines followed by dimetric ones.*19 All the lines are iambic:

Example:

From life/and be/ing's twis/ted skein
Let me/be free;
In re/sig na/tion is/to gain
True li/ber ty.*20

(ii) There are twelve poems, wherein Arberry changes every second line of a couplet from dimetric to trimetric one, keeping the first lines intact, i.e., tetrametric.*21

Example:

Tu mul/tuous love/where'er/it rove
Unto/Thy street/is brought;
What boas/teth he/who fin/deth thee
That for/him self/he sought?*22

4- In the Part I of the book, there are three poems composed in iambic pentameter.*23 Two of these (12 and 34) are in simple pentametric form, wherein all the lines have equal length, e.g.:

What is/the world/the temp/ple of/my thought,
The seen/pro jec/tion of/my wake/ful eye;*24

But, the poem No. 17 is different in its form. Its every second line is dimetric, while its every first line is pentametric. Moreover, its dimetric lines have a dactylic foot followed by an iambic one:

With a/glance at/us who/sit by/the way
He goes ri/ding by:
Con ceive/if thou/canst, my/so ul's/dis may
Sore distraught/am I*25

This somewhat longer discussion has been made to elucidate that Arberry has devoted a special attention to poetic form in this translation, and that he has endeavoured to incorporate as much variety of rhythm as did Iqbal. By making experiments with versatile verse forms, he has contrived his own aesthetics, which need a separate study. Some of his extracts are so elegant that he seems to surpass Iqbal, perhaps, due to the resilience of the English language as well. Let us feel the music and clarity of this stanza:

O let this layman's vessel ride
Upon a full, tempestuous tide:
The wave afrighteth me so sore,
I fix my gaze upon the shore.*26

At many stages, Arberry seems to be quite original, not a translator. The following stanza, for instance, seems to be radiant with Wordsworthian glamour:

In solitude, within my breast,
Immortal beauty lies at rest;
Beneath this envelope of clay
Regard the sun's effulgent ray.*27

The entire book is interspersed with such jewels of poetry. A separate study is required to highlight the aesthetic appeal of this translation.

Arberry, being an accomplished scholar of Persian and a native speaker of English, sometimes provides the reader with rare words. Let us have a glimpse of them in discrete forms:*28

1-	venery	صید
2-	antiphon	نغمہ(جوابی)
3-	baneful strife	روش تاری
4-	loverhood	عاشقی
5-	brazier	آتش دان
6-	vat	خمخانہ
7-	prairie	دشت
8-	leaden sleep	خوابِ گراں
9-	Leviathan	نہنگ
10-	emmet	مُور
11-	iris	نرگس
12-	typhoon	طوفان
13-	liniment	مومیا
14-	hoary acolyte	پیر دیر
15-	redoubt	زندان
16-	cerulean	نیلگوں

Such uncommon words have not been inserted to create an impression of pedantry, but because they have been found

most suitable ones for the flow of rhythm and also conducive to enhance the semantic impact of the respective piece of verse.

Taking the other side of this translation, there are some stages where Arberry has not been able to grasp Iqbal's meaning. Here is a survey of it:

1- In Iqbal's ghazal No. 10, there is a couplet:

نکشد سفینۂ کس بہ یمِ بلند موجے

خطرے کہ عشق بیند بسلامتِ کنارہ [29]

Simply, it means that no barque comes across any danger even in the stormy sea, which love sees in sitting idle on the shore. Arberry has almost completely failed to grasp the idea:

When the waves tumultuous be,
None will put his barque to sea;
It is love that peril sore
Vieweth on the tranquil shore.[30]

Arberry's misunderstanding seems to be rising out of his reading both the lines as separate sentences.

2- The first couplet of the ghazal No. 27 is:

ز شاعر نالۂ مستانہ در محشر چہ می خواہی

تو خود ہنگامہ ای، ہنگامۂ دیگر چہ می خواہی [31]

Here is Arberry's translation:

Why in the concourse dost thou seek
The poet's wild, ecstatic shriek,
Or lookest for another's riot,
Whose heart is troubled and unquiet?[32]

Perhaps, he has overlooked the words 'تو خود' in the second line and, thus, lost the sense.

3- In the translation of the introductory couplet of the Part II, the Quranic term *'Sidra'* has been misspelled as 'Sadra':

Branch of the Sadra tree thou art;
Be not the meadow's straw and thorn*33

4- In the poem No. 19 (Part II), there is a couplet:

خورشید کہ پیرایہ بسمائے سحر بست
آویزہ بگوشِ سحر از خونِ جگر بست *34

In the translation of the second line, Arberry discards the words 'آویزہ' , 'گوش' and 'خونِ جگر' and relies on too simplified sense to satisfy the reader:

Now the sun, that doth adorn
With his rays the brow of morn,
Doth suffuse the cheeks thereof
With the crimson blush of love.*35

Some lenient critics might declare this rendering figuratively correct, but, it is virtually irksome to look at the alternative words he brings in to replace Iqbal's original ones:

(no word)	آویزہ
cheek	گوش
crimson blush of love	خونِ جگر

5- The first couplet of the ghazal No. 31 (Part II) is:

گرچہ می دانم کہ روزے بے نقاب آید بروں
تانہ پنداری کہ جاں از پیچ و تاب آید بروں*36

Iqbal is talking about his beloved that although, his beloved will certainly come out, yet, it does not mean that His coming out will put an end to his (Iqbal's) anguishes and

distresses. Arberry's translation indicates that he could not get even the basic idea of the couplet:

Although the soul, I know,
One day unveiled shall be,
Think not it shall be so,
By writhing endlessly.*37

6- The first line of the couplet 3 of the same ghazal is:

تاکِ خویش از گریہ ہائے نیم شب سیراب دار *38

Arberry translates the word 'تاک' (vine) as 'cup':

Thy cup replenish still
With tears and midnight sighs.*39

7- The last (7th) couplet of the ghazal No. 35 (Part II) is:

دل بے سوز کم گیرد نصیب از صحبتِ مردے
مس تابندۂ آور کہ گیرد در تو اکسیرم *40

Arberry's translation is:

Of Supermen's society
Naught gains the heart that's not aglow:
Bring me thy molten brass, and, lo!
My elixir shall work in thee.*41

Iqbal is talking about 'shining copper' (مس تابندہ) and Arberry about 'molten brass'.

8- In the first couplet of the ghazal No.62 (Part II), Arberry misunderstands the word 'خاور'. Iqbal says:

بگذر از خاور و افسونیء افرنگ مشو
کہ نیرزد بجوئے ایں ہمہ دیرینہ و نو *42

Arberry translates it as this:

Eschew the West, and do not be

Bewitched by Europe's wizardry;
Not worth a barley, in my view
Is all her ancient and her new.*43

Thus, using the word 'West' instead of 'East', Arberry has confined Iqbal's idea of eschewing both the East and the West (the entire world) only to the West. The double use of the possessive pronoun 'her', in the last line, clearly indicates that the translator's vision is unilateral. This misconception has eclipsed the universality of thought in the original Persian couplet.

9- Another misconception occurs in the translation of the couplet 5 of the ghazal No. 58 (part II). Iqbal says:

چراغِ خویش بر افروختم کہ دستِ کلیم
دریں زمانہ نہاں زیرِ آستیں کردند *44

Arberry's translation is as this:

My self's lamp I lit,
Now that Moses' hand
Men have hidden it
Neath the wristlet-band.*45

Literally, it is a correct translation, but, the word 'men' is not required here. It is not men who have concealed the hand of Moses: it is God and His angelic agents, who have done so. This point is important yet in another way that it intrinsically throws light on the finality of the Prophethood.*46

Apart from the above incorrect renderings, there are some other words, which are not precise ones. We may list them as discrete items:*47

1- poverty فقر

2- April فرودیں

3-	stage	منزل
4-	a hundred	دو صد
5-	magic	اکسیر
6-	magic art	کیمیا
7-	beggar's robe	خرقہ

To wind up, Arberry's translation, notwithstanding his pitfalls, is a tremendous effort in the field of the translations of Iqbal. He has offered five valuable translations --- 'The Tulip of Sinai' (1947), 'Persian Psalms' (1948), 'Complaint and Answer' (1953), 'The Mysteries of Selflessness' (1955) and 'Javid Nama' (1966). 'The Tulip of Sinai' is more of an experiment in translation than a standard translation. From first to last, it is in iambic pentameter, i.e., only in a single poetic style. Likewise, 'Complaint and Answer' is in a uniform poetic pattern. The same is the case with 'The Mysteries of Selflessness', which is, thoroughly, in the blank verse. 'Javid Nama', on the other hand, is completely in prose. 'Persian Psalms' seems to be the best of all. In it, we find Arberry making a number of novel experiments in his poetic compositions. He seems to be at the height of rhythmic patterns, structural harmony and stylistic command. Ironically enough, no one except Arberry, has made any effort to translate the ghazals of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam', but, almost every great translator has kept this book before him, while translating the other books of Iqbal. A comparative study reveals that Altaf Husain, Akbar Ali Shah and Maqbool Elahi have utmostly tried to follow Arberry's style of this book.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore.
2. Makateeb-i-Iqbal Banam-i-Garami, Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1981; P.241
3. Persian Psalms; P.32
4. Ibid; P.30
5. Poems No. Part I; 2, 46, : Part II; 1, 18, 20, 22, 26, 31, 33, 40, 45, 68, 69, 73
6. Poems No. Part I; 7, 10, 11, 18, 20, 23, 28, 31, 38, 43, 48, 53
   Part II; 2, 4, 10, 11, 14, 21, 27, 28, 29, 34, 36, 38, 41, 42, 46, 49, 53, 57, 65, 67, 70, 71, 74, 75
7. Ibid; P.5
8. Poems No. Part I; 30, 55 Part-II; 5
9. Ibid; P.27
10. Poems No.6 and 15 (Part II)
11. Ibid; P.58
12. Ibid; Poems No.3, 4, 5, 16, 19, 36, 45, 50, 54; all the nine poems are in Part I
13. Ibid; P.15
14. Ibid; P.65
15. Ibid; P.73
16. Ibid; P.86
17. Ibid; P.124
18. Ibid; Poems Part I: Invocation, 6, 8, 9, 13, 15, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29, 32, 37, 39, 41, 42, 44, 47, 51, 52, 56
    Part II: Introductory couplets; 24, 25, 35, 43, 47, 48, 54, 56, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 66
19. Ibid; Poems No. Part I ; 14,
    Part II; 23, 32, 50
20. Ibid; P.13
21. Ibid; Poems No. Part I; 1
    Part II; 8, 9, 12, 16, 17, 37, 44, 51, 52, 55, 59
22. Ibid; P.1
23. Ibid; Poems No. 12, 17 and 34

24. Ibid; P.11
25. Ibid; P.15
26. Ibid; P.29
27. Ibid; P.50
28. Ibid; PP. 1-6; 2-11; 3-26; 4-35; 5-38; 6-39; 7-43; 8-73; 9-74; 10-78; 11-85; 12-93; 13-105; 14-115; 15-116; 16-119
29. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.15
30. Persian Psalms; P.9
31. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.33
32. Persian Psalms; P.25
33. Ibid; P.53
34. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.81
35. Persian Psalms; P.73
36. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.97
37. Persian Psalms; P.89
38. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.97
39. Persian Psalms; P.89
40. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.101
41. Persian Psalms; P.93
42. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.130
43. Persian Psalms; P.117
44. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.126
45. Persian Psalms; P.115
46. Adopted from 'Naseem-i-Karam', by A.D. Naseem, Sheikh Muhammad Bashir and sons, Lahore; P.120
47. Persian Psalms; PP: Part I: 1-18; 2-23; 3-29; 4-53,
Part II: 5-94; 6-101; 7-109

GULSHAN-I-RAZ-I-JADID AND BANDAGI NAMAH

NEW GARDEN OF MYSTERY AND BOOK OF SERVITUDE

Bashir Ahmad Dar

The translation of the third and the fourth (the last) part of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam' appeared in 1964.*1 The translator, Bashir Ahmad Dar, has named the first part as 'Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid' (New Garden of Mystery) and the second as 'Bandagi Namah' (Book of Servitude), i.e., he maintains Iqbal's original names, but, in brackets, he gives their English meanings.

This book, as B.A. Dar claims, is a sequel to Arberry's translation of the first two parts of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam', "The present translation thus completes the translation of Iqbal's 'Zaboor-i-Ajam'".*2 A major difference, however, between Arberry and B.A. Dar's translations, is that the former is in verse, whereas, the latter is in prose. So, in this respect B.A. Dar's translation cannot be regarded as a continuum of Arberry's work.

This translation is simple and duly annotated, but, a reader comes across grammatical mistakes, which indicate the translator's lack of the command of the English language. First, we have a survey of those mistakes:

1- There are three lines in which he uses the verb 'bewail' with three different prepositions:

(i) He would bewail about his (low) station.*3

(ii) What a nice fancy that he bewails in separation.*4

(iii) Although nobody weeps or bewails over him.[*5]

The verb 'bewail' is always used without any preposition. The second line can be regarded as correct in the following context:

He bewails (something or someone) in separation.

But, there seems to be no justification for using prepositions in the lines (i) and (iii).

2- The verb 'crave' is not used without the preposition 'for', but, B.A. Dar has done so in this line:

You also should crave help by associating with it.[*6]

3- The verb 'bestow' is always followed by 'on' or 'upon', but, B.A. Dar is using 'to' after it:

Bestow that perturbation to the mote.[*7]

4- In order to express grief, he uses 'woe me' instead of 'woe is me' thrice just on one page:

(i) Woe me! I am hidden from myself.
(ii) Woe me! I am uprooted from my native soil
(iii) Woe me! The branch of my faith is sapless.[*8]

5- In a line, he has used 'forego' for 'forgo'. 'Forgo' means 'to leave' or 'abandon', whereas, 'forego' means 'to come before something/someone':

I am ready to forego eternal union.[*9]

Apart from these grammatical mistakes, there are some flaws arising out of the miscomprehension of the original text:

1- In 'Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid', Iqbal says:

نہ پنداری کہ من بے بادہ مستم
مثالِ شاعراں افسانہ بستم [10*]

B.A. Dar misunderstands 'نہ پنداری' :

Don't you think I am intoxicated without wine,
And spin tales like poets.*11

Instead of 'don't think', he says 'don't you think'.

2- In another couplet, Iqbal says:

ز جاں خاک ترا بیگانہ دیدم
بہ اندامِ تو جانِ خود دمیدم 12*

B.A. Dar has used a meaningless 'of' herein:

I saw your clay stranger to life,
Hence I breathed into your body of my own soul.*13

3- In a couplet (question No. 2), Iqbal is commenting upon life:

نخستین می نماید مستنیرش
کند آخر بہ آئینے اسیرش 14*

It is strange that B.A. Dar could not differentiate between 'آئین' and 'آئینہ' :

First it brightens it up,
Then it ensnares it in a mirror.*15

Obviously, he has, in his mind, the Urdu word 'آئینے', which is the plural of 'آئینہ'.

4- There are two couplets in Iqbal's text (question No. 3), which make one sentence:

بآں عقلے کہ داند بیش و کم را
شناسد اندرونِ کان و یم را
جہانِ چند و چوں زیرِ نگیں کن
بہ گردوں ماہ و پرویں را کمیں کن 16*

B.A. Dar has changed the qualities of intellect, described in the second line, into an imperative clause:

> With the aid of that intellect that deals with quantities,
> Probe the depths of mines and oceans,
> Master the world of how and why,
> Catch the moon and pleiads from the sky.*17

Had he started the second line with the words 'and probes ....', he would have saved himself from this syntactic flaw.

5- In a couplet (question 5), Iqbal describes the qualities of a man endowed with the power of Ego:

چناں باز آمدن از لامکانش
درونِ سینہ او در کف جہانش

In this couplet, 'ش' clearly refers to God, but, B.A. Dar uses pronoun 'it' for God:

> So to return from this experience of the spaceless world,
> That it is within his heart, and the world in his hand.*18

Moreover, B.A. Dar has not used 'His world' in the second line.

Here it might be expedient to point out that B.A. Dar uses the word 'Essence' for '(الٰہی) ذات' at all the places, where this word is found.*19 This is by no means a proper word for God.

6- One of the concluding couplets of Iqbal's 'Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid' is:

کسے کو دیدہ را بردل کشود است
شرارے کشت و پروینے درود است *20

Here is B.A. Dar's rendering of it:

He who has opened his eyes on the heart
Has sown a spark and reaped a fire[*21]

He has translated the word 'پروین' as 'fire', whereas, 'پروین' is a constellation of six stars in the space.[*22]

There are some words in this translation, which are almost non-acceptable due to their impression. In a nutshell, we can see them as this:[*23]

1-	mendicant beggar	فقیر
2-	heart-sore	غمِ پنہاں
3-	contemptible	زار
4-	scientist	حکیم
5-	love	دلبری
6-	prophecy	پیغمبری

Overall, this translation is an acceptable prose translation, but, its authorship becomes suspicious, when one comes to know that B.A.Dar's translation of the second poem 'Bandagi Namah', included in this book, has been plagiarized by him, from the journal 'Iqbal' of 'Bazm-i-Iqbal', Lahore, January, 1964, its real translator being K. Badar.[*24] When this translation was published in 'Iqbal', B.A. Dar was the Assistant Editor of this journal. He got it published, in his own name, just after four months of its first publication in K. Badar's name. Although, it is simple prose translation, with no outstanding feature, yet, it has served to expose B.A. Dar's plagiaristic approach. More surprising is the silence of

the Iqbalists over it, especially, the readers of the journal 'Iqbal' of that period.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore.
2. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid and Bandagi Namah; P.x
3. Ibid; P.7
4. Ibid; P.32
5. Ibid; P.73
6. Ibid; P.18
7. Ibid; P.46
8. Ibid; P.66
9. Ibid; P.7
10. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.146
11. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; P.5;
12. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.147;
13. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; P.7;
14. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.152
15. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; P.16
16. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.156
17. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; P.26
18. Ibid; P.37
19. Please see PP. 30, 46
20. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.175
21. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; P.59
22. Farhang-i-Iqbal; P.204
23. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid; PP. 1-6; 2-7; 3-17; 4-25; 5-77; 6-77
24. Iqbal; January, 1964; PP. 64-73

THE NEW ROSE GARDEN OF MYSTERY AND THE BOOK OF SLAVES

M. Hadi Hussain

After Bashir Ahmad Dar, a versified translation of 'Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid' and 'Bandagi Namah', appeared under the title of 'The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves' in 1969.[*1] It is an exquisite piece of poetry. Its first part, 'The New Rose Garden of Mystery', is in rhymed verse, with unequal lines, and the second part, 'The Book of Slaves', is in iambic pentameter and blank verse. Since, poetically, this book is of a high value, it can justifiably be regarded as a sequel to Arberry's 'Persian Psalms' to complete the English translations of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam'. Its careful reading reveals that Hadi Hussain has strived to bring about an artistic affinity with Arberry, and borrowed a reasonable amount of lexical items from B.A. Dar, without losing his own individuality and creativity.

In order to, first, see the variety of his rhythmic patterns, let us take just four lines (7-10) out of 'Introduction'.

A broken flute,
Which cannot but lie mute.
To reawake it, I sing a new melody,
As counterpoint to Mahmud's threnody.[*2]

These lines are dimetric, trimetric, hexametric and pentametric respectively. To be more clear, let us scan these lines in an ascending order:

1- Ā bró/kēn flúte (dimetric)
2- Whīch cán/nōt bút/līe múte. (trimetric)

3- Ās cóun/tĕr póint/tō Máh/mūd's thré/nō ódy
(pentametric)
4- Tō ré/ā wáke /īt Í/sīng á/nĕw mé/lō ódy.
(hexametric)

Here are two other lines, taken from the same page, wherein tetrameter and heptameter have been used:

I put the sun in the mote's clasp.
Do not think I am drunk without an honest
draught of wine.*3

Here is the scansion of these lines:

1- Ī pút/thē sún/īn thé/mōte's clásp (tetrametric)
2- Dō nót/thīnk Í/ām drúnk/wīth óut ān hó/nēst
dráught/ōf wíne (heptametric)

This use of shorter and longer metres together speaks of Hadi Hussain's modernity of approach, as modern poetry has almost discarded the convention of using equal lines in a poem.

As regards the quality of translation, Hadi Hussain has adopted a three-pronged approach:

1- In many cases, he tries to compress Iqbal's idea into least possible words, e.g., Iqbal says:

طلب کن آں یقیں کو بے یسار است *4

Hadi Hussain's rendering is:

Keep straight your aim.*5

Eight words have been translated into four.*6 Such translations only convey the sense, but, rule out the poetic artistry of the original.

2- A major part of Hadi's work consists of word for word rendering, mostly line for line as well, e.g.:

ز عہد شیخ تا ایں روزگارے

نہ زد مردے بجانِ ما شرارے *7

Hadi Hussain's translation of it is:

Since that great master's time
No one has set our souls aflame.*8

These translations are more important poetically, lexically and semantically.

3- There are some translations, wherein Hadi Hussain adopts an interpretative style. By using additional phrases, clauses, or even sentences, he endeavours to explain the meaning, e.g.:

سر و برگِ شکیبائی ندارد
بجز افراز پیدائی ندارد *9

This is how Hadi Hussain renders it:

It knows no tranquil state,
Because it must continually create.
It cannot manifest its own Self save
Through individual selves-through us:
To us it owes its being thus.*10

Such translations are usually not safe from redundancy, yet, they are equally helpful in understanding the complex ideas.*11

A salient feature of this translation is that, in it, the translator has used a number of uncommon words, mostly precise and replete with feelings. Here are some of them:*12

1-	simulacrum	تصویر (ذہنی)
2-	interlocutor	ہم داستان
3-	awning	پناہ گاہ
4-	Lucifer	ابلیس
5-	aping	تقلید

6- matrix درون

7- make-believe طلسم

8- apogee کمال

9- aeon روزگار (زمانہ)

10- acme کمال

11- en masse عام

12- new-fangled culture تہذیبِ نو

13- derelict مردہ

14- deep-bunt داغ داغ (آلودہ)

15- pell-mell بے امام

16- gusto سوز

17- lachrymose اشکبار

18- vade-mecum رہبر

19- cringing خاکسار (چاپلوس)

20- credo کیش

In order to know the standard of the translation, let us quote an extract, in which Iqbal is at the height of his imagination, and, then, see how Hadi Hussain handles it:

شورہ بوم از نیش کژدم خار خار مورِ او اژدرگو و عقرب شکار

صرصرِ او آتشِ دوزخ نژاد زورقِ ابلیس را بادِ مراد

آتشے اندر ہوا غلطیدۂ شعلۂ در شعلۂ پیچیدۂ

آتشے از دودِ پیچاں تلخ پوش آتشے تندر غو و دریا خروش

در کنارش مارہا اندر ستیز مارہا با کفچہ ہائے زہر ریز
شعلہ اش گیرندہ چوں کلبِ عقور ہولناک و زندہ سوز و مردہ نور
در چنیں دشتِ بلا صد روزگار
خوشتر از محکومیٔ یک دم شمار 13*

Here is Hadi Hussain, with his translation:

Think of a heath all thorns with scorpions' strings,
Whose ants bite dragons and tarantulas,
Whose stormy winds are fires of hell at large
(Strong gales which fill the sails of Satan's bark);
Fires tumbling in the air, flame intertwined
With flame; fires wreathed in swirling smoke-puffs; fires
With thunder's rumble and the ocean's roar
(And on their outskirts snakes with ugly hoods
Replete with poison, all coiled up in strife
Like their own flames); fires whose flames pounce
Like biting dogs, which horrify, which burn
The living, but whose light is cold and dead ---
A million years in such a dreadful place
Are better than a moment's servitude.*14

These long quotations are regretted, but, it would have been more injudicious to overlook such excellent pieces of imagery. Hadi Hussain has revived the Miltonic imagery at this stage.

Grammatically, this translation is so accurate that only one mistake could be located out of it:

Declare, "I am the Truth", and testify
Your Self and God's Self both.*15

The verb `testify' is followed either by the preposition `to', or by the relative pronoun `that', e.g.:

1- Her red face testified to her guilt.

2- Her red face testified that she was guilty.*16

Despite Hadi's acute care, there are, as we could see, two non-agreeable words in the translation:*17

1- threnody نامہ(کتاب)

2- heartache دردمندی

A 'threnody' is not a general song. It is specifically a funeral song. Hadi Hussain uses this word while translating the phrase 'نامۂ محمود'. Obviously, Mahmud Shabistari's book, 'Gulshan-i-Raz', is not a funeral song. The word 'heartache' is a medical term, used purely for the physical pain of heart. The word 'دردمندی' (sympathy or commiseration) is a highly positive term with no physical ache.

There are also some places, where Hadi Hussain could not achieve the desired result:

1- There is a hemistich in Iqbal's text:

مرا با فقر سامانِ کلیم است *18

Hadi Hussain renders it:

> There is the grandeur of a Moses in my hermit's ways.*19

It sounds that Iqbal and the hermit are two different persons. Hadi could have avoided this ambiguity, by changing the phrase as 'my hermetic ways'.

2- On his page 5, he has left a full couplet untranslated: that couplet is:

ز جاں خاکِ ترا بیگانہ دیدم

باندامِ تو جانِ خود دمیدم *20

This oversight is deplorable in view of the quality of this translation.

3- The following couplet has also been misunderstood by Hadi Hussain:

خاکِ من دلے چوں دانہ کشتند
بلوحِ من خطِ دیگر نوشتند *21

Hadi Hussain cannot differentiate between 'دل' and 'لوح':

A heart is sown inside me like a seed,
And on it is inscribed a novel creed.*22

All the other Iqbalists disagree with Hadi, as Iqbal wants, in this couplet, to point out the dichotomy between his heart and brain or, may be, fate. Here are three dominant views:

(i) B.A. Dar; Loh-i-Mahfooz*23
(ii) Mian Abdur Rashid; brain*24
(iii) A.D. Naseem; tablet*25

None of these Iqbalists is confusing it with 'loh', as does Hadi Hussain. Moreover, there seems to be no logical proximity between a seed (heart) and a tablet. Anyhow, it is an ambiguous rendering.

4- Iqbal, while describing reality, says in a couplet:

کرانِ او درون است و بروں نیست *26

Hadi Hussain renders it the other way round:

Reality has bounds, without but not within.*27

These were some of Hadi Hussain's shortcomings, but, a judicious critic will ever be ready to recognize him as the translator of a high mark.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore (we are using its latest print – 1991, for references)

2. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; P.3
3. Ibid
4. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.156
5. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; P.16
6. Please see also the translations of the following couplets on pages 30, 50, 53, and 56 respectively:

(1) تب و تابِ محبت را فنا نیست (زبور عجم؛ ص167)

(2) زاں فراوانی کہ اندر جانِ اوست (زبور عجم؛ ص188)

(3) ہر کہ بے حق زیست جز مردار نیست (زبور عجم؛ ص191)

(4) از محبت جذبہ ہا گردد بلند (زبور عجم؛ ص194)

7. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.145
8. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; P.3
9. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.160
10. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; P.21
11. For such translations see also Pages 27, 28, 33 and 34 respectively:

(1) نہاں از دیدہ ہا در ہائے و ہوے (زبور عجم؛ ص161)

(2) شراب افرشتہ از تاکش بگیرد (زبور عجم؛ ص164)

(3) خرد بحرِ ابد ظرفے ندارد (زبور عجم؛ ص165)

(4) چو او بیدار گردد دیگرے نیست (زبور عجم؛ ص 170)

(5) حسابِ روزش از دورِ فلک نیست (زبور عجم؛ ص 170)

12. Please see the following pages for these words:

1-3	6-15	11-37	16-45
2-4	7-17	12-40	17-45
3-4	8-20	13-42	18-48
4-7	9-28	14-42	19-49
5-15	10-30	15-43	20-50

13. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.181
14. The Book of Slaves; P.44
15. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; P.35
16. Please consult `Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English', under the word `testify'.

17. The New Rose Garden of Mystery; PP. 3, 18
18. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.146
19. The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves; P.4
20. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.147
21. Ibid
22. The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves; P.5
23. Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid and Bandagi Namah; P.7
24. Kulliyat-i-Iqbal (Volume I), Zaboor-i-Ajam; Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore; 1992; P.295
25. Naseem-i-Karam, P.142
26. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.154
27. The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves; P.13

JAVID NAMA

THE PILGRIMAGE OF ETERNITY

Mahmud Ahmad

The first, and the only, poetic translation of 'Javid Nama' (1932), appeared in 1961, titled 'The Pilgrimage of Eternity'.*1 It transpires from its 'Introduction' that the translator, Shaikh Mahmud Ahmad, devoted a period of almost twenty years to accomplish this task. The general text of 'Javid Nama' has been translated in blank verse, but, the digressive poems in it have been rendered in rhymed verse as detailed below:

1- Nine poems are in iambic trimeter:
(i) The Song of Stars (ii) The Song of Sarosh (iii) The Song of the Living Stream (iv) Song of Hallaj (v) The Song of Ghalib
(vi) The Song of Tahira (vii) The Dirge of Ghani
(viii) Living Stream (ix) Bartari Hari.*2

2- Five poems are in iambic tetrameter:
(i) The Song of Angels (ii) Song (iii) Song (iv) Nasir Khusru's Song (v) Song (last).*3

3- In 'Tasin of Buddha', Buddha's speech has two parts: the first is in iambic pentameter, and the second in iambic tetrameter. The speech of the dancing girl, in the same Tasin, is in iambic trimeter.*4

4- 'The Song of Baal' contains four stanzas of nine lines each. Lines 1, 3, 5, 7 and 9 of each stanza are in iambic pentameter, and 2, 4, 6 and 8 in iambic tetrameter.*5

This versatility of metres and rhythmic patterns removes the possibility of monotony to a great extent.

Moreover, one finds lack of rhythm nowhere in the book. In this respect, Mahmud Ahmad seems to be more of a creator than translator.

An outstanding feature of this book is that stylistically it is in the British English rather than the sub-continental English. The translator, being well-oriented in the English prosody, poetic traditions and linguistic subtleties, quite skillfully transports the meanings from Persian into English. His choice of the blank verse is quite reasonable, in the sense that, in such a form, he is not restricted to end-stop lines. He can break the line wherever suitable, diminishing the chances of redundancy. Equally important is the fact that the learned translator has got an appreciable proficiency in the Persian language. Hence, we rarely come across lack of comprehension in this book, except some difficult stages.

It is, however, not a complete translation of 'Javid Nama'. The last part, 'سخنے بہ نژادِ نو' (To the New Generation), which is crucially important as a message, has been left out. Besides this, there are a number of other lines which, consciously or unconsciously, could not be translated. Here is a list of the lines, which have been completely left untranslated or partially and negligently translated:*6

1- جرم و از من کم آشوبی خطاست

2- شعلۂ او میرد از غوغائے شہر

3- یا بگردِ او طوافے می کند

4- محملش خواندن فریبِ گفتگوست

5- سّرِ او با مردِ محرم باز گوے

6- اندرونم موج ہائے بے قرار

7- از قریش و منکر از فضل عرب

8- صید چوں شاہیں ز افلاکش بگیر

9- ہر دو فرعون ایں صغیر و آں کبیر

10- تو اگر تقدیرِ نو خواہی رواست

11- ایں زمین و آسماں دیگر شود

12- ایں مسلمانے کہن ملت کش است

A careful reading reveals that the translator has endeavoured to surpass these lines, perhaps, due to their repetitive nature, as in this couplet:

نوع دیگر بیں جہاں دیگر شود

ایں زمین و آسماں دیگر شود *7

He relies upon only this translation of it:

But change thy view and find the world transformed.*8

In some cases, he compresses the sense of a full line into single word, as in this example:

نور دریائے ست ظلمت ساحلش ہمچو من سیلے نزاد اندر دلش

اندرونم موج ہائے بے قرار سیل را جز غارتِ ساحل چہ کار؟ *9

Here is its translation:

The sea of light has darkness for its coast,
A swelling flood I am within that sea,
What can a tide do save attack the coast?*10

In this three-lined rendering of hemistichs, the third hemistich, (اندرونم موج ہائے بے قرار) , has been compressed into the word 'swelling' in the second line. Such short-cuts

usually nullify the impression, which is aimed at by the original poet.

Mahmud Ahmad's major achievement lies in his production of a vast and powerful vocabulary. From first page to the last, this impression remains intact that the translator is merited with a handsome repository of language. Let us cast a look at a short list of the rare words provided by him:*11

1-	hyacinthine tresses	سنبلستانِ دو زلف
2-	rancid	چاوید
3-	temptress	عشوہ فروش
4-	pillory	طعنہ (زدن)
5-	erethism	سوز و گداز
6-	accoutrement	ساز و برگ
7-	aeons	آنات
8-	rudderless	بے ناخدا
9-	principles	محکمات
10-	strumpet	فسوں گر
11-	fief	دولت
12-	besmirched	داغ داغ
13-	dolorous	واژوں
14-	noble lending	قرضِ حسن

15- pub	مے خانہ
16- unitive	یک نظر
17- rapine	کشت و خون
18- libel	دروغ
19- tenement	بنگاہ
20- odalisque	کنیز
21- tumbler	شیشہ (ساغر)
22- aureole	حُلّہ
23- eremite	زاہد
24- anchorite	خرقہ
25- canoe	زورق
26- chalice	ساغر
27- requiem	نالہ
28- sterling self	نقدِ جاں
29- hearse	تابوت
30- skiff	زورق

Although, the selection of vocabulary is mostly subjective on the part of both the translator and the reader, yet, the scholars would feel it easy to agree that most of the above words are beyond the access of the common users.

Mahmud Ahmad's poetry and diction are, no doubt, worth praising, but there are some stages, where he could not grasp the actual sense. Let us analyse his work in this

perspective:

1- In 'Munajat' (Invocation), Iqbal says:

اے تو نشناسی نزاع مرگ و زیست

رشک بر یزداں برد ایں بندہ کیست؟ *12

Mahmud's rendering is:

O Thou who never faced the strife' twixt life
And death, how can man envy Thee? *13

The word 'ایں' , in the second line of Iqbal signifies Iqbal himself, but, the translator is associating it with mankind in general.*14 A.J. Arberry, the other translator of 'Javid Nama', gives it a subtler meaning, by changing it into a rhetorical question:

Who is this slave who would emulate even God?*15

2- In 'Tamheed-i-Asmani' (Prologue in Heaven), there is a couplet:

از افق صبحِ نخستیں سر کشید

عالم نوزادہ را در بر کشید *16

Mahmud Ahmad could not imagine the infancy of the new-born world, and its being embosomed by the rising morning:

The first dawn broke and from the world new-born
It raised the veil.*17

Actually, he seems to be confused in 'برکشید' (raised) and 'در برکشید' (embosomed). Arberry is quite clear about it, '..... drew to its breast the new-born world'.*18

3- In the last paragraph of 'Prologue in Heaven', the learned translator has created a complexity, by translating all the forms of present tense into future tense. Such translation apparently seems to be acceptable, but, scrupulous readers denounce such free-handedness, on the ground that present

tense often describes the laws of nature, and to change it into future means to place it into the realm of improbabilities, e.g., here are Iqbal and Mahmud with their present and future statements:

عقل آدم بر جہاں شبخوں زند

عشقِ او بر لامکاں شبخوں زند 19*

Mahmud: Man's knowledge will invade
All space, his love will claim the Infinite*20

Mahmud's rendering implies that man's knowledge and love have not been able to make any marked progress as yet; they might do something in future, whereas, Iqbal describes the law of nature concerning reason and love, applicable equally to past, present or future.

4- In 'Tamheed-i-Zamini' (Prologue on Earth), there is a couplet:

انجمن روزِ الست آراستند

بر وجودِ خود شہادت خواستند 21*

In this couplet, there is an allusion to the first famous covenant assembly of the souls, convened by God to elicit evidence of His own Godhead. Mahmud Ahmad misapprehends this couplet:

When this assembly was arrayed by God,
Existence found a witness for itself.*22

According to Mahmud, God became the witness to existence.

5- In 'Tamheed-i-Zamini', there is another couplet, which depicts God and man's position in the universe; hence, philosophically very important:

آمر و خالق بروں از امر و خلق

ما ز شستِ روزگاراں خستہ حلق 23*

Mahmud's translation of this couplet is:

The Lord who doth create is far above
The world of men who groan with pains untold.*24

The words *'amr'*(امر) and *'khalq'*(خلق) are the Quranic terms, used for the two worlds --- the abstract world *(alam-i-amr)* and the phenomenal world *(alam-i-khalq)*.*25 The entire couplet revolves around this concept, whereof Mahmud Ahmad seems to be unaware at this stage.

6- In 'Tamheed-i-Zamini', there is another couplet:

عشق سلطان است و برہانِ مبین
ہر دو عالم عشق را زیرِ نگیں *26

This is how Mahmud translates this couplet:

The final plea
Is love, and both the worlds are love's empire.*27

In this couplet, Mahmud has overlooked another Quranic term *'sultan'*(سلطان),which means 'miracle'.*28 Thus, the words 'سلطان' and 'برہان مبین' are synonymous. Their translation, 'final plea', is not convincing.

7- The first couplet of 'Falak-i-Otared' is:

مشت خاکے کار خود را بردہ پیش
در تماشائے تجلی ہائے خویش *29

In this couplet, Iqbal is talking about himself as to how he proceeded on, in the effulgence of his own self. Mahmud generalizes its sense, and changes it into present tense, presenting it as a routine of human life:

Man moulded out of clay promotes his cause
When he confronts effulgence of his self.*30

8- In 'Falak-i-Otared', Iqbal says about the sun:

فطرتش از مشرق و مغرب بری است

گرچه او از روئے نسبت خاوری است *31

It is strange that the word 'خاوری' (eastern) has been translated by Mahmud Ahmad as 'both':

Its nature is to rise above the east
And west, though 'tis related to them both.*32

9- In the same part of the book (Falak-i-Otared), Iqbal comments upon imperialism, through the voice of Afghani:

از ملوکیت نگہ گردد دگر

عقل و ہوش و رسم و رہ گردد دگر *33

Mahmud converts verbs from the present tense into the past tense:

Imperialism affected sense and sight
Warped and distorted the entire way of life.*34

10- In 'Falak-i-Mirrikh', Iqbal has used the word, 'دری' which is a well known old Persian dialect:*35

ایں ہمہ خواب است یا افسوں گری

بر لب مریخیاں حرفِ دری *36

Mahmud Ahmad fails to understand this word:

Is it a spell, is it a dream, that I
The secret word hear from the Martian's lips?*37

At another stage, he tries to guess out its meanings, by calling it 'Darian tongue' through its phonic association with Darius, the great:

Come thou, philosopher of East, O Thou
Whose lips the Darian tongue befits.*38

Darius was a contemporary of Alexander, the great, and lived in the 4th century B.C. The inscriptions of Bistoon, belonging to that period, show that Persian or Dari was not the language of that period. Thus, it is an anachronistic mistake.

11- The first couplet of 'Nawa-i-Ghalib' is:

بیا کہ قاعدۂ آسماں بگردانیم
قضا بگردشِ رطلِ گراں بگردانیم *39

The word 'رطل' in the second line means 'a cup' or 'a goblet', but, Mahmud Ahmad gives a self-coined meaning to it:

Come forth, O spirits brave,
The heaven's mode we'll change,
Against our destiny
Our heavy mace we'll range*40

It sounds that the translator is culling out the sense of 'mace' through mere textual clues.

12- In 'Ansoo-i-Aflak', there are two couplets, wherein a word 'عصیاں' has been misunderstood by Mahmud Ahmad. Sultan-i-Shaheed says to Zinda Rood:

چوں بروید آدم از مشتِ گلے — با دلے، با آرزوئے در دلے!
لذتِ عصیاں چشیدن کارِ اوست — غیرِ خود چیزے ندیدن کارِ اوست!
زانکہ بے عصیاں خودی ناید بدست — تا خودی ناید بدست آید شکست! *41

The word 'عصیاں', generally, means 'sin', but, here it carries the sense of 'rebellion' or 'revolt'. Mahmud Ahmad takes the first sense, i.e., sin, and, thus, Iqbal's entire message crumbles down:

As man grows from a mould of dust, he grows
With longing in his heart. To savour sin

Is his desire, to taste its raptures sweet,
He searches for his ego; save with sin,
The ego but eludes one's grasp.*[42]

Arberry is aware of the possibility of mistake at this stage, so, he translates the word 'عصیاں' as 'rebellion':

His concern is to taste the delight of rebellion.*[43]

These are, as we could trace out, some grave misapprehensions of the translator. Let us, now, briefly list some of his inappropriate words:[44]*

1-	galaxy	ثریا
2-	roe	غزال
3-	harlot	دلبر د
4-	window	بام
5-	aspen	سیماب
6-	dove	صعوہ
7-	bow	زخمہ
8-	cypress	نارون
9-	nightingale	قمری
10-	diamond	لعل
11-	sapphire	عقیق
12-	aquamarine	یشم

Moreover, two verbs, 'testify' and 'partake', have been used without prepositions at three places in the book.*[45]

Three proper names have been misspelled:*[46]

1- Fazeel: instead of Fuzail
2- Ishmael: instead of Ismail
3- Salima: instead of Sulaima

These were some of the shortcomings of this translation. In an overall assessment, this work is of a remarkable standard. The sincerity and dexterity of the translator is explicit in it.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1- Published by Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore.
2- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; PP. i-20; ii-32; iii-76; iv-107; v-108; vi-110; vii-150; viii-156; ix-159
3- Ibid; PP. i-8; ii-10; iii-84; iv-167; v-186
4- Ibid; PP. 36-7
5- Ibid; P.82
6- Javid Nama; PP. 1-11; 2-17; 3-22; 4-24; 5-44; 6-50; 7-55; 8-73; 9-94; 10-107; 11-109; 12-145
7- Ibid; P.109
8- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; line 2124
9- Javid Nama; P.50
10- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 838-40
11- Ibid; lines 1-656; 2-723; 3-771; 4-910; 5-1013; 6-1134; 7-1168; 8-1176; 9-1193; 10-1325; 11-1347; 12-1387; 13-2161; 14-1547; 15-1627; 16-1954; 17-2051; 18-2052; 19-2084; 20-2192; 21-2226; 22-2236; 23-2565; 24-2616; 25-2757; 26-3083; 27-3119; 28-3520; 29-3628; 30-3750
12- Javid Nama; P.10
13- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 91-2
14- Please see 'Naseem-i-Aflak-i-Zamana'; A.D. Naseem; S. Bashir Ahmad & Sons, Lahore; P.14
15- Javid Nama; A.J. Arberry; George Allen & Unwin, London; 1966; P.23
16- Javid Nama; P.14
17- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 116-7

18- Javid Nama (A); P.25
19- Javid Nama (I); P.15
20- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 145-6
21- Javid Nama; P.19
22- The Pigrimage of Eternity; lines 229-30
23- Javid Nama; P.20
24- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 259-60
25- The Quran; الا له الخلق و الامرط تبارك اللّٰه رب العالمين ○ (الاعراف: 54)
26- Javid Nama; P.22
27- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 319-20
28- The Quran: يا معشر الجن والانس ان استعطم ان تنفذوا من اقطار السمٰوٰت والارضط فنفذواط لا تنفذون الا بسلطان ○ (الرحمٰن: 33)
29- Javid Nama; P.59
30- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 982-3
31- Javid Nama; P.63
32- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 1097-8
33- Javid Nama; P.79
34- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 1490-1
35- Please consult: 'The Larger Persian English Dictionary'; S. Haim; Farhang-i- Moaser; 1985; P.814
36- Javid Nama; P.103
37- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 1982-3
38- Ibid; lines 3400-1
39- Javid Nama; P.117
40- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 2282-5
41- Javid Nama; P.181
42- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 3559-63
43- Javid Nama (A); line 3335
44- The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 1-88; 2-122; 3-130; 4-215; 5-366; 6-1296; 7-1583; 8-1970; 9-2456; 10-3104; 11-3390; 12-3390
45- The Pilgrimage of Eternity:
    i. testify; lines 231, 713
    ii. partake; line 3826
46- Ibid; lines 1011, 1661 and 2269

JAVID NAMA

A.J. Arberry

The next translation of 'Javid Nama' was made by A.J. Arberry in 1966, under the same title, 'Javid Nama'.[1] It is a prose translation, unlike his previous efforts in the translations of Iqbal. Like Mahmud Ahmad, he has left out the last part, 'Sakhuney-ba-Nayad-i-Noe' (سخنے بہ نژاد نو). He also follows the pattern of R.A. Nicholson and Mahmud Ahmad in numbering the lines from the first to the last, facilitating the reference work, in this way. This book seems to be a paraphrase, and refinement as well, of Mahmud Ahmad's poetic rendering, 'The Pilgrimage of Eternity'.

Since, its being a prose rendering, no poetic discussion is involved in commenting upon it, we directly move on to its substance. The greatest achievement of Arberry lies in his introduction of a rich vocabulary to the English readers of Iqbal. Although, Mahmud's work is no less significant in this respect, yet, Arberry's being an English native, makes him surpass Mahmud at many places. Let us briefly compare some of their key terms:*2

Mahmud	Arberry	Persian Word
Invocation	Prayer	1- مناجات
Prologue	Prelude	2- تمہید
Flight	Ascension	3- معراج
Song	Chant	4- زمزمہ
Firmament	Sphere	5- فلک
Principles	Foundations	6- محکمات

Speech	Admonition	7۔ تذکیر
Presence	Divine Presence	8۔ حضور
Radiance	Epiphany	9۔ تجلی
Glory	Majesty	10۔ جلال

Let us compare these key-words now, in order to grasp the basis of the precision of one word vis-a-vis the other:

1- 'Invocation' is a general call for help; anything powerful or anyone can be invoked for help (including God). 'Prayer' is specifically offered or made to God.

2- In 'Prologue', the element of initial speech is predominant, whereas, in 'Prelude' the element of action is predominant.

3- 'Ascension' is the precise term, adopted by the Muslims for 'معراج'. 'Flight' can be used even with birds and aeroplanes.

4- 'Sphere' is an accurate astrological term for the sphere of influence of a certain planet. 'Firmament' is used only for 'sky'.

5- 'Chant' is preferable to 'Song' for the word 'زمزمہ', as in chant some musical instrument, group-singing and repetition of some words are regarded as essentials.

6- 'Principles' are usually man-made; 'Foundations' is a universal term, encompassing also the laws governing the phenomenal world.

7- 'Admonition' is a 'warning-speech', but a general 'Speech' may not be inclusive of warning. The word 'تذکیر' necessitates warning.

8- 'Presence' can be that of anything, but 'Divine Presence', although, still un-clear, may be a relatively better phrase for the presence of God.

9- 'Epiphany' is more relevant than 'Radiance', as any luminous object can emit radiance, but not epiphany, which is a divine light, revealed only from heaven.

10- 'Majesty' is addition of awe to beauty: 'Glory' is a splendid form of beauty, but not necessarily awful.

This very brief discussion highlights how Arberry's some basic terms are more relevant. As indicated above, his principal contribution is towards a rich vocabulary. Let us cast a glance at some of his words, rarely used by other writers:*3

1-	transpierced	سفت
2-	aloe	عود
3-	inadvertency	تغافل
4-	untumult	کم آشوبی
5-	magnificat	تسبیح
6-	vicissitudes	حوادث
7-	cranium	کلہ
8-	lapis-lazuli	لاجورد
9-	effluence	فیض
10-	patrimony	میراث
11-	crater	غار
12-	propinquity	قرب

13- conturbation	کش مکش
14- cavalcade	خیل
15- chink	چاک
16- acolyte	مقتدی
17- contingent things	ممکنات
18- gratis	مفت
19- seminary	مکتب
20- jettisoned	درباختند
21- strummer	زخمہ ور
22- talon	مخلب
23- palm fronds	برگ نخیل
24- demented heart	دلِ دیوانہ
25- ululation	ہائے و ہو
26- lees	دُرد
27- caparison	براق
28- monasticism	رہبانیت

It is subjective choice, but, hopefully agreeable to the learned analysts of the translations of Iqbal. Arberry's work is irrefutably worth-while, yet, some of his renderings are non-acceptable and, at times, incorrect:

1- Throughout the book, he has translated the word 'faqr' (فقر) as 'poverty'. In simplest words, 'faqr' is the state

'becoming indifferent to this world and the rewards of the life hereafter, in the ultimate love for God'.*4 As it is one of the supreme themes of Iqbal, rather synonymous with even complete Islam, it is absolutely non-acceptable to call it poverty.*5

2- He has given the word 'Prophecy' for 'Prophethood' (نبوت). 'Prophecy' is used for the status of the predictors of all kinds, but, 'Prophethood' is exclusively status of the God-sent, innocent, born-Prophets, the last of whom, according to Islamic belief, was Muhammad (Sm.). It is strange that many standard dictionaries have not mentioned the word 'Prophethood', e.g., 'Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English', which is regarded as one of the most reliable dictionaries of this time.*6 But, on the other hand, 'The Concise Oxford Dictionary' gives three words for this meaning; Prophethood, Prophetism and Prophetship.*7 Arberry himself has used the two words 'Prophecy' and 'Prophethood', at the same place, in the same sense:

> So long as prophethood is inferior to sainthood
> prophecy is a veritable vexation to love.*8

These lines indicate that he was not conscious of the difference between these two words.*9 It is interesting to note that in the second half of his book, Arberry uses the word 'Prophethood' instead of 'Prophecy'.*10

3- Another unagreeable translation is that of 'ذات' (God). He uses the word 'Essence' for it.*11 'Essence' is purely a philosophical term, with various interpretations by different schools of philosophy.*12 The crux of all the philosophical polemics is that it is not safe to use the single word 'Essence' for God; the phrases 'Absolute Essence' or 'Ultimate Essence'

might be used instead, if required at all. But, why not to use the word 'self' to qualify 'God', as 'God's Self', which gives the sense purely an Iqbalian touch as well.

4- A yet more misleading translation is that of 'ام الکتاب'. Iqbal has used this phrase thrice in 'Javid Nama', and at all the three places, he means 'the Quran' by it.*13 Arberry, once again, creates a confusion by using the abstract philosophical word, 'Archetype':

(i) Heavenly Archetype
(ii) the Archetype of the Book
(iii) the Archetype of the Book*14

All the three translations seem to convey the sense that it is not the Book, which is being considered here, but, it is its Archetype, which is under consideration. This philosophisation creates a lot of problems for the new reader of Iqbal.

5- In 'Tamheed-i-Zamini', Iqbal depicts the beauty of nature at the advent of Rumi. There is a couplet:

از متاعش پارۂ دزدید شام
کوکبے چوں شاہدے بالائے بام 15*

Arberry translates the word 'شاہد' (beloved) as 'a witness':

evening stole a portion of its capital
and a star stood like a witness above the roof.*16

6- In the same chapter, another couplet has been misunderstood by Arberry. Iqbal says:

چیست معراج آرزوے شاہدے
امتحانے روبروے شاہدے 17*

Iqbal himself has translated this couplet, in his 'The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam':

What is 'Ascension'? Only a search for a witness
Who may finally confirm thy reality.*18

Arberry takes a quite opposite meaning:

What is Ascension? The desire for a witness,
an examination face-to-face of a witness.*19

In Iqbal's view, the witness confirms the reality of the ascendant, but, to Arberry, the ascendant examines the witness. Bashir Ahmad Dar has discussed this mistake in an article, 'Discussion'.*20

7- B.A. Dar points out another mistake of Arberry, in the same article.*21 In 'Falak-i-Mushtari', there is a couplet:

نقشِ جاں تا در جہاں گردد تمام
می شود دیدارِ حق دیدارِ عام! *22

Arberry misunderstands the second line of this couplet; he translates it as this:

when the soul's image is perfected in the world,
to behold the commons is to behold God.*23

B.A. Dar gives a clear rendering of the second misunderstood line:

All would be able to enjoy God's vision.*24

8- In 'Falak-i-Qamar', Iqbal describes the impressions of good poetry:

خوں ازو اندر بدن سیار تر
قلب از روح الامیں بیدار تر *25

Here, again, Arberry misunderstands the second hemistich:

Through it the blood courses swifter in the body,
the heart grows more aware of the Trusty Spirit.*26

The second line should be:

the heart grows more aware than the Trusty Spirit.

9- In the same chapter, Iqbal describes the zone of 'Yarghamid': one of the couplets is:

فرشیاں از نورِ او روشن ضمیر
عرشیاں از سرمۂ خاکش بصیر *27

By 'فرشیاں' and 'عرشیاں', Iqbal means 'the dwellers of the earth and the sky'. Here, Arberry's rendering is ridiculous:

the Carpet-angels are inly lit by its light,
its dust's collyrium brightens the eyes of the Throne-angels.*28

The phrase 'Carpet-angels' is really ridiculous. Mahmud Ahmad's translation of these lines is quite clear:

Its light gave earthly men a brighter soul,
Its clay collyrium for the angel's eyes.*29

10- In 'Falak-i-Zuhra', Iqbal mentions the powers of a pure soul. There is a couplet:

پیشِ او نُہ آسماں نُہ خیبر است
ضربتِ او از مقامِ حیدرؓ است *30

Arberry's translation is:

Before it the nine heavens are nine Khaibers,
its smiling is of the stature of Haider.*31

The word 'smiling' in the second line might be a misprinted 'smiting'; otherwise, there is no sense in this line.

11- In 'Falak-i-Mirrikh', there is a couplet about the damsel, who claimed prophethood:

گفت نازل گشتہ ام از آسماں
دعوتِ من دعوتِ آخر زماں *32

The phrase 'آخرزماں' does not denote time. It denotes 'the last Prophet'.[*33] This couplet is actually a vitrolic satire on a self-made prophet of Iqbal's age. Arberry ascribes it only to time:

> She declared, "I have come down from heaven;
> my message is the <u>final message of time</u>."[*34]

12- Arberry uses the word 'pomegranate tree' for 'نارون' in the translation of this line:

درمیاں یک زن قدش چوں نارون[*35]

He translates it as this:

> ... amidst them a woman with the stature of a tall <u>pomegranate tree</u>.[*36]

In its general sense, his translation is correct and acceptable, because 'نارون' is a kind of pomegranate tree. But, for intensive readers, there is a difference between the two trees. 'Pomegranate' is used for a tree that produces a well-known fruit, 'انار', whereas, according to the sub-continental lexicographers, 'نارون' means 'گلنار', which is a kind of wild-pomegranate that produces only flowers.[*37] S.Haim, in his three dictionaries, has called it '<u>elm-tree</u>'.[*38] John Richardson and Steingass have also provided the word '<u>elm-tree</u>' for 'انار'.[*39] An elm-tree is tall and extremely beautiful, whereas, a pomegranate-tree has got no importance in this respect. Since Iqbal is describing the bewitching stature of a lady, it is more suitable to use the word 'elm-tree'.

Besides these cases, wherein Arberry failed to comprehend the basic ideas, there are some words used by him, which are not precise ones:[*40]

1-	Oman	عماں
2-	grey	سنجاب
3-	thigh	صلب

4-	table	خوان
5-	production	خروج
6-	rouge	غاز
7-	labour	شان
8-	remembrancer	اھل ذکر
9-	beer	دُرد
10-	wolf	روبہی
11-	table	مائدہ
12-	apparition	جلوۂ

In an overall estimation, Arberry's work is an appreciable attempt, though it is in prose, unlike his other translations, which are all in verse.

REFERENCES

1. Published by George Allen & Unwin, London.
2. Javid Nama (I); 1-7; 2-13; 3-17; 4-27; 5-29; 6-68; 7-111; 8-188; 9-195; 10-195

   Javid Nama (A); 1-21; 2-25; 3-28; 4-35; 5-36; 6-59; 7-88; 8-136; 9-140; 10-140

   The Pilgrimage of Eternity; 1-1; 2-6; 3-9; 4-20; 5-22; 6-57; 7-101; 8-179; 9-186; 10-186
3. Javid Nama (A); lines 1-37; 2-60; 3-64; 4-107; 5-169; 6-177; 7-333; 8-402; 9-414; 10-468; 11-528; 12-695; 13-783; 14-808, 15-961; 16-992; 17-1171; 18-1284; 19-1367; 20-1406; 21-1498; 22-1562; 23-1798; 24-2097; 25-2306; 26-2408; 27-3244; 28-3444

4. Farhang-i-Iqbal; P.630
5. Please see Javid Nama (A); lines 457, 1307, 1455, 2611, 2824, 2868, 3146, 3475, 3588
6. Published by The English Language Book Society, London; 1998
7. Published by Clarenden Press, Oxford; 1990 (Please see under the word 'Prophet'); P.957
8. Javid Nama (A); lines 817-8
9. Ibid; Please see the word 'Prophecy' used in these lines: 729, 748, 813, 849, 1321
10. Ibid; Please see lines 1993 and 2037
11. Ibid; lines 172-3, 306 and 625
12. Please see, 'Dictionary of Philosophy'; C.A. Qadir; Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore; 1994; P.173
13. Javid Nama (I); PP 61, 76 and 79
14. Javid Nama (A); lines 1012, 1362 and 1444
15. Javid Nama (I); P.18
16. Javid Nama (A); lines 219-20
17. Javid Nama (I); P.20
18. The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam; Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore; 1996; P.157
19. Javid Nama (A); lines 253-4
20. Articles on Iqbal; Bashir Ahmad Dar; Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1997; P.269
21. Ibid; P.270
22. Javid Nama (I); P.130
23. Javid Nama (A); lines 2377-8
24. op cit; P.270
25. Javid Nama (I); P.43
26. Javid Nama (A); lines 709-10
27. Javid Nama (I); P.45
28. Javid Nama (A); lines 757-8
29. The Pilgrimage of Eternity; lines 765-6
30. Javid Nama (I); P.87
31. Javid Nama (A); lines 1557-8
32. Javid Nama (I); P.110

33. Naseem-i-Aflak-i-Zamana; P.155
34. Javid Nama (A); lines 2039-40
35. Javid Nama (I); P.110
36. Javid Nama (A); lines 2023-4
37. (i) Ghayas-ul-Lughat; Mulla Ghayas-ud-Din Rampuri; Lucknow; 1930
    (ii) Lughat-i- Kishwari; Tasadduq Hussain; Lucknow; 1935
    (iii)Lughat-i-Ferozi; Maulvi Froze-ud-Din; Lahore; 1952
38. (i) The One Volume English Persian Dictionary; Teheran; 1987
    (ii) The English Persian Collegiate Dictionary; New Delhi; 1992
    (iii) The Larger Persian English Dictionary; Teheran; 1985
39. (i) Persian English Dictionary; F. Steingass; Lahore; 1981
    (ii) Dictionary, Persian, Arabic and English; John Richardson; Lahore; 1998
40. Javid Nama (A); lines 1-208; 2-217; 3-514; 4-928; 5-1093; 6-1325; 7-1386; 8-1395; 9-1414; 10-1450; 11-1477; 12-1901

IQBAL'S JAVID NAMA

A.Q. Niaz

The only complete translation of 'Javid Nama', titled 'Iqbal's Javid Nama', made by A.Q. Niaz, was published in 1984.*1 It is a simple prose translation, and as his preface writer, Gilani Kamran, writes, "Niaz undertook to translate 'Javid Nama' in the early Fifties, and the work was completed, with unavoidable distractions, in the late 1960".*2 So, it can be inferred that Sheikh Mahmud Ahmad and A.Q. Niaz were simultaneously busy in their work, without , perhaps, any knowledge of each other. Arberry could utilize Mahmud's translation, but, could not do so in case of Niaz's translation, since it was published quite later on.

There are some idiosyncrasies of this translator, which cause problems for a reader:

1- There is a deluge of useless transliterations of the Persian words, which could have been easily translated and, then, understood in English (Please see 'Notes and References' for a list of such words).*3 There are 66 such words. In our list, we have mentioned each word just once, whereas, most of these words appear in the text again and again. The translator has adopted three approaches to introduce these words:

(i) He manages to print them in italics.

(ii) In some cases, he explains the Persian words/ terms in footnotes, e.g., 'Ishq' and 'Rind' on pages 7 and 28.

(iii) Some words/terms have been interpreted within the text, through an additional word,

phrase, clause or a sentence, as the words 'Ghaib' and 'Hozoor' interpreted in the translation of this couplet:

شیوہ ہائے زندگی غیب و حضور

آں یکے اندر ثبات، آں در مرور *4

Translation:

The ways of life are gahib (ghaib) and hozoor:
Concealment, invisibility, on the one hand;
and revealment, presence in fact, on the other:
One always on the march; the other subsisting in permanence.*5

In this translation, the lines 1 and 4 are the translation of the original text, but, 2 and 3 are the interpretation of 'ghaib' and 'hozoor'. But, the point to consider is that the translator has not given any indication of it. This practice he carries on throughout the book.

2- The excessive use of the original words/terms might be justifiable for some words, whereof there is no substitute word in English, e.g., ***Ishq, Faqr, Qalandar, Deen, Momin, Mi'raj, Allah Hoo*** etc: rather it is appreciable to convey such exclusively Islamic terms to the European readers. However, it seems awfully queer to keep the words like 'bood', 'anjuman', 'mahmal', 'fikr', 'saf-shikan', 'mughbachaa' etc. as untranslated.

3- He does not dwell only upon the transliteration, and repetition of this transliteration, of the above 66 words, but also does sc with all the Quranic verses, their parts or any single Quranic word. This excessive transliteration, firstly, impedes the flow of reading and, secondly, affects

comprehension of the text, as most of the readers are unfamiliar with this style.

4- In his predilection to transliteration, he has given a full couplet of Ghalib in such a script and, consciously or unconsciously, has passed on without giving its translation. Here is that couplet:

Qumree kaf-i-khakistaro Bulbul Qafasi rang:
Ai-nalah nishan-i-jigari sokhtah cheest? *6

5- In his orthographic style, he seems to have something in his mind, especially about the pronunciation of diphthongs (double vowels). For almost every prolonged voice, he tries to spell the word with double vowels, e.g., 'Aadam', 'Ghanee', 'Abdalee', 'Kashmeeree' etc.*7 Such innovations might be a nice subject for the phoneticians, but generally, they are considered as a departure from the accepted modes of spellings.

6- Another idiosyncrasy of this tanslation is that in most of the cases, A.Q. Niaz has given the rendering of 'ما' (our/us) in terms of 'من' (my/I), e.g.:*8

(i) Life for me is like colour and fragrance for a flower.

زندگی مارا چو گل را رنگ و بو

(ii) This body is not a partner in my life, my Mind and my Soul.

ایں بدن با جانِ ما انباز نیست

(iii) Why, if my salvation lies in being divested of the spirit of the search and strife.

گر نجاتِ ما فراغ از جستجو ست

As far as the quality of the translation is concerned, one can safely say that, semantically, it equals, if not surpasses, those of Mahmud Ahmad and Arberry. This translation has to its credit the contribution of some nice lexical items. Here are some of them:*9

1-	fordable	پایاب
2-	rankles	می خلد
3-	insidious thread	زنار
4-	creation of men of stamp	آدم گری
5-	equinimity	فراغ
6-	ensconce	نشیں
7-	weltering	غلطیدن مثلِ بسمل
8-	fructification	ثمر آوری
9-	penmanship	فنِ تحریر
10-	apportionment	تقدیر
11-	alligator	نہنگ
12-	high-provost	شحنہ
13-	bedraggled	آشفتہ
14-	sycamore	چنار
15-	cotton-shredder	پنبہ زن

These are some of his selected words, speaking of his expertise in the use of language. Generally, his style is easy to follow, and he is successful in grasping and conveying the sense. But, there are a large number of incorrect translations, omissions and inconsistencies in this translation. Here is a survey of it:

1- There are 17 couplets, as we could see, whereof he has failed to give a correct rendering.*10

2- There are 42 hemistichs, which have been translated incorrectly.*11

3- There are about 41 words/phrases, which have not been properly understood by the translator.*12

4- He has, consciously or unconsciously, overlooked some key-words or phrases and hemistichs.*13

5- Moreover, there are some spelling mistakes, which are indicative of the translator's lack of due attention.*14

Since a complete book is required to analyse all these errors and shortcomings in detail, we are giving the lists of them, instead of analysing some of them and leaving others.

After this analysis, it seems quite pertinent to mention that, perhaps, the version in view is not the final version. It was in the form of a manuscript, which Gilani Kamran and S.W. Zaman managed to publish posthumously. Had A.Q. Niaz lived longer, he would have necessarily made some additions, omissions or deletions, as there do exist some inconsistencies in this translation, especially in terminology and orthography. It, therefore, cannot be accepted as a standard translation.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. Iqbal's Javid Nama; P.xiii
3. Here is a list of the transliterations with pages: Ishq (7); tajallee (8); Mi'raaj (18); Azzan (27); gahib and hozoor (27); Rind (28); Ushaaq (31); Marad-i-Faqeer (41); Qalandar (41); Bandgee (53); Mard-i-Momin (58); Toor (60); Mahmal (62); Allah Hoo (65); Roohul Ameen (66); Zaratasht (75); Wilaayat (77); Wahdat (77); Khalwat and Jalwat (79); Kaafiree (115); Sijdah (87); Rak'at (88); Hast-o-Bood (91); Auliya (92); Kaainaat-i-Shauq (110); Anjuman (111); Aamir (115); Aamiree (115); Faqr (120); Iblees (122); Kafir (124); Yadi Baiza (126); Millati Baiza (126); Zikr (128); Fikr (133); Takya (139); Zikr-i-Jameel (148); Deen (150); Hudee (162); La Makan (172); Taqdeer (175); Irfan (188); Shauq-i-Beparwah (191); Maqaam-i-Bekhabri (192); Amr-i-Haq (201); Anbiya (205); Rahmatun-lil-aalameen (205); abdohoo (208); Suuna (211); Zahid (213); Fana (213); Ahl-i-Firaq (214); Tauheed (215); Khawaja Ahl-i-Firaq (215); Naist (219); Majzoob (238); Kausar (245); Ghilman (245); Hauz-i-Kausar (249); Shaitan (251); Saf-Shikan (254); Jam-i-Jamm (261); Mard-i-Darvesh (265); Darveshee (266); Mughbachaa (266); Taqwa (327).
4. Javid Nama; P.21
5. Iqbal's Javid Nama; P.27
6. Ibid; P.204
7. Ibid; PP. 17, 249, 271
8. Ibid; PP.23, 35 and 44
9. Ibid; PP: 1-11; 2-16; 3-32; 4-67; 5-73; 6-77; 7-104; 8-117; 9-175; 10-176; 11-192; 12-193; 13-228; 14-254; 15-254
10. Incorrect couplets:

Page No.		Page No.	
12-	آں چناں تارِ نفس از ہم گیخت	111-	شعلۂ کزوے شررہا در گسست
17-	خیالِ او کہ از سیلِ حوادث پرورش گیرد	113-	صاحبِ تحقیق را جلوت عزیز
86-	از ہلاکِ قیصر و کسریٰ سرود	136-	از نم و زیرِ حیات آکہ شوی

188۔ کار حکمت دیدن و فرسودن است!

188۔ آں چہ در ترازوے بجہ

191۔ ز خواب خویش طلب آتشے کہ پیدا نیست

219۔ [illegible] نیست ایں از الٰہی است

219۔ تا نصیب از درد آدم داشتم

243۔ کس نگوید ایں کہ گردوں آشناست

243۔ یا سرورے کاید از دیدار دوست

284۔ از تن آسانی بگیر د سہل را

286۔ ہم سپاہی ہم سپہ گر ہم امیر

301۔ عشق کس را کے بخلوت می برد

316۔ باپشیزے دین و ملت را فروخت

11. Incorrect hemistichs:

Page No.

20۔ گر دام و دد ملولم و انسانم آرزوست

22۔ کوکبے چوں شاہدے بالاے بام

23۔ چیست معراج آرزوے شاہدے

36۔ دیدہ ہا از سرمہ اش روشن سواد

66۔ قلب از روح الامیں بیدار تر

66۔ جانِ تو بے لذت گفتار باد

68۔ قہرِ یزداں ضربتِ کرار او

82۔ ایں سراپا نالہ و فریاد کیست

85۔ از دم او رفتہ جاں آمد بہ تن

94۔ ورنہ آں کارے کہ مزدش جنت است

105۔ گفت نقش کہنہ را باید زدود

110۔ فطرتِ او خاک را آدم کند

111۔ فاش گویم با تو اسرارِ حجاب

116۔ ہر زماں اندر کمینِ یک دگر

Page No.

142۔ مخلبش گیرندۂ جبریل و حور

143۔ بر کشیدم پردہ ہائے این وثاق

154۔ تو اگر ترکِ جہاں کردہ سرِ او داری

170۔ بر لبِ مرتخیاں حرفِ دری

177۔ رنج بے گنج است تقدیر ایں چنیں

185۔ ہر چہ خواہی از بنین و از بنات

195۔ چند در افکارِ خود باشی اسیر

201۔ بندۂ حق را بدار آویختند

212۔ نقش حق اندر جہاں انداختند

220۔ تا نہ گردد نامہ ام تاریک تر

224۔ منکرِ خود از تو می خواہم بدہ

244۔ ناید اندر وہم و آید در نظر

250۔ سید السادات، سالارِ عجم

254۔ جہد را ہموارہ سُود است ایں چنیں

263۔ تابنائے کوہ را بر می کند
265۔ نشترِ تو گرچہ در دلہا خلید
284۔ علم دشوار است می سازد بہ لہو
286۔ آنکہ با کاہش نیرزد بوستاں
287۔ آہ زاں معشوقِ عاشق ناشناس
290۔ کہنہ گردیدی شباب تو ہماں
294۔ زانکہ در عرضِ حیات آمد ثبات

308۔ امتاں را طغرل و سنجر از و ست
309۔ آں یکی را بیند ایں گردد یکی
320۔ تا جہانش را دگر گوں کردہ ام
323۔ خوشتر آں درسے کہ گیری از نظر
324۔ آں بانکارِ وجود آمد 'عجول'
332۔ اہلِ دیں را باز داں از اہلِ کیں
335۔ می شناسی حرص فقرِ حاضر است

12. Incorrect words:
رواں - moving (3); نوبت - climax (3); نزاع - agonies (9); طیلساں - maze (13); آہو - hind (13); تپید - went (14); نورِ جاں - light of the mind (15); پارہ - jewel (21); اشکم - flesh (26); گرد - mist (34); نہال - happy (37); فردا - today (42); قفار - back (46); دیر - universe (50); سنگِ قمر - marble (69); بساط - sacred field (86); خواں - table (87); ابرکے - mica (92); بوالبشر - Man (93); سیدالسادات - Leader of Leaders (94); رقیب - rival (111); گرچہ - if (112); جرہ شاہیں - the young eagle (115); دوک - reed (116); غزال - stag (126); پیر روم - the old man Rumi (153); غزال - antelope (163); حب - dose (178); معرفت - comprehension (213); ارغنون - institution (219); اعتبارات - witness (245); مینو نظیر - emerald (250); عقیق - rubies (274); یشم - agate (274); حرفِ دری - sparkling speech (275); عمامہ - oriental turban (283); عصیاں - sin (287); سودہ - seen (288); طرخون - willow (312); مس - base alloy (323); سبزہ رنگ - white (326).

13. Untranslated words/phrases:
زریں قباب-248 ; قفیز-188 ; ارحام-186؛ نارون-182 ؛ قرآنش-123 ؛ متن-34
hemistichs:
؛ زندہ رود، اے صاحبِ سوز و سرود!-297 ؛ دل بہ چاہِ بابلے انداختی؟-54

14. Incorrect Spellings:

lightening (lightning) 28; threat (throat) 31; marage (manager) 32; marad (mard) 41; withouht (without) 61; shallt (shalt) 85; spare (snare) 90; valted (vaulted) 116; vengence (vengeance) 160; Salima (Sulaima) 192; Ajm (Ajam) 208; hwite (white) 254; he (the) 259, 284; commo (common) 259; Heave (have) 288

PAS CHEH BAYAD KARD AEY AQWAM-I-SHARQ,

WHAT SHOULD THEN BE DONE
Bashir Ahmad Dar

'Pas Cheh Bayad Kard' (1936) witnessed its first English translation in 1977, made by Bashir Ahmad Dar, with the title 'What Should Then be Done O People of the East.'*1 It is a prose rendering, and its greatest quality is that it is nicely annotated and, syntactically, easy to follow. In this work, the translator is more careful as compared to his previous efforts in this field. His diction is more relevant and refined. One feels almost satisfied while reading this translation. But, there are some places where there is a need for improvement:

1- In 'Tamheed', Iqbal says:

اے خوش آں مردے کہ دل با کس نداد *2

B.A. Dar's translation is:

> Fortunate is he who never bowed before any man,*3

The word 'bowed' does not convey the sense of 'being enamoured of someone'. It is more akin to horror or fright.

2- In the same chapter, Iqbal says:

خرقہ خود بار است بر دوشِ فقیر *4

B.A. Dar translates it thus:

> To the mendicant, even his patched-up garment is a burden.*5

The word 'mendicant' is used for 'a person living as a beggar'.*6 Iqbal's 'faqeer' is the one who is in possession of 'Faqr'. What is faqr? Iqbal defines it as this:

چیست فقر اے بندگانِ آب و گل　　یک نگاہِ راہ بیں، یک زندہ دل
فقر کارِ خویش را سنجیدن است　　بر دو حرفِ لاالہ پیچیدن است
فقر خیبر گیر با نانِ شعیر　　بستۂ فتراکِ او سلطان و میر
فقر ذوق و شوق و تسلیم و رضاست　　ما امینیم ایں متاعِ مصطفیٰ ست
فقر بر کروبیاں شبخوں زند　　بر نوامیسِ جہاں شبخوں زند *7

Can the owner of such superb qualities be called 'a mendicant'?

3- About a disintegrated nation, Iqbal says:

میرد اندر سینہ اش قلبِ سلیم
در نگاہِ او کج آید مستقیم *8

B.A. Dar could not understand the second line of this couplet. He also uses 'their' instead of 'its':

The pure heart dies in their breast,
and to their eyes the crooked appears straight.*9

The correct translation is:

The pure heart dies in its breast,
And to its eyes the straight appears crooked.

4- In the following couplet, the second line has been misapprehended by B.A.Dar:

پس چہ باید کرد اے اقوامِ شرق؟
باز روشن می شود ایامِ شرق *10

His translation of this couplet is:

What should then be done, O people of the East?---
that the life of the East may once again brighten up.*11

In the second line, Iqbal is witnessing a radical change in the East. He, therefore, asks the Eastern Nations to think about their condition and role in this changing scenario. The next couplet clearly elucidates the idea of the awakened East:

در ضمیرش انقلاب آمد پدید

شب گذشت و آفتاب آمد پدید *12

B.A.Dar's sense, in the second line, is altogether different. He is asking the Eastern Nations to think about the ways and means to bring about a brighter revolution in the East. Thus, Iqbal is presenting a post-revolutionary idea, whereas, B.A.Dar is lagging behind in a pre-revolutionary quagmire.

5- In 'Dar Hozoor-i-Risalat Ma'ab', two couplets are in the following order:

آتش افرنگیاں بگداختش یعنی ایں دوزخ دگرگوں ساختش

شیخ مکتب کم سواد و کم نظر از مقام او نداد او را خبر *13

B.A. Dar, in his translation, has reversed the order of these couplets, i.e., he has placed the translation of the second couplet before the first one.*14

These were some of the comprehension flaws. Let us, now, see some of his words, which cannot be regarded as precise:*15

1- mat   بوریا

2- meditation   ذکر

3- attitude   حال

4- unsheathed sword   تیغ آختہ

5- Clarion Call   تکبیر

6- canal   ناودان

7- kettle دیگ

All these words and their imprecision in translation is clear, except 'navidan'(ناودان) , the meaning whereof has been given even by Iqbal himself, in his footnote, as 'پرنال' (an outlet for water on a roof). B.A. Dar calls it a canal.

Keeping aside these few shortcomings, it is a dependable translation, with highly precious annotations vis-a-vis a fluent and smooth version.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.8
3. What Should Then Be Done; line. 45
4. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.9
5. What Should Then Be Done; line. 63
6. Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English; 'mendicant'; P.678
7. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.20
8. Ibid; P.11
9. What Should Then Be Done; lines 105-6
10. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.43
11. What Should Then Be Done; lines 807-10
12. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.43
13. Ibid; P.49
14. What Should Then Be Done; lines 973-6
15. Ibid; lines1-54; 2-101; 3-148; 4-204; 5-459; 6-484; 7-485

IQBAL'S PAS CHEH BAYED KARD

Sheikh Hassan Din

A poetic translation of 'Pas Cheh Bayad Kard' appeared in 1988, bearing the title 'Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard'.*1 The translator, Sheikh Hassan Din, has translated the book in heroic couplet, i.e., 'lines of iambic pentameter, rhymed in pairs'.*2 No other rhythm has been employed in the book except some casual hexametric lines. Although, there is nothing poetically outstanding in the book, yet, it becomes pretty obvious that the translator has got a reasonable knowledge of prosody.

The most attractive aspect of this translation is the translator's command of the English language. Some very rare as well as precise lexical items have been contributed by him. Given below are some of them:*3

1-	mental dynamite	جذب دروں
2-	sham-god	غیر اللہ
3-	brocade-blind	اطلس ناشناس
4-	cap-a-pie	سراپا
5-	foe-benumbed	کشتۂ تدبیر غیر
6-	contrite	درویش
7-	hone	فساں
8-	Deuce	شیطان
9-	pest	وبال
10-	long-interred	کہنہ

11- rank-bedazed	جاہ مست
12- buck-hunting	صیدِ آہو
13- trice	لحظہ
14- Self-abstraction	مجذوبی
15- autocracy	قاہری
16- zither	ساز

These words also throw light on the translator's deep study of the English literature.

This translation is a posthumous publication in 1988, whereas, the translator passed away in 1963. Obviously, he must have had done his work in the fifties or the early sixties. On the other hand, B.A. Dar translated the same book in the seventies, and got it published in 1977. A comparative study of the two translations reveals that there are glimpses of Hassan Din's work in B.A. Dar's translation. When and where did B.A. Dar see the manuscript of Hassan Din? It is yet to discover. However, most probably, he did utilize it. Here are two examples:

1- The second couplet of the chapter 'Pas Cheh Bayad Kard Aey Aqwam-i-Sharq' is:

پس چہ باید کرد اے اقوامِ شرق؟
باز روشن می شود ایامِ شرق *4

Hassan Din could not grasp the sense of the second line of it. His translation is:

So nations of the East! What should do we
To cause its days bright again to be.*5

In this couplet, Iqbal is addressing the Eastern Nations, advising them to adjust themselves to the changing circumstances, caused by the revolution, which has occurred in the East. Hassan Din, like B.A.Dar*6 is asking the Easterners to think of how to bring about a revolution.

2- In 'Dar Hozoor-i-Risalat Ma'ab', the order of the following two couplets has been reversed by Hassan Din:

آتش افرنگیاں بگداختش
یعنی ایں دوزخ دگرگوں ساختش
شیخ مکتب کم سواد و کم نظر
از مقامِ او نداد او را خبر *7

Strangely enough, B.A. Dar has done exactly the same.*8 This flaw is neither that of comprehension or oversight. It stems from straight paraphrasing; the order of the poet (Hassan Din) was, unconsciously, maintained by the paraphraser.

In some cases, Hassan Din has not been able to provide us with accurate words:

1- In 'Hikmat-i-Kalimi', Iqbal describes the qualities of the men of God. One of the couplets is:

صحبتِ او ہر خزف را دُر کند
حکمتِ او ہر تہی را پُر کند *9

Hassan Din uses the word 'urn' with wisdom:

His contact coral beads to pearls does turn
Thus fills all empties from his wisdom's urn.*10

'An urn' is a container used in Greece to contain ashes of the dead bodies. Keats's 'Ode on a Grecian Urn' is a famous ode. Sometimes this word is roughly used for teapots or utensil of

such kind. But to use it in the sense of a container of wisdom is much queer.

2- In the same chapter, Iqbal advises:

فقر خواہی؟ از تہی دستی منال

عافیت در حال و نے در جاہ و مال *11

Hassan Din could not portray the sense of 'حال', as he uses the word 'mind' for it:

Don't grieve for want if Faqr be your pursuit
Tis mind, not wealth, that bliss does constitute.*12

The mystic condition of 'حال' is a state of 'divine' inspiration and ecstasy. Everyone possesses a mind, but very few people are there who enjoy the state of *'haal'*.

3- In the same chapter, there is another advice:

در ظلامِ ایں جہانِ سنگ و خشت

چشمِ خود روشن کن از نورِ سرشت *13

Hassan Din renders it as this:

In glooms of world opaque of stone and brick
Illume thy eye by flame of bosom's wick.*14

A 'wick' is 'the twisted thread in a candle that burns, when the wax melts': 'bosom' is purely a physical term. Thus, it looks ill-sounding to use ' bosom's wick' for a life endowing phrase like 'نورِ سرشت'.

4- In the chapter 'La Ilaha Illallah', there is a line:

ایں کہ می بینی نیرزد با دو جو *15

Hassan Din translates it as this:

It isn't worth a fig what you see.*16

His translation is idiomatically correct, but, there is a possibility that it may cause confusion in the minds of purely English readers, concerning the difference between 'barley' (جو) and 'fig'(انجیر). Perhaps, he is unaware that 'barley' is also used in English exactly in the same sense, i.e., worthlessness. Here is an example from Arberry:

Iqbal:

کہ نیرزد بجوے ایں ہمہ دیرینہ و نو 17*

Arberry:

Not worth a barley, in my view,
Is all her ancient and her new.*18

Moreover, Iqbal is using the word ' دو ' (two): Hassan Din renders it as 'a' (one).

Such minor oversights are there in this translation, but, generally, it is a highly appreciable translation, especially in precise translations of some religious terms.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Sheikh Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore.
2. A Dictionary of Literary Terms; P.97
3. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; PP. 1-5; 2-7; 3-7; 4-11; 5-21; 6-33; 7-37; 8-41; 9-51; 10-63; 11-69; 12-69; 13-77; 14-77; 15-91; 16-95
4. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.43
5. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; P.83
6. What Should Then Be Done; lines 809-10
7. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.49
8. What Should Then Be Done; lines 973-6
9. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.13
10. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; P.17
11. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.13
12. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; P.17

13. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.14
14. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; P.19
15. Pas Cheh Bayad Kard; P.19
16. Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard; P.29
17. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P.130
18. Persian Psalms; P.117

MUSAFIR

THE TRAVELLER

Maqbool Elahi

The first translation of the mathnavi 'Musafir' was made by Maqbool Elahi, under the title 'The Traveller', and was published along with Hassan Din's translation, 'Pas Cheh Bayed Kard', in 1988.*[1] It was Maqbool Elahi himself, who managed the joint publication of both the translations.

It is a prose rendering, but, at times, the translator tries to become poetic. Here is his own opinion in this respect:

> As to my own rendering, it will be found that it is a combination of regular and free verse as well as of prose, as dictated by my mood at the moment.*[2]

Obviously, the translator has observed no poetic convention or pattern. It is a matter of his own mood. Outrightly, it can be called a semi-prose and pseudo-poetic translation. After reading Hassan Din's nicely composed poetic rendering, one feels quite uneasy to peruse this combination of prose and self-created poetic style.

Linguistically, this work is quite elegant. In this work also, like his 'The Secrets of the Self', Maqbool Elahi has come forward with some rarely-used words, indicating the writer's penetrating look into the language: some of such words are:*[3]

1-	hearse	جنازہ
2-	bed-rock	اساس
3-	beautician	حنابند
4-	puerile Turkish ebullience	ترک جوشی

5- halcyon past بہار پارستان

6- wiseacre شوریدہ

7- in smithereens ریز ریز

8- morose ژ ند

9- Isthmus برزخ

10- bat-blind ناصیر

These words virtually augment the value of this translation. On the other hand, some inconsistencies are also there in it:

1- While addressing the Afghan races, Iqbal says:

این کہن ساماں نیرزد با دو جو
نقشبند آرزوے تازہ شو 4*

Maqbool Elahi's translation is:

These old assets sell for a song.
Horizons new mark up for self.*5

Thus, in the first line, the translator renders the word 'جو' (barley) as 'song'.

2- Out of the same chapter, the following hemistich has been left untranslated:

آرزو سرمایۂ سلطان و میر 6*

3- In 'On the Tomb of Sultan Mahmood', there is a line:

نکتہ سنج طوس را دیدم بہ بزم 7*

Here, Iqbal is talking about the famous poet of the age of Mahmood, 'Firdosi', but, Maqbool Elahi calls him a philosopher:

The Philosopher of Toose
I saw in session.*8

4- In the last chapter, there is a couplet:

تا دو تیغ لا و الّا داشتیم
ماسوی اللہ را نشاں نگذاشتیم *9

Iqbal is talking of the past glory of the Muslims, but, Maqbool Elahi is associating it with present and future:

So long as we wield the double-edged sword
Of La and illa
We shall not yield our flag
To other than Allah.*10

Other than these misapprehensions, there are some words, which, though, do not hamper the overall sense, yet, are imprecise. Here are three of them:*11

1-	sparrows	کبک
2-	quail	تدرو
3-	pink	ارغوان

Overlooking these few pitfalls, this translation can be placed among the works, wherein praise-worthy efforts have been made.

REFERENCES

1- Published by Sheikh Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore.
2- Iqbal's Pas Cheh Bayed Kard and Musafir; P. vii
3- The Traveller; PP. 1-125; 2-125; 3-141; 4-143; 5-157; 6-161; 7-165; 8-169; 9-179; 10-207
4- Musafir; P.60

5- The Traveller; P.125
6- Musafir ; P. 60
7- Ibid; P.72
8- The Traveller; P.161
9- Musafir; P.85
10- The Traveller; P.211
11- Ibid; PP. 1-117; 2-117; 3-123

THE TRAVELLER

Jamil Naqvi

The second translation of the mathnavi 'Musafir' was made by Jamil Naqvi in 1991, under the title 'The Traveller'.*1 It is a line for line prose translation, wherein the translator has tried to be as clear as possible.

An outstanding feature of this translation is that, like some chosen translators, Jamil Naqvi has tried to use some uncommon and appealing words. Given below are the most impressive ones out of them: *2

1-	hyper-space	لامکاں
2-	alack	حیف
3-	votary of God	بندۂ حق
4-	corporate body	ملت
5-	manacle	بند
6-	godly folk	مردانِ حق
7-	lolls	می غلطد
8-	esprit de corps	صحبت
9-	iridescent	رنگین
10-	cupola	گنبد
11-	voluptuary	رند
12-	tipsy	مست
13-	Interstise	برزخ
14-	connoisseur	نکتہ سنج
15-	pristine hue	نخستین رنگ

Such words are indicative of the translator's vastness of vocabulary. However, this translation has also got some mentionable flaws. Here are the ones, which we could locate:

1- In praise of the city of Kabul, Iqbal says:

چشم صائب از سوادش سرمہ چیں

روشن و پائندہ باد آں سرزمیں *3

In the translation of the first line of this couplet, the translator has dropped the poet Saib's name:

> the eye of poet acquires collyrium from its precincts*4

Moreover, the second line has been left untranslated.

2- In Kabul Iqbal offered the late-afternoon prayer, led by Sultan Nadir Shah: he says;

وقتِ عصر آمد صدائے الصلوٰت *5

Jamil Naqvi translates it as this:

> The call of noon prayer arose awhile.*6

Everyone knows well that no prayer *(salat)* is offered by the Muslim at noon. Maqbool Elahi has translated this line as this:

> In the afternoon rose the call for prayers.*7

Thus, he has rendered the word 'عصر' as 'afternoon'. Most of the dictionaries have supplied the same word for this meaning. This word is obviously correct, however, it would be more suitable to use the word 'afternoon' for *Zohr* (ظہر), and 'late-afternoon' for *Asr* (عصر) to clarify the time of these two prayers.

3- About the city of Qandhar, Iqbal says;

نارہا یخ بستہ اندر نارہا *8

Jamil Naqvi's translation is:

fires frozen within pomegranates.[*9]

The word 'نار' (fire) is very simple. The learned translator is confusing it with 'انار'(pomegranate).

Overall, this translation is almost equal to that of Maqbool Elahi. Its language seems to be more careful and precise.

REFERENCES

1- Published by Royal Book Company, Karachi.
2- The Traveller; PP. 1-20; 2-20; 3-20; 4-21; 5-21; 6-21; 7-24; 8-30; 9-32; 10-33; 11-34; 12-38; 13-38; 14-40; 15-41;
3- Musafir; P.61
4- The Traveller; P.24
5- Musafir; P.63
6- The Traveller; P.26
7- Op cit; P.135
8- Musafir; P.75
9- The Traveller; P.37

ARMAGHAN-I-HIJAZ

ARMAGHAN-I-HIJAZ

Q.A. Kabir

As we have mentioned in the Part I, 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' has been translated only by Q.A. Kabir. We have also given our comments upon the translation of the Urdu section of this translation. The conclusion we drew out of our reading was that this translation is a complete failure, poetically, grammatically and semantically. At this stage, we are going to judge the quality of the translation of the Persian section of this book.

The Persian section of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' consists of five parts, having further sub-sections:

1- Hozoor-i-Haq: 11 sub-sections
2- Hozoor-i-Risalat: 13 sub-sections
3- Hozoor-i-Millat: 18 sub-sections
4- Hozoor-i-Alam-i-Insani: 13 sub-sections
5- Ba Yaran-i-Tariq: 6 sub-sections

In the entire Persian portion of quatrains, Iqbal has numbered every sub-section. Q.A. Kabir makes an amendment, by dropping Iqbal's numbers, and inserting his own numerical order, starting from 1 upto 394. Thus, the original book loses its shape. There are three places, where he has changed the order of Iqbal's quatrains:

1- نداند جبرئیل ایں ہائے و ہو را

2- (i) جہانِ چار سو اندر برِ من

(ii) دریں وادی زمانی جاودانی

3- خنک آں ملتے کز وارداتش 1*

At two places, he has left headings: at one place he has misplaced it:

1- 'Hozoor-i-Haq', before quatrain No. 2
2- 'Iblis-i-Khaki-o-Iblis-i-Nari', before the quatrain No. 339
3- Quatrain No. 278 is included in the chapter 17 of 'Hozoor-i-Millat', but, the translator places it in the chapter 18.

There are five quatrains, of which he gives translations in two different versions.*2 There are two other quatrains, the second couplet whereof has been translated in two different versions.*3 This duplication of translations rises out of the translator's confusion. Let us consider the two versions of one of these quatrains:

جہاں از عشق و عشق از سینۂ تست
سرورش از مے دیرینۂ تست
جز ایں چیزے نمی دانم ز جبریل
کہ او یک جوہر از آئینۂ تست *4

The two versions:

(1) For love the world came from thee the love's flame,
In love the hidden joy thy old wine's game.
I know only one thing from the Gabe's tune,
That he took his glamour from thy moon's boon.

(2) For the world of love the fount is thee,
Thy old wine gives a constant glee.
The Gabe but told only one thing to me,
That he is a drop while you are a sea.*5

Obviously, both the versions are incorrect, exposing the translator's inability to transfer Iqbal's thought into English. In addition, by moving from longer lines to shorter ones, he seems to be practising with shorter rhythmic patterns, at the cost of meaning. His rhythm as well as rhymes are no more than a naive practice in versification. His greatest blunders, and ridiculous translations alike, stem out of his wanton effort to thrust in illegitimate rhymes, and mould the sense accordingly. For instance, the words 'flame', 'game', 'tune' and 'boon', in the first version above, are all out of place and vitiate the sense. Judged on actual poetical criteria, this translation amounts to just a heap of garbage.

A more appalling aspect of this translation is that of its grammatical inaccuracies. What to speak of his poetic artistry, one can easily assess the level of his competence in the English language by casting a glance at his two-paged prose 'Preface' to this book. Here is its pivotal sentence:

> But nobody took the painstaking to translate any book of Iqbal to maintain the same grace and gloss, splendour and lush, the rich and gorgeous beauty of Iqbal's own style and symmetry of words with a proper rhyme and meterical flow of Persian and Urdu compositions for which these languages are so proud.*6

By looking at the usage of the words 'painstaking', 'gloss', 'lush', 'meterical' and 'for', one can assess his standard of diction: five mistakes have been committed in a single sentence.

Out of a total of 394 quatrains, one would scarcely find more than ten quatrains translated correctly. The translator

badly needs an orientation in the English language. Let us evaluate his translation of the very first quatrain:

خوش آں راہی کہ سامانے نگیرد
دل او پند یاراں کم پذیرد
بہ آہ سوز ناکش سینہ بکشاے
زیک آہش غم صد سالہ میرد *7

Here is its translation by Q.A. Kabir:

Hail the lucky seeker no goods who hikes,
To playmates' counsels his heart seldom likes,
So open the heart with his ruthful sigh,
All gaps and griefs old would hither to die.*8

Here are some comments on this translation:

(1) The adjective 'lucky' or, else, 'hail' is additional.

(2) 'no goods who hikes' is incorrect, as it needs some preposition .It should have been 'with no goods who hikes', or 'without goods who hikes'.

(3) The verb 'like' is always used without preposition. The translator is using 'to' with it.

(4) In the third line, 'so' is redundant, and 'with' should be replaced with 'to' and 'the' with ' your', i.e., 'open your heart to...'

(5) In the last line, 'زیک آہش' has not been translated, and the words 'gaps' and 'hitherto' are additional and meaningless here.

Almost every translation in this book is of the same kind. Let us see some more grammatical errors:

1- The definite article, 'the', has been used frequently with the proper nouns:*9

(i) From the Adam's blood get a glow and bloom.
(ii) The sons of the Abe how long in this fane,
(iii) Knows not the Gabriel this hue and cry,
(iv) With 'faqr' thou destined to the Siddiq's part,
(v) The God knows that in the Abram's wake
(vi) Who can take tussels with the Kaiser's line.
(vii) In shame the Jum's realm to my content bows,
(viii) From the Farooq's bold eyes borrow a glance,
(ix) The Egypt's base would be firm I hope.
(x) By God's grace live with the Abram's grace.
(xi) No links with that Momin the God would keep,
(xii) Blame not the God for this or that hurt,
(xiii) An axe I use not in the Farhad's way.
(xiv) His shine and vigour big, the God is Great,

2- There are some glaring mistakes in the use of verb. Let us see some major ones: *10

(i) Let separation pangs had sharper force.
(ii) In words, the grief hidden cannot contain,
(iii) To dream and weaken is banned in her creed.
(iv) He wont let to know his secret mask.
(v) In one mosque two Mullahs may ne'er contain.
(vi) Did the spark raised from the axe or from stone?
(vii) He drived thee out from the Heavens first.

3- A number of mistakes have been committed in the use of prepositions as well, e.g.: *11

(i) To playmates' counsels his heart seldom likes,
(ii) From seeds I sow now no fruits would bear.

(iii) That 'Heaven's outcast' is better of me,
(iv) To Nimrods of this age, know by face,
(v) When self is deprived from godly tint.

Such childish mistakes as these indicate that the translator is not well equipped for his chosen task. Some open-minded critics get ready to overlook grammatical shortfalls, and accept the translation, even if it has conveyed the sense in a sub-standard language. But, what about those who translate without comprehending the original text. Regretfully enough, Q.A. Kabir suffers from the same ailment. Let us elucidate our statement through some translations of him, wherein he has fallen in pits of fiasco:

1- Iqbal:

روم راہے کہ او را منزلے نیست *12

Kabir:

I tread a path there which leads no where,*13

The word 'there' is additional: 'no where' should have been 'nowhere'.

2- Iqbal:

اگر می آید آں داناۓ رازے
بدہ او را نواۓ دل گدازے
ضمیرِ اُمتاں را می کند پاک
کلیمے یا حکیمے نے نوازے *14

Kabir:

If so e'er comes that gifted mystic sage,
To him then convey a burning message,
To purify conscience of nations soon,
With Sceptre of Moses and David's tune.*15

'نواۓ دل گدازے' means 'impressive poetry'. It is a prayer to

God, not a message. In the second couplet, 'می کند' has been overlooked to the detriment of the meaning.

3- Iqbal:

دل از دستِ کسے بردن نداند
غم اندر سینہ پروردن نداند
دم خود را دمیدی اندراں خاک
کہ غیر از خوردن و مُردن نداند *16

Kabir:

To lose heart to some one he did not know,
How grief is held dear he knew not so.
He just fanned breath in his dusty frame,
Save eat and die he had no aim.*17

Iqbal is talking in present tense, commenting upon the human nature. Kabir has changed it into the past tense. The word 'دمیدی' means 'you have infused'; Kabir has changed 'you' into 'he'.

4- Iqbal:

دلِ ما از کنارِ ما رمیده
بصورت مانده و معنی ندیده *18

Kabir:

My heart so restive is fleeing from me,
So wan and puzzled though, is yet at sea.*19

There is no sense in the second line.

5- Iqbal:

بجانِ شاں ز آوازِ جرس شور
چو از موجِ نسیمے در نیستاں *20

Kabir:

By God my feelings rouse from peals of bell,
As if the wind booms through canes wood dell.*21

In the first line, Iqbal talks about the travellers on the path of light, who get re-energized by the peal of the marching bell: Kabir is talking of himself, that also through swearing by God.

6- Iqbal:

چو آں مرغے کہ در صحرا سر شام
کشاید پر بہ فکر آشیانہ 22*

Kabir:

As the birds at dusk would fly back to nest,
I cherish to fly for the desert's quest.[*23]

Iqbal's bird is in the desert, while Kabir's bird is in quest for desert.

7- Iqbal:

گناہِ عشق و مستی عام کردند
دلیلِ پختگاں را خام کردند
بآہنگِ حجازی می سرایم
'نخستیں بادہ کاندر جام کردند' 24*

Kabir:

To love 'an rapture sins gave a common sense,
And made ripes' wisdom a raws logic hence.
I sing songs hey! to Makkan tunes gay,
Since wine in cup was poured on the first day.[*25]

Only the translator can tell what he means in these lines.

8- Iqbal:

امیرِ کارواں! آں اعجمی کیست؟ 26*

Kabir:

Who's that Ajmi as head of caravan?[*27]

Iqbal is asking the Amir of the caravan about the identity of the Ajmi man; Kabir is making the Ajmi the Amir of that

caravan.

9- Iqbal:

شبِ ہندی غلاماں را سحر نیست [28]

Kabir:

No morn yet to slaves O Indian night,[29]

Iqbal simply says that the night of the Indian slaves is yet mornless; Kabir is apostrophising the night.

10- Iqbal:

چہ گویم زاں فقیرے درد مندے [30]

Kabir:

As such I say to a soft hearted soul,[31]

The word 'زاں' means 'about'. Thus, Iqbal speaks about the soft-hearted faqir; Kabir is talking to him.

11- Iqbal:

دلے در سینۂ چاکش ندیدم [32]

Kabir:

I didn't peep though through his bosom's slit,[33]

Iqbal looks into and does not find any heart in the Muslim's wounded breast; Kabir even does not peep into the wounded breast to see any heart in it.

12- Iqbal:

حضور تو غم یاراں بگویم [34]

Kabir:

The sufferings of friends I say not to thee,[35]

A direct contradiction, through the word 'not'.

13- Iqbal:

طبیب نکتہ رس دید از نگاہش [36]

Kabir:

O wise critique see him from his view,[37]

Iqbal means that the wise doctor found out through his (the

Muslim's) eyes; Kabir is requesting the wise 'critique' to do so; ironically enough, he is unaware of the difference between a 'critique' (critical article) and a critic.

14- Iqbal:

تواں اسرار جاں را فاش تر گفت *38

Kabir:

Thus ope more and more life's secret tips,'*39

Iqbal is talking of the possibility of revealing the life-secrets; Kabir is giving this line an imperative sense, with a request to open them.

15- Iqbal:

نیابی در بر ما تیرہ بختاں
دلے روشن ز نورِ آرزوئے *40

Kabir:

None ill-starred came in my bosom's frame,
Being lit up with light of his hopeful flame.'*41

Iqbal simply means, 'you will not find a heart enlightened with the light of desire in the breasts of the unlucky ones like us'. What Kabir wants to say, only he can tell.

16- Iqbal:

فقیراں تا بمسجد صف کشیدند
گریبانِ شہنشاہاں دریدند
چو آں آتش درونِ سینہ افسرد
مسلماناں بدرگاہاں خزیدند *42

Kabir:

As long in mosque the poor kept a row,
They tore the emperors collars he!
That fire when cooled in his heart and soul,
They crawled to tombs of saints to roll.*43

Such lack of agreement between the pronouns like 'he', 'his'

and 'they' cannot be expected even of a child.

17- Iqbal:

نگاہِ التفاتے بر سرِ بام
کہ من با عصرِ خویش اندر ستیزم *44

Kabir:

On every ones terrace now leans thy look,
For which a constant war I have to brook.*45

This couplet contains Iqbal's request to the Holy Prophet (Sm.) to grant him a favouring look from His holy roof, since he (Iqbal) has waged a war against his time. Kabir is highly confused at this stage as well.

18- Iqbal:

تجلی ریز بر چشمم کہ بینی
بایں پیری مرا تابِ نظر ہست *46

Kabir:

Cast thy vision's light so that I may see,
Though old I have courage to bear this glee.*47

Once again, the translator is extremely careless, as he is using 'I' for 'you', in the first line. This misuse makes the sense altogether different.

19- Iqbal:

نہ پنداری زبون و زار و پیرم *48

Kabir:

I boast not but weep being old, weak and sick.*49

Certainly, the translator is lost in the sense of 'نہ پنداری'.

20- Iqbal:

مسلماناں کہ خود را فاش دیدند
بہر دریا چو گوہر آرمیدند
اگر از خود رمیدند اندریں دیر
بجانِ تو کہ مرگِ خود خریدند *50

Kabir:

As long the Muslim, in self can peep,
Like pearls they <u>rest</u> in the oceans deep.
From ego <u>if you</u> ran in this fane,
Your own death <u>you</u> buy for life's bargain.*51

The translator changes the past tense into present, and also plays the same havoc with the pronouns -- 'they' converted into 'you'.

21- Iqbal:

'نداند آں غلام احوالِ خود را
کہ دوزخ را مقامِ دیگرے گفت' *52

Kabir:

That slave knows not where he would go?
Who is sending the rest in hell's long row.*53

The focal point of Iqbal is that a slave's life is his own hell, nothing else. Kabir is highly confused in the second line.

22- Iqbal:

ز فیض او گرفتم اعتبارے
کہ بامن ماہ و انجم ساز کردند *54

Kabir:

From his grace I got a grace and trust.
For me he tamed the Moon and Stars first.*55

There is no agreement between Kabir's subject 'he' and Iqbal's verb 'کردند'. The word 'first' too is additional and out of context.

23- Iqbal:

نصیب از آتشے دارم کہ اوّل
سنائی از دلِ رومی بر انگیخت *56

Kabir:

To Rumi I owe a share of his flame,
Which Snaee took first and earned great fame.*57

The translator does not know that Sanaee was Rumi's predecessor, not successor, and it was he who aroused fire in Rumi's heart.

24- Iqbal:

خلافت، فقر با تاج و سریر است *58

Kabir:

The Faqr and Caliphate with King's Crown shine,*59

This line gives us an elegant definition of Caliphate that it is Faqr, having crown and throne. Kabir has miserably failed to get at this idea.

25- Iqbal:

بدریا گر گره افتد بکارم
بجز طوفاں نمی خواہم کشودے *60

Kabir:

When I see a gale my heart then regales,
To tempest time ties my hardihood hails.*61

The translator seems to guess in vain, the meanings in the first line.

26- Iqbal:

شبِ ایں کوہ و دشتِ سینہ تابے
نہ دروے مرغکے نے موجِ آبے *62

Kabir:

The hill and desert night defies thy day,
The birds and waves know not their old songs gay.*63

Once again a guessed translation, totally incorrect.

27- Iqbal:

چمن با زاں جنوں ویرانہ گردد
کہ از ہنگامہ ہا بیگانہ گردد *64

Kabir:

If a craze consumes the garden's face,
And saps its beauty and social grace.*65

The sentence ends just on a conditional clause, having nothing to do with Iqbal's thought.

28- Iqbal:

نخستیں لالۂ صبحِ بہارم
بیاپے سوزم از داغے کہ دارم *66

Kabir:

The poppy of my dawn's first vernal tide,
Is burning alone from a scar I hide.*67

Iqbal is talking about himself; Kabir is talking about a poppy other than Iqbal.

29- Iqbal:

پریشانم چو گردِ رہگذارے
کہ بر دوشِ ہوا گیرد قرارے *68

Kabir:

So scattered I'm like dust of the way,
On the wings of storms I cannot stay.*69

Iqbal likens himself to the dust that feels at ease on the shoulders of winds. Kabir refutes this in the second line.

30- Iqbal:

نمودش سرّے از اسرارِ غیب است
زہر گردے بروں ناید سوارے *70

Kabir:

His birth a secret of a secret hand,
Who would change <u>her fate</u> in a manner grand.*[71]

The second line is a complete self-assertion.

31- Iqbal:

و لیکن آں خلافت راہ گم کرد
کہ اول مومناں را شاہی آموخت *72

Kabir:

But the Caliphate lost that path and force,
And taught the Momin first the Kingship's course.*[73]

By overlooking the words 'آں' (that) and 'کہ' (which), the translator has lost the sense of the couplet.

32- Iqbal:

مقامش عبدہٗ آمد و لیکن
جہانِ شوق را پروردگار است *74

Kabir:

His 'slave' he was ranked, yet the slave ranks,
To eager world's eyes in the Master's Ranks.*[75]

Certainly, the translator is at a loss to understand the text.

33- Iqbal:

نہ پنداری کہ رَست از بندِ افرنگ *76

Kabir:

On freedom of the West they do not boast,*[77]

The same flaw is there --- translation without understanding.

34- Iqbal:

درِ صد فتنہ را بر خود کشادی
دو گامے رفتی و از پا فتادی *78

Kabir:

For him, <u>he</u> opened hundred doors for plots,
Two steps <u>he</u> only takes and slips in trot.*79

Iqbal is addressing the Brahman in this quatrain: Kabir is talking to the Brahman about someone else, or the other way round.

35- Iqbal:

نیاید جز بہ زور دست و بازو
خدائے را تراشیدن ز خارہ *80

Kabir:

It can't be achieved save with arms might,
From stone <u>he</u> carves gods to put his hand right.*81

The translator changes the infinitive 'تراشیدن' into the present tense'می تراشد' (carves), and creates a subject of his own, i.e., 'he'.

36- Iqbal:

ازاں فکرِ فلک پیما چہ حاصل؟
کہ گردِ ثابت و سیارہ گردد *82

Kabir:

No use of a thought which measures sky,
But settles like <u>dust</u> or moves like <u>fly</u>.*83

The second line is highly ridiculous. Iqbal means 'stars and planets', and Kabir is calling them 'dust' and 'flies'.

37- Iqbal:

نوا از سینۂ مرغِ چمن برد
ز خونِ لالہ آں سوزِ کہن برد *84

Kabir:

Who sapp'd sweet tone of the birds and buds,
Who damp'd old flame of the poppy's blood.*85

An assertive statement has been changed into an interrogative one, without any rhyme and reason.

38- Iqbal:

رہِ تخمین و ظن گیری، ہمیری 86*

Kabir:

A thought when you follow the self then dies.*87

The translator creates a problem by rendering 'تخمین و ظن' as 'a thought' or 'self'.

39- Iqbal:

ولیکن با تو گویم این دو حرفے
کہ با من پیر مردے از عجم گفت 88*

Kabir:

Bid me, tell to thee two words at least,
To me please talk in accent of East.*89

It is a pity that the translator is so careless that he does not pay any attention even to the words like 'مرد' (man); he calls him 'accent'.

40- Iqbal:

وجود است این کہ بینی یا نمود است
حکیمِ ما چہ مشکل ہا کشود است 90*

Kabir:

This being would last or just a passing show,
The wise could not solve this knotty tie so.*91

In the second line, the translator is in direct contrast with Iqbal, in saying that our wise ones have not solved our convictional problems.

41- Iqbal:

دلِ دریا سکوں بیگانہ از تُست
بہ جنبش گوہرِ یک دانہ از تُست 92*

Kabir:

O heart's sea! no peace yet known to thee,
The gloss of gems here, due to my glee.*93

Iqbal is addressing the wave in this quatrain, but, Kabir is dragging himself and his heart's sea in it.

42- Iqbal:

تو بینی حلقۂ دامے کہ پیداست
نہ آں دامے کہ اندر دانۂ اوست *94

Kabir:

You know the vice circle of his snare,
It is not the snare, a grain lies where.*95

The translator could not get the idea of 'snare into grain'.

43- Iqbal:

نہ ہر خاکی سزاوار نخ اوست *96

Kabir:

On his footsteps no dusty Satan looks,*97

The word 'نخ' means 'thread'.*98 Iqbal says that not every man is fit for Satan's trap. Kabir has no grasp over this sense.

44- Iqbal:

نہ پنداری کہ مرغِ صبح خوانم *99

Kabir:

I boast not to be a song bird of dawn,*100

The word 'نہ پنداری'(don't think) has been used at many places by Iqbal, and everywhere Kabir gets confused.

45- Iqbal:

خداوندے کہ در طوفِ حریمش
صد ابلیس است و یک روح الامیں نیست *101

Kabir:

O God during rounds of thy sacred place,

I saw hundred satans not the Gabe's face.*102

Iqbal is talking about Europe, and calls it a false-god, whose sanctuary has got hundreds of satans, but, no Gabriel. Kabir is addressing the one real God, ascribing such a desecration to Ka'ba.

This was a brief survey of the mistakes committed by Q.A. Kabir in the comprehension of Iqbal's thought. He has also given us some new words, e.g.:*103

1-	kowtow	تگور
2-	bloke	مرد
3-	jazz	نوا
4-	tete-a-tete	وصال

It is unfortunate that Q.A. Kabir undertook this stupendous task without the requisite competence in English and Persian. He has undergone a miserable failure in this translation.

REFERENCES

1. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); PP. 14,30,30,94
2. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); quatrains No. 135, 158, 162, 290, 304
3. Ibid; quatrains No. 302, 316.
4. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P. 54
5. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); quatrain No. 135.
6. Ibid; P.v
7. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (!); P.3
8. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); P.1
9. Ibid; quatrains No. 14, 22, 29, 87, 129, 134, 136, 161, 171, 192, 263, 308, 354, 389

10. Ibid; quatrains No. 60, 127, 180, 259, 260, 297, 336
11. Ibid; quatrains No. 1, 10, 27, 192, 201
12. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.8
13. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.10
14. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.13
15. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.24
16. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.13
17. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.26
18. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.14
19. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.27
20. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.24
21. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.46
22. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.24
23. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.47
24. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.25
25. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.48
26. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.27
27. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.55
28. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.31
29. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.67
30. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.31
31. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.68
32. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.35
33. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.79
34. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.35
35. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.80
36. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.36
37. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.81
38. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.37
39. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.84
40. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.38
41. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.88
42. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.38
43. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.89
44. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.42

45. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.100
46. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.50
47. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.124
48. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.61
49. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.157
50. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.67
51. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.169
52. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.74
53. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.190
54. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.77
55. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.198
56. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.78
57. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.202
58. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.79
59. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.204
60. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.80
61. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.208
62. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.84
63. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.221
64. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.86
65. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.227
66. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.87
67. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.228
68. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.87
69. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.229
70. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.87
71. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.230
72. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.89
73. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.236
74. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.91
75. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.240
76. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.91
77. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.241
78. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.96
79. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.257

80. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.97
81. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.258
82. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.99
83. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.265
84. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.100
85. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.269
86. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.110
87. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.291
88. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.111
89. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.294
90. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.112
91. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.296
92. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.113
93. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.299
94. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.127
95. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.342
96. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.128
97. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.345
98. Farhang-i-Iqbal (Persian); P.831
99. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.135
100. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.360
101. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (I); P.142
102. Armaghan-i-Hijaz (K); Q.380
103. Ibid; quatrains No. 3, 20, 49, 327

PART THREE

MISCELLANEOUS ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL'S POETRY

BOOKS

A VOICE FROM THE EAST

Nawab Zulfiqar Ali Khan

After Nicholson's translation of 'Asrar-i-Khudi' in 1920, Iqbal's close friend, Nawab Zulfiqar Ali Khan, wrote his introductory book on Iqbal in 1922, bearing the title of 'A Voice from the East'.*1 In this book, the writer includes some verses from 'Bang-i-Dara' (published later on, in 1924) and 'Payam-i-Mashriq', with their translations by Umrao Singh, and some parts of 'Asrar-i-Khudi' (1915), translated by R.A. Nicholson.

We have already commented upon Nicholson's complete translation, 'The Secrets of the Self'. As far as Umrao's translations are concerned, it should be minded well that they are the renderings of the initial versions, which were amended by Iqbal at the time of the first publications of 'Payam-i-Mashriq' (1923) and 'Bang-i-Dara' (1924). Here is a detail of the verses translated by Umrao:

1- Nine couplets of the ghazal 'March 1907'; all included in 'Bang-i-Dara'.

2- 'Tasweer-i-Dard', ten couplets; couplets No. 1, 3, 5, 7 and 10 included in 'Bang-i-Dara', with a slight change in couplet 3:

(i) تری ظلمت میں مَیں روشن چراغاں کر کے چھوڑوں گا *2

(ii) تری تاریک راتوں میں چراغاں کر کے چھوڑوں گا *3

3- The poem 'Muhabbat', completely in 'Bang-i-Dara', with a change of two words 'پہ' and 'کے', in couplet 5:

سنا ہے عالمِ بالا پہ کوئی کیمیا گر تھا

صفا تھی جس کے خاکِ پا میں بڑھ کر ساغرِ جم سے *4

The two words 'پہ' and 'کے' were changed into 'میں' and 'کی'.[*5]

4- Six Persian couplets, subsequently included in 'Payam-i-Mashriq', ghazal No. 7, with an addition of two couplets.[*6] A change in the syntactical order in couplet 6 has also been made:

(i) ز تغافل تو خام بره تو ناتمام [*7]

(ii) بہ رہ تو ناتمام ز تغافل تو خام [*8]

5- The poem 'Siqillia' (صقلیہ), included in 'Bang-i-Dara', with the following changes:

(i) یہ محل خیمہ تھا ان صحرا نشینوں کا کبھی [*9]
تھا یہاں ہنگامہ ان صحرا نشینوں کا کبھی [*10]

(ii) شعلۂ جاں سوز پنہاں جن کی تلواروں میں تھے [*11]
بجلیوں کے آشیانے جن کی تلواروں میں تھے [*12]

(iii) آفرینش جن کی دنیائے کہن کی تھی اجل
جن کی ہیبت سے لرز جاتے تھے باطل کے محل [*13]

اک جہانِ تازہ کا پیغام تھا جن کا ظہور
کھا گئی عصرِ کہن کو جن کی تیغِ ناصبور [*14]

(iv) زندگی دنیا کو جن کی شورشِ 'قُم' سے ملی
مخلصی انساں کو زنجیرِ توہم سے ملی [*15]

مردہ عالم زندہ جن کی شورشِ 'قُم' سے ہوا
آدمی آزاد زنجیرِ توہم سے ہوا 16*

(v) جس کے آوازے سے لذت گیر اب تک گوش ہے
وہ جرس کیا اب ہمیشہ کے لیے خاموش ہے؟ 17*

غلغلوں سے جس کے لذت گیر اب تک گوش ہے
کیا وہ تکبیر اب ہمیشہ کے لیے خاموش ہے؟ 18*

(vi) مرثیہ تیری تباہی کا مری قسمت میں تھا
یہ تڑپنا اور تڑپانا مری قسمت میں تھا 19*

غم نصیب اقبال کو بخشا گیا ماتم ترا
چن لیا تقدیر نے وہ دل کہ تھا محرم ترا 20*

There is an addition of one (last) couplet in 'Bang-i-Dara':

میں ترا تحفہ سوئے ہندوستاں لے جاؤں گا
خود یہاں روتا ہوں، اوروں کو وہاں رلواؤں گا 21*

These changes have been highlighted to save the reader from any confusion arising out of textual discrepancies. Moreover, through this detail, we intend to infer that one should not be so much serious about these translations due to the changes incorporated by Iqbal himself in his subsequent refined text. However, the translations are

simple, and contain no serious mistake, except the word 'perfectionnment', used by the writer to denote the word 'کمال'.*22 This seems to be the translator's self-coinage, since no dictionary has mentioned this word.

REFERENCES

1. Mercantile Press, Lahore.
2. A Voice from the East; P.17
3. Bang-i-Dara; P.71
4. A Voice from the East; P.20
5. Bang-i-Dara; P.111
6. A Voice from the East; P.23
7. Ibid
8. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.150
9. A Voice from the East; P.25
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.133
11. A Voice from the East; P.25
12. Bang-i-Dara; P.133
13. A Voice from the East; P.25
14. Bang-i-Dara; P.133
15. A Voice from the East; P.26
16. Bang-i-Dara; P.133
17. A Voice from the East; P.26
18. Bang-i-Dara; P.133
19. A Voice from the East; P.26
20. Bang-i-Dara; P.134
21. Ibid
22. A Voice from the East; P.21

ARTICLES ON IQBAL
Bashir Ahmad Dar

The book 'Articles on Iqbal', posthumously edited by Shima Majeed, contains the translations of four longer poems of Iqbal by Bashir Ahmad Dar.*[1] These poems are:

1- Address to Javid (Javid Nama) *[2]
2- To God (Armaghan-i-Hijaz)
3- The Poetic Note-Book of Mullazade Zaigham of Laulab (Armaghan-i-Hijaz)
4- Reflections of Mihrab Gul Afghan(Zarb-i-Kalim).*[3]

All these translations are in simple prose. One feels quite at ease while going through them. The language is quite fluent and void of redundancy. These translations are mostly correct. However, some weaknesses have transpired during our reading:

1- The following hemistichs have been left untranslated:

(i) در ہوا آشفتہ گردد ہمچو دود *4

(ii) ہے کہاں قافلۂ موج کو پروائے جرس *5

2- In 'Javid Nama' Iqbal says:

ہر کسے بر جادۂ خود تندرو
ناقۂ ما بے زمام و ہرزہ دو *6

B.A. Dar translates it as this:

Everybody is moving fast on his own path,
Like a bridleless dromedary and without any goal.*[7]

The translator could not get the sense that in the first line, Iqbal talks about other fast-moving nations, and in the

second one, about his own dromedary, which is bridleless and astray.

3- One of the Iqbal's advices to Javid is:

روزگارے را کہ می آید نگر *8

Iqbal wants him to develop a precognition of the coming events. B.A. Dar fallaciously talks about the present:

Look at the time in which you live.*9

4- The word 'عہد', in the following hemistich, means 'age' or 'period':

یادِ عہدِ مصطفیٰ آید مرا *10

B.A. Dar takes it in the sense of 'promise' and uses a Biblical word 'testament':

And the testament of Mustafa comes to my mind.*11

5- The word 'زمان' (age/time), in the very next couplet, has also been rendered incorrectly as 'deed':

از زمانِ خود پشیماں می شوم *12

B.A. Dar:

I feel ashamed of my own deeds.*13

Had the translator pondered upon the very next couplet, he could have avoided this pitfall:

در قرونِ رفتہ پنہاں می شوم *14

6- A verb 'partake' has been used without its required preposition, 'of', in this line:

He partakes in its management.*15

7- In 'Hozoor-i-Haq', Iqbal says about the man of his age:

دل از دستِ کسے بُردن نداند *16

B.A. Dar's rendering is:

The heart doesn't know taking from other's hands.*17

Here lies a syntactic flaw. The heart is an object in Iqbal's line, but, it appears to be a subject in B.A. Dar's version.

8- In 'The Poetic Note-Book of Mullazade Zaigham of Laulab', the translator is confused about a verb:

they fear lest my beautiful songs
rent asunder the saint's threshold stone.*18

The word 'rent' is the second form of 'rend'. The first form, 'rend', was required at this place.

9- A basic Islamic code, 'لا شریك له 'has been rendered unsatisfactorily, as 'None is associated with Him'.*19 It should have been 'None is His partner'. The word 'association' denotes 'contact', and everything in the universe is, instinctively, associated with God.

These were some of the weaknesses of these translations. Overall, these are the renderings really worth considering. The scrupulousness of the translator is quite evident.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1997
2. First published in 'Iqbal Review'; April, 1971; P.12
3. First published in 'Iqbal'; March, 1972; P.34
4. Javid Nama; P.201
5. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.170
6. Javid Nama; P.201
7. Articles on Iqbal; P.173
8. Javid Nama; P.201
9. Articles on Iqbal; P.174

10. Javid Nama; P.205
11. Articles on Iqbal; P.179
12. Javid Nama; P.205
13. Articles on Iqbal; P.179
14. Javid Nama; P.205
15. Articles on Iqbal; P.181
16. Armaghan-i-Hijaz; P.13
17. Articles on Iqbal; P.214
18. Ibid; P.235
19. Ibid; P.242

IQBAL
Khwaja Tariq Mahmood

A rhymed translation of Iqbal's selected poems has been made by Khwaja Tariq Mahmood, under the title of 'Iqbal', in 1996. *1 The translator, primarily a Brigadier of the Pakistan Army, with a career in Mechanical Engineering, and a post-retirement law practitioner, has selected poems and parts of poems from 'Bang-i-Dara', 'Bal-i-Jibril', 'Zarb-i-Kalim', 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz', 'Asrar-i-Khudi' and 'Payam-i-Mashriq'. In his 'Foreward', he writes about his selection of these poems:

> Finally, a word about the selection of poems for translation. There is no grand design in the selection; the guiding factor being their translatability; not least my limitation in translating or understanding the poem. For the same reasons, some poems have had to be paraphrased.*2

This selection is so haphazard that the reader feels highly uneasy, while going through this book. The poems, ghazals and quatrains of the above-mentioned books have been blended together, without any justification. It seems that the translator translated different verses at different times, and did not bother to arrange them, even while compiling them in the shape of this book.*3

In most of the cases, he has not given the translations of complete poems or ghazals. The total number of the pieces translated by him is 95; a detail is given below:

1- Bang-i-Dara: 43
2- Bal-i-Jibril: 18

3- Zarb-i-Kalim: 6
4- Armaghan-i-Hijaz: 6
5- Asrar-i-Khudi: 1
6- Payam-i-Mashriq: 21

An initial positive effect of this translation is that the translator looks quite dexterous in the use of the English language, but, he is unfortunate to have made an effort towards producing a versified rendering. By verse, he only means rhyming, and nothing else. Thus, due to rhythmlessness, he has produced a ridiculous rhymed prose. In his reckless effort of pseudo-rhyming, he has committed blunders, which have nullified his entire effort. Let us see an example from the poem 'Mirza Ghalib':

محفل ہستی تری بربط سے ہے سرمایہ دار
جس طرح ندی کے نغموں سے سکوتِ کوہسار
تیرے فردوسِ تخیل سے ہے قدرت کی بہار
تیری کشتِ فکر سے اُگتے ہیں عالم سبزہ وار *4

Here is K. Tariq's rendering of it:

Feast of life was so enlivened by your verbiology
Like torrent in a hilly terrain with its musicology
Your lofty thinking is a fillip for nature's sociology
Growth of global humanism is product of your psychology.*5

Other than such ridiculous and deplorable rhyming alike, which is rampant throughout the book, one can assess the quality of the translation out of this passage. The translator endeavours to drag and imprison Iqbal's thought into his non-poetic rhymes.

Although, it is useless to comment upon such a miserably distorted rendering, yet, it would be expedient to cite another example, wherein the cause of errors is nothing short of carelessness:

عطار ہو، رومی ہو، رازی ہو، غزالی ہو
کچھ ہاتھ نہیں آتا بے آہِ سحر گاہی *6

Its translation by K. Tariq is:

Be it Avicena or Rumi or Plato or Socrates
You cannot excel in any field without morning immersion.*7

It is a pity that the translator cannot copy even proper names. A highly appalling situation arises when the translator inserts his guessed meanings in his distorted text, e.g.: *8

1- cycle	اشہب
2- Brevity	حقیقت
3- pedestal	عرش
4- identification	جدائی
5- shark	خارماہی
6- firmament	نور

To be brief, non-seriousness in the selection of poems, dispersal of the original order of Iqbal's text, undue fragmentation of the poems or ghazals, rhythmlessness of the lines and addition of far-fetched rhymes to them, the translator's self-insertion in order to expose himself as a poet and lack of command over Persian and Urdu are the

drawbacks, which unequivocally render this translation a futile effort.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Dhan Kahoon Publications, Chakwal.
2. Iqbal (T); P. (xvii)
3. Here is the order in which the translations have been made:

Bang-i-Dara:	4
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	2
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	12
Bal-i-Jibril:	2
Bang-i-Dara:	1
Payam-i-Mashriq:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	9
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	3
Payam-i-Mashirq:	1
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Zarb-i-Kalim:	1
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Payam-i-Mashirq:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	1
Payam-i-Mashirq:	13
Asrar-i-Khudi:	1
Payam-i-Mashirq:	2
Armaghan-i-Hijaz:	3
Payam-i-Mashirq:	3
Bal-i-Jibril:	2
Bang-i-Dara:	1
Bal-i-Jibril:	6

Bang-i-Dara:	7
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Zarb-i-Kalim:	1
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Zarb-i-Kalim:	2
Armaghan-i-Hijaz:	1
Zarb-i-Kalim:	1
Bal-i-Jibril:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	1
Zarb-i-Kalim:	1
Bang-i-Dara:	2
Armaghan-i-Hijaz:	2

4. Bang-i-Dara; P. 26
5. Iqbal (T); P. 7
6. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 56
7. Iqbal (T); P. 149
8. Ibid; PP. 1-13; 2-17; 3-21; 4-41; 5-49; 6-115

IQBAL: A SELECTION OF THE URDU VERSE
D.J. Matthews

An orientalist, D.J. Matthews, has offered a fine collection of the miscellaneous translations of Iqbal's Urdu verse, titled 'Iqbal: A Selection of the Urdu Verse'.[1] In this book, the translator has made a selection out of three Urdu books of Iqbal, as this:

1- Bang-i-Dara: Piety and Profligacy; Young Baby; The Indian Anthem; A New Shiva Altar; Dagh; On the Banks of the Ravi; One Evening; Sicily; The Anthem of the Islamic Community; Complaint; In Memory of My Late Mother; Khizr on the Road; The Rise of Islam (13 poems in total).

2- Bal-i-Jibril: Five ghazals (16 section I; 2, 4, 7 and 15 section II); The Mosque of Qortoba; Lenin; Saqinama; To Javed; To a Punjab Peasant; To the Pirzadas of the Punjab (5 ghazals, 6 poems: 11 in total).

3- Zarb-i-Kalim: La Ilah Ill' Allah; Learning and Love; Tauheed; The Indian Muslim; Jihad; Struck on the West; Fate; Eastern Nations; A Student; College; Western Man; Parda; Women's Liberation; Paris Mosque; The Voice of Karl Marx; High Office; Europe and Jews; Bolshevik Russia; An Eastern League of Nations; Mussolini (20 poems in total).

An overview of this selection gives an impression that the translator has tried to select the poems related mostly to the political, religious and cultural aspects of the poet's contemporary life. Probably, he wants to assess Iqbal's thoughts in the light of the similar topics adopted by the European poets.

The translation is in quite fluent simple prose, and the

most outstanding characteristic of this translation is that the translator has tried his level best to avoid any redundancy or omission. Thus, it is an exquisite word for word rendering, annotated through four appendices as well, including a vocabulary guide.

Some weaknesses, however, have been traced in this translation, needing special attention:

1- Iqbal:

کہسار کے سبز پوش خاموش [2]

Matthews:

The Flanks of the mountain clothed in green are silent.[3]

The word 'سبز پوش' is a metaphor that simply means 'trees', not 'flanks'.[4]

2- Iqbal:

ہم وہی سوختہ ساماں ہیں، تجھے یاد نہیں؟ [5]

Matthews:

We are the same burnt-out material![6]

The phrase 'سوختہ ساماں' , as Ghulam Rasul Mehr writes, means 'lovers'.[7]

3- Iqbal:

جوئے خوں می چکد از حسرتِ دیرینۂ ما
می تپد نالہ بہ نشتر کدۂ سینۂ ما [8]

Matthews:

A stream of blood will trickle from our age-old longing. The song of lament will burn our breasts in which daggers have been plunged.[9]

Iqbal's text is in the present tense, but, the translator has changed it into the future tense. Moreover, 'daggers' should have been 'lancets'.

4- Iqbal:

فطرتِ ہستی شہیدِ آرزو رہتی نہ ہو

خوب تر پیکر کی اس کو جستجو رہتی نہ ہو *10

Matthews:

<u>Could it be</u> that the nature of existence will not ever be a martyr to desire?

<u>Could it be</u> that it will not seek to make a better form?*11

The words 'رہتی نہ ہو' (might be) denote possibility. Thus, the translation can be as this:

It might be that the nature of existence remains a martyr to desire,

And it might be ever looking for the better and better.

Matthews seems to be highly confused, as he tries to create a sense of definiteness. Ghulam Rasul Mehr has beautifully conveyed this idea, "... perhaps, everything is dying for desire, and is ever looking for finer shapes".*12

5- Iqbal:

زندگانی تھی تری مہتاب سے تابندہ تر *13

Matthews:

Life was made brighter <u>by</u> your moonlight.*14

The line simply means:

Your life was brighter than moonlight.

6- Iqbal:

نوجواں اقوامِ نو دولت کے ہیں پیرایہ پوش! *15

Matthews:

the young men of nations, which have newly acquired wealth, now <u>wear the mantle</u>.*16

The phrase 'پیرایہ پوش' means 'imitators'.*17 Matthews has failed to get the basic idea.

7- Iqbal:

تو برگ گیاہے نہ دہی اہلِ خرد را *18

Matthews:

You (God) will not give people of wisdom a blade of grass!*19

Here also, Iqbal's statement in the present tense has been changed into the future tense.

8- Iqbal:

یہ کافرِ ہندی ہے بے تیغ و سناں خوں ریز! *20

Matthews:

These Indian infidels shed blood without swords or spears.*21

Iqbal is talking of himself; Matthews about all the Indian infidels.

9- Iqbal:

عشق سراپا حضور، علم سراپا حجاب! *22

Matthews:

Love is totally visible; learning is from head to foot a veil.*23

The word 'حضور' does not denote the sense of 'being visible'. It means 'to be present to see'. Thus, love is 'the seer', not 'the seen'.*24

Other than these flaws, there are impertinent words for their specific meanings, e.g.: *25

1- canon — توپ

2- Khizr on the Road — خضرِ راہ

3- Shrine — حرم (کعبۃاللّٰہ)

4- dove — کبوتر

5- poverty فقر

6- firmness تقویم

On the standard of a general appraisal, this translation is an elegant effort towards introducing Iqbal to the English community.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Heritage Publishers, New Delhi; 1993.
2. Bang-i-Dara; P.128
3. Iqbal; P.25
4. Please see 'Farhang-i-Iqbal' (Urdu); P.437
5. Bang-i-Dara; P.168
6. Iqbal; P.39
7. Please see 'Matalib-i-Bang-i-Dara'; P.216
8. Bang-i-Dara; P.169
9. Iqbal; P.39
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.232
11. Iqbal; P.51
12. Adopted and translated into English from 'Matalib-i-Bang-i-Dara'; P.282
13. Bang-i-Dara; P.236
14. Iqbal; P.57
15. Bang-i-Dara; P.256
16. Iqbal; P.61
17. Farhang-i-Iqbal (Urdu); P.177
18. Bal-i-Jibril; P.20
19. Iqbal; P.89
20. Bal-i-Jibril; P.27
21. Iqbal; P.93
22. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.21
23. Iqbal; P.129
24. Please see 'Farhang-i-Iqbal' (Persian); P.317
25. Iqbal; PP. 1-33; 2-59; 3-73; 4-77; 5-93; 6-119

IQBAL'S POETRY

K.G. Saiyidain

A collection of miscellaneous extracts of Iqbal's poetry, translated, as the compiler claims, by Khawaja Ghulam-us-Saiyidain, in 1995, under the title of 'Iqbal's Poetry'.*1 Actually, this is a posthumous collection of 150 small pieces of Iqbal's poetry, made by Dr. Shayesta Khan. In this connection, Dr. Shayesta writes:

> Lying scattered throughout his books, his articles and addresses, these renderings into English of Iqbal's Persian/ Urdu verses have been collected, in bits, from Saiyidain's well known, less known, and sometimes rarely known writings.*2

In view of this statement, it is obvious that these are just fragments, taken out of Saiyidain's writings. It seems to be only the compiler's assumption that these are Saiyidain's own translations, because:

1- Nowhere in his writings, Saiyidain has tried to expose himself as a translator of Iqbal.

2- The compiler has heaped together all the extracts, form 1 to 150, without giving any indication of the source of the extracts --- names of the books, names of the poems, numbers of the ghazals, or any context whatsoever. It, therefore, becomes very difficult, for a reader, to determine the original text of Iqbal through these translations, especially in the cases of one-lined or two-lined renderings. However, we have been able to locate eight extracts, which have been taken from R.A. Nicholson's 'The Secrets of the Self'. Here is a detail of it:

Extract No.		Nicholson
1-	31	lines: 449-52
2-	37	lines: 445-8; 455-9
3-	44	lines: 309-12
4-	48	lines: 267-72; 285-6; 277-8; 297-8
5-	93	lines: 323-6; 339-40; 425-6
6-	101	lines: 1323-4
7-	102	lines: 1335-8; 1385-6
8-	145	lines: 1011-4; 1021-8; 1033-6; 1044-6; 1069-70

The inclusion of Nicholson's translations defies the compiler's claim that all these extracts are G. Saiyidain's translations. This fact also enhances the possibility of Saiyidain's adoption of translations from some other translator as well.

Another considerable aspect, which indicates the compiler's non-seriousness, in this compilation, is that there are a number of translations, which have been repeated, whereas, their repetition is totally useless.*3 If we carefully look at these repetitions, we see that especially two stages are clearly indicative of the compiler's lack of proper attention:

1- Extracts No. 138 & 139 are exactly the same, but repeated at the same place.

2- Extract No. 24 has been repeated in 84 and again repeated in 144. In this dusk of uncertainty about the authorship of these translations, and the carelessness shown by the compiler, it sounds by no means reasonable to accept these translations as standard ones.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by KhudaBakhsh Oriental Public Library, Patna.
2. Iqbal's Poetry; P. xii
3. Repetitions: 21 & 128; 13 & 38; 17 & 53; 18 & 62; 24 & 84; 16 & 99; 109 & 117; 138 & 139; 24, 84 & 144; 2 & 147.

IQBAL'S SELECTED URDU VERSES

Nusrat Baqa

A translation of 71 selected Urdu couplets of Iqbal has been made by Nusrat Baqa, under the title of 'Iqbal's Selected Urdu Verses'.*[1] These selections have been made out of Iqbal's three books as under:

1- Bang-i-Dara: 41 couplets
2- Bal-i-Jibril: 13 couplets
3- Zarb-i- Kalim: 17 couplets

Out of these 71 couplets, 12 couplets have been translated in 6 pairs (two couplets each), and the remaining 59 couplets have been kept single. Since all the couplets have been decontextualized, without any reference to even its source, it is quite difficult for a common reader to grasp Iqbal's ideas, as required.

Basically, this book seems to be a personal diary of the translator, which she subsequently decided to get published as it was. The translations included in it are very simple and word for word, more suitable for children than advanced readers. It might be helpful also for orators.

Since this booklet of just 16 pages, that also without head or tail, cannot play any desirable role in dissemination of Iqbal's proper message, it would not be suitable to rank it with the standard translations.

REFERENCE

1. Published by 33 Salisbury Avenue Barking, Essex; (Date not Given)

IQBAL' S SUPERMAN

A.Q. Niaz

In 1960, a translation of Iqbal's six Urdu poems was made by A.Q. Niaz, under the title of "Iqbal's Superman":[1] these poems are:

1- Shikwah.
2- Reply to Shikwah.
3- The Candle and the Poet.
4- Khizr-i-Raah.
5- The Dawn of Islam.
6- The Mosque of Cordova.

The objective of this collection, as the translator specifies on the title page of the book, is "bringing out Iqbal's idea of Superman .... along with Iqbal's idea concerning the potential position of the Muslims in the coming events". The translator's choice, though not comprehensive, is praise-worthy.

The greatest feature of this translation is that it is in coherent and simple prose style. It is unique in the sense that its translator has adopted a connotative approach; but, he does not give his connotations on the margin or in foot-notes. He inserts interpretative phrases or clauses in the text. Thus, his work is more of an interpretation than translation. Let us, for instance, see the very first stanza of 'Shikwah', wherein he has rendered Iqbal's six hemistichs in twenty lines:

Why should I waste my time
In fruitless works? Why my own good
Should I ignore? Why should I confine myself
To grieving over the past?

Why to the morrow should I not give
A thought? And why only with listening
To the plaintive cries
Of the nightingale
Should I content myself?
Am I dumb and helpless,
From inarticulation,
Like a flower, my friend,
That though my heart be torn
To pieces, I must stay mute?
No; a thousand times No.
My bold and fearless speech
On me bestows a daring courage:
And, may my mouth be filled with dust,
A burning complaint have I to voice
Against Allah Himself!*2

This apparently redundant, but, virtually interpretative mode goes on throughout the book, and no syntactic and semantic complexity could be traced in its text, except five mistakes:*3

1- dark Unknown	بحرِ ظلمات	
2- the Qais:		misuse of the article 'the'
3- the Qais, the Laila:		
4- blue goddess	نیلم پری	
5- dove	کبوتر	

An irksome aspect of this translation is its orthographic idiosyncrasy; in spelling diphthongs, for all the prolonged

voices, he doubles vowels. This may be acceptable in some cases, but sounds very heavy at times, e.g.:

Iraan; Quraan; Afghaan; saaqee; Rumee; momiyaaee, etc.*4

This orthographic inconsistency is more problematic in his translation of 'Javid Nama'.

A plus point of this rendering is that, in it, A.Q. Niaz makes an effort to introduce the original Islamic terms, by transliterating them in his text and explaining them in the 'Explanatory Notes' at the end of the book.*5 But, on the other hand, he seems to be staggering, when he leaves some oriental words untranslated, whose counterparts are well-known in English, e.g.:

mizraab; Hoor; Mahmil; momiyaaee; etc.*6

In an overall estimation, this translation can be called a nice effort, particularly for those who are prone to knowing Iqbal's ideas portrayed in simple prose.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Ferozsons, Lahore.
2. Iqbal's Superman; P.7
3. Ibid; PP. 1-13; 2-19; 3-55; 4-74; 5-91
4. Ibid; PP. 1-11; 2-30; 3-33; 4-46; 5-82; 6-83
5. Please see pages 113 to 122
6. PP. 20, 30, 47 and 83

LONGER POEMS OF IQBAL

A.R. Tariq

A translation of Iqbal's nine poems, titled 'Longer Poems of Iqbal', was made by A.R. Tariq, in 1978.[1] These poems are:

1- Urdu: (i) The Renaissance of Islam (Bang-i-Dara)
(ii) The Guide (Bang-i-Dara)
(iii) The Candle and the Poet (Bang-i-Dara)
(iv) In Memory of My Mother (Bang-i-Dara)
(v) The Mosque of Cordova (Bal-i-Jibril)
(vi) The Devil's Council (Armaghan-i-Hijaz)
(vii) Saqi Nama (Bal-i-Jibril)

2- Persian: (i) The Voice of Time (Payam-i-Mashriq)
(ii) The Song of Stars (Payam-i-Mashriq)

It is a very simple prose translation. The translator gives a brief introduction in the beginning of each poem, and every couplet has been numbered separately, with connotations and explanations in foot-notes. Unlike A.Q. Niaz's interpretative style, it is a word for word translation, free of any redundancy. Moreover, unlike Arberry's changing patterns in his various translations, this translation is in the same pattern as that of 'Secrets of Ego' and 'Secrets of Collective Life' , the two other well-known translations of this translator. The pattern adopted by A.R. Tariq is appreciable, in the sense that it facilitates reference work.

Despite its clarity and lucidity, there are some places, where there are some grammatical and semantic flaws:

1- Iqbal:

ضمیرِ لالہ میں روشن چراغِ آرزو کر دے
چمن کے ذرّے ذرّے کو شہیدِ جستجو کر دے [2*]

A.R. Tariq:

O God! Light the lamp
Of Desire
In the heart of Tulip,
And make every particle
Of the Garden crazy
For an eternal search[*3]

Iqbal is addressing the nightingale, or, may be, his reader, but, A.R. Tariq is addressing God, for which there is no contextual clue in the preceding lines.

2- Iqbal:

ہوئے احرارِ ملّت جادہ پیما کس تجمّل سے
تماشائی شگافِ در سے ہیں صدیوں کے زندانی [*4]

A.R. Tariq:

Oh, with what Dignity
And Grandeur
Are marching on the Liberators
Of our Nation!
The Spectators have been
Peeping through the holes
Of their Doors,
For hundreds of years! [*5]

The translator is confused in the rendering of the second line. It is not that the spectators (prisoners) have been peeping out for hundreds of years, but, they have remained in imprisonment for hundreds of years, and, now, they are peeping out to have a look at the marching liberators.

3- Iqbal:

ہیں کلام اللہ کے الفاظ حادث یا قدیم [*6]

A.R. Tariq:

Are the Words of Holy Quran
"New" or "Antique" ? *7

The words 'حادث' (causal) and 'قدیم' (perennial) are purely philosophical terms, deeply associated with God *(Qadeem)* and the universe *(hadith)*. The words 'new' and 'antique' are by no means relevant to these meanings.

4- For the word 'نبوت', the translator has twice used 'Prophecy'*8 whereas, a well-known term 'Prophethood' is used for this sense:

(i) You are the Gift,
Which Prophecy took away
From this world*8

(ii) They say, "Poetry is a part
Of Prophecy".*9

5- In the translation of the following couplet, he uses the article 'the' with a material noun, 'gold':

ٹکڑے ٹکڑے جس طرح سونے کو کر دیتا ہے گاز*10

As the Scissors Cut
The Gold into pieces*11

'The' can be used with a material noun used in a possessive compound, e.g., 'the gold of Africa', but, it is a big mistake to use it with such noun when it is single.

6- Iqbal:

عصرِ حاضر کے تقاضاؤں سے ہے لیکن یہ خوف
ہو نہ جائے آشکارا شرعِ پیغمبر کہیں *12

These are Satan's words in 'Iblis Ki Majlis-i-Shura'. A.R. Tariq translates these words as this:

Yet due to the Political

And Social requisites of this Age,
I have a fear that Islam
May not regain its past glory.*13

He would have used only 'may' instead of 'may not'.

7- A single verb 'sprout' and a phrasal verb 'turned out' have been used incorrectly in the following lines:

(i) When this Spark of Dust
Attains Self-confidence,
It sprouts the feathers and
The wings of Gabriel.*14

(ii) ---- those who were hit
By the waves,
Turned out shining Pearls.*15

The verb 'sprout' is an intransitive one. The translator has transformed it into a transitive one; the correct version can be:

The feathers and wings of Gabriel sprout out of it.

The phrasal verb 'turned out' must be followed by 'to be' or 'as', otherwise, it means 'to expel' or 'oust'.

8- The name of 'سُلیمیٰ' (Sulaima), a famous Arab beloved, has been misspelled by the translator as 'Salima'.*16

In an overall assessment, this translation is acceptable and deserves recommendation for common readers.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Sheikh Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore.
2. Bang-i-Dara; P. 268
3. Longer Poems of Iqbal; P.6
4. Bang-i-Dara; P. 270

5. Longer Poems of Iqbal; P.14
6. Armaghan-i-Hijaz; P.14 (Urdu Section)
7. Longer Poems of Iqbal; P.157
8. Ibid; P.11
9. Ibid; P.82
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.264
11. Longer Poems of Iqbal; P.58
12. Armaghan-i-Hijaz; P.12 (Urdu Section)
13. Longer Poems of Iqbal; P.154
14. Ibid; P.15
15. Ibid; P.19
16. Ibid; P.81

MOHAMMAD IQBAL : POET AND PHILOSOPHER

Mumtaz Hasan

A book titled 'Mohammad Iqbal: Poet and Philosopher',*[1] contains the translations of 13 poems of Iqbal, as under:

1- Payam-i-Mashriq: 5
2- Javid Nama: 4
3- Bang-i-Dara: 4

This book is a collection of the translations, articles and essays about Iqbal, compiled by Pak German Forum, under the supervision of the President of the forum, Mumtaz Hasan, and his German counterpart, H.D. Podeyn.

The translations included in the book are in two languages, German and English. The German translations have been made by Dr. Annemarie Schimmel, whereas, the English translations have been made by Mumtaz Hasan.

Since the book has been compiled with sincere sentiments of promoting fraternal ties of the two nations, all the writers are very careful and devoted in their respective assignments.

The English translations of Mumtaz Hasan are in prose, but, so fluent that a common reader, who does not have an insight into the English prosody, might take them for poetry. All the translations are literally accurate and finely structured. It seems that the translator has utmostly tried to make these renderings as simple as possible. This simplicity, together with accuracy and fluency, creates a highly consoling effect. There are some slightly uncommon words, but, they also are resonant with sublimity, e.g.:*[2]

1- Schismatics	فراق
2- reprobate	رند
3- requital	مکافات
4- Seraphims	قدسی
5- moonstruck-wanderers	آوارۂ جنوں

In short, these translations are excellent and deserve re-publication.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Pak German Forum, Karachi; 1960
2. Ibid; PP. 1-47; 2-47; 3-52; 4-128; 5-128

POEMS FROM IQBAL

V.G. Kiernan

V.G. Kiernan's famous selected translations of Iqbal's poetry, 'Poems from Iqbal', appeared in 1947.*1 Kiernan has selected 118 verses (poems, ghazals and quatrains) from five books of Iqbal, as under:

1- Bang-i-Dara: 18
2- Bal-i-Jibril: 41
3- Zarb-i-Kalim: 44
4- Armaghan-i-Hijaz: 7
5- Payam-i-Mashriq: 8

It is a versified translation, wherein the translator has endeavoured to be, artistically and semantically, as close to the original as possible. A very comprehensive note on the rhythm and rhymes of the verses has been given by the translator in the beginning of the book. The shortness and length of lines is, in most of the cases, in accordance with Iqbal's text, and the forms of the couplets, three-lined and five-lined stanzas and quatrains have been kept intact, with few exceptions, e.g.:

1- In poems No. 62, 92, and 113, each Urdu line has been translated in two English lines.

2- In 13, two Urdu lines have been rendered in one English line.

3- Poem No. 104 is in the blank verse, the only example in the book.

It is highly convincing that, despite his foremost attention to Iqbal's poetic patterns, he does not overlook the conventions of the English poetry. One can find elegant

pieces of the English poetry in these translations. Let us see a stanza of the poem No. 14, 'Two Planets':

Two planets meeting face to face,
One to the other cried, 'How sweet
If endlessly we might embrace,
And here for ever stay! how sweet
If Heaven a little might relent,
And leave our light in one light blent!'*2

Being a nice example of iambic tetrametric rhythm, this stanza is an exquisite example of a sestet.*3 The examples of tersets, quatrains and cinquains (three, four and five-lined stanzas) are also rampant in the book, for which a separate study is required. Poeticaily, this book seems to be comparable with Arberry's 'Persian Psalms'.

As far as its quality of translation is concerned, the translator's claim seems to be correct, when he says, "I have tried first of all to give the sense of the originals as exactly as possible, without addition or subtraction."*4

Other than a non-redundant and non-omissive style, it is the sublimity of the language that impresses a reader. Due to scarcity of space, we give below a list of some selected words, which create this impression:*5

1- painted water — تصویرِ آب

2- eldritch arts — جادو

3- gramarye — افسوں

4- Blue-mantled fairy queen — نیلم پری

5- largesse — فیض

6- undertow — سمندر (کی تہ)

7- pharisee	فقیہہ
8- mummery	خرافات
9- tassell	خوشہ
10- mystagogue	مداری
11- belly-cheer	ناو و نوش
12- paynim	کافر
13- footpad	رہزن
14- fetish-fashioning	آزری
15- Hades	دوزخ
16- casuist	فقیہہ
17- rushlight	مٹی کا دیا
18- fervescence	معرکہ
19- canonist	شیخ (مفتی)
20- cap-a-pie	دوش تاکمر
21- grime	دھواں
22- nadir	زوال
23- genuflexion	سجدہ
24- evangel	پیام
25- fig-leaf	پردہ
26- pusillanimous	سربزیر
27- lackey	بندہ (چاکر)
28- melee	رزم

This subjective list of words can be extended or curtailed in view of one's verbal priorities, but, it does give a glimpse of the translator's linguistic standard. In order to assess their aesthetic significance, one has to see them in their contextualized form.

Another delicate aspect of this translation is the translator's creativity. At many places, he has carefully displayed his fertility of mind. Here are some examples:

1- In 'Kanar-i-Ravi', Iqbal says:

کھڑے ہیں دور وہ عظمت فزائے تنہائی
منارِ خواب گہِ شہسوارِ چغتائی *6

Kiernan translates it:

Far off, magnificent, those towers stand, where
<u>The flower of Moghul chivalry</u> lies asleep;*7

Iqbal uses the phrase 'شہسوارِ چغتائی', but, Kiernan sublimates it in 'The flower of Moghal chivalry' --- flower, being the most fragrant and beautiful part of a plant.

2- In 'Haqiqat-i– Husn', Iqbal says:

کہیں قریب تھا، یہ گفتگو قمر نے سنی
فلک پہ عام ہوئی، اخترِ سحر نے سنی *8

Kiernan renders it as this:

The moon stood near and heard this colloquy,
The words <u>took wing</u> about the sky
And reached the morning- star;*9

'To take the wing' is an idiom impregnated with a beautiful flash of imagery, particularly associated with flight in the supernal world. It serves to enhance Iqbal's impact in this couplet.

3- In 'Siqilliyya', Iqbal says:

درد اپنا مجھ سے کہہ، میں بھی سراپا درد ہوں
جس کی تو منزل تھا، میں اس کارواں کی گرد ہوں 10*

Kiernan's rendering is:

Tell your grief then to me, who am grief, who am
dust of that caravan whose magnet you were:*11

The word 'منزل' has been translated as 'magnet'. Metaphorically, it is really wonderful term to denote the attraction of some destination.

4- In 'Phool Ka Tohfa Ata Honey Par', Iqbal says:

مرا کنول کہ تصدّق ہیں جس پہ اہلِ نظر
مرے شباب کے گلشن کو ناز ہے جس پر 12*

Kiernan's translation is:

My heart, though it found love
In feeling hearts its vassal ---
This heart of mine, pride of
The garden of my youth,*13

The word 'کنول', figuratively used by Iqbal, is a dual symbol, which may denote either the beloved or a heart. Kiernan desymbolizes it, and puts down its actual connotation in relation to the succeeding couplets.

A notable aspect of this translation is that Kiernan mentions the red colour even on unexpected occasions. Here are some examples:

1۔ آفتابِ تازہ پیدا بطنِ گیتی سے ہوا 14*

From the womb of this old universe a new red sun is born*15

2۔ زخمِ گُل کے واسطے تدبیرِ مرہم کب تلک 16*

For the red wounds of the rose your idle ointments will you bring. *17

3- کہ فطرت خود بخود کرتی ہے لالے کی حنابندی *18

To stain the tulip red is Nature's care. *19

4- صف جنگاہ میں مردانِ خدا کی تکبیر *20

The prayers of God's folk treading
The battlefield's red sod. *21

5- پُر ہے مئے گل رنگ سے ہر شیشہ حلب کا *22

Aleppo's rare glass brims with their red wine. *23

6- نہ بہ بادہ میل داری نہ بمن نظر کشائی *24

The red wine you leave untasted, and your eyes do not come near me; *25

7- گل گفت کہ عیشِ نوبہارے خوشتر *26

Sweet is the time of Spring, the red Rose cried; *27

These lines are in addition to the ones, wherein Iqbal himself has mentioned the red colour. This propensity to this colour might be the outcome of the translator's instinctive liking for this emotional colour, or his attachment to some class, whose emblematic colour is red.

Like many other translators, Kiernan has also committed flaws in the use of some words. Let us list them here: *28

1- sacrifice	نذر (تحفہ)
2- mustard	اسپند
3- blessings on God	صلوٰۃ
4- self-abasement	نیاز

5- mercury مریخ

6- passion عشق

7- wren خفاش

8- kettle چھلنی

9- pot چھاج

10- coffin کفن

11- droning psalm قوالی

In short, V.G. Kiernan's translation is one of the most outstanding efforts in Iqbal's translations in English. His poetic felicity, linguistic competence and semantic alertness, all are equally significant. His minor shortcomings, as indicated above, do not have any serious ill-effect on his overall impact.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. First published by Kutab Publishers, Bombay: second edition, John Murray, London; 1955: third edition, Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1999: we are using the latest edition for references here.
2. Poems from Iqbal; P.32
3. A six lined stanza, having a rhyme scheme of ***ababcc***, also called sixain.
4. Poems from Iqbal; P. xxv
5. Ibid; PP. 1-40; 2-36; 3-40; 4-50; 5-62; 6-76; 7-90; 8-114; 9-124; 10-130; 11-134; 12-146; 13-154; 14-156; 15-156; 16-160; 17-164; 18-166; 19-168; 20-168; 21-198; 22-206; 23-222; 24-222; 25-232; 26-262; 27-266; 28-272
6. Bang-i-Dara; P.95
7. Poems from Iqbal; P.20

8. Bang-i-Dara; P.112
9. Poems from Iqbal; P.22
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.134
11. Poems from Iqbal; P.32
12. Bang-i-Dara; P.158
13. Poems from Iqbal; P.34
14. Bang-i-Dara; P.263
15. Poems from Iqbal; P.54
16. Bang-i-Dara; P.263
17. Poems from Iqbal; P.54
18. Bal-i-Jibril; P.14
19. Poems from Iqbal; P.64
20. Bal-i-Jibril; P.150
21. Poems from Iqbal; P.148
22. Zarb-i-Kalim; P.156
23. Poems from Iqbal; P.218
24. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.126
25. Poems from Iqbal; P.284
26. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.219
27. Poems from Iqbal;P.290
28. Ibid; PP. 1-36; 2-70; 3-102; 4-104; 5-144; 6-166; 7-182; 8-212; 9-212; 10-214; 11-230

POEMS OF IQBAL

Anis Nagi

A prose translation of Iqbal's ten Urdu poems has been made by Anis Nagi, under the title of 'Poems of Iqbal'.*1 These poems are:

1- The Mosque of Cordova
2- Lenin
3- Saqi Nama
4- For Serfs
5- Evening
6- Life
7- Ghazal
8- Man
9- A Poem
10- Philosophy and Religion

These poems have been selected from Iqbal's four books in the following order:

1-	Bal-i-Jibril:	1, 2, 3, 7, 10
2-	Bang-i-Dara:	5, 6
3-	Zarb-i-Kalim:	4
4-	Armaghan-i-Hijaz:	8, 9

This is one of the most unfortunate books in the field of Iqbal Studies, wherein derogatory and obnoxious words have been used for Iqbal. This translator, consciously or unconsciously, uses two such words:

1- Voyeur: This word is the heading of the five-paged preface to this book.*2 It is used in the world of sexual perversion. The world's most famous dictionary, 'Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English',*3 describes this word as this:

A person who obtains sexual excitement from watching sexual activities of others, especially secret.

Since sexual perversion is a subject of Psychology, let us see how psychologists take this word. The 'Dictionary of Psychology'*[4] defines this word as follows:

one who obtains sexual gratification by watching others undress or engage in sexual activity.

It is unintelligible as to how and why the translator has used this insultive word for Iqbal.

2- Maverick: In the very first sentence of the preface to the book, the translator calls Iqbal a maverick poet.*[5] This word is used for stray cattle or, in case of humans, for political rolling stones. 'Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English' gives two meanings of this word:

(i) a young cow without its owner's mark

(ii) a person who acts independently because he thinks differently from the rest of the group, especially among politicians.*[6]

The second definition seems to be somewhat convincing, but, when one penetrates the root of this word, one grasps a clear idea that, derived from the name of an advocate, John Maverick, whose cattle were stray and abodeless, this word is primarily used for wandering animals, and metaphorically, for political turncoats. 'Webster's Dictionary of Word Origins' traces the history of this word and, then, enumerates its denotations as this:

masterless and unbranded cattle-sons of small farmers in County Clare, shoeless vagabonds of Kerry, herders of Ballyvegan; much wanted 'moonlighters' (night raiders) and the like.*[7]

Is it justifiable to include Iqbal in this category of animals, or animal- like distorted, uncivilized and base persons!

Out of the above-mentioned ten poems, the following three poems have been translated partially:

1- Saqi Nama: Out of a total of 7 verse paragraphs, only 3 have been translated.
2- Life: It is only one part out of 6 parts of 'Khizr-i-Rah'.
3- A Poem: It is Nagi's self-coined heading for a part of 'Mullahzade Zaighum Laulabi Kashmiri Ka Bayaz', out of 19 parts.

The translator has given no justification for adoption of these parts and omission of the others. Ironically enough, he has left out 7 hemistichs out of the poems he has translated:

1- Mosque of Cordova:

i- نغمۂ اللہ ھو میرے رگ و پے میں ہے *8

ii- حاملِ "خلقِ عظیم"، صاحبِ صدق و یقیں *9

2- Lenin:

مشرق کے خداوند سفیدانِ فرنگی *10

3- Saqi Nama:

i- وہ مے جس سے کھلتا ہے رازِ ازل *11

ii- نہ حد اس کے پیچھے نہ حد سامنے! *12

iii- خودی جلوہ بدمست و خلوت پسند
سمندر ہے اک بوند پانی میں بند *13

The text, which has been translated has got serious mistakes:

1- لعلِ بدخشاں کے ڈھیر چھوڑ گیا آفتاب! *14

Sun has left behind a heap of pearls of Yemen.*15

'Badakhshan' has been translated as 'Yemen'.

2۔ ازل اس کے پیچھے، ابد سامنے! [*16]

Eternity is behind <u>his</u> back, perpetuity is in front of it.[*17]

Two different personal pronouns, 'his' and 'it', have been used for 'Khudi' in a single sentence:

3۔ عالمِ آب و خاک و باد! سرِّ عیاں ہے تو کہ میں؟ [*18]

Are you or am I the manifest secret of the world of elements?[*19]

Iqbal is apostrophizing the world of elements, but, the translator is making it a subject and talking to someone else about it. This basic misconception has destroyed the entire translation of this ghazal, as it comprises the address to the phenomenal world from its start to end.

4۔ شاخیں ہیں خموش ہر شجر کی [*20]

Silent are <u>bows</u> of each tree.[*21]

Does the translator not know the difference between 'bow' (to kneel) and 'bough' (a branch)?

5۔ لاؤں کہاں سے بندۂ صاحبِ نظر کو میں! [*22]

From where should I seek the <u>voyeur</u>? [*23]

The word 'voyeur' has been repeated. The translator seems to be highly confused in this word. But, the basic question is as to what is his source of this word?

6۔ پہچانتا نہیں ہوں ابھی راہبر کو میں [*24]

I do not yet <u>reckon</u> my guide.[*25]

Instead of using the verb 'recognize', 'reckon' is being used.

In an overall estimation, this translation seems to be a

non-serious attempt. A penetrative look might denounce it as a sugar-coated anti-Iqbal pill.*26

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Jamaliyat, Lahore; (date not given)
2. Poems of Iqbal; P. 5
3. Published by English Language Book Society & Longman, U.K.;P.1232
4. Published by Goyl Saab, Delhi, India;P.491
5. Poems of Iqbal; P. 5
6. Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English; P.672
7. Webster's Dictionary of Word Origins; Merriam Webster, U.S.A; P. 299
8. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 96
9. Ibid; P. 98
10. Ibid; P.107
11. Ibid; P.123
12. Ibid; P.127
13. Ibid
14. Ibid; P.100
15. Poems of Iqbal; P. 25
16. Bal-i-Jibril; P.127
17. Poems of Iqbal; P. 37
18. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 28
19. Poems of Iqbal; P. 44
20. Bang-i-Dara; P. 128
21. Poems of Iqbal; P. 41
22. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 148
23. Poems of Iqbal; P. 48
24. Bal-i-Jibril; P.148
25. Poems of Iqbal; P. 48
26. For a detailed analysis of this translation, please see my article 'Anis Nagi's Translations of Iqbal's Poetry' in the journal 'Iqbal' of Bazm-i-Iqbal Lahore; October 1998.

RUBAYIAT OF IQBAL

A.R. Tariq

An anthology of the translations of 201 selected quatrains of Iqbal was presented by A.R. Tariq, in 1973, titled as 'Rubayiat of Iqbal'.*1 He has selected these quatrains out of three books, as under:

1- Payam-i-Mashriq: 77
2- Armaghan-i-Hijaz: 93
3- Bal-i-Jibril: 31

Since A.R. Tariq has not translated Iqbal's all the quatrains, he has given an index of his selected ones at the end of the book, giving the first hemistich of each quatrain. This index is very helpful in searching out any quatrain translated by him. He has also given each quatrain his own number from 1 to 201.

As far as the quality of the translation is concerned, it is very simple, clear and accurate. The translator has adopted a controlled interpretative style. He adds phrases and clauses, wherever he feels necessary. So, most of the quatrains have been translated in ten or more than ten lines. His accuracy is to this extent that we have been able to locate only four minor flaws out of the entire book:

1- The verb 'aspire' is not followed by any preposition, but, A.R. Tariq has used the preposition 'to' with it:

To the assembly of Garden-fowls
I always Aspire. *2

2- In a quatrain in 'Payam-i-Mashriq', Iqbal says:

تجم بحریست تا پیدا کنارے *3

The translator could not concentrate on 'تجم', and translated

the line as this:

This world seems like a
Vast Ocean to Me.[*4]

This seems to be just an oversight.

3- In a quatrain in 'Hozoor-i-Risalat', Iqbal expresses his surprise over the Muslim's lack of familiarity with death:

مسلماں زادہ و نامحرم مرگ! [5*]

A.R. Tariq's translation of this line is:

A "Muslim" by birth
And so oblivious and Clear
Of Death![*6]

The word 'Clear' is highly confusing. It might have been 'unclear', misprinted as 'clear'.

4- The quatrains No. 176 and 177 are about 'love'. The translator has used the personal pronoun 'he' for love, in both the quatrains:

(i) And sometimes he comes naked,
And without Sword or Spear,[*7]

(ii) Sometimes Love pleases
The Society
With his Wit![*8]

Perhaps, the translator is keeping the word 'Ishq'(عشق) in his mind, which is used as a masculine gender in Urdu.

To wind up, it is a dependable and simple prose translation, highly useful for common readers in the English speaking society.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore.
2. Rubayiat of Iqbal; P.34
3. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.74
4. Rubayiat of Iqbal; P.71
5. Armaghan-i-Hijaz; P.35
6. Rubayiat of Iqbal; P.98
7. Ibid; P.184
8. Ibid; P.185

A SELECTION AND TRANSLATION OF IQBALIAT

M. Yaqub Mirza

A collection of miscellaneous translations, made by M. Yaqub Mirza, appeared in 1991, under the title of 'A Selection and Translation of Iqbaliat'.*1 In this book, 185 couplets have been translated out of seven books of Iqbal: here is a detail:

1- Zarb-i-Kalim:	33
2- Bal-i-Jibril:	41
3- Bang-i-Dara:	60
4- Javid Nama:	10
5- Pas Cheh Bayad Kard:	4
6- Payam-i-Mashriq:	35
7- Armaghan-i-Hijaz:	2

The translator has selected shorter poems and various couplets for his purpose. An immediate and strong impression of this choice is that he picks up the verses from Iqbal, which the socialistic school of thought uses in order to prove that Iqbal was a poet toing their line. In this respect, this is a misleading translation, since the choice is highly personal.

Like some other translators, this translator also pretends to be a poet, but, there is nothing poetic in him, except ill-fixed rhymes --- no rhythm, no metre. Here is an example of the worst rhyming, wherein the translator is using the conjunction 'and' as a rhyme:

Again it is I, who made mirror out of sand,
Out of Thy poisons, I made medicines and.*2

The prose version of the second line is:

And out of Thy poison, I made medicines.

The quality of the translation is generally acceptable, however, the translator could not save himself from committing mistakes at some stages:

1- Iqbal:

خودی میں ڈوبنے والوں کے عزم و ہمت نے

اس آبجو سے کئے بحر بیکراں پیدا 3*

Yaqub Mirza:

Those who dared, drunk in confidence of their powers,
Out of dust, they raise some of the mightiest towers.*4

The translator has changed 'sea' into 'towers' and 'stream' into 'dust' simply to adjust a word rhyming with 'powers'.

2- Iqbal:

تجھے کتاب سے ممکن نہیں فراغ کہ تو

کتاب خواں ہے، مگر صاحبِ کتاب نہیں! 5*

Yaqub Mirza:

Relief from books is not possible for you,
You are a reader but an author you are not.*6

By 'صاحبِ کتاب' Iqbal means the knower of the secrets of the Quran;*7 Yaqub Mirza wants him to be an author.

3- Iqbal:

آملیں گے سینہ چاکانِ چمن سے سینہ چاک 8*

Yaqub Mirza:

The afflictors will embrace the afflicted.*9

The phrase 'سینہ چاک' means 'the afflicted', not 'the afflictors'.

4- Iqbal:

دوڑ پیچھے کی طرف اے گردشِ ایام تو 10*

Yaqub Mirza:

O Misfortune! Turn round-Run as fast as you can.*11

Iqbal simply desires to regress into the past to see the natural life of the forefathers of mankind; Yaqub Mirza is associating it with misfortune.

5- Iqbal:

ایں کیست کہ بر دلہا آوردہ شبیخونے [12]*

Yaqub Mirza:

Why on earth should a <u>groom</u> be the victim of a night attack?*[13]

The translator reads the word 'دِلہا' (hearts) as 'دُلہا' (groom), an Urdu word, and commits such a blunder.

To wind up, in view of the ideologically erratic background and the translator's lack of the required competence in language, it does not seem expedient to encourage such translations.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. Iqbaliat; P. 132
3. Zarb-i-Kalim; P. 101
4. Iqbaliat; P.48
5. Zarb-i-Kalim; P. 82
6. Iqbaliat; P.52
7. Farhang-i-Iqbal (Urdu); P. 512
8. Bang-i-Dara; P. 194
9. Iqbaliat; P. 110
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.23
11. Iqbaliat; P. 116
12. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 166
13. Iqbaliat; P. 134

SELECTIONS FROM GHALIB AND IQBAL
K.N. Sud

An Indian journalist, K.N. Sud, has given the translations of 32 poems, rubaiyat and extracts of Iqbal's poetry in his book ' Selections from Ghalib and Iqbal', published in 1978.*1 These verses have been taken out of the following four books:

1- Bang-i-Dara: 21
2- Bal-i-Jibril: 9
3- Payam-i-Mashriq: 1
4- Armaghan-i-Hijaz 1

These translations have been included in the second half of the book, along with a biographical sketch of Iqbal. The translation has been made in free verse, and the translator seems to be well-equipped as far as the language is concerned, but, judged on the other standards of rendering, his work is unreliable one, due to the following reasons:

1- Out of a total of 32 verses, the translations of 11 verses are incomplete.*2 The most important poems, like 'Saqi Nama', 'Shikwah' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwah', have been fragmentarily translated. In such fragmentation, Iqbal's basic ideas have been lost.

2- Nowhere any reference has been made to the source of the poems. Therefore, it becomes quite impossible for a common reader to know from which book the poems have been selected.

3- In the case of 9 ghazals, the translator has changed them into poems, by giving them self-coined headings.*3

4- A quatrain of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' has been given the title of 'Epilogue', and converted into a short poem.*4

5- The poem 'Himalayas' has been translated by the translator in an abridged form.*5 An untranslated stanza of this poem has been made a separate poem, under a separate caption, 'An Evening Scene'.*6

6- K.N. Sud does not know Persian. So, he includes a borrowed translation of a poem, 'Tanhai' of 'Payam-i-Mashriq', made by V.G. Kiernan.*7 The Persian quatrain of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz', included in this collection, is so famous that almost every reader of Iqbal knows its translation. It is not difficult to find its translation and reparaphrase it.

7- Since these translations are just snapshots of Iqbal's Urdu verses, those also of only two books out of four --- overlooking all of his Persian poetry, it would be a futile effort to look for Iqbal's comprehensive concepts in them.

The language of these translations is mostly correct, but, the translator's self-insertions are too frequent and create hindrances in going into the original thought, e.g.:

Iqbal:

عزّت ہے محبت کی قائم اے قیس! حجابِ محمل سے
محمل جو گیا، عزّت بھی گئی، غیرت بھی گئی، لیلیٰ بھی گئی *8

Sud:

Love's honour is safe
so long there's some veil,
and sense of decency;
be morbid or play with it,
all ethics part, all modesty.*9

All the central words in the couplet, 'Qais', 'Mahmil' and 'Laila', have been dropped, rather most of the words have been set aside, and the translator tries to convey the sense in

his own, but, more complicated way. This approach has been adopted throughout the book, which is highly misleading.

It would not be wise to recommend this translation to Iqbal's lovers, as it is not convincing in its selection of verses, or its precision in translation.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Sterling Publishers, Delhi, India
2. Truant Sparks; A Wish; To The Saqi; Sorrow's Profile; The Himalayas; An Evening Scene; The Complain; God Replies; The Fire Of Longing; Wincing To Spurn; Satire; Ruba'iyat
3. I Beg No Redress; Mine Or Yours; All Is Topsy Turvy; Back To Bottle; The Fire Of Longing; Stars Not The Limit; Wincing To Spurn; My Dust; Whose Sigh?
4. Selections from Ghalib and Iqbal; P.110
5. Ibid; P.82
6. Ibid; P.86
7. Ibid; P.88
8. Bang-i-Dara; P.277
9. Selections from Ghalib and Iqbal; P.103

THE SWORD AND THE SCEPTRE

Riffat Hassan

'The Sword and the Sceptre' is a collection of articles, compiled by Riffat Hassan, on the life and poetical works of Iqbal.*1 A salient feature of this book is that it contains both the English translations and the original Urdu/Persian versions of all the verses referred to by the writers in their articles. Thus, this book is an exquisite repository of the English translations of Iqbal's verses. A relatively more important portion of this book is an article, 'Iqbal's Message of the East', written by R.A. Nicholson, wherein he has given his own English translations of 20 verses (poems, quatrains and extracts) from 'Payam-i-Mashriq', as this:

1- Peshkash — 3 couplets
2- Lala-i-Toor — 4 quatrains
3- Afkar:
  (i) Zindagi
  (ii) Hayat-i-Javid (2 couplets)
  (iii) Zindagi (2 couplets)
  (iv) Zindagi-o-Amal
  (v) Nawa-i-Waqt
  (vi) Sarood-i-Anjum
4- Naqsh-i-Farang:
  (i) The first and last stanza
  (ii) Jam'iat-ul-Aqwam
  (iii) Falsafa-o-Siyasat
  (iv) Shopenhaur-o-Neitzche (6 couplets)
  (v) Neitzche
  (vi) Pegham-i-Bergson
  (vii) Nawa-i-Mazdoor

(viii) Khitab-be-Inglistan

All the translations are convincing and accurate. Nicholson's translation of 'Asrar-i-Khudi' (The Secrets of the Self), was in prose, but, here, we come across him as an accomplished poet. He has dexterously and successfully experimented with various metric compositions, from trimetric to hexametric lines, e.g.:

1- Our infinite world-of old
Time's ocean swallows it up.*2 (trimeter)

2- Feast not on the shore, for there
Softly breathes the tune of Life.*3 (tetrameter)

3- I asked a lofty sage what Life might be.
"The wine whose bitterest cup is best", said he.*4 (pentameter)

4- Clad in cotton rags I toil as a slave for hire
To earn for an idle master his silk attire.*5 (hexameter)

5- Of life, O brother I give thee a token to hold and keep:
Sleep is a lighter death, and Death is a heavier sleep.*6 (heptameter)

In the translation of the poem 'The Song of the Stars', he has included dimetric lines as well, e.g.:

1- The heat of battle,
2- The fall of kings,*7

In some verses, he has combined various metres, e.g., in a quatrain, he combines iambic pentametric lines with iambic trimetric ones, as this:

A stranger to yourself, the Vision yonder
You sought, to Sinai ran.

Nay,' tis in search of Man your feet must wander:
God too is seeking Man.[8]

A point of special notice in these translations is that Nicholson's choice of verses covers most of Iqbal's themes --- struggle for existence, life, time and space, self-realization, philosophy and politics, love versus reason and the condition of Europe etc. All the renderings are careful, precise and free of semantic errors. The above- mentioned five examples of the variety of rhythm may also be re-read as the specimens of standard translations. In order to further elucidate the simplicity and precision of Nicholson, let us see the translation of two couplets of a short poem:

شبے زار نالید ابرِ بہار ؎   کہ ایں زندگی گریۂ پیہم است
درخشید برقِ سبک سیر و گفت   خطا کردۂ، خندۂ یکدم است [9]

Nicholson:

Sad moaned the cloud of Spring,
"This life's a long weeping".
Cried the lightning, flashing and leaping,
" 'Tis a laugh on the wing,".[10]

It seems appropriate to point out that there is a couplet, wherein Nicholson seems to be unclear:

چشم بکشائے اگر چشمِ تو صاحب نظر است
زندگی در پئے تعمیرِ جہانِ دگر است [11]

Nicholson:

Open thine eyes, if thou hast eyes to see!
Life is the building of the world to be.[12]

Iqbal is talking about his contemporary life, which, according to him, was at the threshold of a revolution.

Nicholson is taking it in the sense of the general nature of life.

Overall, these translations are very precious in choice and treatment on the part of the translator.

II

This book offers another set of the translations of 12 poems from 'Bang-i-Dara', included in an essay, 'Iqbal', written by H.T. Sorley.*13 The poems are:

1- Love
2- The Bud
3- Moth and Candle
4- Cloud
5- Man
6- Address to Muslim Youth
7- The Wave of River
8- Withered Rose
9- Separation
10- Prayer
11- Firefly
12- Firefly and Bird

The technical condition of these translations is as follows:

1- Prose: 1, 2, 4, 5 and 11
2- Poetry:

(i)	Iambic tetrameter:	3
(ii)	Iambic tetrameter + trimeter:	8
(iii)	Iambic pentameter:	7, 10, 12
(iv)	Iambic penatmeter + trimeter:	6
(v)	Iambic hexameter:	9

The poetic standard of the translator is acceptable, but, at some places, he has failed to understand the original Urdu text, and has committed big mistakes. Here are the most serious ones out of them, which are too obvious to invite any comment:

1- قمر اپنے لباسِ نو میں بیگانہ سا لگتا تھا *14

The moon looked somewhat strangely in its new unwonted dress.*15

2- ہویدا تھی نگینے کی تمنا چشم خاتم سے *16

When the wish to fix the jewel, in the Maker's sight was grown.*17

3- پھرایا فکرِ اجزا نے اسے میدانِ امکاں میں *18

Thought's atom sent him wandering across What-Can-Be's plain. *19

4- جب دکھاتی ہے سحر عارضِ رنگیں اپنا *20

When the bud shows itself in the morning's fresh beauty.*21

5- سامنے مہر کے دل چیر کے رکھ دیتی ہے *22

It rends the sun's heart, its own head extending.*23

6- بہرِ نظارہ تڑپتی ہے نگاہِ بیتاب *24

As the glamour my gaze spins all restless apace.*25

7- غم خانۂ جہاں میں جو تیری ضیا نہ ہو

اس تفتہ دل کا نخلِ تمنا ہرا نہ ہو *26

Had your lustre not been in the world's house of woe,

The tree of hot love had been green. [*27]

8۔ خورشید، وہ عابد سحر خیز [28*]

The sun that doth worship the morning. [*29]

9۔ غنی روز سیاہ پیر کنعاں را تماشا کن [30*]

Rich man, behold the darkened day
Kinan's old man once knew, [*31]

10۔ ثریا سے زمیں پر آسماں نے ہم کو دے مارا [32*]

The heaven from the zenith has dashed it down
And cast it on the ground. [*33]

11۔ خار ماہی سے نہ اٹکا کبھی دامن میرا [34*]

My garment's hem on thorn of fish e'er tore. [*35]

These incorrect renderings make it clear that the translator badly needs an orientation in the Urdu language. This statement can be further proved by casting a glance at his use of discrete words, e.g.: [*36]

1- rum (wine)	رم
2- grandeur	بے نیازی
3- melted	گوندھا
4- rain	مہوس
5- riddle	رازجو
6- world	گردوں
7- still	مضطرب
8- goal	پایاب
9- covenant	اقرار
10- zenith	طور

Keeping in view all these incorrect translations, one does not feel any hesitation in concluding that H.T. Sorley's work cannot be ranked among the reliable renderings.

REFERENCES

1. Published by Iqbal Academy, Lahore; 1977: First published in Islamica, Lipsiae, 1924-25, Volume-1 , PP. 112-124
2. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.307
3. Ibid; P.306
4. Ibid; P.305
5. Ibid; P.319
6. Ibid; P.307
7. Ibid; P.311
8. Ibid; P.306
9. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.96
10. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.308
11. Payam-i-Mashriq; P.192
12. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.314
13. Ibid; PP. 176-200
14. Bang-i-Dara; P.111
15. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.181
16. Bang-i-Dara; P.111
17. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.182
18. Bang-i-Dara; P.111
19. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.182
20. Bang-i-Dara; P.118
21. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.184
22. Bang-i-Dara; P.118
23. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.184
24. Bang-i-Dara; P.118
25. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.184
26. Bang-i-Dara; P.41
27. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.185

28. Bang-i-Dara; P.127
29. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.188
30. Bang-i-Dara; P.180
31. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.191
32. Bang-i-Dara; P.180
33. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.191
34. Bang-i-Dara; P.62
35. The Sword and the Sceptre; P.192
36. Ibid; PP. 1-181; 2-182; 3-183; 4-183; 5-188; 6-190; 7-192; 8-192; 9-193; 10-199

Dr. MUHAMMAD IQBAL: THE HUMANIST

S. G. Abbas

One of the latest translations is S.G. Abbas's 'Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist', published in 1997.*1 This book contains the translations of 21 poems, taken out of Iqbal's two Urdu books, as under:

1- Bang-i-Dara:*2 15
2- Bal-i-Jibril:*3 6

The first and, perhaps, the foremost, fact to bear in mind, about this book, is that it has been composed to prove that Iqbal was the poet of all the humanity, not only that of Islam, as the translator claims:

> ... his commentators and critics have so far not been able to do full justice or make a fair assessment of the poetry of this great poet. As most of these commentators and critics were Muslims, therefore, while studying the works of Iqbal and analysing them subsequently, their Muslim instinct was at work.... a poet of the stature of Dr. Iqbal could never be so partisan in his outlook as to restrict his poetry to a particular group based on religion or ethnicity.*4

Hence, it is not a haphazard pick-up of random poems. The translator has stepped forward with an avowed aim. But, unfortunately, he also turned out to be one of those unlucky translators, who try to do poetic translations without themselves being a poet, and, thus, obliterate their own works.

S.G. Abbas seems to be knowing nothing about the art of poetry, except rhymes, that also pseudo-rhyming. Being utterly ignorant of musicality or rhythm, he thrusts in

rhymes at the end of lines, and, then, moulds the text accordingly, to the detriment of the sense, e.g.:

How charming for others, is this temporal world?
But alas! for us, it's a conjectural world,
With our departing, it's an infernal world.
Sans a Unified God, it's a banal world,*5

Here is Iqbal's original text:

بنی اغیار کی اب چاہنے والی دنیا
رہ گئی اپنے لیے ایک خیالی دنیا!
ہم تو رخصت ہوئے اوروں نے سنبھالی دنیا
پھر نہ کہنا ہوئی توحید سے خالی دنیا! *6

Actually, the translator tries to imitate Iqbal's rhyming pattern, but, being unskilled in the poetic art, he creates ridiculous patterns. His entire book is interspersed with such examples.

The above example indicates that the translator's pseudo-rhyming distorts the meanings of the original text. But, S.G. Abbas creates more problems for himself, when he tries to create an elliptic expression.*7 Ellipsis is governed by very delicate rules. It is not just heaping down the words. Succinctness and brevity in the style are the outcome of ellipsis, but, its misuse deshapes the entire make-up of the writing. S.G. Abbas's book is replete with a number of unsuccessful experiments in ellipsis, for example:

Iqbal:
محفلِ ہستی تری بربط سے ہے سرمایہ دار
جس طرح ندی کے نغموں سے سکوتِ کوہسار
تیرے فردوسِ تخیل سے ہے قدرت کی بہار
تیری کشتِ فکر سے اُگتے ہیں عالم سبزہ وار *8

S.G. Abbas:

With thy harp exists, this world's precious treasure,
As with the river-songs, there's mount's leisure,
Heavenly thy fancy, source of Nature's pleasure,
World's greenery grows, with thy thoughts of stature.*9

In the fourth line here, the translator has failed to bring in any suitable word rhyming with 'treasure', 'leisure' and 'pleasure': he, therefore, uses the word 'stature', which is a conspicuous example of pseudo-rhyming. Under the garb of these false rhymes, he tries to be brief and curt, particularly in the second and the third line, through the words 'there', 'mount' and 'river-songs' etc., or omitting the double use of the verb 'is' in the next line. Such interaction of pseudo-rhyming and pseudo-ellipsis has ripped up the entire fabric of Iqbal's thought. Let us see two other examples of non-acceptable ellipsis:

1- Flower leaves a mirror, as spring's precursor,
For wine's surfeit, cup's refill-ness a mirror.*10

2- Sky's first couplet, all sweet in utterance,
A balm for heart's solitude, cause of forbearance.*11

It is impossible to know what these couplets mean, unless one consults the original text in Urdu, if one knows it:

1- برگِ گل آئینۂ عارضِ زیبائے بہار
شاہدِ مے کے لیے حجلۂ جام آئینہ *12

2- مطلعِ اوّل فلک جس کا ہو وہ دیواں ہے تو
سوئے خلوت گاہِ دل دامن کشِ انساں ہے تو *13

All the above examples, also throw light upon the

translator's quality of translation, yet, it would be more relevant to put down some words directly on the semantic precision, or otherwise, of this translator:

1- In 'Himala', Iqbal says:

داغ جس پر غازۂ رنگِ تکلف کا نہ تھا 14*

S. G. Abbas translates it:

Formality's scourge, which did not least entail.*15

Instead of using 'rouge', he is using 'scourge', which means 'lash'.

2- In 'Saqi Nama', there is a line:

ہری شاخِ ملّت ترے نم سے ہے 16*

The translator reads 'ترے نم' as 'ترنم', and thus portrays it:

Moist of nation, with rhythm's glee.*17

3- In the same poem, Iqbal says about 'khudi':

کرن چاند میں ہے، شرر سنگ میں 18*

S. G. Abbas seems totally unaware of the sense of 'khudi' in this line:

Moon-beam has glint, stone has flint.*19

4- In 'Jawab-i-Shikwa', heaven-dwellers say about man:

عالمِ کیف ہے، دانائے رموزِ کم ہے 20*

S. G. Abbas is unclear about 'کیف و کم' (quality and quantity of things), and relates these words to 'کیف و مستی'(sentiments) and 'کم' (little) versus 'بیش'(much):

All sentiments he is, with no wisdom, insight.*21

5- In 'Lenin', Iqbal says about Europe, using Lenin's words:

حق یہ ہے کہ بے چشمۂ حیواں ہے یہ ظلمات 22*

The translator does not understand the sense of 'چشمۂ حیوان' (The (The spring of life), and interprets it as animal (حیوان) :

Yet darkness persists, as if animals' habitation.*23

Through these five examples, one can assess the writer's either lack of knowledge about the original poet's language, or his lack of seriousness. Since we cannot afford a detailed analysis, in our limited scope, it would be sufficient to indicate that we have located 30 translations in this book, which are by no means acceptable.*24 We have overlooked minor mistakes. Otherwise, this number would have gone to hundreds.

In our study, we have focussed more upon the weaknesses of this translation, since its structural, literal and technical mistakes preponderate in every aspect. No doubt, the translator possesses an exquisite command of the English language, but, the fact remains intact that this is not the only pre-requisite for translating Iqbal. Had he rendered these translations in simple prose, he would have been a successful servitor of Iqbal's cause.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Iqbal Academy, Lahore.
2. Child's Prayer; Mirza Ghalib; Shakespeare; Daagh; Indian Anthem; National Song of the Indian Children; Ram; Nanak; Himalaya; On Receiving a Flower Present; Prayer; National Anthem; Protest; Rejoinder to Protest; In Memorium of Late Mother.
3. To the Cup-bearer; Cordova Mosque; Lenin; Song of Angels; God's Command to Angels; To Javed.
4. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 1
5. Ibid; P. 125

6. Bang-i-Dara; P. 167
7. Ellipsis is 'a figure of speech in poetry, where it allows the maximum meaning to be condensed into the shortest form of words' (A Dictionary of Literary Terms; P. 71)
8. Bang-i-Dara; P. 26
9. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 7
10. Ibid; P. 11
11. Ibid; P. 37
12. Bang-i-Dara; P. 251
13. Ibid; P. 22
14. Ibid; P. 23
15. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 41
16. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 124
17. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 53
18. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 127
19. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 69
20. Bang-i-Dara; P. 200
21. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P. 143
22. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 107
23. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist; P.181
24. P. 3 Very like a moth … (full couplet)
    P. 5 For beauty alone … (full couplet)
    P. 39 From thy lapel …
    P. 39 Cloud-specks driven …
    P. 41 To onlookers …
    P. 43 Brighter than the sun …
    P. 45 The first martyr's …
    P. 47 Spring! bearer of …
    P. 51 Mysticism, culture …
    P. 57 Each moment, prone …
    P. 63 Journey Real, False …
    P. 65 Faded few flowers …
    P. 75 Words can't express … (full couplet)
    P. 81 Reflects one's attributes …
    P. 81 Manifests one's ups …

TWELVE JEWELS OF IQBAL
Syed Khalid Eqbal Haider

A collection of the translations of 12 poems of 'Bang-i-Dara' was offered by Syed Khalid Eqbal Haider, under the title of 'Twelve Jewels of Iqbal', in 1985.*1 The following poems have been translated by the translator:

1- Beauty's Existence
2- The Dew and the Stars
3- A Wish
4- Sympathy
5- A Cow and a Goat
6- Glow-worm
7- A New Shrine
8- Flower
9- Mountain Cloud
10- Journey by Khizer
11- Khizer's Answers
12- Taranaye Milli

All the translations are in prose. The translator does not seem to possess the required command of language. His raw-handedness is quite conspicuous throughout the book. This is more of an experiment in translation than a standard translation. Here are some of the major flaws, which render this effort an unsuccessful one:

1- In these prose translations, there are 5 poems in which the translator has inserted rhymes, without any rhythm.*2 This useless effort has obliterated the fluency of the prose rendering.

2- In the poem 'Sympathy', he uses both the masculine and feminine genders for the same nightingale:

(i) She complained about the enveloping night's gloom.*3

(ii) A nearby glow-worm did him tell,*4

3- In 'Naya Shiwala', Iqbal says:

سُونی پڑی ہوئی ہے مدّت سے دل کی بستی
آ، اک نیا شوالہ اس دیس میں بنا دیں
دنیا کے تیرتھوں سے اونچا ہو اپنا تیرتھ
دامانِ آسماں سے اس کا کلس ملا دیں*5

K.E. Haider translates it:

The vallies of our hearts are unfurrowed and barren for long:
O come, a new shrine is created in our country's land highest
be our praying place amongst all world's places of holiness,
Its steeple is met with the blue.*6

If we consider the word 'is' in the second and the fourth line, we can say that the translator is playing havoc with the grammar. The next couplet also contains a similar mistake.

4- In 'Taranaye Milli', Iqbal's *radeef* (ردیف) is 'ہمارا' (our/ours). The translator has changed 'our' into 'my/mine' in the entire poem.*7

5- A number of single lines have been rendered incorrectly; e.g.:

i۔ بدلے نیکی کے یہ برائی ہے*8

they behave me bad good instead.*9

ii۔ کثرت میں ہو گیا ہے وحدت کا راز مخفی*10

The secret of oneness is revealed in polytheism.*11

iii- تاقی شاہد رحمت کا حدی خواں ہوتا *12

to be a viceroy harbinger of coming falling bliss.*13

6- As indicated above, the translator is careless in grammatical correctness and prepositional usage. Here are some other examples:

(i) the world abounds with fear.*14 ('with' used for 'in')

(ii) Hundred of fears are in jungle,*15 ('s' should be added to 'hundred')

(iii) It never suits us to fault in him find.*16 ('in' used for 'with')

(iv) The glimpses of eternity is reflected in everything.*17 ('are' should be used instead of 'is')

These were some selected examples of the grammatically and literally flawed translations. Overall, this book looks the production of an immature mind, not worthy of scholastic studies. Its narrowness of choice and shallowness of approach are the weaknesses, which incapacitate it to represent Iqbal.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published in Bihar Sharif, Nalanda, India.
2. The Dew and the Stars; A Wish; Sympathy; A Cow and a Goat; Taranaye Milli.
3. Twelve Jewels of Iqbal; P.21

4. Ibid
5. Bang-i-Dara; P.88
6. Twelve Jewels of Iqbal; P.27
7. Ibid; P.37
8. Bang-i-Dara; P.33
9. Twelve Jewels of Iqbal; P.24
10. Bang-i-Dara; P.85
11. Twelve Jewels of Iqbal; P.26
12. Bang-i-Dara; P.27
13. Twelve Jewels of Iqbal; P.31
14. Ibid; P.17
15. Ibid; P.24
16. Ibid
17. Ibid; P.26

IQBAL'S ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF HIS OWN POETRY

IQBAL'S ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF HIS OWN POETRY

Iqbal did not try to translate any of his books or poems, with a special intention of translation, except his poem 'اشکِ خون', which was written and translated by him, under the title of 'Tear of Blood', in 1901, to mourn the death of Queen Victoria.*1 This poem of 10 stanzas has not been included in 'Kulliyat-i-Iqbal', as its theme does not agree with the subsequent revolutionary ideas of Iqbal. It was just an experiment in writing an elegy, expressing a hollow grief. Neither the poem, nor its translation is of any importance to us, as the theme of the poem is unimportant, and its translation is in simple prose, giving no basic or relevant term for help in understanding Iqbal's actual message conveyed in his 'Kulliyat'.

In Iqbal's subsequent writings, we find some of his own translations of his important couplets. Dr. Muhammad Riaz, a renowned Iqbalist, has collected Iqbal's own English translations of 33 couplets from his three books.*2 The number of couplets taken from these three books is as follows:

1- Zaboor-i-Ajam:	17
2- Javid Nama:	15
3- Payam-i-Mashriq:	01

1- Zaboor-i-Ajam:

(i) The following last couplet of the ghazal No. 11, Part II, has been translated by Iqbal.

گرفتم ایں کہ شرابِ خودی بسے تلخ است
بدردِ خویش نگر زہرِ ما بدرماں کش *3

The wine of egohood is no doubt bitter, but do look to the disease and take my poison for the sake of the health.*4

(ii) Three extracts have been translated from 'Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid':

ز مرگے کہ می آید چہ باک است   خودی چوں پختہ شد از مرگ پاک است
ز مرگے دیگرے لرزد دل من   دلِ من، جانِ من، آب و گل من
ز کار عشق و مستی بر فتادن   شرارِ خود بہ خاشاکے ندادن
بدست خود کفن بر خود بریدن   بچشم خویش مرگ خویش دیدن
ترا ایں مرگ ہر دم در کمین است   بترس از وے کہ مرگِ ما ہمیں است 5*

Why fear that death which comes from without?
For when the "I" ripens into a self it has no danger of dissolution.
There is a more subtle inner death which makes me tremble!
This death is falling down from love's frenzy;
Saving one's spark and not giving it away freely to the heaps of chaff;
Cutting one's shroud with one's own hands;
Seeing one's death with one's own eyes;
This death lies in ambush for thee!
Fear it, for that is really our death!*6

(b) اگر گوئی کہ من وہم و گمان است   نمودش چوں نمودِ این و آن است
بگو با من کہ دارائے گماں کیست؟   یکے در خود نگر آں بے نشاں کیست؟
جہاں پیدا و محتاجِ دلیلے   نمی آید بفکرِ جبرئیلے
خودی پنہاں ز حجت بے نیاز است   یکے اندیش و دریاب ایں چہ راز است

خودی را حق بداں باطل مپندار   خودی را کشتِ بے حاصل مپندار
خودی چوں پختہ گردد لازوال است   فراقِ عاشقاں عینِ وصال است
شرر را تیز بالے می تواں داد   تپیدِ لا یزالے می تواں داد
دوامِ حق جزائے کارِ او نیست   کہ او را ایں دوام از جستجو نیست
دوام آں بہ کہ جانِ مستعارے   شود از عشق و مستی پائدارے 7*

If you say that the 'I' is mere illusion ---
An appearance among other appearances ---
Then tell me who is the subject of this illusion?
Look within and discover.
The world is visible, yet its existence needs proof!
Not even the intellect of an angel can comprehend it;
The "I" is invisible and needs no proof!
Think a while and see thine own secret!
The "I" is Truth, it is no illusion;
Don't look upon it as a fruitless field.
When it ripens, it becomes eternal!
Lovers, even though separated from the Beloved live in blissful union!
It is possible to give wings to a mere spark,
And to make it flutter for ever and for ever!
The Eternity of God is (elemental and) not the reward of His action!
For His eternity is not through seeking.
That eternity is superior, which a borrowed soul
Wings for herself by love's frenzy.*8

(c) مرا دل سوخت بر تنہائی او   کنم سامان بزم آرائی او
مثالِ دانہ می کارم خودی را   برائے او نگہ دارم خودی را 9*

My heart burns on the loneliness of God!
In order, therefore, to maintain intact His Ego-Society
I sow in my dust the seed of selfhood,
And keep a constant vigil over my "I".*10

2- Javid Nama:

15 couplets have been translated by Iqbal himself from this book:

(a) بود حلاجے بشہرِ خود غریب — جاں ز ملا برد و کشت او را طبیب *11

A Hallaj, A stranger in his own land!
Safe from the Mullah's hit, killed by the
Physician's hand.*12

(b) خواست تا از آب و گل آید بروں — خوشۂ کز کشتِ دل آید بروں
آنچہ او جوید مقامِ کبریاست — ایں مقام از عقل و حکمت ماوراست *13

The 'I am', which he seeketh,
Lieth beyond philosophy, beyond knowledge.
The plant that groweth only from the invisible soil of the heart of man,
Groweth not from a mere heap of clay.*14

(c) زندۂ یا مردۂ یا جاں بلب — از سہ شاہد کن شہادت را طلب
شاہدِ اوّل شعورِ خویشتن — خویش را دیدن بنورِ خویشتن
شاہدِ ثانی شعورِ دیگرے — خویش را دیدن بنورِ دیگرے
شاہدِ ثالث شعورِ ذاتِ حق — خویش را دیدن بنورِ ذاتِ حق
پیش ایں نور ار بمانی استوار — حیّ و قائم چوں خدا خود را شمار
بر مقامِ خود رسیدن زندگی است — ذات را بے پردہ دیدن زندگی است
چیست معراج آرزوئے شاہدے — امتحانے روبروئے شاہدے

شاہدِ عادل کہ بے تصدیقِ او   زندگی ما را چو گُل را رنگ و بو
در حضورش کس نماند استوار   ور بماند هست او کامل عیار
ذرهٔ از کف مده تابے کہ هست   پخته گیر اندر گره تابے کہ هست
تابِ خود را بر فزودن خوشتر است   پیشِ خورشید آزمودن خوشتر است
پیکرِ فرسوده را دیگر تراش   امتحانِ خویش کن 'موجود' باش
ایں چنیں 'موجود' 'محمود' است و بس   ورنہ تارِ زندگی دُود است و بس 15*

Art thou in the stage of 'life', 'death' or 'death-in-life'? Invoke the aid of three witnesses to verify thy 'Station'.
The first witness is thine own consciousness ---
See thyself, then, with thine own light.
The second witness is the consciousness of another ego ---
See thyself, then, with the light of an ego other than thee.
The third witness is God's consciousness ---
See thyself, then, with God's light.
If thou standest unshaken in front of this light,
Consider thyself as living and eternal as He!
That man alone is real who dares ---
Dares to see God face to face!
What is 'Ascension'? Only a search for a witness
Who may finally confirm thy reality ---
A witness whose confirmation alone makes thee eternal.
No one can stand unshaken in His Presence;
And he who can, verily, he is pure gold.

Art thou a mere particle of dust?
Tighten the knot of thy ego;
And hold fast to thy tiny being!
How glorious to burnish one's ego,
And to test its lustre in the presence of the Sun!
Re-chisel, then, thine ancient frame; And build up a new being.
Such being is real being,
Or else thy ego is a mere ring of smoke.*16

3- Payam-i-Mashriq:

Dr. M. Riaz has also found out a translation of a single couplet from 'Payam-i-Mashriq':

اسرار ازل جوئی؟ بر خود نظرے وا کن
یکتائی و بسیاری، پنہائی و پیدائی *17

Shall I point the way to the eternal secret? Open thine eyes on thyself;
Thou art visible and invisible, many and one.*18

These translations have been taken from Iqbal's three articles:

1- Self in the Light of Relativity*19
2- McTaggart's Philosophy*20
3- Is Religion Possible*21

As all the three articles are immensely important philosophical writings of Iqbal, the poetic excerpts, cited therein, are also equally important. Their translations are highly significant, because the Persian couplets and their English meanings both spring from the same fountain, i.e., Iqbal's mind. Some points to be borne in mind about these translations are:

1- These prose renderings have been made in biblical style, in which R.A. Nicholson wrote his 'The Secrets of the Self'; thou, thee, doth, shaketh etc.

2- Some philosophical key terms can be seen clearly translated by Iqbal, e.g.:

i-	I	من
ii-	illusioin	وہم و گمان
iii-	Self, selfhood, ego, the 'I'	خودی
iv-	appearance	نمود
v-	truth	حق
vi-	the 'I am'	مقامِ کبریا
vii-	consciousness	شعور
viii-	witness	شاہد
ix-	ancient frame	پیکر فرسودہ
x-	eternal secret	اسرارِ ازل
xi-	one and many	یکتا و بسیار

3- Despite philosophical and complex themes, Iqbal has tried to remain as simple as possible.

Although quite less in quantity, these translations can help the translators in understanding some basic terms and determining the style of translation as preferred by Iqbal.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. Published by Mufid-i-Am Press, London
2. Iqbal Review; April-September 1986; Please see the article 'Iqbal's English Translation of His Own Persian Couplets', PP. 1 [illegible] 83
3. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P. 72
4. op cit ; P. 183
5. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P. 165
6. op cit; P. 180
7. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P. 170
8. op cit; P. 180
9. Zaboor-i-Ajam; P. 174
10. op cit; P. 181
11. Javid Nama; P. 152
12. op cit; P. 182
13. Javid Nama; P. 153
14. op cit; P. 182
15. Javid Nama; P. 19
16. op cit; P. 182: Please note that Dr. Mohammad Riaz has overlooked the first couplet, out of Iqbal's translation: We, therefore, have taken its translation from the last page of the seventh lecture, 'Is Religion Possible', in 'The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam'; P.157, Published by Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore, 1996.

    زندہ ای یا مردہ ای یا جاں بلب

    Iqbal has excluded the following couplet in his translation of this extract:

    مرد مومن در نسازد با صفات

    مصطفیٰ راضی نشد الا بذات
17. Payam-i-Mashriq ; P. 167
18. op cit ; P. 183
19. Included in Syed Abdul Vahid's Collection, 'Thoughts and Reflections of Iqbal', Published by S. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore, 1964; PP. 110-5
20. Ibid ; PP. 116-27
21. op cit ; P. 157

JOURNALS

(i) Iqbal Review (The Journal of Iqbal Academy)
(ii) Iqbal (The Journal of Bazm-i-Iqbal)

JOURNALS

In this section, we are going to have introductions, with brief critical judgements, of the translations appearing in two leading journals in Iqbal studies:

1- Iqbal Review: The quarterly of Iqbal Academy, Lahore.

2- Iqbal: The quarterly of Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore.

However, here we are not including the translations, which were published in journals, but were subsequently published in book forms, since we have already discussed them in our preceding chapters. Moreover, instead of considering them author-wise or in chronological order, we deem it more convenient to analyse them under the titles of Iqbal's books. This approach has been preferred in order to facilitate further research work on separate books:

Bang-i-Dara

1- A translation of 'Eik Sham' was made by A.D. Azhar,*[1] under the title of 'An Evening --- On the Banks of the Neckar'. It is a quite simple and word for word prose translation, void of any mistake.

2- A ghazal 'کبھی اے حقیقتِ منتظر، نظر آ لباسِ مجاز میں' was translated by Amin Khorasanee, under the title of 'A Ghazal Of Iqbal'.*[2] This excellent poetic translation has been made in iambic pentameter, with a rhyming scheme of *abab*. The poetic rhythm and the semantic precision both are at their climax in this translation. Let us see an example:

کبھی اے حقیقتِ منتظر، نظر آ لباسِ مجاز میں
کہ ہزاروں سجدے تڑپ رہے ہیں مری جبینِ نیاز میں [3*]

O! Long-awaited Truth for once express
Thyself in golden garb of Shape and Form
For at my brow, that it Thy Feet may press,
A thousand fealties have stirred a storm.*4

3- Three poems of this book have been translated by Dr. Mustansir Mir:*5

(i) The Poet (Shair)
(ii) The Night and the Poet (Rat aur Shair)
(iii) Muslim

These translations are in a simple and clear prose style. The translator first gives a comprehensive introduction to the poems and, then, translates them. His utmost effort is to make the readers understand the text, e.g.:

مبتلائے درد کوئی عضو ہو، روتی ہے آنکھ
کس قدر ہمدرد سارے جسم کی ہوتی ہے آنکھ 6*

If but one limb should suffer from pain,
The eye sheds tears:
How caring, how solicitous
Is the eye for the entire body! *7

4- Five poems of 'Bang-i-Dara' have been translated by Rajindhar Singh Verma:

(i) New Shrine (Naya Shivala)
(ii) India's National Anthem (Tarana-i-Hindi)
(iii) Anthem of Indian Children (Hindustani Bachoon Ka Geet)
(iv) Quintessence of Beauty (Haqiqat-i-Husn)
(v) Nanak*8

These are poetic translations. The translator seems to be dexterous in the art of versification. He creates beautiful

rhythmic patterns through combinations of dactylic and iambic metres. His rhythmic schemes in these poems are as under:

(i) New Shrine: dactylic+iambic+iambic (3 feet)
(ii) India's National Anthem: dactylic+iambic/dactylic+ iambic (4 feet)
(iii) Anthem of Indian Children: dactylic+iambic (2 feet)
(iv) Quintessence of Beauty: dactylic+iambic (2 feet)
(v) Nanak: Iambic pentameter (5 feet)

The chief quality of this translator is that he knows how to balance the art and the meaning. In his artistic radiance, he has successfully conveyed the correct meanings of Iqbal, e.g.:

خدا سے حُسن نے اک روز یہ سوال کیا
جہاں میں کیوں نہ مجھے تو نے لازوال کیا *9

One day beauty asked
Maker of the world,
"Why didn't You, Lord!
Make me Immortal?" *10

Even a child can feel the rhythmic throb as well as the simplicity and lucidity of expression in these lines. Verma's most of the translations are of the same nature. He deserves a special appreciation.

Bal-i-Jibril

1- An Italian Iqbalist, A. Baussani, has written an invaluable article, in the Italian language, in which he has compiled all the poems out of Iqbal's poetical works, wherein Satan is a major theme. This article was translated by R.A. Butler from Italian into English.*11 Out of twelve

poems in total, two have been selected from 'Bal-i-Jibril':

(i) Dialogue Between Jibril and Satan

(ii) Satan's Petition

Although, this work is the translation of a translation, i.e., twice removed from the original, yet, R.A. Butler is very careful, and his translations are correct and clear. He has adopted a dramatic style and combined prose with poetry as suits the situation. Here is a specimen of his rendering:

جمہور کے ابلیس ہیں اربابِ سیاست
باقی نہیں اب میری ضرورت تہِ افلاک [12*]

For fiends its rulers serve the populace:
Beneath the heavens is no more need of me.[*13]

2- Amin Khorasanee has also translated a ghazal (No. 7 – Part II) of 'Bal-i-Jibril'.[*14] It is another masterpiece of him. Composed in iambic pentameter, with a rhyme scheme of ***abab***, it is immensely mellifluous piece of poetry, e.g.:

پھر چراغِ لالہ سے روشن ہوئے کوہ و دمن
مجھ کو پھر نغموں پہ اکسانے لگا مرغِ چمن [15*]

The hills and foothills are illumined by
The lamps of tulip once again; the bird
Within the garden bids me cease to sigh,
Lures me to sing again and thus be heard.[*16]

The same ghazal has been translated by Dr. M. Yusuf Abbasi, under the caption of 'The Poppy Lamps', in free verse.[*17] Here is his translation of the above couplet:

The poppies lit their lamps,
On the desert brow;

Minstrels of the air,
In their plumage fair,
Burst into song,
And so stir my heart,
That I like to take part,
In their musical throng.*[18]

It is a nice translation in modern poetic style, however, Amin Khorasanee's rendering is more convincing due to its artistic mastery.

3- Q.A. Kabir has translated the first ghazal of the Part II of 'Bal-i-Jibril'.*[19] This translator suffers from two major problems:

(i) He poses to be a poet, whereas he is not.
(ii) He badly needs an orientation in the English language.

We have discussed him in detail while commenting upon his translation of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz'.

4- An excellent poetic translation of 'Saki Nama', under the same name, has been offered by M. Hadi Hussain.*[20] It is in blank verse, and its rhythm and diction both reveal the learned translator's dexterity in prosody and lexis. The greatest quality of this translation is that from the beginning to end, it seems to be original rather than a translation. Let us, for example, read the rendering of the first two couplets:

Spring's caravan has pitched its tent
At the foot of the mountain, making it
Look like the fabled garden of Iram
With a riot of flowers --- iris, rose,
Narcissus, lily, eglantine,

And tulip in its martyr's gory shroud.*21

This translation virtually deserves a republication.

5- Three ghazals of 'Bal-i-Jibril' have also been translated by Rajindhar Singh Verma:*22

(i) Ghazal No. 10 Part I
(ii) Ghazal No. 11 Part I
(iii) Ghazal No. 40 Part II

All the three ghazals are in highly resonant rhythmic patterns:

(i) Dactylic+iambic+iambic (3 feet)
(ii) Dactylic+iambic (2 feet)
(iii) Dactylic+iambic+iambic (3 feet)

The translations are semantically careful and correct as those of 'Bang-i-Dara'. R.S. Verma has also translated seven quatrains of 'Bal-i-Jibril'.*23 These translations are in iambic pentameter, like those of Arberry in his 'The Tulip of Sinai', and fluent and easy to grasp.

Zarb-i-Kalim

1- R.A. Butler's above-mentioned translations also contain two poems from 'Zarb-i-Kalim':*24

(i) Fate (Taqdeer).
(ii) Satan's Order to his Political Offspring (Shaitan Ka Farman Apney Siyasi Farzandoon Ke Nam).

Being a continuum of the poems of 'Bal-i-Jibril', these translations share the same characteristics.

2- R.S. Verma's translations of three poems of 'Zarb-i-Kalim' are also included in the same journal:*25

(i) Beloved Guest (Mehman-i-Aziz)
(ii) India's Artists (Hunarwaran-i-Hind)
(iii) Censure (Gilah)

The rhythmic scheme of these poems is as follows:

(i) Beloved Guest: dactylic+iambic+iambic (3 feet)
(ii) India's Artists: dactylic+iambic (2 feet)
(iii) Censure: dactylic+iambic (2 feet)

Verma's translations are musical, simple and appealing. Let us have a feeling of these qualities through his translation of 'Mehman-i-Aziz':

پُر ہے افکار سے ان مدرسہ والوں کا ضمیر
خوب و ناخوب کی اس دور میں ہے کس کو تمیز
چاہیے خانۂ دل کی کوئی منزل خالی
شاید آ جائے کہیں سے کوئی مہمان عزیز 26*

Minds of the school-bred people are
Meeting place of medley thoughts.
What is good and what is bad
Who can tell in our age?
Better keep unoccupied
One storey of heart's abode
May be some beloved guest
Poure into it from somewhere.*27

Verma is, perhaps, the simplest and clearest of all the poet-translators of Iqbal.

Armaghan-i-Hijaz

1- Three poems of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' have been included in the aforesaid collection translated by R.A. Butler:*28

(i) Satan Earthy and Satan Fiery (Iblis-i-Khaki-o-Iblis-i-Nari)
(ii) Say unto Iblis (Bago Iblis Ra)

(iii) Satan's Parliament (Iblis Ki Majlis-i-Shoora)

The first two poems are actually six and eight quatrains respectively, which the translator has changed into regular poems, by translating them into blank verse. 'Satan's Parliament' is an oft-translated poem. Its original form has been retained by the translator. The quality and the style is the same as that of the previous poems.

M. Hadi Hussain has also translated this poem, under the title of 'Satan's Advisory Council',*29 but, unlike Hadi's usual practice, it is in simple prose, like that of M. Ashraf in 'Thus Conferred Satan'. Butler's translation seems more attractive due to its poetic impact.

2- Three parts of 'Armaghan-i-Hijaz' have been translated by Khawaja Nizam-ud-Din:

(i) The Poetic Note-Book of Mullazade Zaigham of Laulab.*30

(ii) For the Companions of the Way.*31

(iii) To God.*32

These translations are in simple prose. The translator has managed to give a line for line rendering. It is a nice effort for common readers.

It is a demand of justice to mention here that B.A. Dar got K. Nizamuddin's translation, 'For the Companions of the Way', published in his own name just two years after its publication.*33 The same treatment has been meted out to K. Nizamuddin's 'To God', which has been published by B.A. Dar in his book 'Articles on Iqbal', in his own name.*34

K. Nizamuddin's third translation 'The Poetic Note-Book of Mullazade Zaigham of Laulab' has also been published in the same book, in B.A. Dar's name.*35 Thus, all

the three translations of K. Nizamuddin have been plagiarized by B.A. Dar.

Asrar-i-Khudi

M. Hadi Hussain has also translated 'Prologue' to 'Asrar-i-Khudi' in his peculiar and impressive poetic style of free verse.*36 In the same style he subsequently translated 'Saki Nama'. In this translation, he beautifully combines shorter lines with longer ones to create an intrinsic rhythm, which is regarded as a major quality of the modern poetry. His art is in utmost harmony with the meanings. Let us see these lines, wherein he exquisitely conveys his sense:

ساقیا بر خیز و مے در جام کن   محو از دل کاوشِ ایام کن
شعلۂ آبے کہ اصلش زمزم است   گر گدا باشد پرستارش جم است 37*

Come, Saqi, fill my cup with wine;
Make me forget all griefs of mine.
Give me that liquid fire, as pure
As Zam Zam's water, which for sure
Can make mere beggars feel like kings.*38

Payam-i-Mashriq

1- In R.A. Butler's collection, the poem 'Taskheer-i-Fitrat' has been included, under the title of 'The Conquest of Nature'.*39 The writer has given first priority to this poem, since it, in itself, is a complete dramatic poem. The style of this poem is more akin to that of 'Satan's Parliament'.

2- Three poems of 'Payam-i-Mashriq' have been translated by Dr. Mustansir Mir:

(i) (a) Solitude (Tanhai)
    (b) The Houri and the Poet (Hoor-o-Shair) *40

(ii) Sages (Hukama) [*41]

Dr. Mustansir, first of all, gives a comprehensive introduction to the poem and, then, translates it into the free verse. His translations are fluent and simple, e.g.:

بنوائے آفریدی چہ جہانِ دلکشائے
کہ ارم بہ چشمم آید چو طلسم سیمیائی! [42*]

With your song you have created
Such a lovely world
That Paradise itself, it seems to me,
Is but a work of magic.[*43]

The poem 'Tanhai' has also been translated by K.A. Rashid in prose,[*44] but, Dr. Mustansir's translation is far better in its form and contents.

3- Rajindhar Singh Verma has translated two poems out of 'Payam-i-Mashriq':[*45]

(i) Houri and Poet
(ii) Chorus of The Stars

Verma's translation of 'Hoor-o-Shair' is poetically more skilled, hence preferable. It is in uniform style of iambic pentameter. In diction, both the translations seem to be equal. As a comparative glance, let us see Verma's translation of the above couplet:

From your tune has sprung such a pleasing world,
That heaven appears to me silvered spell.[*46]

The 'Chorus of Stars' is a poem in which each line has three feet (dactyl + 2 iambs). It is an elegant piece of melody and careful rendering. Here is the translation of the second stanza of the poem:

Parade of beloved ones.
Exhibition of images.
War of being, and non-being
Strain and stress of human life
Slow passing and rush of time
We watch all this and go on.*47

Q.A. Kabir has also translated this poem in his same pseudo-poetic style.*48 Let us see his translation of the above stanza:

To scene of plays, to fane of craze,
To being and naught's battle arrays.
To man's efforts for existence,
To wide world's fast and slow sequence.
To course of events in that sense,
We watch and move in tempos hence.*49

His inability to express the meanings in suitable words is quite evident.

4- A philosophical poem, 'Nawa-i-Waqt', has been translated by Mian Muhammad Sharif.*50 It is a quite clear prose translation by a competent Iqbalist, who himself was a philosopher, and well conscious of the philosophic delicacies incorporated by Iqbal, in this poem, about his philosophy of time. Perhaps, the most confusing hemistich in this poem is the second one of the first couplet:

در من نگری، ہیچم، در خود نگری جانم *51

M. Sharif beautifully clarifies the sense of this complex line:

If thou looketh within me, I am nothing; if
looketh thou within thyself, I am life itself.*52

Zaboor-i-Ajam

A ghazal of 'Zaboor-i-Ajam' has been translated by S.M. Owais.*53 The first couplet of the ghazal is:

خضرِ وقت از خلوتِ دشتِ حجاز آید بروں

کارواں زیں وادیٔ دور و دراز آید بروں *54

S.M. Owais has translated this ghazal of five couplets in five stanzas, in blank verse. He seems to be well acquainted with prosody, and his translation is literally correct and convincing. Let us see his rendering of the first couplet written above:

Oh, Hark! The Guide of Age is up and risen
From cloistered waste of Desert Araby!
And now from that far-off lonely wild Vale,
The Caravan starts and hastens, marches on!*55

Javid Nama

Four poems of 'Javid Nama' are there in the collection translated by R.A. Butler: *56

(i) Ahriman Tests Zoroaster (Azmaish Kardan Ahriman Zartasht Ra)
(ii) The Song of Baal (Naghma-i-Ba'al)
(iii) Satan's apparition in the Firmament of Jupiter (Namudar Shudan Khawaja-i-Ahl-i-Firaq Iblis)
(iv) The Wail of Satan (Nala-i-Iblis)

All these poems are in blank verse, and manifest the translator's prolific mind.

For our own convenience, we have seen these translations by dividing them into the books from which they have originally been taken. However, it is more convenient to read them in the cumulative form, as arranged

by the writer of the article. In this condition, these translations can make a small book on the model of Milton's 'Paradise Lost' and will also help in getting a panoramic view of Iqbal's ideas concerning Satan.

NOTES & REFERENCE

1. Iqbal Review; April 1962; P. 47
2. Ibid; April 1968; P. 66
3. Bang-i-Dara; P. 280
4. op cit; P. 66
5. Iqbal Review:
   (i) The Poet; The Night and the Poet; April 1995; PP. 29-30
   (ii) Muslim; October 1995; PP. 78-80
6. Bang-i-Dara; P. 61
7. op cit; P. 29
8. Iqbal:
   (i) New Shrine; India's National Anthem; Anthem of Indian Children; Quintessence of Beauty; January/April 1990; PP. 14, 17, 23 and 24-25
   (ii) Nanak; October 1991/January 1992; P. 43
9. Bang-i-Dara; P. 112
10. op cit; P. 24
11. Iqbal Review (Karachi); October 1968;PP.68-118
12. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 162
13. op cit; P. 78
14. Iqbal Review; April 1969; P. 66
15. Bal-i-Jibril; P. 30
16. op cit; P.66
17. Iqbal Review; January 1978; P.221
18. Ibid
19. Ibid; P.215
20. Iqbal Review; April 1980; PP. 69-75
21. Ibid; P. 69

22. Iqbal; April 1990; PP.17-22
23. op cit; PP. 9-11
24. op cit; PP. 46 and 146
25. Iqbal; January/April 1990; PP.11-13
26. Zarb-i-Kalim; P. 81
27. op cit; P. 11
28. op cit; PP. 79-85
29. Iqbal Review; October 1979; PP. 95-100
30. Iqbal; January 1975; PP. 71-78
31. Iqbal Review; April 1976; PP. 57-65
32. Iqbal; January 1977; PP. 77-88
33. Ibid; July 1978; PP. 63-72
34. Articles on Iqbal; PP. 211-217
35. Ibid; PP. 229-36
36. Iqbal Review; October 1973; PP. 1-8
37. Asrar-i-Khudi; P. 8
38. op cit; P. 4
39. op cit; PP. 69-72
40. Iqbal Review; April 1995; PP. 25-6 and 31-2
41. Iqbal Review; October 1995; P. 71
42. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 127
43. op cit; P. 31
44. Iqbal Review; April 1967; P. 22
45. Iqbal; October 1991/January 1992; PP. 37-42
46. Ibid; P. 37
47. Ibid; P. 39
48. Iqbal; October 1977; PP. 125-8
49. Ibid; P. 126
50. Iqbal; January 1965; P. 59
51. Payam-i-Mashriq; P. 89
52. op cit; P. 59
53. Iqbal Review; October 1975; PP. 61-2
54. Zaboor-i-Ajam; ghazal No. 12, Part II; P. 73
55. op cit; P. 61
56. op cit; PP. 72-6

NEWSPAPERS

(i) The Dawn
(ii) The News
(iii) The Pakistan Times

THE TRANSLATIONS PUBLISHED IN THE NEWSPAPERS

In our survey of the English dailies, it has been observed that our editors are least interested in publishing the English translations of Iqbal's complete poems. Very often, they publish fragments or single couplets, mostly as decorative pieces, without even mentioning the translator's name. The articles published by them are usually interspersed with the translations of the referential couplets. A few translations, which we have, so far, been able to trace, are mostly the ones, which have, subsequently, been published in book forms. Here is a glimpse of them:

Bang-i-Dara

1- Altaf Husain's famous translation of 'Jawab-i-Shikwah' was published in 'The Dawn', April 21, 1948, under the caption of 'The Message of Iqbal'. The next year, both 'Shikwah' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwah' were published on the same date (Iqbal Day), in the same daily, under the title of 'The Complaint and the Answer'.*1

2- Twenty four couplets of 'Shikwah' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwah'(12 couplets each) were published in ' The Pakistan Times', November 9, 1988, but, the translator's name has not been given. These translations are very simple, and have been published at eight different places in this newspaper, as separate stanzas, as decorative pieces.

3- A translation, 'The Two Stars', by Mumtaz Hasan appeared in 'The Dawn', April 21, 1968. It is a verse

translation, in which Mumtaz Hasan's poetic talent is nicely reflected.

4- The third stanza of 'Tulu-i-Islam' (8 couplets) was published in 'The Pakistan Times', April 20, 1975, translated by S. Rahmatullah. It is a single prose extract, published, perhaps, only for encouragement.

5- A.Q. Niaz's translation of 'Khizr-i-Rah', twice published in book forms previously, under the titles 'The Guide' and 'Iqbal's Superman' (along with other poems), was again published in 'The News', April 21,1994, under a new title, 'The Muslim World'.*2

Bal-i-Jibril

1- An anonymous translation of the seventh (second last) stanza of 'Masjid-i-Qortoba' was published in 'The Pakistan Times', May 1, 1947, under the title of 'Lines from Iqbal'. It is a clear and simple prose translation.

2- A translation of 30 couplets (verse-paragraphs 3&4) of 'Saqi Nama' was published in 'The Pakistan Times', April 21, 1948, under the title of 'To The Saqi'. The translator, M.D. Taseer, has tried, in this translation, to produce a poetic rendering, but, unluckily, he could gather only rhymes; no rhythm is there. His language, however, is fine and precise.

3- A poem, 'A Mullah and Heaven', translated by V.G. Kiernan, was published in 'The Pakistan Times', April 21, 1948. This poem was taken from his 'Poems from Iqbal' (1947).

4- A translation of K.G. Saiyidain, 'God's Command to the Angels', was published in 'The Pakistan Times', May 21, 1951. It is a lucid and fluent prose translation.

5- In 'The Dawn', April 21, 1949, two translations by Ahmed Ali were published:

(i) And Other Worlds Beyond (ghazal No. 4)

(ii) Quatrains (4 rubaiyat)

These two translations are in verse, and artistically valid, with literariness alike.

Romooz-i-Bekhudi

A.J. Arberry's three translations of the selected extracts from 'Romooz-i-Bekhudi' appeared in 'The Pakistan Times':

(i) Freedom of Man; April 21, 1950

(ii) Ride Down the Wind; April 21, 1956

(iii) The Age of Tumults; April 21, 1956

The first of these translations, i.e., 'Freedom of Man', was published before the completion of 'The Mysteries of Selflessness' in 1953. The remaining two have been taken out of 'The Mysteries of Selflessness'.*3

Although the survey of the newspapers was not a part of our synopsis, yet, in order to have a panoramic surview of the English translations of Iqbal's verse, we have collected some material from the leading dailies of Pakistan. It is just an overview, not an evaluation in its true sense. However, more or less, it can be of some help for the researchers to come.

NOTES & REFERENCES

1. We have discussed this translation in detail in the Part One, under the translations of 'Bang-i-Dara'.

2. We have discussed this translation in the Part Three, under 'Miscellaneous English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry'.
3. We have discussed 'The Mysteries of Selflessness' in detail in the Part Two of this thesis, under 'The English Translations of Iqbal's Persian Poetry'.

PART FOUR

CONCLUSIONS

SUMMARY OF THE RESEARCH

In this research, we have introduced and evaluated the English translations of Iqbal's poetical works, included in his "Kulliyat" (Urdu and Persian). This research project covers nearly the span of complete twentieth century, from 1901 to 1999. Given below is a summary of what we have been able to find out during the course of this research.

We have thoroughly studied 105 translations as primary sources (55 books, 39 journals and 11 newspapers). Out of them, 16 translations are those of complete books, and the other 89 are either those of the parts of books, or of miscellaneous poems. We have given the details of these translations in the beginning of, initially, every part, and, then, for every book separately.

We have analysed the translations of 52 translators. There are two distinct categories of these translators:

a- poet-translators 28
b- prose-translators 24

a- Poet-Translators

The poet-translators of Iqbal can be further divided into two main groups:

1- real poets
2- quasi-poets

1- There are 17 translators, who are either inborn poets, or accomplished poets, having complete command over the English prosody:

(i) Abbas Ali Jaffery
(ii) Altaf Husain
(iii) Akbar Ali Shah
(iv) A.J. Arberry
(v) Hadi Hussain
(vi) Hassan Din
(vii) V.G. Kiernan
(viii) Mahmud Ahmad
(ix) Nawab Mahmood Ali Tyro
(x) R.A. Nicholson
(xi) H.T. Sorley
(xii) K.N. Sud
(xiii) Amin Khorasanee
(xiv) R.A. Butler
(xv) S.M. Owais
(xvi) Rajindhar Singh Verma
(xvii) Ahmed Ali

Out of these 17 translators, the orientalists are, no doubt, the leading ones; they are:

(i) A.J. Arberry
(ii) R.A. Nicholson
(iii) H.T. Sorley
(iv) R.A. Butler
(v) V.G. Kiernan

These orientalists have got a complete command over the English language. Arberry is much ahead of them, both in the quantity and quality of translation. He has an edge upon V.G. Kiernan, because he has translated two complete books of Iqbal, whereas Kiernan, despite his poetic excellence, could not go to this extent. Out of

the occidentalists, the following 8 translators deserve preference over the others because of their poetic nature, command of the English prosody and accuracy in translation:

(i) Abbas Ali Jaffery
(ii) Altaf Husain
(iii) Akbar Ali Shah
(iv) M. Hadi Hussain
(v) Sheikh Mahmud Ali
(vi) Nawab Mahmood Ali Tyro
(vii) Rajindhar Singh Verma
(viii) Hassan Din

Hadi Hussain seems to be more poetic than the other seven. R.S. Verma, however, looks more acquainted with the modern poetic flux of thought. Nawab Mahmood Ali Tyro's rendering of 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' is in classical style; yet it is highly invaluable. Three translators, Ahmed Ali, Amin Khorasanee and S.M. Owais are nice poets, but, they could produce the translations of only 2,1,2 shorter poems/verses respectively. If they could have chance, they would have produced excellent pieces of translation.

K.N. Sud is a poet, and nothing else. As a translator of Iqbal, he is a distortionist, as in his 32 translations, made in free verse, he leaves 11 verses as incomplete. He keeps the source book of his translation in dark, and changes the ghazals into poems by self-coined headings. He also abridges the poems and, in some cases, changes one poem into two or more. His work is replete with interpolations as well. Thus, his

translation cannot be regarded as a reliable one.

2- There are 11 translators, who have devalued their own effort, by trying to become a poet, without being a poet. They gather rhymes and, then, place them at the end of their prose lines. Such translators include:

(i) S.G. Abbas
(ii) Q.A. Kabir
(iii) M.A.K. Khalil
(iv) Khushwant Singh
(v) Maqbool Elahi
(vi) Naim Siddiqui
(vii) Sadiq Khan Satti
(viii) Sultan Zahur Akhtar
(ix) Khwaja Tariq Mahmood
(x) Yaqub Mirza
(xi) Suleman Zubair

Out of these 11 quasi-poet translators, S.G. Abbas, M.A.K. Khalil, Khushwant Singh, Maqbool Elahi, Sultan Zahur Akhtar, Khwaja Tariq Mahmood and Yaqub Mirza seem to be well equipped with sublime language, but, unfortunately, lose themselves in the labyrinths of the art of poetry. They are sincere in their task, but have been misdirected by their own ambition to be a poet

The remaining four quasi-poets are too non-serious to be spared:

(i) Q.A. Kabir translates into English, without knowing English. He badly needs an orientation in this language.

(ii) Naim Siddiqui leaves out 27 poems, 8 ghazals, 2 quatrains and 105 miscellaneous couplets of 'Bal-i-Jibril' untranslated. Even then, there is a media impression that it is a complete translation of this book. He defaces the entire book, by changing the order of its contents, omitting important parts and numbering it in his own way.

(iii) Sadiq Khan Satti has, firstly, committed the same mistake as did Naim Siddiqui, i.e., defacing the book. Secondly, and more pitiably, he has to say something else, under the guise of 'Bang-i-Dara'. This book throws more light on the translator's own life than the message of Iqbal.

(iv) Suleman Zubair is translating 'Shikwa' and 'Jawab-i-Shikwa' without knowing Urdu. The deluge of grammatical, orthographic and semantic blunders speaks of the translator's utter non-seriousness.

It is a fact that the translations of all these quasi-poets are sub-standard, but, these four translations demand an immediate notice, as they are injurious not only to Iqbal and his lovers, but also to the printers and the publishers.

b- <u>Prose Translators</u>

There are 24 translators, who have produced their translations in prose.

(i) Abdul Haleem
(ii) Anis Nagi
(iii) B.A. Dar
(iv) S.K.E. Haider

(v) Jamil Naqvi
(vi) Mumtaz Hasan
(vii) D.J. Matthews
(viii) Muhammad Ashraf
(ix) A.Q. Niaz
(x) R.A. Nicholson
(xi) Nusrat Baqa
(xii) Saleem Gilani
(xiii) A.R. Tariq
(xiv) Zulfiqar Ali Khan
(xv) A.D. Azhar
(xvi) K.A. Rashid
(xvii) Khawaja Nizamuddin
(xviii) Dr. Mustansir Mir
(xix) K. Badar
(xx) M. Sharif
(xxi) Rahmatullah
(xxii) Saeed Ahmad Durrani
(xxiii) A.J. Arberry
(xxiv) K.G. Saiyidain

Out of these translators, B.A. Dar, Jamil Naqvi, A.Q. Niaz, R.A. Nicholson, A.R. Tariq and A.J. Arberry are most important, as they have produced the translations of complete books. Most of these translations are valuable, notwithstanding some semantic flaws indicated by us in the discussions on them.

The translations of Mumtaz Hasan, D.J. Matthews, Khawaja Nizamuddin and Dr. Mustansir Mir are very useful due to their clarity and simplicity.

All other translations are of average level, having

nothing in special. However, there are three exceptions, which require an immediate attention:

(i) Anis Nagi, a distortionist in his mode of translation, has used two highly obnoxious words for Iqbal in his book --- 'voyeur' and 'maverick'.

(ii) B.A. Dar has plagiarized three poems of K. Nizamuddin and one that of K. Badar, and has got them published in his own name.

(iii) The authorship of K.G. Saiyidain's translations, compiled by Shayesta Khan, is suspicious, as we have located 8 extracts of Nicholson's 'The Secrets of the Self' included in this collection as Saiyidain's translations.

After an epitomised survey of the translators, let us now have a gist of the strengths and weaknesses of the translations. We can see them under two heads:

a- Areas of Achievement
b- Problematic Areas

a- Areas of Achievement

There are some areas, in which the translators have been more successful in grasping and conveying Iqbal's sense:

1-Most of the translators are more successful in the translations of the poems concerned with the phenomenal world. The impact of the romantic poets of English is quite evident in these translations. The poems on literary topics have also been translated more successfully.

2- R.A. Nicholson is quite expert in philosophical

descriptions, whereas, A.J. Arberry and V.G. Kiernan's literariness is praise-worthy. In creativity and portrayal of imagery, Hadi Hussain seems to surpass all others. His 'Saki Nama' and 'The Book of Slaves' are the outstanding examples of his poetic genius.

3- The translators seem to be at ease while translating the quatrains. This is, perhaps, due to shortness of the text of these quatrains and singularity of thought.

4- The translations, for which some previous models are available, are more clear and refined, as A.R. Tariq's simplification of Nicholson's 'The Secrets of the Self', or A.A. Shah's following of A.J. Arberry's 'Persian Psalms'.

5- Some translators have made a nice effort to introduce some Urdu/Persian words into English, e.g.:

(i)	bulbul	(vi)	saqi
(ii)	caravan	(vii)	caravansarai
(iii)	qafila	(viii)	laskhar
(iv)	surma	(ix)	cadi
(v)	henna	(x)	mahmil

6- Sometimes the translators surpass, or equal the original. In Iqbal's case, there are five translators, whose works can be judged on this criterion:

(i)	A.J. Arberry:	Persian Psalms
(ii)	V.G. Kiernan:	Poems from Iqbal
(iii)	Hadi Hussain:	A Message from the East
(iv)	Akbar Ali Shah:	The Rod of Moses
(v)	Abbas Ali Jaffery:	The Moonbeams over the East

All these translators have created highly resonant poetic patterns. They really deserve appreciation for it.

b- The Problematic Areas

After a glance at the areas of achievement, let us now have a look into the root-causes of the errors committed by the translators. We can see these errors at three levels:

1- Intellectual level

2- Academic level

3- Linguistic level

1- Intellectual Level: Iqbal is a poet of a very high intellectual calibre. His vastness and depth of thought, sharpness of feeling and universality of images are shared by very few translators. Only Arberry, V.G. Kiernan, Shaikh Mahmud Ahmad and Hadi Hussain seem to be following his foot-prints. However, it is still a blank area, waiting for some ingenious figure to come.

2- Academic Level: Iqbal is a man of vast erudition. It is, therefore, a Herculean task to encompass his knowledge in translation. The translators have committed major mistakes in this area:

(i) Most of the translators have not been able to translate the actual Islamic terms precisely, e.g.:

Divine Essence	ذات (باری)	1-
beautific melody	اللہ ھو	2-
God is Great	لا موجود الا اللہ	3-
None is associated with Him	لا شریکَ لہٗ	4-

-5	نبوت	Prophecy
-6	خاتم	Seal
-7	سیدّالسادات	Chief of Chiefs, Leader of Leaders
-8	اُمّی	Illiterate Person
-9	ختم الرسل	Last Envoy
-10	صلوٰۃ و درود	song of bliss, ecstatic tune
-11	صلوٰۃ	Blessing on God
-12	دعوت آخر زماں	final message of time
-13	خیر الانام	the best Nation
-14	ام الکتاب	Archetype of the Book
-15	کعبہ، حرم	Shrine, Fane, Sanctuary
		Kirk, House of God
-16	حدیث	good words
-17	زکوٰۃ	almsgiving
-18	کلمہ	Creed, Sentence, God is one
-19	اذان	Call
-20	تکبیر	Call, Clarion Call
-21	عصر	noon
-22	ھو	an incentive, He the King
-23	قیام (نماز میں)	stay
-24	مہدی	Guide

antique	قدیم	-25
new	حادث	-26

Most of them are confused in the mystic terms, e.g.:

worldly affairs; mind; attitude	حال	-1
poverty, beggary	فقر	-2
droning psalm	قوالی	-3
mendicant, beggar	فقیر	-4
voyeur	صاحبِ نظر	-5
lust	فیض	-6
spaceless thought	بیچگون	-7
meditation	ذکر	-8
the world of men	امر و خلق	-9

(ii) At times, they are unclear in cultural terms, e.g.:

hymn	حدی	-1
April, May	فرودیں	-2
canal	ناودان	-3
pot	چھاج	-4
kettle	دیگ	-5
kettle	چھلنی	-6

(iii) Some translators get entangled in historical and geographical terms and names:

poet	صائب	-1
Solomon	قارون	-2
Kaisar	پرویز	-3
book of psalms	پاژند	-4
light	جیحوں	-5
Basra	بخارا	-6
Yemem	بدخشاں	-7
Zenith	طور	-8
Eden	اِرم	-9
brush	بہزاد	-10
Socrates	غزالی	-11
Plato	رازی	-12
Avecina	عطار	-13

(iv) Astrological terms have also been handled carelessly by some translators:

mars, stars	مُشتری	-1
galaxy	ثریا	-2
mercury	مریخ	-3

(v) An especially carelessly handled field is that of botanical terms:

hyacinth	نرگس	1-
cypress, red-beech, red-plane-tree	چنار	2-
cypress, oak	شمشاد	3-
pomegranate, poplar, cypress	ناروان	4-
fig	جو	5-
water-melon	خربوزہ	6-
mustard, straw	اسپند	7-
willow	طرخون	8-

(vi) A special area of weakness is that of the ornithological and zoological terms, e.g.:

dove	کبوتر	1-
dove	صعوہ	2-
hind, antelope, roe	غزال، آہو	3-
wolf	روباہ	4-
eagle	ہما	5-
wren	خفاش	6-
birds	چڑیاں	7-
nightingale	قمری	8-
sparrow	کبک	9-
quail	تدرو	10-

(vii) Likewise, another neglected aspect is that of stonology, e.g.:

diamond	لعل	-1
sapphire	عقیق	-2
aquamarine, emerald	یشم	-3

(3) Linguistic Level: At this level, a number of mistakes have been located in two areas:

(a) lexical mistakes

(b) grammatical mistakes

(a) In lexical mistakes we come across a number of misapprehensions:

(i) The words having the same spellings in Urdu and Persian, but different meanings:

Persian	Urdu		
again	falcon	باز	-1
a law	mirrors	آئینے	-2
pupil	people	مردم	-3
a small cloud	mica	ابرک	-4

or the confusing words in English spellings:

cord	cod	مچھلی	-1
scourge	rouge	غازہ	-2
canon	cannon	توپ	-3
lightening	lightning	برق	-4

(ii) Some translators have read some words incorrectly and, thus, have translated those words according to their incorrect reading, e.g.:

groom	ڈلہا	دلہا	1۔
Quran	قُرآن	قران	2۔
Sa'di	سعدی	سُعدیٰ	3۔
Salima	سلیمٰی	سلَیمٰی	4۔
Fazeel	فضیل	فُضَیل	5۔
rhythm	ترنم	ترے نم	6۔
Azar	آذر	آزر	7۔

(iii) Some translators guess the incorrect meanings:

(a) from the structures of the words, which turn out to be incorrect:

fishing tackle	خارماہی	1۔
animal's habitation	چشمۂ حیواں	2۔
sky	بیستوں	3۔
author	صاحبِ کتاب	4۔
heartache	دردمندی	5۔

(b) from the contextual clues:

motherland	مازنی	1۔
right hand	مِلکِ یمین	2۔

cup	تاک	-3
ubiquitous	ہرجائی	-4
cold eyed	زردچشماں	-5
fire	پروین	-6
carpet angels	فرشیاں	-7
throne angels	عرشیاں	-8

(b) linguistic mistakes have been located mostly in the use of:

(i) Verbs:

a) Single verbs:

Has sank, has shrank, forego, sharped, drived

b) Compound verbs:

(i)	برہم زدم	(v)	برفتد
(ii)	برخوانم	(vi)	دربر کشید
(iii)	کارمش	(vii)	برچید
(iv)	برآورد		

(ii) Prepositions, e.g.:

aspire to, know to, bemoaned of, bear from, wrapped with, compensate for, watered to, crave, heed, deprived from, engaged by, bestow to, bewail about, partake, let to, reach to, take to.

(iii) Definite article, e.g.:

The Siddiq, the Gabriel, the Abrams, the Egypt, the Farhad, the Farooq, the East

and West, the Adam, the God, the Islam.

(iv) Linking words:

A number of mistakes have also been located in the usage of linking words, e.g., and, although, if, at times, even though, until etc.

(v) Genders:

Some translators have used the masculine and feminine genders according to Urdu, e.g.:

a) He: for love (Ishq), star, sun etc.

b) She: for love (محبت), reason, moon etc.

The Strategies of the Translators

The translators have mostly adopted four strategies to overcome these problems:

1- Generalization: In the cases of the words about which they are unclear, or have no specific translation, they generalize them, as for 'کعبہ' they use the words 'Sanctuary' or 'Fane', and for 'زمزم' they use the phrase 'the Sacred Well'. This strategy is fallacious, as it removes the specificity of that particular term.

2- Improvisation: In some cases, the translators use some alternate word belonging to that particular category, e.g., 'wolf' for 'روباہ' and 'dove' for 'کبوتر', or 'galaxy' for 'ثریا' and 'diamond' for 'لعل'. Obviously, it is an evasive approach, indicative of the translator's lack of competence.

3- Evasion: At the stages, where they are completely unable to produce any suitable word for a

specific meaning, they try to slip pass, as in the case of the word 'زردے' (turmeric), avoided by Hadi Hussain and 'گلِ یک نالہ' (the flower of a lament), avoided by A.J. Arberry.

4- Copying: It has been observed that most of the translators go on copying the previous translators. In this blind following, a number of incorrect translations have been transferred from person to person, e.g.: 'چھلنی' (kettle), 'چھاج' (pot), 'روباہ' (wolf) etc.

Since we could not give the references to the above words, as it was a summary of the research, we have added two indices (separately for English and Urdu/Persian words) for immediate reference, at the end of this thesis.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It seems quite expedient, at the end, to make some recommendations in the light of our research:

1- In our 'Summary of the Research', we have pointed out the outstanding and serious translators. It is highly beneficial for the coming translators to keep their works in view, while doing their translation work.

2- Since no poetic or prose translation has been made of the complete poetical works of Iqbal, it is necessary that a team of scholars should be given this task, duly supported by the government to translate Iqbal into simple prose, for the English readers throughout the world. As far as his poetic rendering is concerned, it needs another Iqbal to do it.

3- The material on Iqbal in Urdu is being criticized and scrutinized from time to time, but unluckily, there is no check on the writers in English. It is for this reason that some very rough material has crept in. We have highlighted all this rubbish, yet, there are five books which must immediately be heeded to, and a committee of scholars should be deputed to adjudge the material presented therein:

(i) Allama Doctor Iqbal's 'Baang-e-Dara': M. Sadiq Khan Satti
(ii) Allama Muhammad Iqbal's Expostulation with the Almighty and Almighty's Censure: Suleman Zubair
(iii) Baal-i-Jibreel: Naim Siddiqui
(iv) Armaghan-i-Hijaz: Q. A. Kabir
(v) Poems of Iqbal: Anis Nagi

Our recommendation, in this respect, is that these books must be confiscated, and their further publication should be banned. (Please see our analysis of these books in the relevant pages)

4- The prestigious institutions, like Iqbal Academy, may please be advised to be careful in publishing particularly the English translations, without the approval of a high level committee of the scholars of the English language and literature.

5- We have made a cumulative study of the English translations of Iqbal's complete poetical works. It is, however, a highly demanding topic. For a further penetrative look, it is better to study the translations of every book separately. On the other hand, some translators deserve a separate study. Our priority list is:

(i) A.J. Arberry
(ii) M. Hadi Hussain
(iii) Akbar Ali Shah
(iv) V.G. Kiernan
(v) A.R. Tariq

6- B. A. Dar's plagiarism should be further probed in, and all of his plagiarized translations should be published, at least once, in the names of their actual authors.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. **Primary Sources:**
   (i) An Author-wise List of the English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry (Published in Separate Book Form).
   (ii) The English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry Published in the Journal "Iqbal Review" of Iqbal Academy Pakistan.
   (iii) The English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry Published in the Journal "Iqbal" of Bazm-i-Iqbal.
   (iv) The English Translations of Iqbal's Poetry Published in the Newspapers.

2. **Secondary Sources:**
   (i) Helping Material (English).
   (ii) Helping Material (Urdu and Persian).

I
PRIMARY SOURCES

AN AUTHOR-WISE LIST OF THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL's POETRY

(Published in Separate Book Form)

1- **Abbas Ali Jaffery, Syed:**
- The Moonbeams over the East: Royal Book Company, Karachi: 1996.

2- **Abbas, S.G.:**
- Dr. Muhammad Iqbal: The Humanist: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1997.

3- **Abdul Haleem, Muhammad:**
- The Mosque of Cordova: Iqbal Academy, Hyderabad: 1976.

4- **Akbar Ali Shah, Syed:**
- Gabriel's Wing: Modern Book Depot, Islamabad: 1979.
- The Rod of Moses: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1983.

5- **Altaf Husain:**
- The Complaint and the Answer: Orientalia, Lahore: 1954.

6- **Anis Nagi:**
- Poems of Iqbal: Jamaliyat Publications, Lahore: (date of publication not given)

7- **Arberry, A.J.:**

- Complaint and Answer: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1995.
- Javid Nama: George Allen & Unwin London: 1966.
- Persian Psalms: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1996.
- The Tulip of Sinai: The Royal Indian Society, London: 1947.
- The Mysteries of Selflessness: John Murray, London: 1953.

8- **Bashir Ahmad Dar:**

- Gulshan-i-Raz-i-Jadid and Bandagi Namah: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1996.
- Iqbal's Address to Javid: S.M. Mir, Karachi: 1971.
- What Should Then be Done O People of the East: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1977.
- Articles on Iqbal; Compiled by Shima Majeed: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1997

9- **Hadi Hussain, M.:**

- A Message from the East: Iqbal Academy Pakistan: 1977.
- The New Rose Garden of Mystery and the Book of Slaves: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1991.

10- **Hassan Din, Sheikh:**

- Pas Cheh Bayed Kard: Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore: 1988.

11- **Haider, S.K.E.:**

- Twelve Jewels of Iqbal: Nashaiman Publications Bihar Sharif: 1985.

12- **Iqbal, Allama:**
- Tear of Blood: Mufid-i-Am Press, Lahore: 1901.
- The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam; Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore:1996

13- **Jamil Naqvi:**
- The Traveller: Royal Book Company, Karachi P 1991.

14- **Kabir, Q.A.:**
- Armaghan-i-Hijaz: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1983.

15- **Khalil, M.A.K.:**
- Call of the Marching Bell: Tayyab Iqbal Printers, Royal Park, Lahore: 1997.

16- **Khushwant Singh:**
- Complaint and Answer: Oxford University Press, Delhi: 1981.

17- **Kiernan, V.G. :**
- Poems from Iqbal: John Murray, London: 1955.

18- **Mahmud Ahmad , Shaikh:**
- The Pilgrimage of Eternity: Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore: 1961.

19- **Mahmud Ali Khan, Nawab:**
- Shikwa and Jawab-i-Shikwa: Iqbal Academy, Hyderabad: (date of publication not given)

20- **Maqbool Elahi:**
- The Secrets of the Self: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1986.
- The Traveller: Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore: 1988.

21- **Matthews, D.J.:**

- Iqbal, A Selection of the Urdu Verse: Heritage Publishers, New Delhi: 1993.

22- **Muhammad Ashraf:**

- The Devil's Conference: Urdu House Booksellers, Gujrat (Pakistan): 1983.
- Thus Conferred Satan: The Book House, Lahore: 1977.

23- **Mumtaz Hassan:**

- Muhammad Iqbal --- Poet and Philosopher: Pak German Forum, Karachi: 1960.

24- **Naim Siddiqui:**

- Baal-i-Jibreel: Alhamra Publications, California: 1996.

25- **Niaz, A.Q.:**

- Iqbal's Superman: Ferozsons, Lahore: 1960.
- Javid Nama: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1984.
- Iqbal's Khizr-i-Rah: Friends in Council, Lahore: 1952.

26- **Nicholson, R.A.:**

- The Secrets of the Self: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1978.

27- **Nusrat Baqa:**

- Iqbal's Selected Urdu Verses: 33-Salisbury Avenue, Barking, (Essex) (date of publication not given).

28- **Riffat Hassan (Compiler):**

- The Sword and the Sceptre: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1977.

29- **Sadiq Khan Satti, M.:**

- Allama Doctor Iqbal's "Bang-e-Dara": Ferozsons Rawalpindi: 1984.

30- **Saiyidain, K.G.:**

- Iqbal's Poetry (Compiled by Dr. Shayesta Khan): Khuda Bakhsh Oriental Public Library, Patna (India): 1995.

31- **Saleem Ahmad Gilani:**

- The Mosque of Cordoba: Iqbal Academy, Lahore: 1995.

32- **Sud, K.N.:**

- Selections from Ghalib and Iqbal: Sterling Publishers Delhi: 1978.

33- **Suleman Zubair:**

- Allama Muhammad Iqbal's Expostulation with Almighty and Almighty's Censure; Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1997

34- **Tariq, A.R.:**

- Longer Poems of Iqbal: Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore: 1978.
- Rubayiat of Iqbal: Sh. Ghulam Ali & Sons, Lahore: 1973.
- Secrets of Collective Life: Islamic Book Service, Lahore: 1977.
- Secrets of Ego: Islamic Book Service, Lahore: 1977.

35- **Tariq & Aziz:**

- The Guide: Pan Islamic Publications, Lahore: 1965.
- The Renaissance of Islam: Pan Islamic Publications, Lahore: 1966.

36- **Tariq Mahmud, Khwaja:**

- Iqbal: Dhan Kahoon Publishers, Chakwal: 1996.

37- **Yaqub Mirza, M.:**

- A Selection and Translation of Iqbaliat: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1991.

38- **Zahur Akhter, Raja Sultan:**

- Shikwah, Jawab-i-Shikwah; Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1998

39- **Zulfiqar Ali Khan:**

- A Voice from the East: Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore: 1982.

II- THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL's POETRY PUBLISHED IN THE JOURNAL "IQBAL REVIEW" OF IQBAL ACADEMY PAKISTAN

1- **A. A. Shah:**

- Ghazals of Baal-i-Jibreel (6): April, 1975.

2- **A. A. Shah:**

- Two Ghazals of Baal-i-Jibreel: April, 1969.

3- **A. A. Shah:**

- Four Ghazals of Baal-i-Jibreel: October, 1969.

4- **A. A. Shah:**

- Thirteen Ghazals of Baal-i-Jibreel: October, 1970.

5- **A.D. Azhar:**

- An Evening -- on the Banks of The Neckar: April, 1962.

6- **Ameen Khorasanee:**

- A Ghazal of Baal-i-Jibreel: April, 1969.

7- **Ameen Khorasanee:**
- A Ghazal of Iqbal: April, 1968.

8- **Bashir Ahmad Dar:**
- Address to Javid: April, 1971.

9- **Butler, R.A.:**
- Satan in Iqbal's Philosophical and Poetical Works: April, 1968.

10- **Hadi Hussain:**
- The Book of Servitude: April, 1966.

11- **Hadi Hussain:**
- The Conquest of Nature: October, 1965.

12- **Hadi Hussain, M.:**
- Dedicatory Epistle: October, 1972.

13- **Hadi Hussain ;**
- Prologue to Iqbal's Asrar-i-Khudi: October, 1973.

14- **Hadi Hussain, M.:**
- Satan's Advisory Council: October, 1979.

15- **Hadi Hussain, M.:**
- Saki Nama: April, 1980.

16- **Kabir, Q.A.:**
- Frenzy's Drive: January, 1978.

17- **Kabir, Q.A.:**
- Quatrains in Armughan-i-Hijaz (15): October, 1975.

18- **Mumtaz Hassan:**
- An Evening: April, 1969.

19- **Muhammad Yusuf Abbasi, Dr.:**
- The Poppy Lamps: January, 1978.

20- **Muhammad Iqbal, Allama:**

- Iqbal's English Translations of His Own Persian Couplets: Compiled by Dr. Muhammad Riaz: April, 1986.

21- **Mustansir Mir, Dr.:**

Translation of the following four Poems:

- Solitude
- The Poet
- The Night and the Poet
- The Houri and the Poet: April, 1995.

22- **Mustansir Mir, Dr.:**

Translation of the following two Poems:

- The Sages
- Muslim: October, 1995.

23- **Nizam-ud-Din, Khawaja:**

- For the Companions of the Way: April, 1976.

24- **Nicholson, R.A.:**

- Iqbal's Message of the East.
- Everlasting Life.
- Life and Action.
- The Song of Time.
- The Song of Stars.
- Bergson's Message.
- (Other extracts also translated): October, 1972.

25- **Nicholson, R.A.:**

- The Song of Time: April, 1966.

26- **Owais, S.M.:**

- The Guide of the Age: October, 1975.
- Saki Nama: April, 1980.

27- **Rasheed, K.A.:**
- Solitude: April, 1967.

28- **Saeed Ahmad Durrani, Dr. :**
- Translations of selected extracts form Iqbal's Poetry: October, 1990.

III- THE ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF IQBAL's POETRY PUBLISHED IN THE JOURNAL "IQBAL" OF BAZM-i-IQBAL

1- **Abdul Kabir, Qazi:**
- Song of Stars: October, 1977.

2- **Badar, K. :**
- Bandagi Nama of Iqbal: January, 1964.

3- **Bashir Ahmad Dar:**
- For the Companions of the Way: July, 1978

4- **Bashir Ahmad Dar:**
- Reflections of Mihrab Gul Afghan: March, 1972.

5- **Ghulam-us-Saiyidain, Khawaja:**
- Some Selected Verses of Iqbal (Part-I): April, 1996

6- **Ghulam-us-Saiyidain, Khawaja:**
- Some Selected Verses of Iqbal (Part - II): July, 1996.

7- **Muhammad Sharif, Mian:**
- The Song of Time: January, 1965.

8- **Nizam-ud-Din, Khawaja:**
- The Poetic Note-Book of Mullazada Zaighum of Laulab: January, 1975.

9- **Nizam -ud-Din, Khawaja:**
   - To God: January, 1977.

10- **Rajindhar Singh Varma:**
   - Iqbal for Everyone: April, 1990.

11- **Rajindhar Singh Varma:**
   Translations of following Three Poems of Iqbal:
   - Houri and the Poet
   - Chorus of the Stars
   - Nanak: October, 1991 / January, 1992.

IV- THE NEWSPAPERS

1- **The Dawn:**
   - Altaf Hussain; Jawab-i-Shikwah; April 21, 1948
   - Altaf Hussain; Complaint and Answer; April 21,1949
   - Ahmed Ali:
     (i) And Other World Beyond; April 21,1949
     (ii) 4 Rubaiyat; April 21,1949
   - Mumtaz Hasan ; Two Stars; April 21,1968

2- **The News:**
   Niaz, A.Q; The Muslim World; April 21,1994

3- **The Pakistan Times:**
   - Anonymous: Lines from Iqbal(Mosque of Cordova); May 1.1947
   - Taseer, M.D.; To the Saqi ; April 21, 1948
   - Kiernan, V.G.; Mullah and Heaven ; April 21, 1948
   - Arberry, A.J.; Freedom of Man ; April 21, 1950

- Saiyidain, K.G.; God's Command to the Angels; May 21, 1951
- Arberry, A.J.:
    - (i) Ride Down the Wind; April 21, 1956
    - (ii) The Age of Tumults; April 21, 1956
- Rahmatullah, S; Iqbal's Message to Muslims; April 20, 1975
- Anonymous: Shikwah 12 couplets, Jawab-i-Shikwah 12 couplets; November 9, 1988.

2
SECONDARY SOURCES
I- HELPING MATERIAL (ENGLISH)

(a) Books Containing Miscellaneous Translations:

1- **Abdul Mughni, Dr:** Iqbal, The Poet: Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore: 1992.
2- **Abdul Vahid, Syed:** Iqbal, His Art and Thought: Oxford University Press, Lahore: 1969.
3- **Abdul Vahid, Syed:** Studies in Iqbal: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1986.
4- **Abul Hasan Ali Nadvi:** Glory of Iqbal: Haji Arfeen Academy, Nazimabad, Karachi; 1987.
5- **Arberry, A.J.:** Notes on Iqbal's Asrar-i-Khudi: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, Lahore: 1992.
6- **Muhammad Hamid:** Iqbal, Poet--Philosopher of Fifteenth Century Hijrah: Sang-e-Meel Publications, Lahore: 1400 H.

7- **Muhammad Iqbal, Prof:** The Poet's Vision and Magic of Words: Islamic Book Service: 1973.
8- **Nasira Habib (Editor):** Versatile Iqbal: Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore: 1985.
9- **Rafiq Zakaria:** Iqbal, The Poet and the Politician: Viking, New Delhi: 1993.
10- **Riffat Hassan:** An Iqbal Premier: Aziz Publishers, Lahore; 1979.
11- **Saeed Sheikh, M (Editor):** Studies in Iqbal's Thought and Art: Bazm-i-Iqbal, Lahore: 1987.
12- **Sharif-al-Mujahid:** Iqbal, The Poet-Philosopher of the East: Quaid-i-Azam Academy, Karachi: 1986.
13- **Sinha, Dr.S.:** Iqbal, The Poet and His Message: Ram Narain Lal Allahabad: 1947.

(b) Journals Containing Important Articles Concerning the Topic:

1- **Iqbal Review**: April, 1972
Abdul Vahid, Syed: "A. J. Arberry, A great student of Iqbal"
2- **Iqbal Review:** April, 1977.
An Auditorial Review on A. R. Tariq's Translations of "Asrar-e-Khudi": "Secrets Of Ego"
3- **Iqbal Review**: April, 1977.
Introduction: "A Message from the East"
4- **Iqbal:** July, 1972
Bashir Ahmad Dar: "Discussion"
5- **Iqbal Review**: April, 1975.
Reyazul Hasan: "Iqbal's Tulip of Sinai".

6- **Iqbal:** January, 1984.
Muhammad Riaz, Dr.: "Arberry and His Translations on Iqbal Works"

(c) Books on Language and Translations:

1- **Burton, S. H.:** Mastering English Language: Macmillan. London: 1986.
2- **Catford, J.C.:** Linguistic Theory of Translation: Oxford University Press, U.K.: 1965.
3- **Edited by Hossein Nasr, Syedd:** Philosophy, Literature and Fine Arts: King Abdul Aziz University, Jeddah: 1982.
4- **Fowler, H. W.:** Modern English Usage: Oxford University Press: 1977.
5- **Newmark, Peter:** Approaches to Translation: Pergamon Press, London: 1981.
6- **Pike.L, Kenneth:** Linguistic Concepts: University Nebraska Press, London: 1982.
7- **Quirk, Randolph & Greenbaum, Sidney:** A University Grammar of English: Longman, London: 1973.
8- **Reeves, James:** Understanding Poetry: Heinemamn, London: 1968.

(d) Dictionaries and Thesauruses:

1- **A Dictionary of Linguistics and Phonetics:** David Crystal Basil Black Well, Britain: 1987.
2- **A Dictionary of Literary Terms:** J. C. Cuddon: Penguin Books: 1992.

3- **A Dictionary of Literary Terms:** Martin Gray: Longman, U.K.: 1985.

4- **A Dictionary of Urdu, Classical Hindi and English**: (Compiled By J.T. Platts): Sang-i-Meel Publications, Urdu Bazar, Lahore: 1983.

5- **New Persian English Dictionary (In Two Volumes):** S. Haim: Farhang Moaser, Tehran: 1985.

6- **NTC's Dictionary of Grammar Terminology:** Spear, Richard A.: NTC Publishing Group, Illenois: 1998.

7- **Persian English Dictionary:** F. Steingass: Sang-i-Meel Publications, Lahore: 1981.

8- **Qaumi English Urdu Dictionary:** Dr. Jamil Jalibi: Muqtadara Qaumi Zuban, Islamabad: 1994.

9- **Roget's International Thesaurus:** Oxford University Press, New Delhi: Third Edition.

10- **The English-Persian Collegiate Dictionary (In Two Volumes)**: Abbas Aryanpur and Manoocheh Aryanpur: Amir Kabir Publication Organization, New Delhi: 1992.

11- **The Concise Oxford Dictionary:** Oxford University Press, New York: 1990.

12- **The Poet's Dictionary:** William Packard: Harper Collins Publishers, New York: 1989.

13- **Urdu English Dictionary:** Ferozsons Ltd.: Lahore, Karachi, Rawalpindi.

14- **Webster's Dictionary of Word Origins:** Merriam Webster: Smithmark, New York: 1997.

II-Helping Material (Urdu & Persian)

(a) Research Papers

۱۔ اقبال بانو : عبدالرحمن طارق بطورِ اقبال شناس : مقالہ برائے ایم اے اردو : پنجاب یونیورسٹی، لاہور : ۱۹۹۱ء

۲۔ شازیہ ظہیر خواجہ : کلامِ اقبال کے تراجم کا توضیحی اشاریہ : مقالہ برائے ایم اے اردو : پنجاب یونیورسٹی، لاہور : ۱۹۹۱ء

۳۔ شوکت حسین : اسرارِ خودی کے انگریزی تراجم کا تحقیقی مطالعہ : مقالہ برائے ایم۔ فل (اقبالیات) : علامہ اقبال اوپن یونیورسٹی اسلام آباد : ۱۹۹۶ء

۴۔ محمد حمید کھوکھر : پس چہ باید کرد اے اقوامِ شرق مع مسافر کے اردو اور انگریزی منثور و منظوم تراجم کا تحقیقی و توضیحی مطالعہ : مقالہ برائے ایم۔ فل (اقبالیات) علامہ اقبال اوپن یونیورسٹی اسلام آباد : ۱۹۹۳ء

۵۔ نوشین صباحت : کلامِ اقبال کے منظوم تراجم : مقالہ برائے ایم اے اردو پنجاب یونیورسٹی لاہور : ۱۹۸۲ء

۶۔ نوید کیانی، اے کیو : پیامِ مشرق کے اردو اور انگریزی تراجم کا تنقیدی مطالعہ : مقالہ برائے ایم۔ فل (اقبالیات) : علامہ اقبال اوپن یونیورسٹی اسلام آباد : ۱۹۹۴ء

(b) Helping Books (Iqbaliyat)

۱۔ احمد جاوید : تسہیل پیامِ مشرق : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۹۲ء

۲۔ اکبر حسین قریشی، ڈاکٹر : مطالعہء تلمیحات واشاراتِ اقبال : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۸۶ء

۳۔ حسن اختر، ملک : دائرہ معارف اقبال : مکتبہ عالیہ، لاہور : ۱۹۷۷ء

۴۔ حفیظ صدیقی، ابوالاعجاز : اوزانِ اقبال : شیخ غلام علی اینڈ سنز، لاہور : ۱۹۸۳ء

۵۔ حمید یزدانی، ڈاکٹر خواجہ : تسہیل پس چہ باید کرد مع مسافر : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۹۹ء

۶۔ حمید یزدانی، ڈاکٹر خواجہ : شرح اسرارِ خودی : بزمِ اقبال لاہور : ۱۹۹۷ء

۷۔ حمید یزدانی، ڈاکٹر خواجہ : مثنوی رموزِ بے خودی متن ولغت وترجمہ : مطبوعہ بزمِ اقبال، لاہور : ۱۹۹۹ء

۸۔ رفیع الدین ہاشمی، ڈاکٹر : کتابیات اقبال : مطبوعہ اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۷۷ء

۹۔ زمرد محمود و محمود الحسن : اقبالیات کا موضوعاتی تجزئی اشاریہ : علامہ اقبال اوپن یونیورسٹی، اسلام آباد : ۱۹۸۶ء

۱۰۔ طاہر شادانی و ضیاء محمد ضیاء : تسہیل ارمغانِ حجاز : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۹۷ء

۱۱۔ عبداللہ قریشی، محمد : مکاتیب اقبال بنامِ گرامی : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : طبع اول، ۱۹۶۹ء

۱۲۔ عبدالرشید، میاں : کلیاتِ اقبال فارسی مع سلیس اردو ترجمہ : جلد اول ودوم : مطبوعہ شیخ غلام اینڈ سنز لاہور : طبع اول : ۱۹۹۲ء

۱۳۔ غلام رسول مہر : مطالب : مطبوعہ شیخ غلام علی اینڈ سنز، لاہور

مطالب بانگِ درا : ۱۹۹۱ء

مطالب بالِ جبریل : ۱۹۹۱ء

مطالب ضربِ کلیم : ۱۹۹۲ء

مطالب اسرار ورموز : ۱۹۶۹ء

۱۴۔ قمر عباس : موضوع وار اشاریہ مضامین اقبال شناسی : مطبوعہ اقبال اکیڈمی، پاکستان : ۱۹۹۶ء

۱۵۔ محمد یونس حسرت : کلید اقبال : مطبوعہ اقبال اکیڈمی، لاہور : ۱۹۸۶ء

۱۶۔ معین الرحمٰن، ڈاکٹر سید : جامعات میں اقبال کا تحقیقی و تنقیدی مطالعہ : اقبال اکیڈمی، لاہور : ۱۹۷۷ء

۱۷۔ معین الرحمٰن، ڈاکٹر سید : جہان اقبال : اقبال اکادمی پاکستان، لاہور : ۱۹۷۷ء

۱۸۔ مقبول انور داؤدی : مطالب اقبال : مطبوعہ فیروز سنز، لاہور : ۱۹۷۴ء

۱۹۔ نسیم امروہوی : فرہنگ اقبال (اردو) : اظہار سنز، اردو بازار لاہور : ۱۹۸۴ء

۲۰۔ نسیم امروہوی : فرہنگ اقبال (فارسی) : مطبوعہ اظہار سنز، اردو بازار لاہور : ۱۹۸۹ء

۲۱۔ نسیم، ڈاکٹر الف۔ د۔ و غلام جیلانی، ڈاکٹر : کلیاتِ اقبال فارسی و اردو ترجمہ : مطبوعہ شیخ محمد بشیر اینڈ سنز لاہور : سنہ ندارد

۲۲۔ یوسف سلیم چشتی : شروح کلامِ اقبال : مطبوعہ عشرت پبلشنگ ہاؤس، لاہور :

ا۔ اردو :

شرح بانگِ درا : سنہ ندارد

شرح بالِ جبریل : سنہ ندارد

شرح ضربِ کلیم : سنہ ندارد

شرح ارمغانِ حجاز : سنہ ندارد

ب۔ فارسی :

شرح اسرارِ خودی : ۱۹۵۴ء

شرح رموزِ بے خودی : ۱۹۵۳ء

شرح پیامِ مشرق : ۱۹۶۱ء

شرح زبورِ عجم : ۱۹۵۳ء

شرح جاوید نامہ :۱۹۶۱ء

شرح پس چہ باید کرد مع مسافر :۱۹۵۷ء

شرح ارمغانِ حجاز :۱۹۵۵ء

(c) Journals

۱۔ اقبال :اپریل ۱۹۷۶ء :

محمد ریاض،ڈاکٹر : "اقبال کے چند تراجم اور ماخوذات" : تقابلی نمونے

۲۔ اقبال ریویو :جولائی ۱۹۷۶ء :

عبدالقوی بستوی :"ہندوستان میں اقبالیات"

۳۔ اقبال :اپریل۔جولائی ۱۹۷۷ء

ملک معین نواز اظہر :"اقبال پر برصغیر پاک وہند کی یونیورسٹیوں کے مقالات کی توضیحی کتابیات"

۴۔ اقبال :اپریل ۱۹۷۹ء :

محمد عبداللہ قریشی :"بشیر احمد ڈار"(ایک معروف اقبال شناس بشیر احمد ڈار کا شخصی تعارف اور انکی اقبالیاتی تحریروں پر تبصرہ)

۵۔ اقبال :اکتوبر ۱۹۹۲ء۔جنوری ۱۹۹۳ء

تسلیم احمد تصور "اشاریہ اقبالیات امروز"(زمانی اعتبار سے)

۶۔ اقبال :جنوری ۱۹۹۴ء :

سید ندیم الحسن :"صحافتی اصطلاحات وملحقات"(ایک صحافتی کشاف جو تحقیقی تحریروں میں از حد مفید ہے)

۷۔ اقبالیات :جنوری۔مارچ ۱۹۹۴ء

INDICES

INDEX-I
IMPORTANT WORDS DISCUSSED IN THE THESIS
(English)

A

B

C

D

E

F


N

O

P

INDEX-II
IMPORTANT WORDS DISCUSSED IN THE THESIS
(Urdu & Persian)




و ہمّت ہے لحد
نے بتایا رازِ الوند
Iqba